

APPROACHING EQUITY



**Civil Society Inputs for the Approach Paper
– 12th Five Year Plan**

A WNTA publication, with support from UNDP.



United Nations Development Programme (UNDP, India)



WADA NA TODO ABHIYAN

National Secretariat

C-1/E (Second Floor)

Green Park Extension

New Delhi - 110016

Tel: + 91 11 46082371

Fax: +91 11 46082372

www.wadanatodo.net

Photo credit: Michael Cannon

APPROACHING EQUITY

CIVIL SOCIETY INPUTS FOR
THE APPROACH PAPER
— 12TH FIVE YEAR PLAN

Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	3
FOREWORD	5
PREAMBLE	7
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CHALLENGES	
1. Enhancing the capacity for growth	13
2. Enhancing skills and faster generation of employment	21
3. Managing the environment	33
4. Markets for efficiency and inclusion	43
5. Decentralisation, empowerment and information	47
6. Technology and innovation	69
7. Securing the energy future of india	75
8. Accelerated development of transport infrastructure	79
9. Rural transformation and sustained growth of agriculture	83
10. Managing urbanisation	91
11. Improved access to quality education	99
12. Better preventive and curative health care	111
OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS	
Urban poor	127
THEMATIC INPUTS from others	
1. Maternal health	133
2. Land rights	135
3. Food and nutrition security in the 12th Five Year Plan	138

4. Health	140
5. Water	142
6. Right to Education and key challenges	144
7. Resourcing the transparency regime in India	145
8. Inclusive growth ensuring distributive justice from a labour rights perspective	148
9. Climate change	150
10. Energy	153
11. Improving access to quality education	155
12. Mining	164
13. Budget	166
14. Review of the Central Social Welfare Board	171
15. Voluntary sector and government: partners in development	172
16. Governance, institutions and the planning process	173
17. Need for peace and equity audit as a parameter for development planning	175

SUMMARY REPORTS

1. Dalits	179
2. Adolescents	187
3. Muslims	191
4. Elderly	195
5. Migrants	199
6. Advasis	205
7. Youth	210
8. North-east	212
9. Children	217
10. Conflict	224

APPENDIX

1. Strategy Challenges	229
2. List of CSOs, Individuals and Media in the 12th Five Year Plan Consultations 2010-11	231
3. Abbreviations	242

Acknowledgements

We, Wada No Todo Abhiyan, are grateful to all the organizations, networks, campaigns and individuals that participated in the consultation process and contributed their invaluable inputs. This publication has been made possible by their support, participation, and contribution of inputs, time, energy, knowledge, and dedication.

We also would like to acknowledge the effort, energy and commitment of following organizations that anchored the consultations around each subgroup:

1. North East – North East Network,
2. Youth – JOSH, The Tehelka Foundation, Pravah, IYCN, YP Foundation and Liberal Youth Forum
3. Women – Women Power Connect, JAGORI, UN Women, CBGA, NAWO, EKTA
4. Children – IACR, Plan4Children Collective, MCF, CRY, HAQ, SCF, NCDHR, JWP, Plan India, CRT, Mobile Creches, KCRO, WVI, Young Lives, CINI
5. Dalits – NCDHR, NACDOR, NDF, NFDW
6. Adivasis – Ekta Parishad
7. Transgenders – UNDP
8. Migrants – International Organization for Migration, UNDP
9. Conflict – COVA, Ekta Parishad, SANSAD, PUCAAR, ASHA Parivar
10. Urban Poor – Hazards Centre, Swaasthya, IGSSS, Green Flag, Action Aid
11. Muslims – TPMS, NACDOR
12. People with Disability – VSO, Aarth Astha India
13. Elderly – HelpAge India, TISS
14. Adolescents – Swaasthya, CHETNA, Smile Foundation
15. PLHIV – UNDP, Indian Network of People Living with HIV
16. Decentralization – Decentralization Community, Solution Exchange, UNDP

Thematic Papers

1. Maternal Health – National Alliance for Maternal Health and Human Rights
2. Land Rights – Ekta Parishad
3. Food and Nutrition Security in 12th Five Year Plan – Dipa Sinha, Right to Food Campaign
4. Health – Indranil, Research Scholar, JNU
5. Water – Romit Sen, CSE
6. Right to Education and Key Challenges – Sandeep Mishra, NCE
7. Resourcing the Transparency Regime in India – Venkatesh Nayak, CHRI
8. Inclusive Growth Ensuring Distributive Justice from a Labour Rights Perspective – J John, CEC
9. Climate Change – Aditi Kapoor
10. Energy – Vinuta Gopal, Greenpeace
11. Improving Access to Quality Education – Anjela Taneja, Oxfam India
12. Mining – R Sreedhar, Convenor, Mines, Minerals and People
13. Budget – Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability
14. Central Social Welfare Board – Kalyani Menon-Sen
15. Voluntary Sector – VANI
16. Policies and Programmes for the Older Persons in India: A Background Paper – Prof. S Siva Raju, TISS
17. Governance, Institutions and the Planning Process – National Social Watch Coalition
18. Need for Peace and Equity Audit as a Parameter for Development Planning – Mazher Hussain, COVA
19. Inputs for the Child Health Approach Paper 12th Five Year Plan – Dr. Rajiv Tandon, Save the Children

A full list of civil society organisations, individuals and media organisation can be found in Appendix 2.

We are very grateful to UNDP for supporting these consultations.

Foreword

Historically, civil society groups have engaged with the Planning Commission by both constructively critiquing it as well as engaging with it to either develop plans, and/or by serving as advisors. As a result of the sustained, long-standing effort to have civil society perspectives inform planning and make it a people-oriented process, the Planning Commission has, in a pathbreaking move, approached civil society organisations to engage with them openly, formally and systemically and opened up the process for inputs into the approach paper (instead of sharing and seeking inputs after the draft approach paper is ready).

Civil society groups feel this move is a key window of opportunity to actualise the shift of the planning process to a people-led one, make the 12th Five Year Plan inclusive, and create spaces for the most marginalized. There is also a need to institutionalize this process into a formal, systemic one. While the primary objective is to ensure that the planning process in India includes both civil society groups and citizens, the emphasis is to include the most marginalized groups. The other – equally important – objective is to ensure that all groups retain their autonomy.

On 26 October 2010, a planning meeting was organized at Teen Murti Bhavan, New Delhi, in which Dr Syeda Hamid (Planning Commission Member responsible for civil society interface) and Mr Arun Maira (Planning Commission Member and anchor for the 12th Five Year Plan process) participated and shared the process and their expectation. More than 60 civil society groups representing a diversity of groups, including children, youth, women, the elderly, education, and health participated in the meeting. The Planning Commission expressed its keenness to get civil society inputs at all stages of the 12th Five Year Plan, with particular emphasis on the preparation of the approach paper. The Planning Commission also shared a list of 12

challenges around which they would like to prepare the approach paper.

It was decided that national consultations around 16 social groups would be held before the approach paper is prepared, and an attempt would be made to get regional inputs by spreading national consultations geographically. Different civil society groups representing these communities and working with them would lead the process, where the attempt would be to reach out further to all the actors working with the same social groups across the country. It was also decided that the Planning Commission members would be invited to these consultations (to which they agreed). WNTA facilitated these consultations.

These consultations were to be completed before 15 December 2010, and their summary and report sent directly to the Planning Commission. As committed, Planning Commission Members attended these consultations, in order to benefit directly from the deliberations, and take the voices back to the approach paper.

This publication is a culmination of these consultations and contains all the recommendations made by the different social groups.

Wada Na Todo Abhiyan

Preamble

Non-governmental organizations and civil society organizations from across the country, representing various constituencies and theoretical approaches, collectively welcome the effort of the Planning Commission of India to make the planning process more responsive to citizens' concerns for the 12th Five Year Plan Approach Paper.

We have seized this opportunity to make this 12th Five Year Plan process further participatory, and somewhat representative of public opinion. Government planning is one of the few sites that lend itself to participation by civil society and non-government experts. In addressing the emerging Plan Approach, we have undertaken wide-ranging consultations to identify and reflect the insights and aspirations of the public in whose best interests the State should seek to govern.

These principles have already been enshrined in the Preamble to the Indian Constitution – **Justice – social, economic, and political** – and should be kept in mind if the State is to deliver the people's rights and entitlements. The Directive Principles are declared as “fundamental to the governance of the country”. Article 37 imposes an obligation on the State to apply them. Since the Constitution emphasises the positive duty of the State to promote the welfare of the people by affirming social, economic and political justice, as well as to fight income inequality and ensure individual dignity, the question arises for each Five Year Plan: why is the State not more attentive to this obligation, and what should the next Plan reflect?

Our recommended inputs are aimed to strengthen the Indian State's provisions and commitments and ensure through special measures and safeguards these rights and universal entitlements for the most marginalised and vulnerable people residing within the jurisdiction of the Indian State. All planning and development processes

should be inclusive of all vulnerable groups, irrespective of the area of concern, i.e. markets, agriculture, economy, industries, etc.

The draft listing of priorities for the Plan Approach could gain from reaffirming these mandates. Basic rights must be consciously examined against any listing of challenges and targets identified for the Plan. It cannot be assumed that they will be addressed. Much less can it be assumed that they are optional in the drive for sustainable and equitable development!

Who is to be served and empowered by development? **The concept of “inclusion”** in the planning process should be centred on mobilising the excluded as active agents of their own development; their participation should be made essential to the very design of the development process; and they themselves must not simply be welfare targets of development programmes. Our proposals envisage bringing to the forefront the full agency of these excluded groups in planning. The processes of development planning deserve review.

We believe that those who are affected by any challenge or problem have the right to be directly involved in evolving measures through discussion and participation to address and solve that particular problem, whether it is in local committees, councils or in developing policies or programmes. This is not to say that others need not be included in this process, but that the views, needs and desires of the affected groups must be foregrounded.

We have deliberately moved away from the language of ‘recipients’ and ‘beneficiaries’, whether it be of planning processes, programmes, and schemes or in terms of access to resources, and of ownership and entitlements, and the right to claim or reclaim them. Our recommendations also

underline the safety and protection measures needed for this process of reclamation and the inclusion of voices, desires, and needs of all those who are full and active stakeholders and constituents in every governance and investment process.

Certain groups and communities face social and economic “**exclusion**” and political marginalisation due to their caste, class, gender, age, religious affiliation, region, sexuality, disability, marital status, education, or living with HIV and/or other stigmatised health conditions. Consequently, our primary attempt has been to focus on developing plans, policies, and schemes to address this gap. All our thematic papers and inputs adopt approaches that specifically take into account the needs and desires of these socially, culturally, and economically marginalised groups and communities and attempt to work towards mitigating the effects of this marginalisation/exclusion to ensure **social and distributive justice**. In our view, these groups have so far been regarded as “not quite citizens” and certainly not full citizens.

A case in point is the faulty categorisation of key under-served groups. For example, take the categories of ‘women’ and ‘children’. The practice of clubbing women along with children in a separate chapter of the current 11th Plan document has served neither the woman nor the child. Not only does this reduce women and children to exclusive reproductive and dependent roles, but also takes away from their productive and social potential. This cannot qualify as any kind of human resource development for the public good. Similar examples can be given for all the other excluded and marginalised groups with whom we have been engaged.

Therefore, we have adopted a perspective of planning that uses the concerns of the most marginalised as an overarching, cross-cutting concern, with the primary objective of promoting growth with justice and inclusion of all citizens in development. We stand by this.

Illustrative examples of how rights to essential entitlements actually play out demonstrate what we mean. Everyone has a right to all the essential entitlements for their survival, development, dignity, and happiness and should be provided these. Among these are protection of life; food and nutrition security; safe, clean and regular supply of drinking water; affordable and clean sanitation facilities; secure housing; equal and affordable quality education; sustainable and safe livelihood options; quality public health services; access to natural resources; social security provisions; cheap

transportation; infrastructure; safety and protection, all of which are easily accessible from where they live. The Government, in our view, has a duty to provide these to all.

Is there sufficient and conscious State investment in ensuring this? Only this can end the continued cycle of vicious poverty and exclusion and move India towards economic prosperity for all. Our proposals for the Plan approach are therefore deeply rooted in this belief and all suggestions to strengthen existing schemes and plans as well as suggestions for new measures have been formulated from this perspective.

We further believe that all groups and citizens of our country have equal rights as citizens, stakeholders and owners of all the resources available to them and their communities. All processes that affect these resources affect them and their livelihoods. We believe it is necessary to empower all citizens, especially the socially and economically excluded, with the right to monitor all schemes and programmes as owners and participants of all development and governance processes in their areas of residence. This further ensures decentralisation of all planning, implementation, and monitoring processes. Such an approach would ensure that all plans and schemes will be owned and developed by the people and will be meaningful and structured to address the gaps in their needs and desires.

Concern for India’s environment and commitment to understanding and addressing such a concern must be a pillar of this and future Plans. Our inputs emphasise that the crucial need to move to more aware and informed planning and action to ensure climate justice and the sustainability of the environment cannot be postponed to a future Plan. A core concern is the issue of the ownership, control, management, and utilisation of all natural resources and national assets that are in the interest of the people. We believe that social, economic, and environmental marginalisation are at the root of a great deal of engineered violence and conflict, much of it promoted by state agencies, that may be easily addressed by making planned efforts to ensure justice.

We invite a re-examination of the assumption that it is population pressure alone that imperils the environmental balance of resources, renewability, and the common people’s use or expectation of land, water, and forests. It is necessary to recognise the impacts of market-influenced decisions on use and exploitation of natural resources. These not only upset and diminish positive conservation traditions but also move benefits out of the people’s hands.

Overall, the case for market-led growth should not go unquestioned. Our process has sought to analyse what makes a “people’s Plan” authentic. If the core development objective is to better the lot and brighten the prospects of the common citizen, it must be argued that the national resolve should be for markets to serve and secure the hopes and happiness of the people rather than for the people – and the use of their energies and talents – to be geared to benefit the market. The seedbeds of a prosperous republic, which deserve recognition rather than replacement in India’s quest for genuine growth, are the little economies of neighbourhoods and communities that draw upon local skills and resources and cater to local requirements. This does not at all imply shutting the door on access to new technologies and products. We believe that advocating privatisation of resources will lead to the further marginalisation and disempowerment of large sections of society.

With the utilisation of this **livelihood approach**, we therefore reiterate that people own and have a right to the commons and common resources – and to chart their own course towards a destination of holistic development true to the country’s ideals. By this, we mean for example that planning should be livelihood-based, people-centric, pro-poor, and owned by the people themselves, as this in turn warrants that any developmental scheme and plan is environmentally sustainable.

It is regularly argued – and explained – that a Five-Year Plan is an economic plan, about intentions to spend. If these are its confines, India’s planners must reveal the ideology and the development manifesto to which it relates. It is in this endeavour that the voluntary sector and civil society have the responsibility to seek, and find, and understand what the people really aspire for – and to strive to make it a reality.

These are for us the key principles for our inputs. We believe that respect for them will facilitate and build a prosperous India while simultaneously securing re-distributive, economic and social justice. This will further result in “growth” for all rather than for a select few. In order to ensure this, the forthcoming Approach Paper to the 12th Five-Year Plan needs to address the **following key concerns and recommendations**:

1. GDP growth alone as a goal of planning is rejected by all the civil society groups. We suggest instead that a comprehensive real-time database on the marginalisation of and violence against the poor and vulnerable must first be created in order to enable more realistic and just planning.

2. This database should be analysed to identify all livelihood generation possibilities that are people-centred and, therefore, require minimal investments, and will, in turn, contribute to national prosperity rather than waiting endlessly for growth at the top to trickle down to the bottom.
3. Another key concern that has been expressed by diverse groups, namely the Dalits, Adivasis, Muslims, people living with HIV, people with disability, transgenders, the elderly, the youth and, especially, women and children, is to provide access to essential entitlements and development opportunities to the marginalised. To achieve this, they suggest that the government should increase investments in public services such as **health, education, skill development, training and in infrastructure building** instead of curtailing them in favour of private parties, which will only result in the further alienation of the marginalised sections.
4. Investments for the poor should be increased and programmes like the Public Distribution System, Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme, Swarn Jayanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana, Swarn Jayanti Shahari Rozgar Yojana etc should be strengthened and broadened to include also forthcoming governmental programmes, such as the National Livelihoods Mission.
5. A persistent problem for the poor in this country is the lack of access to institutional financial services in general and cheap credit in particular. Special steps need to be taken to make cheap credit and other financial services available to the poor who are at present largely unbanked.
6. Transparency, accountability, and monitoring have to increase and mechanisms for people’s participation in monitoring should be established. We believe that this is the only way in which public services can ensure delivery, as financial allocations alone will not be able to achieve this due to rampant corruption.
7. Laws should be strictly followed, especially labour laws, and protection laws enacted for children, Dalits, Adivasis, women, people with disability, and Muslims. Violence and atrocities against these vulnerable sections is a key cause of concern, especially in areas of conflict and where the state machinery has failed miserably to prevent this.
8. Displacement and environmental damage, including the looming climate change crisis caused by projects, especially mining, are a major concern and a key cause

of internal displacement and out-migration. Justice has to be ensured through proper rehabilitation and resettlement for those being voluntarily displaced. Projects should be dropped if it becomes clear during a transparently conducted preliminary assessment itself that the social and environmental costs are going to be unacceptably high to the affected communities.

9. Migration – both internal and overseas – has become a major socio-economic phenomenon and migrants are mostly without rights and entitlements in destination areas. Proper registration and enumeration of the migrants, portability of their entitlements, and security of their rights has to be ensured. The proliferation of the urban poor in the city, their unhygienic and unsafe living conditions, and lack of access to clean drinking water and sanitation call for immediate and multi-pronged interventions.
10. Agricultural distress has also been pointed out by many of the groups and this phenomenon is once again linked to out-migration. A sustainable agricultural policy along with practicable post-production management and marketing is urgently required.
11. The poor status of local governance is another important area of concern across all the groups – and our suggestion is that Information Education and Communication campaigns along with proper devolution (namely the 3 Fs – Funds, Functions and Functionaries), institutional mechanisms, and financial and administrative support is needed to make local governance truly inclusive.
12. An increased investment in decentralised production and distribution of renewable non-conventional energy is also a common concern for us all.

Recommendations for Challenges

1

Enhancing the Capacity for Growth

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM THE DISCUSSION GROUPS RELATED TO CHILDREN, YOUTH, DALITS, NORTH EAST, CONFLICT, ADOLESCENTS, ADIVASIS, TRANSGENDERS, MIGRANTS, WOMEN, PEOPLE LIVING WITH HIV, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY AND MUSLIMS

Enhancing the Capacity for Growth

Section Contents

Context	15
Dalits	15
Youth	15
North East	16
Children	16
Conflict	16
Reform of the subsidy regime	16

Specific Recommendations	18
Dalits	18
Children	18
North East	19
Conflict	19
Youth	19
Muslims	19
People with Disability	20

1. Context

i. Dalits

A primary challenge in approaches to economic growth is the need to ensure Dalits, Adivasis and other minority and marginalized groups are partners in determining the priorities of the growth sectors which have made our economy one of the fastest growing economies in the world. Dalit, Adivasi and other minority perspectives, interests and development do not seem to be evident in the current planning model. India has had to continuously mobilize foreign resources to meet its domestic needs. This foreign investment has, however, been focused on priority sectors such as infrastructure development, energy and power sectors, irrigation, roads, and urban development. These sectors are planned such that they seem to be out of the purview of Dalits and Adivasis. The benefits may trickle down, but the focus seems to be on other sections of society.

Given the new image of a developed nation for India, and the high spending in defence and nuclear power, several countries have wanted to curtail aid to India. However, strategies have not emerged as yet to increase state social sector spending.

The Public Private Partnership (PPP) model has been looked at as an alternative to increased government spending on public sector services. To encourage private sector investment and cut government costs, this then encourages the deployment of user fees to access the said services. The

largest values of contracts are in ports, followed by urban development, energy, roads and airports,¹ and a fairly small volume is devoted to education. Maharashtra, Andhra Pradesh and Karnataka have the highest PPP projects. An analysis of where the Dalits are and what stakes they have in PPP projects, will depict their abysmal participation levels. The disaggregated data on these aspects is not maintained.

Clearly, having the private sector finance public sector services has resulted in heavy investment in airports, ports, roads and health and education in urban areas. There is no monitoring or assessment of whether health and educational services are being provided as per the needs of Dalits, Adivasis and minorities. Plan outlays on health, education or social sector are currently less than the expected rates of allocation of GDP. It was 4.3 per cent of total GDP for health, education, drinking water and sanitation. Expected level for education alone was 6 per cent and 5 per cent as stipulated by the World Health Organization (WHO) for health expenditure. Social sector spending on Dalits, Adivasis and minorities has also been reduced considerably after the initial three years of planning last year.

ii. Youth

There is a need to understand and define 'growth' beyond Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and economic terms. Enhancing the capacity for the growth of the economy is the 'means' to an end. This is the holistic development of the nation. Economic growth as a measure can be quite

¹ <http://www.pppinindia.com/database.php>

distracting on its own and would remain incomplete without the indicators of socio-political development. Every citizen in India should benefit from economic growth, and its positive effects on development should be felt and experienced across the nation. Especially, growth has to cater to the needs of the youth of the country. The growth of the country's economy should lead to more opportunities and avenues for the youth and their development.

iii. North East

The 'one size fits all' approach of development schemes does not serve the intended beneficiaries because of the diverse social and geographic settings in the North East. Plan schemes should be prepared in the context of the region, its peoples and the current situation of some states that are burdened with unrest and political turmoil.

iv. Children

The magnitude of the 'Child Budget' within the Union Budget, i.e. the aggregate outlay for child-specific schemes as a proportion of total budget outlay of the Union Government increased to 4.1 per cent in 2010-11 (Budget Estimate) from 3.7 per cent in 2009-10 (Revised Estimate). However, if the allocations earmarked for the children in the whole period from 2007-08 to 2010-11 are considered, the increase is miniscule in 2010-11 (Budget Estimate). The major flagship programmes for the welfare of children

– Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS), Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) and the immunisation programmes – depend heavily on external funds. In 2008 – 09, external aid as a proportion of the Child Budget was as much as 13 per cent. These programmes also leave many children out, especially the most vulnerable.

The infrastructure for child survival, development and protection remains weak and inadequate. Buildings, staff, and supplies meant for delivery of services are inadequate and it is always a case of trying to get more for less. With respect to children, sectoral schemes are formulated with little attention to the multidisciplinary needs of the child as a person. Also, a life cycle perspective, catering to age specific needs, is found missing even in integrated child development programmes.

v. Conflict

Arbitrary and unequal resource allocations and income disparities have generated conflicts like Adivasi unrest, caste conflagrations, armed struggles, urban agitations, interstate and interregional disputes. The growth and development of the marginalised communities like Adivasis, dalits, minorities, women and the rural and urban poor are badly affected as a result. Consequently, growth in the monetary sense is not enough. Growth must come with equity and production with distributive justice.

2. Reform of the subsidy regime

i. Dalits

A general problem with the subsidy regime is that it tends to heavily favour large corporations, infrastructure companies and intermediaries rather than small traders, consumers and producers. These corporations and intermediaries are also out of the reach of Dalits, Adivasis and minorities, and hence social exclusion is reinforced. The 'inefficiencies' of the subsidy regime followed in the past by India have been heavily criticised, specifically by multilateral lending agencies like the World Bank. These institutions have recommended a reduction in subsidies in order to accelerate growth and remove market distortions. Nevertheless, food subsidies have continued to increase. Food price inflation also continues.

Narrow targeting through the Public Distribution System (PDS) has weakened it. A large section of the population still has to buy food from the market, particularly the Dalits, who are landless. Nevertheless, there has been a huge wastage of food stocks rotting in the open in Food Corporation of India godowns. Moreover, black marketing has made the system prone to leakage. Starvation deaths and malnutrition are on the rise as the food needs of the increasing numbers of the poor are still not being met.

Casteism heavily dominates the PDS and the Dalits are not only denied access to food but are also made to pay more. Of the total 521 villages surveyed in five states – Uttar Pradesh, Bihar, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu and Andhra Pradesh – almost 40 per cent

reported that the Dalits were found to be receiving lesser quantities for the same price as compared to the upper castes. There is also a preponderance of the dominant castes among the PDS dealers and a paucity of Dalit dealers. The targeted system requires identification of the poor and this is done by the village headmen who belong to the dominant castes.

ii. Children

The supply of food through the PDS is ridden with the problems of corruption, poor quality grains, irregular supply and non-availability of food commodities in areas where the need is the highest. Slackness in the monitoring and oversight of delivery persists at the cost of fulfilling the rights and entitlements of the poor. The responsibility of the central government definitely extends beyond transfer of funds to states for various schemes and programmes etc. Each such fund transfer needs to be followed upon to determine its capital efficiency in terms of benefits for the poor and marginalized, especially children.

iii. North East

Government subsidies to industries in the North East Region must be re-evaluated and conditional subsidies should be imposed. They must be based on certain criteria, including the employment of local human resources and without environmental degradation. Corporate recipients of government subsidies should be given social development targets to fulfil. Subsidies should not be given to the mining sector in the region. However, air transport subsidy should be given for all agricultural, handicraft and weaving products from the North East states being sent for sale to metropolitan cities.

iv. Conflict

The withdrawal of subsistence subsidies to the poor and allocation of resources at subsidized prices to the rich in the name of growth should be avoided. This generates a class divide and leads to struggles for subsistence leading to conflict. The state should not become a mere regulator instead of being a provider of basic services in sectors like health, education, infrastructure, livelihoods, etc. Most subsidies fail to benefit the intended beneficiaries. Fertilizer subsidies, for example, go disproportionately to fertilizer producers and well-off farmers. Thus, there is a need for better targeting of subsidies.

3. Specific Recommendations

i. Dalits

1. Foreign direct investment, aid and borrowing for infrastructure projects, power and other projects creating loss of livelihoods and assets of the poor and causing environmental damage should be avoided. A proper impact and needs assessment should be done to see to what extent such projects are essential. They need to be linked to the Special Component Plan for Scheduled Castes (SCP) and the Tribal Sub Plan (TSP). The institutions not able to design divisible programmes for the Dalits and Adivasis should give the SCP/TSP proportion of their budget to the Nodal Ministry/Department for the divisible programmes.
2. Greater focus needs to be given on the inclusion of communities from SC/ST background as representatives in decision making, the setting of priorities and in assessing the impacts of programmes on health, education, water, etc. The indicators that measure the inclusion of the excluded castes and address the issues of exclusion of access to civic amenities should be clearly devised and regularly tracked. Care needs to be taken in promoting Dalits, Adivasis and minorities not just as the passive recipients of largesse but also as the active partners in the execution of projects, as contractors and as other active stakeholders.
3. Greater thrust needs to be given for PPPs to serve the Dalits, Adivasis and the most marginalised. User charges should not be levied on from these sections. Therefore, a different incentive policy for private sector participation needs to be thought of, as otherwise the sole dependence on PPPs to provide health and education services may exclude a large number of people. PPPs should always have a proportion of share holding from excluded communities like Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and women (not less than 10 per cent). The PPPs need to be linked to the SCP and TSP and clear monitoring practices have to be evolved to increase the stakes in development of the Dalits, Adivasis and minorities.
4. There should be special allocation under the PDS for Dalits. On the whole, subsidies, if planned and targeted

well, can ensure distributive justice and better resource allocation. The PDS should be used to target the real levels of poverty in the country. Leakage in fair price shops and Food Corporation of India godowns should be checked. The food coupon system should be strictly avoided as it shifts all powers of provisioning to private traders. Community-run hamlet-level systems can be formed for storage of excess food grains. There should be marketing and procurement cooperative societies of Dalits/Adivasis at the block level.

ii. Children

5. The overall allocation for child-specific schemes must be stepped up in the Union Budget during the 12th Plan to universalize the delivery of quality services to all children in the country from birth until the attainment of the age of 18 years.
6. The issue is aggravated by the responsibility for the development of children being split between different ministries and there being no focus on transition planning. This must be addressed through schemes and plans that address children from birth till they reach the age of 18.
7. Dependence on external resources must be reduced and national resources must be mobilised. It is imperative that commitments to children's development are not sacrificed to the vagaries of changes in global funding priorities and the resulting conditionalities of such assistance.
8. The allocations for children in state budgets need to be increased to bridge the gap between planning and actual implementation.
9. Greater clarity on targeting and a stronger commitment to the decentralized delivery of services is needed. Also needed are the greater involvement of Panchayat Raj Institutions (PRI) and urban local councils in the identification of target groups and the delivery of services in an open and transparent manner.
10. The Prime Minister's recent meeting on nutrition stressed on the need for a review of targeting methodologies. The nutritional values of food commodities have to be re-examined and new measures to reach vulnerable families have to be formulated. The goal of reducing malnutrition among children of all ages requires special attention to be paid to the most vulnerable age-groups (0–3 years and adolescents).

11. Sustaining subsidies through the ongoing programmes of ICDS and Midday Meals is inadequate as these do not guarantee food security to children. The Food Security Act should focus on making protein-rich foods such as milk and eggs available, especially to young children.
12. The adoption of a holistic approach and the removal of the condition that the child or beneficiary must provide proof of residence to access the services provided (in the case of a child, his/her birth certificate) would be beneficial.
13. The stress should be on consolidation rather than proliferation. The conclusions of several studies and the Mid Term Review of the 11th Plan should be effectively utilised for the integration and streamlining of schemes.
14. There must be a conscious and proactive focus on all age groups of children (0-18 years).
15. The criteria for the choice of programmes and schemes should be well-defined and targets set for coverage should be based on such criteria.
16. Local plans and implementation should be need-based with built-in flexibility to respond to the special needs of the area or beneficiary groups such as the children of nomadic families.

iii. North East

17. The population criteria for sanction of grants and schemes does not fit in with some states like Arunachal Pradesh, Meghalaya, Nagaland and Manipur because of sparse settlements in a radius of 50 km from each other. Thus, the schemes should be need based. Such remote areas also require investment in projects relating to roads, health units, educational centres and PDS outlets.
18. Proper implementation is required of a mining policy that would ensure that a percentage of the profits from mining are ploughed back into the community located in the mining areas. A specific mechanism for the benefit of resident populations focused on skill upgradation and capacity building should be developed.

iv. Conflict

19. Redistribution of income and economic justice should be focused on. Providing benefits to only one section

of the society may lead to growth but cannot bring about equitable development.

20. Resource allocations should reach the people. For example, huge allocations are being made in Kashmir for hydel and other infrastructure projects but only a fraction of these resources and benefits from these projects are reaching the local people.
21. Efforts should be made to increase the mobilization of resources to ensure evenly distributed development.
22. Corporate tax contribution to the GDP should be more. In foreign nations the contribution of corporate tax is far higher than what it is in India. The reasons for this needs to be studied and understood.

v. Youth

23. Make Gross National Happiness (GNH) the metric of growth in preference to GDP. Gross National Happiness recognizes sustainable development, cultural values, natural environment and good governance as the four pillars of development, and will make young people less anxious and more purposeful and hopeful.

vi. Muslims

24. Increase the budgetary allocation for minorities in proportion to their population in the country. (Though there has been a significant percentage increase in the budget of the ministry of minority affairs since it started, in absolute terms, it is way behind the percentage population of the minorities).
25. The effective participation of Muslims in the national mainstream should be ensured through affirmative action in the sphere of education and employment. Through the Special Component Plan of Rs. 25,000 crores, an annual budget of Rs. 15,000 crores may be created to modernise madrassas and to open new educational institutions for Muslims.
26. On the lines of the Schedule Cost Component Plan and Tribal Sub Plan, the government should have a Minority Component Plan which should be mandatory for all ministries.
27. The fund utilisation under different schemes of the Ministry of Minority affairs has been way below the targets. There should be a mechanism to monitor the utilisation of the budget so that the allocated funds are utilised.

28. Reasons for under-utilisation may also be because the schemes are not addressing the key needs of the minorities. Hence, the government should review its schemes for minorities from this viewpoint.
29. It is necessary to form a cell to oversee the use of funds allotted and prevent misuse.
30. Drafting of grassroots micro-plans is necessary to understand the actual need of the community.
31. The 11th Five Year Plan had clubbed all marginalised social sections together in one chapter and the importance given to all the marginalised social sections (including minorities, SCs, STs, etc) was negligible compared to the overall plan. The 12th Plan should have full separate chapters in the Plan document and minorities should be given due importance in the 12th Plan.
32. Compiling and making available data on socio-economic conditions and participation in government welfare programmes as suggested by the Sachar Committee through the creation of a National Data Bank (NDB) for planning.

vii. People with Disability

33. Reform the subsidy regime – ensure that the reforms have a direct impact (meaningful, positive, measured changes in quality of life) in the lives of people with disabilities.
34. Ensure that in this mechanism the matter of accessibility (universal) is given due importance with active participation of appropriate bodies (say for instance, the National Institute of Urban Development).
35. In the matter of improving efficiency of planned expenditure there have to be mechanisms of inclusive strategies in proliferation.
36. Concurrent impact evaluation – The impact (monitoring) evaluation mechanism must have components related to inclusion of People With Disabilities – it has to be part of all reporting mechanism – then only one would consider it during impact assessment (the impact assessment strategies and bodies should comprise PWDs/or such) – the planned allotment for expenditure for particular sectors (say, disability) needs to have a mechanism of transparency and accountability (includes the states and local bodies).

2

Enhancing Skills and Faster Generation of Employment

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM THE DISCUSSION GROUPS RELATED TO CHILDREN, YOUTH, DALITS, NORTH EAST, CONFLICT, ADOLESCENTS, ADIVASIS, TRANSGENDERS, MIGRANTS, WOMEN, PEOPLE LIVING WITH HIV, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY AND MUSLIMS

Enhancing Skills and Faster Generation of Employment

Section Contents

Context	23
Women	23
Youth	23
Dalits	24
Children	25
Adivasis	25
Migrants	25
North East	25

Specific Recommendations	26
Women	26
Youth	26
Dalits	27
Children	27
Adolescents	28
Adivasis	28
Transgenders	29
Migrants	29
North East	30
Conflict	30
Muslims	31
PLHIV	32
People with Disability	32

1. Context

i. Women

Women's labour is getting casualised and there is increasing feminisation of poverty. With traditional occupations eroded and wiped out, women are now being forced to enter new markets, where labour laws are not enforced. Mushrooming of Special Economic Zones and Free Trade Zones are live examples of what is happening to the labour market. This is the result of the neo-liberal policies that have only helped in widening the gap between the rich and the poor, with the poorest of the poor being women. While there is little hope of reversal of these policies, what can be expected is to ensure that further marginalisation of women does not take place. There should be mechanisms to promote asset-building for women, including land. Wage disparities should be removed and proper implementation of both the Minimum Wages Act as well as the Equal Remuneration Act should be ensured.

There is a need to upgrade women's skills and equip them to face the changing times. Women constitute a major proportion of the agricultural workforce and yet they are not considered farmers. They do not have right to assets and control over natural resources, though women are the conservers of resources. With increasing migration of women and out-migration of men, there are more women-headed households and the burden of both economic and social responsibility is borne by women. The informal sector

is widening and labour laws are not implemented. Thus, women are exploited and denied benefits which the formal sector workers get.

Recurrent disasters, both natural and human-made, have resulted in destroying traditional livelihoods, where women played a key role. These need to be revived and upgraded so that women's indigenous knowledge and experience in these areas can contribute to the nation's productive growth. Even in the formal sector, there is a glass ceiling that does not allow women in high-level decision-making positions.

ii. Youth

There exists at present unequal access to skill building opportunities and huge disparities within the education system for young people across regions, caste, class, and gender. The social group determines the type of skills they learn and the professions they are permitted to practise. For example, Dalits have traditionally worked as sweepers while boys are not encouraged to go in for nursing or psychology. The education system lacks practical orientation. It also does not encourage experimentation or experiential learning. The pressure of getting certificates for secure mainstream jobs does not allow young people to explore their interests and talents, discover their passions, take risks and start their own enterprises. Instead, they are forced by their parents to enter socially recognized professions such as law, banking, medicine, engineering and the civil service. There is no focus at present on building entrepreneurial skills in young people. The education system also has an urban bias and

does not value labour or local skills and knowledge. Rural knowledge and skills are neglected and are dying out. Most young people do not want to acquire skills that may be in demand but are not socially valued or upwardly mobile, for example, plumbing, carpentry, electric work, mechanic work, etc. There is a devaluation of the dignity of labour and a lack of social status for these professions.

iii. Dalits

The generation of employment has not been linked with education programmes. Nor have education programmes focused on livelihoods which provide upward mobility for Dalits and opportunities for wealth creation. Employment has not been viewed as a right. Hence, there is a lack of adequate safeguards and policies for the provision and protection of employment. There has been a lack of emphasis in generating skills for SCs in school education. Along with this, skill upgradation practices have not been catering to the current market needs. The employment generation strategy of the 11th Five Year Plan was based on the reduction of underemployment and movement of the surplus labour in the agriculture sector to higher-wage and more gainful employment in the non-agriculture sector. However, this has led to the problem of lack of jobs for Dalits and bad working conditions of a large number of workers in the informal sector. Poverty alleviation programmes such as the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (MGNREGS), Swarna Jayanti Shahari Rozgar Yojana (SJSRY) and the Swarna Jayanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana (SGSY) are unable to provide long-term sustainable employment opportunities for beneficiaries or cater to the growing market needs. The employment of Dalits in service sectors, requiring high levels of education and skills through improving their current levels of education and skill training, remains a challenge.

Micro, small and medium enterprises (MSME) are considered currently to be the main providers of employment in the economy. However, the number of SCs engaged in such enterprises has shown a declining trend. It is crucial to enhance market access and institutional credit and provide specific support to SCs for them to be able to compete in a highly competitive scenario. In spite of the encouragement given to MSMEs, over the years, there has been a decline of SC owners and entrepreneurs of MSMEs. The state is giving increased attention to promoting enterprises as seen in the Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises Act of 2006.

However, Dalits are unable to access the provisions of this Act, given their low investment levels, inaccessibility to credit, inaccessibility to technical skills or other support to start enterprises. In addition, caste discrimination is reported from the smallest to the bigger Dalit entrepreneurs (DEEP, 2010).

There is considerable disparity in the average daily earnings across different social groups for women and men, showing stark inequality particularly in urban areas compared to rural areas and in regular employment compared to casual employment. The NSSO data shows the disparity being Rs.93.56 for urban Dalit women compared to Rs.197.36 for non SC/ST women and Rs.147.95 for urban Dalit men compared to Rs.240.04 for non SC/ST men (Government of India, Employment Report, 2010). Inter-district and inter-state migration has also increased with large proportions of these vulnerable workers coming from Dalit communities. Children continue to be in the workforce instead of in schools.

Caste-based discrimination in hiring practices and recruitment in the private sector has been reported in studies (Thorat and others, 2007). In 2006, there was a call from the Prime Minister to promote inclusion in the private sector. The distress due to lack of employment and poverty is sought to be addressed through the various employment generation schemes currently being implemented under the MGNREGS. Most schemes targeted at Dalits are for non-literate or semi literate persons and up gradation of skills in traditional occupations. This does not provide them the skills to enter the current and emerging professions. These existing schemes do not open up spaces for the growing section of educated Dalit youth.

While women on the whole face barriers in employment, rate of unemployment among Dalit women continues to be higher than that of other women (NSS data). They face several barriers in continuing education and as new entrants into the workforce. As high a proportion as 42 per cent of trained Dalit women are out of the workforce. Dalits are a major human resource for economic growth as they comprise the overwhelming number of landless and casual wage labour. They work as construction workers, unorganized sector workers, environment and hygiene workers and waste management workers of cities. However they continue to suffer from poor income and poverty levels.

iv. Children

The household economic and social condition is highly important for ensuring food security. The freedom from hunger is essential for fulfilment of child potentialities. In crisis situations like drought and famine, the children of poor families are more vulnerable to child marriage, bonded labour and exploitation. Poor access to employment opportunities forces the poor to be trapped in inter-generational low-paying occupations and exploitative working conditions.

v. Adivasis

The loss of dignity and respect associated with traditional knowledge and skills is a major problem for Adivasis. This leads to stagnation in learning processes and disinterest amongst the youth as economic returns are way below the effort. The spread of consumerism and aggressive mainstreaming has further contributed to the loss of skills and knowledge. There are threats to their traditional intellectual property rights from commercial agencies where these are valuable to the modern system.

vi. Migrants

The major problem for migrant workers is that they are not being counted in census and below poverty line (BPL) surveys. Consequently, migrants and their families also miss out on access to government schemes and services at the source as well as the destination areas. There is also political exclusion of migrant workers as large numbers of migrants are not able to vote at the time of elections. The lack of a valid identity proof increases their vulnerability as they suffer police harassment. Women migrants suffer sexual harassment and there is also trafficking of their children. They are also unable to register births and deaths at destination due to complicated processes and language barriers. All this leads to bad working and living conditions and specific problems, described below.

- The lack of access to banking and financial inclusion and the carrying of large amounts of money.
- The vulnerability of the children of the migrants leading to child labour and child trafficking.
- Labour rights violations like termination without notice, non-payment of wages, the exploitative system

of bondage through advance payment, irregular working hours and poor working conditions.

- Lack of legal support to migrant workers.
- Discrimination and conflict between local people and migrant workers in the destination area.

vii. North East

The North East of India is a special region and special institutions have been created to cater to its needs. These institutions, like the North Eastern Council (NEC), have to consider the varying degrees of prevailing disparities within the region and make interventions to fit the people's differing needs in the various states. Development should not be measured only in terms of the GDP model of growth but within a human development framework that is also environment friendly.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Women

1. Provision of funds for Women's Resource Centres at village, Panchayat and cluster levels to ensure women's access to information, rights, livelihoods, counseling, etc.
2. Skill training, literacy, education, access to information and technology with the perspective of employment and addressing all forms of marginalisation.
3. All government programmes should invest 30 per cent funds in women's capacity building as defined above.
4. Existing women's institutions, NGOs etc should be involved by the government in capacity building processes.
5. It should be mandatory for technical institutions to earmark funds for training women for promotion of indigenous and modern skills that are context-appropriate and viable.
6. Government should provide appropriate subsidies and institutional spaces for women in production and marketing.
7. Work-specific tools, spaces, markets, etc should be provided to women according to their needs.
8. Women's security related infrastructure and services should also be provided (shelter, sanitation, street-lighting, transport, post office, police, etc).
9. Government functioning should be made more efficient and not privatised.
10. A comprehensive framework of rights to employment, resources, and equal and decent work needs to be adopted for women's right to livelihoods and microcredit should not be the sole strategy.
11. Protection should be provided to women thrown into the labour market without any social security due to changes in the economy, especially those in difficult situations due to loss of livelihoods.
12. Protection from privatisation and environmental degradation should be provided.
13. Common property resources should be managed by people's committees with not less than 50 per cent representation of women.
14. A Status Report on Women and Livelihoods should be prepared with an emphasis on re-examining microcredit as the only strategy.
15. Individual entitlements for food and employment schemes should be separately provided to women e.g. separate ration cards, bank accounts and MGNREGS Job Cards (with 100 days of work for each individual above 18 years as promised by the government).
16. Women should be considered as separate units and not treated as constituting a unit with men within the household.
17. Women's concerns with respect to the recent negative fallout of the activities of micro-finance institutions should be taken into account.
18. Employment should be provided to stop migration; increased migration leaves women managing not just the home but also the entire agricultural work, where earlier the men folk would do some of it.
19. Migration is also pushing women into work that exploits them sexually and economically. This should be prevented.
20. A lot of women migrating out of their area in search of work end up as domestic workers working under exploitative conditions with little legal protection.
21. Economic rights should include national income accounting for care work.
22. Pension should be ensured to all old aged women, widows, women with disability and single women heading families and this should be indexed to inflation.
23. Economic and livelihood support programmes should be introduced in conflict-affected areas taking into account the special vulnerabilities of women and youth.

ii. Youth

24. Introduce career counselling in educational institutions which enables young people to explore their interests and choose a career that matches their worldview.
25. Introduce opportunities for internships and job shadowing so that young people get a first-hand exposure to the professions they are interested in pursuing.
26. Protect and promote traditional rural livelihoods so that they are recognized and valued.

27. Work with grassroots organizations to identify out-of-school youth, map their aspirations and the existing skill levels of young people in their community, design and run relevant skill training and find appropriate and fair employment opportunities.
28. Train youth facilitators to co-create a safe, youth-friendly spaces that are conducive to experimental reflection and learning. These spaces could be run by young people and be used for connecting with peers and mentors for learning new skills, discussing contemporary social issues and also for planning and initiating their own action projects or enterprises.
29. Create a regulatory and financial environment that will enable young people to start their own enterprises.
30. Reduce entry barriers for youth to start their own enterprises. This would involve removing the requirement of bank account and address for starting an enterprise, simplification of rules, dissemination information on government schemes for the informal sector and provision of seed funding.
31. Open cells at the workplace to organize informal workers so that they can get their grievances redressed. Improve safety at workplaces, especially in the informal sector.

iii. Dalits

32. Technical skill upgradation and enhancement should be according to the current market needs.
33. However, skill development should not lead to the larger admission of SCs into Industrial Training Institutes (ITI) and Polytechnics at the cost of their admission to higher education. The ratio of SCs in the relevant age group in higher education should be at par with the general ratio.
34. Dalit girls should be given priority for absorption into regular employment.
35. Special skill training programmes have to be conducted catering to the needs of different categories like non-literate (bonded labour, landless workers, construction workers, domestic workers, daily wage workers etc), literate, educated and higher educated.
36. Minimum wage payment, dignified working conditions and social security coverage must be ensured.
37. The labour standards conforming to fundamental principles and gender rights should be prescribed in the labour policy for the protection of Dalit women in the workforce,
38. Schemes such as MGNREGS, SGSY, SJSRY should be better designed and linked to the skills, capital, information and technologies required for the requirements for inclusive growth.
39. Concessions to the private sector should be linked with measures for promoting employment of marginalized sections in their enterprises through affirmative action and a policy of reservations.
40. The Ministry of MSME should allocate funds to SCP and special protection measures and market support should be given to SCs initiating enterprises. The participation of SC/ST communities in the main sectors driving the growth of the economy like information technology, services, transport, communication and finance needs to be enhanced and procedures simplified.
41. The distribution of land as a productive asset to poor Dalit households needs to be implemented more aggressively. Land should be allocated on a long lease basis to SCs along Golden Quadrilateral highways and other national and state highways. Allotment of side-plots to SCs for entrepreneurial ventures like motels, petrol pumps, service stations, truck terminals, etc. should be implemented and closely monitored with adequate redressal systems in place.
42. Reservation quotas for SCs in PSUs should be filled by SC youth and appropriate training should be given to SC youth to remove their skill gap so that these vacant quotas in PSUs and other government institutions are filled.
43. Quality training and education should be given to Dalits by government in all occupations. The place or source of earning (e.g. ponds, yards, industrial sheds etc.) should be either in government possession or should be leased to Dalit groups.

iv. Children

44. Revise curricula of schools to include vocational skills programmes for adolescents to be able to engage in sustainable livelihoods based on demands of the market.
45. Upgrade vocational training programmes and introduce new skills education in schools using the experience from existing programmes and institutions.

state-level missions for vocational education should be set up to secure children's right to a sustainable livelihood when they reach adulthood.

46. Build coordination between the National Council of Vocational Training (NCVT) and the State Councils of Vocational Training (SCVT). Clear demarcation needs to be made of the areas of functioning of the Directorate General of Employment and Training (DGET), NCVTs and SCVTs and an effective coordination mechanism needs to be developed.
47. The government must set up special concessional markets within easy access for the poor.
48. Strengthening of labour laws is one way of protecting families from vulnerability.
49. The State has to set the highest standards for the enforcement of labour laws and strengthening of agencies to ensure justice for the labouring poor.
50. Make sustainable livelihood a right of every parent so that wage security for adults will act as a strong counter-measure to child labour.
51. Integrate child labour and bonded labour prevention strategies with poverty eradication programmes. Livelihood and development initiatives should be developed so as to ensure safeguards for keeping older children in school.
52. Integrate child labour prohibition and regulation with the Right to Free and Compulsory Education and strictly enforce the ban on all child labour for children under 14 years of age.
53. The MGNREGS should be made flexible by making special provisions applicable to displaced children and communities.
54. Increased access to affordable credit (for instance through self-help groups or rural banks) would help reduce the extent of unsustainable debt which strangulates the earnings of the poor.
55. When a disaster is about to strike or in the early stages after a disaster has struck, a special MGNREGS should be implemented in order to assist those whose lives will be or have been affected.
56. The government must ensure special concessional markets with easy access for the poor.
57. Strengthening labour laws is one way of protecting families from vulnerability. The state has to set the highest standards for enforcement of laws, especially labour laws.

58. Conduct impact assessment of all development schemes with focus also on livelihoods and safety of local populations.

59. Provide institutional support/creches for child care for working parents at the work site as an integral component of employment/livelihood strategies.

v. Adolescents

60. Adolescent Resource Centres should be set up at the Panchayat level. These will function as the hubs for innovative ideas and provide comprehensive counselling services ranging from health related issues to career counselling, offer vocational skills-building programmes and life skills building-programmes for out of school adolescents. The vocational skills development programmes should be linked to markets and therefore to employment security. These centres will also provide adolescent-friendly information.

vi. Adivasis

61. Creation of Gramin Gyan Kendras to serve as banks of local knowledge and prevent the patenting of knowledge and products by outsiders.
62. Planning should be done at the gram sabha level based on local knowledge and resources.
63. ITIs that are being opened in Adivasi areas should offer courses that enhance local skills such as bamboo craft, iron smithy etc.
64. Inclusion of people with traditional knowledge in the state and district planning boards should be made mandatory.
65. Establish institutional power for conservation of common property resources through women's collectives by setting up full time environment protection committees at the Panchayat level.
66. Promotion of the plantation of traditional plants (like mahua, char, sarai, khamhar etc.) in forestry projects along with the security of Nistar Rights of the local community.
67. Enactment of a Minimum Land Holding Act for de-notified nomadic tribes, pastoral and semi-pastoral communities for sustaining their livelihood.

vii. Transgenders

68. There is a government order from the Andhra Pradesh Minority Welfare Department which states that hijras are to be considered a minority and welfare schemes are to be devised for them. A recent newspaper clipping also states that all adult eunuchs in Delhi, India will be given pensions of Rs. 1000 per month in recognition of their low status by the local government. There is an urgent need for more such social protection and welfare schemes for needy transgenders and hijras.
69. Adequate outreach and communication is required to enable these welfare services to reach the most marginalized and vulnerable. The National Skills Mission and other concerned authorities should be directed to open up existing schemes to transgenders and put in requisite safe guards to ensure inclusion and full participation of these groups.
70. Development agencies must provide new opportunities for transgender-hijras in their programmes as this will in the true sense contribute to the 12th Five Year Plan's goal of inclusive and sustainable growth.

viii. Migrants

71. Set up an institutional mechanism for registration of migrant workers at the Panchayat/Urban Local Body level at the source and the destination areas.
72. Create a computerized database of migrant workers based on the data obtained from the above registration process.
73. The Inter-State Migrant Workers Act should be amended to accord with prevailing realities with clear guidelines for implementation at the local level.
74. The Unique Identity (UID) Authority should integrate its project with organizations working with migrant workers across the country to ensure that migrant workers are fully covered.
75. The UID should be linked to provision of services like education, banking for savings, credit and remittances, health and PDS.
76. Benefits of unorganized sector welfare boards and/or schemes should be made available to migrant workers also in the destination areas.
77. Enable voting in elections for migrant workers.
78. The Census enumeration should be made more sensitive to increased mobility of rural populations.

79. Interstate validity of identity and entitlement documents such as ration cards or other valid IDs should be ensured so that migrant workers can access social benefit schemes in destination states.
80. Formalise the payment of wages to migrant workers through banks to address payment-related issues and implementation of programmes for financial inclusion of migrant workers.
81. A migrant workers relief fund should be set up to cover all sectors of unorganized work, both at the national and the state level.
82. There should be an urban employment guarantee scheme on the lines of the MG NREGS for migrant workers.
83. The living and working conditions of migrant workers should be monitored by the government, trade unions, the media and NGOs.
84. Assistance/information centres for migrants and their families should be established.
85. A National Migrant Labour helpline on the lines of the Child Line should be established.
86. Appropriate amendments where necessary and effective implementation of the following acts is required—Minimum Wages Act, 1948, Inter State Migrant Workman (Regulation of Employment and Conditions of Service) Act 1979, Building and other Construction Workers (Regulation of Employment) Act 1996, Building & Other Construction Workers Welfare Cess Act 1996, Contract Labour (Regulation and Abolition) Act 1970, Emigration Act 1983 and Emigration (Amendment) Rules 2009.
87. Benefits of the Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana (RSBY) should be made portable and made available to migrant labour.
88. Establish a National Overseas Manpower Corporation to handle recruitment processes in a safe manner for overseas migrants.
89. Establish a Labour Attaché at Indian Embassies at destination countries.
90. In order to overcome lack of awareness, the demand letter, power of attorney and the terms of contract should be made available in the local language to migrants going overseas.
91. There should be a mechanism for timely redressal of grievances.

92. Bilateral and multilateral agreements should be negotiated with destination countries to ensure safety of overseas migrants.
93. Migrant Resource Centres should be established in all states.
94. There should be resettlement and re-integration programmes for returnees from work overseas.

ix. North East

95. The social capital of the region should be taken into account while planning for employment generation. In Nagaland it is in the sphere of community health. Similarly, other parts of the region should invest in appropriate, people driven schemes.
96. Promotion of ethno-tourism would enhance the earning capacities of the local people and also contribute to the preservation and promotion of ethnic cultures.
97. There has to be professional skills building of the local populace in management of the entertainment and hospitality industry and various facets of eco-tourism like popularising ethnic cuisines, publishing travel booklets and folk and general histories of the area in order to attract inter-state and foreign tourists.
98. Investing in the development of locally managed areas like river banks and environmentally green areas in the foothills as well as the hills and consolidating the region's territorial integrity with India. Arunachal Pradesh is a case in point. The NEC had in September 2004 at Shillong emphasized the potential of ethno-tourism in a discussion between the Chief Secretaries of the north eastern states and the Secretary of the Ministry of Development of the North Eastern Region.

x. Conflict

99. Skill training should be an integral part of the school education system. The PPP model has the potential to achieve this even in rural areas. This would ensure that students who are not able to pursue their education after the 8th standard that is mandated according to the RTE should be able to find some skilled work which can help them in their sustenance.

100. The curricula need to be revised and should be made more relevant to help in opening up more job opportunities. The existing curricula needs to be checked from time to time for its relevance and the changes should be incorporated quickly before they become outdated again.
101. Communication and soft skills training is required by the retailing/service sectors that are booming. Appropriate investments in these fields will make rural areas competent to connect with global markets.
102. Further training to workers who already have some skills would lead to greater productivity.
103. Increased allocations should be made to promote distance education programmes, use of modern training technologies, e-learning, web based learning etc. This can prevent migration from rural to urban areas and also bring education and skill enhancement opportunities to a larger number of people, especially the marginalized.
104. Capacity building should be done in rural areas as well. The focus should not only remain on building of IITs and IIMs but also on developing ITIs and institutions oriented to training in agriculture, horticulture and rural livelihoods. It is equally important to nurture the abundant rural talent lying untapped.
105. The traditional employments should be focused on and efforts be made to expand and promote them. Agro-based employment opportunities should be promoted. This shall also help in decreasing the migration from rural to urban areas.
106. Provisions should be made to promote institutions and mechanisms that respect and promote local and traditional knowledge systems.
107. There is an urgent need to review the character of and support for ITIs, polytechnics and rural-based institutions.
108. There should be adequate provisions for scholarships, stipends and hostel facilities for students of all such institutions in both urban and rural areas.
109. Special provisions should be made for imparting English language and computer skills at all such institutions.
110. Provisions should also be made for facilities and infrastructure at all these institutions in both rural and urban areas to enable them to deliver competencies

in line with nationally and internationally recognized standards as in the case of IITs and IIMs.

111. Increasingly people are getting work much below their education or skills. This not only leads to underemployment but generates frustration and could result in socially undesirable results. Thus, there should be provision of appropriate and gainful employment or compensation in lieu thereof for every adult who is willing to work.
112. Greater reliance on self-employment and entrepreneurship needs to be planned and provided for.
113. The variety of jobs must be increased and focus should also be given on promoting new emerging occupations. This will lead to more employment opportunities.
114. Placement and post-placement help should be provided to people.
115. Dignity and equality of labour should be considered while planning employment programmes. Due recognition, status and appropriate remuneration should be accorded for manual work.
116. Minimum wages need to be revised and revisited and the Planning Commission should ensure due observance of stipulated minimum wage rates and basic social security norms, particularly in the case of outsourced and informal sector employment.
117. Economic and livelihood support programmes should be introduced in conflict-affected areas with special regard to the vulnerabilities of women and youth.
118. Psycho-social support should be provided to the employees of the outsourced and informal sectors. Job safety, working environment, pay scale and terminal benefits are a matter of concern for employees in these sectors. Exploitation of people employed in both these sectors needs to be checked.
119. The planning authorities also needs to look into the issue of lop sided development. People migrate to the cities, often unwillingly, for survival. Because of lack of employment opportunities they have no option but to migrate. Schemes like the MGNREGS should be implemented throughout the country and employment should be provided throughout the year. Migration should be understood as a class phenomenon and lower-class people should be provided housing.

xi. Muslims

120. Appropriate directions should be given to the concerned authorities to provide employment to Muslims proportionate to their size in the population of the area under the rural employment and entrepreneurship programmes.
121. Credit should be given to Muslims from financial institutions, banks and various corporations for self-employment, micro-enterprises and small and medium scale industries. Measures may, therefore, be taken for enhancing credit to Muslims in Priority Sector Advances. Any shortfall in achievement of targeted amount in minority-specific programmes should be parked with National Minorities Development and the Finance Corporation. Specific programmes should be funded with this amount. Separate co-operative societies and co-operative banks should be started for various Muslim artisanal groups especially for women. Formalities for registration for all these institutions and allotments of necessary funds to support these institutions should be made easier.
122. More branches of banks should be opened in Muslim-concentration areas.
123. A policy to enhance the participation of minorities in the micro-credit schemes of the National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development (NABARD) should be laid down. This policy should spell out the intervention required by NABARD through a mix of target and incentive schemes based on the population percentage of Muslims in the village to enhance the participation of Muslims in micro-credit.
124. Introduce a social security system for self-employed persons in the informal sector, especially home-based workers.
125. Policies to increase representation of Muslims on the boards of directors of public financial institutions, insurance companies and public sector units should be put in place.
126. Special schemes to ensure housing for poorer sections of the Muslim community may be started. Special schemes may also be formulated for allotment of shops, PDS outlets, petrol pumps and gas agencies to Muslim youth.
127. Industries should be set up and opportunities for work created in areas of Muslim concentration to enable them to get employment.

128. The Small Industries Development Bank of India (SIDBI) should set aside a dedicated fund for training of minorities under its Entrepreneurial Development Programme.
129. Comprehensive human resource development initiatives and policies should be formulated in a time bound manner.
130. Sensitisation and training of local government officials for the allocation of government schemes in an unbiased manner.
131. Increase budgetary allocation to ensure proper development of the 90 Muslim concentration districts that have been identified.
132. Include rural skilled activity under the MGNREGS to provide employment opportunity to Muslims. Most rural Muslims are traditionally involved in skilled activity.
133. Under the Food Security Act, include all Muslims along with Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes as beneficiaries.

xii. PLHIV

134. The PLHIV as well as affected family members including children should be provided a special status. This special status will provide priority and waiver of administrative requirements for availing state- and centre-sponsored social welfare schemes and entitlements. Experience suggests that lack of knowledge and information at both the beneficiary and provider levels a big problem and this should be rectified through information, education and communication campaigns.
135. Special schemes and entitlements can be made available nationally, following examples from Rajasthan, Gujarat and Tamil Nadu. For example, conditional cash transfers to support travel to access healthcare, OVC funds etc.
136. Ensure priority and access to women living with HIV in both urban and rural settings with regard to economic opportunities, poverty alleviation programmes, access to credit, employment, development of skills and leadership. The priority should be given to making available existing opportunities as well as developing special ones.

xiii. People with Disability

137. People with Disability (PWD) should be engaged in MGNREGS work and there should be a separate job identification for them.
138. The list of jobs for PWDs under MGNREGS has to be reviewed (as followed in Andhra Pradesh). MGNREGS-related work should be made barrier-free.
139. There should be increased access for skilled workers under the MGNREGS.
140. The coverage has to be increased and funds meant for PWDs should not be diverted.
141. There is lack of representation of PWD in the bodies related to decision making (right from the Panchayat Raj Institutions)
142. The infrastructure being built through MGNREGS should be accessible to PWD.
143. The National Rural Livelihoods Mission should be made PWD-friendly.
144. Reasonable accommodation should be provided to PWD.
145. There should be a special focus on skill development for PWD in the mainstream set up.
146. Involvement of family members in skill development should be encouraged and incentives given to parents to take disabled children to their workplace.
147. Employment and skill development in non conventional fields like film-making, media technology, art and culture etc. should be explored.

3

Managing the Environment

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM THE DISCUSSION GROUPS RELATED TO CHILDREN, YOUTH, DALITS, NORTH EAST, CONFLICT, ADOLESCENTS, ADIVASIS, AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY.

Managing the Environment

Section Contents

Context	35
Children	35
Youth	35
Dalits	36
Adivasis	36
Adolescents	37

Specific Recommendations	38
Youth	38
Children	39
Adolescents	39
Dalits	40
Adivasis	40
North East	40
Conflict	41
People with Disability	41

1. Context

i. Children

The Preamble to the Constitution of India ensures rights to all citizens to a clean environment. Due to the global economic slowdown, attention and political will for tackling climate change and managing environmental issues like land, minerals, forests, water, waste and pollution and water has flagged dangerously. As the world's average temperature rises year on year, the sea level also rises and the number of natural disasters increases. The poorest and most marginalised continue to suffer the brunt of these adverse changes in climate. A global 'Green Revolution' is required with individual states taking long term decisions to ensure that future generations live in a clean and safe environment. Children must be central to all strategies which affect the environment because they are the ones who will face the consequences of policy decisions made today. Unless we make dramatic changes in how we use energy, water, land and forests, we will lose the development gains of the past and risk our own children's future.

ii. Youth

There is rampant abuse of nature on which the survival of human beings depends and especially of the youth (irrespective of position, community, region). Considering the fact that the Right to Life gets precedence over the Right to Development, our economic policies (and all industrial

project proposals) should adhere to environmental laws and regulations before even being considered for discussion or implementation. We take this stand because human survival is not dependent on industries of the modern world and alternative ways to give jobs to youth and create value in the economy can still be promoted.

The inhabitants of areas in natural settings (including animals, birds, etc.) and their rights are not considered before imposing economic decisions of urban human beings on them. Natural areas also contribute to the economy through ecological balance and tourism. This imposition of the economic will of a few urban people on the vast majority of rural people is not a symbol of a progressive society.

Communities have always been identified by their culture arising out of their interaction with their natural surroundings. Natural resources must not be viewed separately from the rights of communities living harmoniously with them. Economic and social planning for the country must start with this premise. Repeated displacement and migration due to various factors will give rise to a populace with little connection with the environment as it is not their own, thus making it even more difficult in the future to regulate their behaviour.

There is a refusal to acknowledge and use traditional knowledge and practices which can provide alternatives to products, services and professions and reduce environmental degradation. Even if there are alternatives, there is a lack of promotion of and awareness about these.

The education system we have inherited from the pre-Independence era has created several problems for the culture. In the context of the environment, this system does not encourage rural/semi-urban students to choose professions that involve direct interaction with the environment such as farming, pottery and poultry. It also does not give them dignity in being who they are and creates unsustainable aspirations of becoming city-dwellers. Urban students also do not have any motivation to take up such professions or readily consider nature conservation as a preference.

Indian environmental legislation, already inadequate and lacunae-ridden, is ignored to accommodate industrial interests. Industry and enterprise must be promoted but their scale, impact and tendency to benefit a few individuals at the expense of society and the environment must be kept in check. A particular stratum of society can create value for the country only for a limited time. In the long term interest of the nation, other strata should also be given their share. The elite stratum is consuming more than their share due to the lack of disincentives and of redistribution of wealth through appropriate mechanisms.

We have been defensive and reactive in our approach to climate change even though sustainable means of living that can create economic value have always been present in India. The growing energy and food crisis can only be compounded by climate change. The recent World Energy Outlook report has clearly stated that world oil production had peaked in 2006. But our oil imports continue to increase residly and unsustainably. This will have a major influence on our transport industry that runs on a fast depleting resource and an even bigger impact on food production which depends heavily on pesticides and fertilizers derived from fossil fuels. Some of the most progressive plans of the Indian government have not been very successful in their implementation at the grassroots. Rampant corruption and flawed business models have to be tackled effectively by strengthened communities in addition to the direct intervention of the government.

iii. Dalits

Discussions in the recent Copenhagen and the earlier Rio summits of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change have clearly brought out the threat to the livelihoods of vulnerable communities across the world. India has greater responsibility and should evolve long-term plans with adequate budget allocations to protect its vulnerable communities. Instead of this the laws and

policies being followed by the Government of India are exposing millions of Dalits and Advasis to environmental disasters. Whether it is the Wildlife Protection Act or the Environment Protection Act or the Forest Rights Act or the Wetlands Conservation Act, Dalits have no right over the ecosystems in which they have been living for generations. The shifts in the rainfall pattern have increased the debt burden on these communities. Whether it is floods or drought, people are not only experiencing the price increase in essential commodities but also several other difficulties. These are the additional costs of rebuilding houses, the lost days of work and schooling, the increasing difficulty of the collection of fuel-wood by women, the difficulty of survival in severe droughts or floods and migration in search of livelihoods. It is a known fact that farmers get compensation from the government after a flood or drought whereas agriculture labourers, who are mostly Dalits, are abandoned to fend for themselves. The planning process should be able to estimate these additional burdens while making plans. It should dynamically change and enable Dalits to meet the challenges of nature. Science and technology should predict natural disasters, estimate losses, estimate the requirement of basic needs and ensure that these are met. The planning process for emergency relief should have wider consultations with vulnerable communities.

Communities which are dwelling in national parks and sanctuaries for centuries are being evicted. Anthropological evidence show that these communities have been living in the same habitat as a part and not as a threat. Hence, instead of evicting communities from these areas, the 12th Five Year Plan should try to encourage them to be part of the environmental protection process. Government should invest 60 per cent of the profits from the marketing of natural products to improve their livelihoods. If such measures are initiated in the 12th Five Year Plan, the communities living in national parks and sanctuaries will become their foremost protectors.

iv. Adivasis

The non-implementation of the Panchayat Extension to Scheduled Areas Act (rules for which have not been formulated in most states), the rapid depletion of resources critical to their livelihoods due to industrialization and mining and the poor implementation of the Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Rights) Act are the glaring problems with regard to the situation of Adivasis which adversely impacts the

environment also. Harassment and evictions by the forest department which operates without adequate checks and balances and the diversion of agriculture and forest land for non-agriculture and non-forest use and large scale denial of community rights constitutes another problem area. This has led to increasing conflict compounded by the poor functioning of the Adivasi Development Departments in the states and poor utilisation of Tribal Sub Plan allocations.

v. Adolescents

There is a dearth of initiatives to promote the involvement of adolescents in managing the environment. There are very few sensitization programmes for adolescents relating to the environment.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Youth

1. Environmental sensitivity needs to be internalised in the daily operations of lakhs of corporations in the country.
2. Environmental compliance should be made part of company law with verification through annual report submission and huge penalties for non-compliance.
3. Companies must submit proposals to start a new factory, product or service with environmental concerns embedded in the project plan. These proposals must be evaluated with environment as the first criteria followed by their value addition to society as a whole.
4. Industries and commercial establishments should be asked to pay sufficiently for groundwater use and this too should be restricted to a specified depth suitable to local conditions.
5. Water is recognized as the next on the list of scarce resources after coal and oil. Water, being a state subject, should be made mandatory by state governments to harvest rainwater in urban, rural and industrial areas.
6. People's ownership over local resources should be acknowledged and whenever the government or industry proposes a change in resource use, they must be consulted. Allocation of land and other resources to development projects must be done only with adequate explanation to the people on the absolute necessity of the project. Public hearings should be held for each project with video documentation. Plans for alternate residence, civic amenities, and livelihoods for the displaced should be drawn up before hand.
7. Research and development must be promoted in the field of environment-friendly technologies as well as to enhance and adapt existing methodologies to the changing times.
8. Government support must also be given to long-standing practices in agriculture, forestry, people-friendly urban management, fooding, clothing, etc.
9. The age-old way of life in India that is being increasingly eroded needs attention at the highest level as India's traditional economy and ethics are based on that. The education system needs to be aligned to bring in harmonious living and professional choices in young and entrepreneurial minds. The National Curriculum Framework 2005 also aims to meet this objective and should be implemented.
10. The gaps in the implementation of environmental laws and rules cost the country in various ways and give away the country's wealth on a platter for the short-term benefit of a limited few. These gaps should be identified and best practices adopted from successful countries for their elimination. Enforcement must be combined with incentives to ensure compliance.
11. The money collected through taxes and part of the revenue from PSVs should be utilised to provide accessible, affordable, and safe resources (such as air, water, shelter and public transport) to each person in the country. This should be along with a cap on maximum utilisation per household to avoid misuse of essential resources and services such as water, cooking fuel, health, wood, shelter, etc.
12. Redistribution of wealth through carbon tax or other mechanisms should be done for equitable carbon footprint.
13. India has taken a progressive step through its National Action Plan on Climate Change but more needs to be done in addressing the existential issues of food and energy in a resource depleting environment. Mitigation and adaptation strategies should be strengthened through R&D in crop yield, impacts of climate change, organic farming, backyard and rooftop farming for local food production.
14. Improvement of the public transport system with induction of clean energy vehicles so as to reduce the burden on non-renewable fossil fuels.
15. Renewable energy options should be promoted in a decentralised manner in all states for all residential and commercial set-ups with Gram Sabha or Resident Welfare Associations as stakeholders.
16. The capacity of local communities, women and youth should be developed to ensure transparency and effectiveness of the government's environment policies. Environmental Impact Assessment is crucial for people's involvement in project evaluation and often the task is handled by consultants. However, building capacity of local youth and women to perform their own basic EIA can go a long way in

developing an understanding of natural resources and impacts. Other tools like Right to Information Act, local schools for clean and efficient energy, etc. can support communities in meeting their needs.

ii. Children

17. All curricula beginning from the primary to the higher education level must include environmental education related to the conservation of water, the use of natural resources, pollution, the need to limit consumption and mitigation of and adaptation to climate change.
18. The village committees, Panchayat Raj Institutions, Gram Sabhas and district development authorities should play a critical role in the decision making processes relating to climate change action. They must be empowered to develop mitigation and adaption programmes and policies and then carry out their implementation.
19. The existing disaster management framework, including the Disaster Management Act must be implemented immediately with specific interventions for children.
20. India and its neighbours, particularly Bangladesh, Sri Lanka and the Maldives, must collaborate at the international and national level to develop relocation and rehabilitation plans to cope with the growing number of environmental refugees. Particular focus should be put on children and their need for stability, education, health and protection.
21. The Right to Life as enshrined in the Indian Constitution is directly related to clean water and sanitation and with 400,000 children dying of diarrhoea every year, action is needed immediately to stop these preventable deaths. An infrastructure project on the scale of our road building project for improving water resources and providing all children with clean water in a time bound period of two years should be implemented. Water and sanitation should be considered a fundamental human right and this should be reflected in comprehensive legislation at the national and state levels.
22. Replacing mixed forests (capable of sustaining Adivasi livelihoods) with single product-farming should be avoided as evidence shows that this increases food insecurity, child-stunting malnutrition and infant and child mortality.
23. Children's right to a clean environment and health are severely impaired by the lack of institutional waste management systems and the increase in pollution and untreated hazardous waste that industrialisation has brought with it.
24. The government should fund mass general awareness campaigns to reduce pollution caused by wrongful waste disposal. These campaigns should have a strong focus on children as they are the future of the country and are capable of bringing about change.
25. The Child Labour Prohibition and Regulation Act must be implemented and those employing children in waste management should be punished under the law.
26. The millions of unorganised sector workers involved in collecting and selling waste should be employed by government agencies and the waste management system should be institutionalised. Furthermore, an integrated approach towards waste management should be adopted so as to ensure that hazardous waste does not pollute rivers, ground water and the environment.
27. All children, no matter whether they are Adivasi children from the forests of Jharkhand, Dalit children from rural Rajasthan or children from conflict-ridden areas like the North East or Chhattisgarh, who have been forced into child labour in mines should be rescued and provided with proper environmental habitats and facilities. The government should end forced displacement by revising the Land Acquisition Amendment Bill 2007 by taking into consideration child rights. There is also a need to adequately define 'public purpose' and the provisions for grievance redressal.
28. Sustainable food security is a major challenge if hunger and malnutrition are to be overcome. Food security involves strengthening the livelihood security of all members of a household by ensuring both physical and economic access to a balanced diet. The food should originate from efficient and environmentally-friendly production technologies that conserve and enhance the natural resource base of crops, farm animals, forestry and inland and marine fisheries.

iii. Adolescents

29. Adolescents need to be sensitized towards the environmental issues and involved in actions like

preservation of forest, water management and so on. This can be integrated into the Life Skills Education modules and be implemented through curriculum for school-going adolescents and through adolescent resource centres for out-of-school adolescents.

iv. Dalits

30. Protection and conservation of the environment, forests and natural resources should be done with the active participation of indigenous people.
31. Displacement and alienation of land, forest and the resources of indigenous people should be avoided.
32. Disaster mitigation should be through environmental protection involving indigenous people and their methods
33. Mining of minor minerals should be entrusted to indigenous people.
34. The land that is taken for development projects or mining should be taken only on lease for 30 years or a maximum of 50 years and must be returned to the people in a cultivable condition.
35. A comprehensive rehabilitation and resettlement policy ensuring life and livelihood of indigenous people should be drawn up before embarking on a development project.
36. The traditional rights of the indigenous people over land, forests and natural resources should be respected and protected through comprehensive laws and guidelines of the Planning Commission.
37. The indigenous people have to be taken as co-investors in development projects and ensured of royalty from all production and profit because land and natural resources are their primary assets.

v. Adivasis

38. Rules for the PESA Act and its implementation should be formulated by all states. Allocation of central funds to states that fail to do so should be withheld.
39. A White Paper should be released on the status of implementation of the PESA Act as reported by the governors of states.
40. Time-bound implementation of the Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forestdwellers (Recognition of

Rights) Act (2006) (FRA) should be ensured under the sole legal authority of the Adivasi Welfare Department (currently, the interference of the Forest Department is misleading the settlement process).

41. Withdrawal of false cases of forest offences registered against Adivasi people in the light of the FRA settlement process.
42. Minimum Support Prices must be stipulated for all forest produce and rural marketing institutions in Adivasi areas must be strengthened.
43. The responsibility for determining and awarding compensation for acquired common property lands and forest lands should be given to the Gram Sabha instead of the Revenue Department (as practised currently).
44. Central Water Commission guidelines for the use of water should be reviewed and then enforced (creation of appropriate mechanism for compliance to water usage rules).
45. Sharing of 26 per cent profit from mining and industry (proposed under the new Mining Policy) should be adopted. A mechanism that allows the Gram Sabhas to use the money for community work should be put in place.
46. Conversion of Gram Panchyat into Urban Municipalities in 5th Schedule areas is illegal and should be banned. A paper on the current status in this regard should be prepared and guidelines for the future should be laid out.
47. There should be a ban on the conversion of agricultural land for non-agricultural purposes (like Jatropha plantation, urbanization etc).

vi. North East

48. There should be a plan for creation of Wilderness Zones to promote bio-diversity of the region.
49. Technical assistance should be given for achieving optimal utilization of river navigation (especially for dredging specific channels of the Brahmaputra River which is designated as National Waterway No 2). This will promote river-based, environment-friendly and cost-effective bulk transportation that will benefit river bank communities by spurring local economies.
50. Sustainable water management by popularizing rainwater harvesting should be encouraged.

51. A critical study of the region's carrying capacity has to be carried out before any further mega projects are undertaken. Current mega dam projects should be stopped in the region until then.
52. Alternative sources of renewable energy like mini hydel projects should be considered.
53. Community forest rights have to be respected.
54. All existing laws enacted by the Government/ State Government/autonomous councils/traditional institutions for the protection of lands, forests and water resources should be monitored strictly and implemented fully. Scope for review should be given in this process to civil society organizations and stakeholders living in the neighbouring areas.

vii. Conflict

55. The parameters of ownership of natural resources and their access, control and management have to be reviewed. Natural resources such as forests, minerals and water are limited in nature. Hence, allocation and utilization of land and land-based scarce resources should be planned only on a social basis and not as privately owned resources.
56. In all cases where natural resources are the very basis of the sustenance of communities, these should not be treated as marketed goods and they should not be acquired through compensation computed through the usual method of 'market' value.
57. The land mafia should be prevented from growing.
58. The Forest Department should release land held by them to the Gram Sabhas immediately.
59. The acquisition of Adivasi and rural lands under the Land Acquisition Act 1894, particularly after Independence under the pretext of 'public purpose', has in many cases been a clear abuse of the Act. Much of the land thus acquired has been usurped for private use, indirectly as in the case of urban colonies and even directly for private profiteering such as in the case of private industries, mining by private companies, and commercial complexes. This should be avoided.
60. Ownership of land should remain with the farmers and not with the state or any other intermediary; this shall provide them with a sense of security needed for a happy and protected living

61. Land which is lying idle should be put to constructive use.

viii. People with Disability

62. Land, mining and forest rights – these are countering each other (say mining and land/forest rights)– land/ forest rights should also include that of disabled citizens.
63. Rehabilitation strategies should not overlook the specific needs of PWD affecting their livelihoods (especially as there are many PWD whose livelihoods like those of others are based on the forest).
64. Due to existing inequities and disparities, PWD face a disproportionate impact from climate change. They could participate in strategies to conserve the climate and to mitigate climate change.
65. PWD and their families need adaptation and coping strategies and robust systems and mechanisms that can mitigate and minimise the harmful effects of climate change, and promote sustainable access to basic necessities, secure livelihoods, health care, and social and civic participation.

4

Markets for Efficiency and Inclusion

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM THE
DISCUSSION GROUPS RELATED TO CHILDREN, DALITS
AND THE NORTH EAST

Markets for Efficiency and Inclusion

Section Contents

Context 45

Dalits 45

Specific Recommendations 46

Dalits 46

Children 46

North East 46

1. Context

i. Dalits

The liberalisation reforms initiated in 1991 were aimed at increasing market efficiency to increase employment and economic growth. Foreign direct investment (FDI) in the capital and consumer goods sectors as well as generation and provision of international and national services were sought to be encouraged. The 10th Five Year Plan brought about a substantial increase in overall growth of GDP at 7.74 per cent per annum with 9.2 per cent industrial and 9.3 per cent service sector growth rates (Mid Term Review, 2010). However, inequalities between Dalits and non-Dalits continue. In 2004-05, 48 per cent Dalits were employed as casual workers and only 12 per cent Dalits were regularly employed as against 24 per cent in the non SC/ST/OBC castes (Annual Report on Employment, Government of India, 2010). Liberalisation has resulted in a drastic reduction in the growth of government employment, undermining the current reservation policy that ensures social justice. There is considerable resistance to the introduction of reservation in the private sector.

Post-liberalisation industrial policies at the national and state levels have led to the dismantling of many of the labour provisions associated with decent work and human rights. Employers are resorting to 'flexible solutions'. Economists have argued that growth has not resulted in sufficient number of opportunities for 'decent work' with the bulk of

employment being in low productivity activity in 'uncertain and oppressive' working conditions (Chandrasekhar and Ghosh, 2007). The majority of Dalits fall in this category.

There have not been adequate efforts to create capital assets to promote the market participation of Dalits. Specific communities among Dalits like safai karmachari, musahar community and other specific groups are particularly disadvantaged in both employment and economic terms.

Current market approach and the tardy implementation of schemes and programmes of entitlements and provisions have not given space and strength to emerging SC entrepreneurs, marginal workers, farm and non-farm labours, educated rural and urban SCs, youth and women. The demographic dividend among SCs has to be harnessed through various safeguards and affirmative action for participation in the labour market and contribution to the country's economic development.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Dalits

1. Recognise and address discrimination in the market: the social frame of caste based discrimination is reflected in both organized and unorganized markets of land, agriculture, housing and services. These need to be addressed through awareness-building among workers, promoting human and labour rights education and setting up bodies within industries to address caste-based discrimination.
2. Affirmative action in the private sector should be made mandatory. The private sector depends on natural and public resources contributed by the citizens at large. Given the barriers for Dalits to engage and benefit from the emerging private market, reservation and other affirmative measures should be implemented in the private sector market. Marketing outlets at the village, panchayat, block and district should be reserved for SCs/STs in proportion to their population. There should be reservation in marketing boards to promote participation of Dalit businessmen/entrepreneurs at each level.
3. Outsourcing and contractual work has increased manifold, replacing regular employment in both the private and public sector. Dalits should be supported and trained to undertake such contractual and outsourced work both from the public and the private sector. The strategy of establishing marketing and procurement cooperative societies of Dalits/Adivasis at the block level should be adopted as to make markets more inclusive and efficient.
4. Given the great diversity in market employment in terms of remuneration, social security and labour welfare, common national and state-level standards for the above should be evolved and instituted across the market for all workers.
5. Special support systems to access capital must be set up for Dalits. The definition of entrepreneurs should be widened to include many other businesses where SCs are involved. The National Scheduled Castes Finance and Development Corporation and the National Safai Karmchari Finance Development Corporation should be revamped with targeted interventions and proper accountability measures. Employment exchanges

should provide market information and support in curbing discrimination etc. Creating spaces and places such as Ambedkar Town Hall etc. in each city as a facilitation and resource centre for Dalit/Adivasi entrepreneurs.

6. Establish an Equal Opportunity Commission as already recommended by the expert committee.

ii. Children

7. Steps need to be taken to prevent migration. These should include steps to ensure that local markets do not get undermined by government and commercial enterprises. Instead, the locals need to be encouraged to take up local skills and products and turn their trade into viable business opportunities.
8. Children being the cheapest and least demanding workers are more susceptible to exploitation than all others. Labour laws need to be strengthened to ensure child protection and equitable wages for their parents. Labour laws also need to be made more effective in general because for every labourer exploited, the children in his/her family are bound to suffer the consequences.
9. The recent trend of high-end products replacing the market of products and services that are more affordable and intrinsic to the needs of the larger segment of the population has restricted the accessibility of the poor consumer to his/her most basic needs. The state needs to take steps to control this radical makeover of the Indian consumer market and instead promote businesses that rely on economies of scale at the local level to generate profits.
10. It is strongly recommended that all services aimed at fulfilling children's rights should be dispensed solely by the government and the PPP model should not be made use of here because it is the state that can ensure that fulfilment of children's rights remains the first priority of the service as against a usually indifferent third-party service provider.

iii. North East

11. Cold storages have to be set up in large numbers for perishable agricultural and horticultural items produced in abundance in the region and proper marketing and air transport support provided for their export to the rest of India and abroad.

5

Decentralisation, Empowerment and Information

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM THE DISCUSSION GROUPS RELATED TO CHILDREN, DALITS, THE NORTH EAST, YOUTH, ADIVASIS, ADOLESCENTS, TRANSGENDERS, CONFLICT, MUSLIMS, WOMEN, ELDERLY, MIGRANTS, PLHIV, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY AND DECENTRALISATION COMMUNITY

Decentralisation, Empowerment and Information

Section Contents

Context	49
Decentralisation Community	49
Women	49
Youth	50
Dalits	50
Adivasis	51
North East	51

Specific Recommendations	52
Decentralisation Community	52
Women	54
Youth	56
Dalits	57
Adivasis	58
North East	59
Children	60
Transgenders	62
Conflicts	64
Adolescents	64
Migrants	65
Elderly	65
Migrants	66
PLHIV	67
People with Disabilities	68

1. Context

i. Decentralisation Community

Decentralized governance should form the basis for the overall approach of the 12th Five Year Plan. The structure and status of decentralized governance is not uniform and homogenous across the country. Recommendations in the relevant chapters of the 2nd Administrative Reforms Commission (ARC) and the Commission on Centre-State Relations should be the basis for implementation of uniform decentralised governance. The roles of various players and institutions in decentralized governance including that of the state and Central governments has to be made clear. Local governments should be treated as governments and not as agencies of development. Urban governance requires immediate focus considering the huge increase in urbanisation. The PESA needs to be revisited, restructured and implemented in letter and spirit. Efforts to study the diversities and strengthen decentralized and democratic governance in the North-Eastern region, which itself is not homogenous, is required.

A roadmap for ensuring devolution and effective decentralized governance has to be prepared and implemented, jointly with the state governments. By the end of the 12th Plan, every local government should have in place an organizational structure, with office, staff and well defined systems. Mandatory taxation powers and other resource mobilization powers have to be given to

the local governments. This also includes the completion and implementation of activity mapping, a detailed functional mapping, review of the status of conforming and contradictory legislations at the state and Central levels etc. This roadmap should also focus on social justice and local economic development as key mandates of local governments. It is here that institutions like Nyaya Panchayats, missions/programmes on health, livelihoods, food security, employment etc should be integrated with the local government processes. Through all these, inclusion of the excluded can be addressed which in turn will build a vibrant grassroots democracy. The Planning Commission has to oversee the implementation of this roadmap. There should be some simple, minimum, measurable indicators of decentralized governance. The role of the state governments in all these processes should not be undermined.

Ensuring social justice is one of the objectives of the 73rd Constitutional Amendment Act. However, a lot needs to be done to achieve this objective. The local governments have to be facilitated to make them oriented towards social justice.

ii. Women

The report of the Committee on the Status of Women in India set up by the Government of India in 1974 stated that women are not adequately represented in decision-making positions and so there is a need to consider affirmative action that provide women an opportunity to

enter critical leadership positions. This demand translated into reservations introduced in local governing bodies with the enactment of the 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendments. But it has not been easy for women as elected leaders, with a backlash from powerful local leaders, corruption, and criminalisation of politics. They are facing tremendous challenges to be effective leaders. Women do not have access to and control over resources and this makes their position vulnerable.

The Women's Bill for reservation in the upper echelons of political governance has still not become a reality despite the struggle of the past 14 years. It has only been passed in the Rajya Sabha, but unless both Houses pass it, it cannot become an Act. This clearly shows the lack of political will to give women the power and the space to govern so that the political climate and policies governing people's life can be engendered with women's perspective. They are seen as vote banks and not as a significant political resource. Women continue to face various obstacles in the political sphere at all levels.

Statistics from across the country show that violence against women is on the increase, both in the public and private sphere. The forms of violence are also changing with the changing socio-economic and political climate. Violence in conflict-ridden regions is increasing and is not being given the attention it deserves, as the focus is on the larger political dynamics. In such situations, women and children become the worst targets of all forms of violence. Violence is not just physical, it is also mental; it is discrimination and denial in different forms. It is a threat to survival, and a violation of women's rights. Commodification of women and other impediments infringe on their right to live with dignity and equality.

Women are not a homogenous group and therefore are subjected to caste, ethnic and other forms of discrimination. They face different forms of violence due to the communalisation of politics. Patriarchal and feudal controls continue to chain women and it is not easy for them to be public leaders in the absence of an enabling environment within the family, society and community. To ensure and promote women's effective participation and leadership in decision making positions and as elected representatives, there is a need to address a range of issues.

The approach taken by the Planning Commission with regard to the PPP model needs to be reviewed. Essential services remain the fundamental responsibility of the government as these are 'essential entitlements' and pertain

to issues of human security, safety and access to basic services (housing, water, sanitation, etc.) as well as legal services. The essential services/basic amenities come under the purview of local and urban governance, which is to be transparent and accountable to the people's constituency (Gram Sabha) and ensure the participation of women at all levels in local governance.

iii. Youth

Panchayats and other local government institutions are lacking in representation and participation of youth. Information about youth is not treated as a basic resource for planning. What little information gathering and dissemination are done have a 'top down' approach lacking youth perspective. There is a lack of access to relevant information at different levels for youth. There is also a lack of empowerment and capacity-building of youth for them to be able to make critical interventions in governance and other democratic processes. Poor quality of public services and limited access to these for youth is another problem. Youth in conflict-affected areas are specially targeted by law enforcing agencies and this inhibits their development. The majority of migrant youth are unaware of the existence of the Inter State Migrant Workmen Act 1979 and the provisions enshrined therein. The rights based approach to development has been superseded by an agitational demand mentality amongst youth because of responsibility and participation in development.

iv. Dalits

Panchayati Raj legislation has been enacted in all states; yet, panchayats have not graduated into becoming effective instruments of economic development and social justice. Due to incomplete devolution of functions, powers and resources to the local level, the governance and development potential of panchayats has not been fully realised. There continues to be major weaknesses in the current interpretation and implementation of reservations in Panchayati Raj. Broader strategies to transform the caste-class-gender discrimination pervasive in Indian society too have been largely ineffective. Reservations alone do not ensure greater equality and additional measures are required to facilitate Dalits in participating in effective governance.

Factors of caste and political party pressures tend to dominate development decisions at all panchayat levels,

leading to most resources and development benefits being channeled to dominant caste communities. There is also an insufficient emphasis on participation and there are significant barriers of entry in gram sabhas and panchayats for Dalits. Participation is greatly diluted in panchayats and better planning, implementation and audits are needed for the same. Focus needs to be given on every section or group at hamlet and village levels to include women and all sections of society in local governance. Dalit sarpanches usually come to power with the help of other leaders and hence they often act as puppets or are coopted. Actual empowerment needs to be realized for Dalits to fully realise their powers and govern in these offices.

Dalit women sarpanches have been subjected to severe discrimination and have not been included in decision making processes. There continue to be social barriers in calling women for gram sabha meetings. Reinforcement of discriminatory norms of caste, class and gender, lack of enabling environments and capture of power by dominant caste members have often prevented Dalit women and men from taking up practical and strategic gender, caste and class issues. There has been a repeated failure of the state machinery in addressing gross violations of rights of Dalit women and men participating in panchayats. Exclusion and discrimination continue in access to health and basic civic services at the panchayat level. For example, while the quality of public services like water is emphasised, the location of such services or access to Dalits is not. Furthermore, a village oriented model is used to look at public service outreach rather than hamlet oriented models. Several SC hamlets tend to get neglected by major public services due to residential segregation. Dalit hamlets of migrant workers have no sanitary facilities, common property resources, village ponds, drinking water, electricity, playgrounds, schools, community centres, etc. There is a higher incidence of disabilities among Dalits due to lack of access to welfare services and discrimination in healthcare and education.

Poor information flow and accountability mechanisms within departments on schemes for SC/STs and especially on SCP and TSP is another challenge. Except in Kerala, SCP/TSP allocations have not reached panchayats. This prevents the full realisation of SCP/TSP schemes by Dalits and Adivasis. On the other hand, at the level of expenditure, there is evidence of gross diversion of these funds to other, unintended infrastructure projects.

Economic growth has also led to the emergence of a large migrant population serving the needs of the economy. However adequate structures and institutions have not been

put in place to make public services accessible and available to them. Despite the pronouncement of a spurt of policies and provisions for PWD, their access to public services in the areas of education, health and civic amenities have been limited.

v. Adivasis

People involved in peace-building initiatives in Adivasi areas are branded Maoists and denied basic human rights. Inappropriate use of force by police and armed forces, abuse of the Jan Sunwai process and use of force for obtaining No Objection Certificates should be avoided. The suspension of administration and development activities and a large numbers of internally displaced persons further disadvantages Adivasis. The youth lack opportunity. Funds allocated to development schemes are un-utilised and lapse. The absence of accountability shrinks the democratic space.

vi. North East

Human resources development is obstructed when states experience turmoil and conflict. Internationally, the Central government denies situations of around conflict, internally, it considers them insurrections. Government officers use such situations as an excuse for structurally deficient implementation systems. Conflict situations are approached from a national security perspective and not from a human security viewpoint. Policies or programmes are not directly aimed at addressing the fallout of the various conflict situations.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Decentralisation Community

1. The number of centrally sponsored (CSS) and state sponsored schemes (SSS) should be reduced, especially in activities where the subsidiarity principle could be applied. Thus, more untied funds should be transferred to local governments with broad guidelines in accordance with national and state goals. The 12th Plan should earmark funds for local governments too as has been done by the 13th Finance Commission, with states taken into confidence. CSS and SSS should be flexible to the local context and local governments should have the key role in the planning, implementation and monitoring.
2. The 12th Plan should focus on strengthening gram sabhas and defining their roles, responsibilities and powers in planning, implementing and monitoring most local interventions by all tiers of government. These should ensure inclusion of all sections of the society. This Plan will also have to focus on the potential of youth in local governance. Various sub-committees of the local governments also require clarification of role.
3. Capacity-building is to be strategized on the basis of technological and institutional interventions. It should be broadbased, addressing not only the elected representatives but also other functionaries and the gram sabha. Elected representatives of women and of other disadvantaged groups should be focussed on. This should be considered an ongoing process and include issues of social justice, discrimination etc as well as skill development on local governance. State Institutes of Rural Development and Administrative Training Institutes alone will not be able to cater to this massive demand and hence there is a need to have other institutions, civil society organizations and academic institutions working jointly and in a coordinated manner. Such a mix of strategies is all the more important for decentralizing the entire plan process.
4. Capacities of training organizations also need to be enhanced as well as untied financial support provided to them for self-development. Support to initiate collectives of elected representatives at various levels and groups will empower the Panchayati Raj process in the long run.
5. Plans at all levels have to evolve from the village through local government plans. This approach will help include the excluded in the plan process. All levels of plans are to be based on the human development approach. It requires the publication of state, district and sub district Human Development Reports.
6. Gender planning and budgeting has to be introduced at all levels and the TSP and SCP should be subjected to gender budgeting. The potential of the wide network of self help groups, especially that of women and various disadvantaged sections, should be tapped for this process. Overall, there is also the need to incentivise decentralized planning and monitoring.
7. Reliable local level data disaggregated to the Panchayat level should be collated and made available including the downward information flow regarding national and state plans, schemes and funds. The key to good local planning is advance information regarding the resource envelope.
8. The District Plan has to be comprehensive and not in separate compartments, compiled by different departments and missions. Departmental and local government plans have to be integrated with the district plan. This requires the strengthening of the District Planning Committees (DPC). DPCs should be constituted in every district; their roles and structure including the membership and status should be defined clearly. Technical support systems, secretarial assistance and resources for planning have to be provided to all the DPCs by the beginning of the 12th Plan. These are necessary at the sub district levels too.
9. As far as possible parallel bodies and programmes like MP/MLALADS should either be done away with or minimised. Where there is a need, the role of these parallel bodies and missions should be defined vis-a-vis the role of the local governments. The various committees of the local governments and the gram sabha should be entrusted with all functions, powers and responsibilities.
10. Inequality should be measured through an inequality index on the lines of the global one, adapted to the local government context. Local governments should be trained to do this and to understand and work in social justice areas. Performance indicators should be developed at the local level and those should include

- issues of disadvantaged groups, social justice and equitable sharing of resources.
11. All organs/institutes/officials of the state and their functionaries including government officials, police, prison officials, public prosecutors, legal service authorities and legal aid providers must be sensitized on laws and issues relating to vulnerable groups as well as on the potential and role of local government in these.
 12. Guidelines should be formulated to strengthen gram sabhas for better representation in decision-making and to sensitise them to issues related to marginalized people.
 13. The 12th Plan should ensure the launch of Nyaya Panchayats, which in a way could address many aspects of social justice. Various issues like dowry, child protection, atrocities against women, etc could be addressed by local governments if they are given responsibilities and are made accountable. This may require incentives and disincentives.
 14. Budgetary allocation in plans at district, block and village level for SCs, STs, women, old people, children and minorities should be increased. Engendering plans at various levels should be the 12th Plan approach. Social Justice Committees and Social Justice Funds should be created in each village with members taken from the excluded groups.
 15. There is a need to streamline the Management Information System with regard to excluded categories and have gram panchayat-level data on them. BPL list and associated issues can be addressed by local governments with specific guidelines and a sound monitoring system.
 16. Local governments should be given the responsibility to ensure access to service delivery and there is the need to have Citizen Charters at all levels.
 17. The PESA needs to be revisited, restructured and properly implemented and could be one of the key tools in addressing challenges in social justice in Adivasi areas. Possibility of organizing the marginalized (on lines of the SHG movement) at the panchayat level have to be explored.
 18. Land rights issues should be addressed in the gram sabha. These issues vary across states, areas, societies and cultures and each has to be addressed separately as in the case of people in conflict areas, migrants, Dalits, Adivasis, fisherfolk etc.
 19. The 12th Plan should be dedicated to social justice as envisaged in the 73rd Amendment and should be achieved through decentralized governance.
 20. Universalization of access to public services must be ensured. Instead of setting targets, the focus should be on actual delivery and its quality. The quality of services needs to be defined. Strong monitoring of outcomes and analysis of bottlenecks in implementation and delivery of services is critical. Studies should be undertaken to analyse the bottlenecks and cross-sectoral governance issues in implementation of government programmes.
 21. Redeployment, 'rightsizing' and staffing would assist in improving quality of services. Many of the frontline service delivery institutions require adequate infrastructure for effective service delivery. Basic infrastructure, adequate space, provision of computers and other items crucial to service delivery must be put in place.
 22. The setting up of a performance management framework developed in a participatory manner and assessment of performance against the set standards would aid in bringing a positive orientation in service culture. Online monitoring systems should be set up for tracking category-wise and sector-wise fund allocation and utilization.
 23. The gram sabha should be the platform for ensuring accountability at the lowest tier. Steps should be taken to institutionalize social audit across all tiers of government. The regular internal audit should reinforce the social audit.
 24. Information technology must be leveraged for local governance through computerised village kiosks, mobile-based information sharing, reporting and tracking and web SWAN connectivity for improving the quality of service delivery. Some other uses could be single window service delivery systems, online record keeping and grievance handling systems.
 25. There is a need for creating awareness among citizens for using the media for disclosure of information. The governments, including local governments, also should collaborate with media to share development challenges and success stories. Acts/laws pertaining to information availability to citizens need to be collected and disseminated to local bodies.
 26. Steps must be taken for implementation of the RTI Act in letter and spirit, especially the public disclosure

- clause. Training must also be provided to elected representatives on RTI stipulations.
27. Relevant documents relating to government orders, circulars, statutes etc. should be collated, indexed and made available through public libraries at the block and panchayat offices. There has to be a system ensuring regular flow of information on fund flow and schemes of the panchayats.
 28. A National Data Bank should be created for collecting, preserving, disseminating and sharing vital information (particularly relating to the prevailing best practices in the field of local level planning and development) from the local communities and local governments for democratising information.
 29. Frontline service delivery workers such as ICDS workers, primary school teachers as well as civil society organisations may be utilised to provide information to each household on benefits available to the poor from the panchayats and block offices and how to access them. This would require convergence between some departments at the district level.
 30. Folk media, nukkad nataks and community radio/television should be used extensively to provide information to citizens.
 37. Institutional mechanisms should be strengthened to ensure participation of women in scheduled Adivasi areas in the decision-making process as the PESA Act is gender-blind.
 38. Land and house title deeds should be made in the name of both spouses/partners.
 39. Enhance honorarium for elected women's representatives of local governments and ensure facilities for their mobility. It should also be ensured that their loss of wages while attending meetings is compensated.
 40. There should be no preset conditions for women to contest elections like the two child norm or requirement of toilets etc.
 41. There should be regular social audits of the Women's Component Plan and of all development programmes including programmes for minority and marginalised groups.
 42. Mandate involvement of civil society members in gender and social audits.
 43. Promote participation of women in the planning process and make mandatory at least 33 per cent women's participation in District Planning Committees.

ii. Women

31. Local governing units should reserve 33 per cent of houses/flats/industrial units/market spaces for women.
32. Fifty per cent of any development fund should be spent specifically for women, especially focusing on the marginalised.
33. Programmes to promote gender planning and budgeting in PRIs should be introduced.
34. Provision of funds to enable women to contest elections and also to help create women's collectives to help and support elected women's representatives (EWR) to function effectively in the PRIs.
35. Proper functioning of PRIs with devolution of funds, provision of functionaries and clarification of EWRs, roles needs appropriate support.
36. Rural and urban governing committees should be made to function properly. Social justice committees and Gram Nyayalayas must be directed to function as mandated wherever they have been constituted and must be set up wherever they have not been yet.
44. Allocations should be made for marginalised women (SC/ST, minorities) as an inbuilt component of any budgeting.
45. Compilation of gender disaggregated data across sectors/departments with support of statistics department.
46. Make attendance of 50 per cent women mandatory in gram sabhas and any public hearing.
47. Funds of parallel programmes should be integrated to ensure optimal utilisation of resources and avoid replication of beneficiaries. This calls for computerisation of the data of benefactors of all the schemes.
48. Enable women to assert their rights as stakeholders in all aspects of tourism development.
49. Capacity building programmes should be aimed at capacitating SHGs to take up social initiatives for empowering women beyond credit activities.
50. Provisions should be made for capacity-building of EWRs and government functionaries on gender budgeting.

51. Training should be imparted on adult education, awareness of PRI and the election process, with special focus on the political participation of minority women.
52. Gender sensitisation of elected male representatives, with special emphasis on gender budgeting. Such initiatives should incorporate concerns about the demographic profile.
53. Gender education for all political parties.
54. Democratisation of information through the use of community radio, newsletters, etc.
55. Ensure that the principles of Convention for the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) are followed and the Government of India commitments and the Beijing Platform for Action are implemented.
56. State wise research studies should be conducted to identify emerging patterns and dynamics of violence against women in different sectors, with segregated data for violence based at home, the workplace and public places.
57. There should be comprehensive legislation for protection of women working in formal and informal sectors separately. The Sexual Harassment at Work Place Bill, which will become an Act, is a novel legislation, which should include the whole spectrum of informal sector workers, including domestic workers, who it has left out.
58. Introduce strict advertising standards to stop objectification of women as a commodity for consumption and portraying women as exotic, erotic and sexually available.
59. Ensure effective implementation of the Protection of Women Against Domestic Violence Act.
60. Take measures to prevent violence against women and on other vulnerable sections.
61. Awareness generation and sensitisation programmes for men to check gender-based violence.
62. Legal awareness building for and provision of legal aid to women.
63. Safety measures in public places by establishing resting places and toilets for transgenders, the differently abled and women.
64. The government needs to go beyond conventional polices to identify and prevent women-insensitive practices like coercive Adivasi marriages.
65. Effective implementation of shelter home schemes for oppressed and tortured women.
66. Provision for education of the children of prison inmates should be a priority based on where the child resides—with the mother or with the family.
67. District Committees should be set up to monitor shelter homes.
68. A board in shelter home premises should display the rights of the inmates.
69. The word **rape** should be replaced by sexual assault. Justice, relief and rehabilitation should be provided from the right perspective. (The practice of marrying the assaulted person to the assaulter is not the right perspective.)
70. HIV-infected and-affected women should be provided special care and given property rights.
71. The pending legislation on HIV should be passed as it concerns not just the HIV-infected but also those affected. The legislation shall prevent further spread of the disease by increasing awareness and information and dissolving the stigma attached to it.
72. Women should not be used as medical guinea pigs for pregnancy control medicines as it impacts their reproductive health adversely and violates reproductive rights.
73. Mother's committees should be formed for female wards (adolescents) to discuss problems regarding sexual identity and sexual harassment, especially in schools, hostels or shelter homes.
74. Ration cards should be provided to single women as it is the basis for availing the benefits of all government schemes.
75. Special attention should be given to the protection of women's rights in conflict zones (J&K and North East and Naxal-affected regions).
76. Conflict situations have internally displaced numbers of people in the North East. Many of them are displaced for over a decade while several others get displaced periodically. This calls for a comprehensive displacement policy conforming to the existing international standards to be introduced. Before such a policy is formulated and implemented, compensation packages must be introduced for families and individuals affected by conflict irrespective of whether the perpetrators of violence are state or non-state actors.

77. Economic and social support for conflict-hit women should be ensured by providing relief and rehabilitation to widows, 'half-widows' and dependents of disappeared people.
78. Ban adverse gender roles that are endorsed by cultural practices which adversely affect women's ability to fully participate in public life. The PRI model of women's representation should be replicated in traditional institutions/village councils and strictly implemented in urban decision making bodies under the 6th Schedule in the North East.
79. Capacity building of women in leadership skills should be provided to have adequate representation of women in traditional councils, judiciary, police, administration, development councils and in peace processes.
80. Collection of gender-disaggregated data should be undertaken to assess the impact of conflict situations on women, particularly in cases of disappearance and sexual violence by state and non-state actors.
81. The healthcare system must respond to the needs of conflict-affected families and provide trauma counselling services to women and children.
82. Most importantly, strong monitoring systems should be introduced and accountability of implementing agencies must be ensured. For instance, the 11th Plan recommended setting up of a task force on VAW in conflict areas which is yet to materialise.
83. Economic and social support for conflict-hit women should be ensured by providing relief and rehabilitation to widows, 'half-widows' and dependents of disappeared people.
84. Introduce a formal structure by creating a database for migrants, issue them identity cards and provide migrant services like vocational training, etc.
85. Mandatory representation and inclusion of youth in panchayats and other local government institutions
86. Suo motu disclosure of information like functioning and budgetary details and other youth relevant information, should be made in all educational institutions.
87. Information sharing centres should be developed where youth have access to relevant information.
88. Develop curriculum for both school and college level, which should include lessons of laws, policies and provisions like RTI Act, MGNREGS, Domestic Violence Act, Juvenile Justice Act, and others, which will help them to make meaningful contributions as citizens.
89. Democratic platforms should be promoted for interaction amongst youth across all sections of the society.
90. Simplification of procedures for starting and running businesses is a must, especially small and medium size businesses.
91. Promote skill development and develop training systems which encourages hands-on training on entrepreneurial initiatives.
92. Provide special incentives to ventures promoting indigenous skills and products.
93. Establish proper information-sharing systems and effective redressal mechanisms which will ensure transparency and accountability.
94. There is need for widespread use of technology to bridge the information gap and also to develop information systems which can be used effectively by citizens.
95. There is a need for creating an autonomy approach in which communities own, plan and design their development with the state aiding this approach. Such an approach can create emancipatory models of citizenship that are not just rights-demanding but are also responsibility-owning, accountable, caring and nurturing. This brings a sense of self worth and dignity in young people, that they are not asking someone else for their development but are leading it themselves. This approach has the ability to end the sense of alienation among the youth and provide them

iii. Youth

83. Development of a separate Youth Policy having special focus on employment, equal access to education, disadvantaged groups of youth, creation of volunteerism and spaces for youth.
84. Social audit mechanisms should be institutionalized for all public services and youth should be included for monitoring of access and quality of different public services.
85. Sharing of information on entitlements, budgetary details etc. of different public services should be made mandatory, specially at different service points for citizens to be able to monitor them.
86. There should be standing instructions to ensure that all law-enforcing agencies will deal with youth with special compassion and tolerance.
87. Special fact-finding and youth teams to be sent to

meaningful leadership roles.

100. Local and regional planning must get precedence over centralized planning. Local voices and knowledge should lead a completely decentralised planning process. This will give more opportunities for rural youth to become central in the local planning and governance systems and spur their imagination and participation in nation building.

iv. Dalits

101. There is a lot of unfair practices existing in the election process and therefore there is a need for social audit of the same.
102. Proper information is not made available to Dalit Sarpanches on schemes, budgets, plans and programmes and hence there should be effective information dissemination to Dalit Sarpanches. Action should be taken against officials who do not cooperate with Dalit Sarpanches.
103. Training for Sarpanches should be organised at the cluster level.
104. A lot of funds has been made available through centrally sponsored schemes like the MGNREGS, but these are not properly distributed. Rather than giving funds at Panchayat level, it should be given to each Dalit family which will also prevent out-migration of these families. Sustainable livelihoods need to be linked with MGNREGS plans. A proper plan for employment needs to be developed at the Panchayat level involving participatory planning. Currently Panchayats are only implementers.
105. There is corruption in both higher and lower strata however, there is discrimination in action taken on the same. Dalit Sarpanches are targeted more than Brahmin and non-Dalit Sarpanches who are engaged in corruption as well. The same action on corruption should be taken on Dalit and non-Dalit Sarpanches. Accountability and audit mechanisms should be put in place for Sarpanches.
106. Gram sabhas are currently not incorporating all community concerns in their decision making, therefore care should be taken in planning processes that every community participates in the process.
107. The reservation policy has to be effectively enforced at all levels by ensuring the rights of Dalits to freely and safely vote and stand for election and to exercise

their full mandate if elected to their reserved seats. This includes adequate policies and government monitoring and protection of Dalit candidates as well as elected representatives. Reservation quotas should be instituted in the lower-level bureaucracy for SC women and men, ST women and men to ensure that government officials, especially the Block Chief Executive Officers, are representative of these sections of the population.

108. Devolution of powers can only happen if budget allocations, related functions and functionaries are delegated to the panchayats so that they have effective political and economic power for the discharge of their duties. Greater and sufficient budgets need to be made available to panchayats to ensure their proper functioning. This includes lessening bureaucratic controls over panchayat programmes and making bureaucrats more accountable to the panchayats.
109. Several bureaucratic hurdles exist that prevent devolution. The 29 subjects reserved for panchayat institutions haven't been fully handed over and de facto powers have remained at the district level instead. It should be ensured that all 29 subjects are dealt by gram panchayats.
110. District budgeting and panchayat budgeting practices need to be emphasized in order to ensure flow of allocated funds and schemes to reserved panchayats. Greater linkages are needed between the three panchayat tiers and between the panchayats and government departments in charge of rural development schemes with regular meetings and coordination.
111. Implementation of schemes need the participation of the community as well as civil society organisations who have a proven track record. It should be mandated that in all government contracts related to common properties, they should not only benefit Dalits but should also be executed by Dalits as contract holders, at least in proportion to their population.
112. All capacity building and training programmes should include the gender and caste perspective and legal sanctions should apply against those who block Dalit women and men's participation. Stress should be laid on the establishment of Mahila Sabhas to facilitate women's concerns and priorities. Dalit organizations should train Dalit functionaries.
113. SCP planning should be done with SC communities

and should be implemented by Dalit people's groups and organizations and not the Panchayats.

114. A national perspective plan needs to be developed with overall short and long term goals for overall development of Dalit women with fixed time bound targets. Civil society participation should be included to conduct awareness on SCP/TSP plans allocations, schemes, etc.
115. Streamlined information relevant to SCs should be available through a single window system and strict accountability measures should be put in place to ensure implementation. Public services should be made available at the hamlet level.
116. The RTI Act has to be strengthened and more commitment given to making information available to appellants and mechanisms put in place to safeguard the appellants are not harassed for seeking information.
117. Along with a quantum increase of facilities, more emphasis needs to be given on improving awareness of the disabled about their rights and entitlements.
118. A national programme for migrant labourers must be launched to provide mobile ration cards, caste certificates and other identity related papers targeting SC, ST and OBC migrants so they have access to public services.

v. Adivasis

119. Support a voluntary process of building leadership amongst the youth.
120. The PESA should be implemented within a given time frame.
121. The Land Acquisition Act, Mines and Minerals Act, Central Coal Bearing Area Act etc. should be amended and mandatory powers should be given to the Adivasi council with reference to the sanction of industrial, mining and other development projects in Adivasi areas.
122. Fast track court must be established for timely disposal of cases filed against Adivasi leaders.
123. There must be a time-bound land regularization process for people who have been temporarily settled in Salwa Judum camps.
124. Fast track courts must be established for addressing the issues of atrocities against Adivasi women in all

conflict zones.

125. There should be a ban on appointment of ad hoc Special Police Officers in conflict zones.
126. A peaceful dialogue process must be initiated and supported for reducing the risks of violence in Adivasi areas.
127. The Special Area Security Acts imposed for harassing the leadership in Adivasi areas should be repealed.
128. A White Paper should be released on the status of internally displaced persons (IDPs).
129. A separate ministry (both at the Central as well as at state level) should be created to exclusively deal with issues arising in conflict zones.
130. The D Bandopadhyay Committee Report on Extremist Affected Areas (2006, Planning Commission) should be accepted and its recommendations followed.
131. The Adivasi Advisory Councils and other Adivasi institutions must be involved in any budgetary process (both at the state as well as at Central level).
132. A high level permanent Judicial Commission should be set up for enquiry into and redressal of violations of Adivasi rights.
133. Paramilitary forces deployed in conflict zones should be withdrawn in a phased manner for reducing social damage and promoting peace efforts.
134. The Adivasi Welfare Ministry and other related organisations/institutions should be reconstituted. Powerlessness of the ministry in the face of the current challenges resulting from weak and defunct organisations and institutions and lack of adequate human resources has to be reversed so as to effectively tackle problems arising out of mining, industrialization etc.
135. Recognising the history, culture and identity of Adivasi people as distinct and valuable, a new National Adivasi Policy should be formulated.
136. A single window system for handling the grievances of Adivasi people should be set up.
137. Make the Adivasi Advisory Councils more effective and strengthen the scheduled Tribes Commission in view of the challenges arising from violence and loss of livelihoods, habitats and resources.
138. Release White Papers based on the state governors' reports on implementation of the PESA.

139. Restructuring of Adivasi Development Authority by sharing powers with community Adivasi leaders.
140. A comprehensive institutional review is needed for re-classification and inclusion of other eligible castes/ sub castes in the list of Scheduled Tribes (the Sahariyas are recognised as a primitive tribe in Madhya Pradesh, whereas in Uttar Pradesh they are treated as Dalits; originally the Musahar community were categorized as Forest Dwellers but now they are treated as a Dalit community in Bihar and Uttar Pradesh and the Saura in Eastern Orissa are not registered as Scheduled Tribes).
141. The budgetary process for Tribal Sub Plan Areas must be prepared and monitored in association with local Adivasi institutions and councils.
142. Set up special fast track courts for resolving the disputes under Adivasi Land Alienation Act and Adivasi (Prevention of) Atrocity Act.

vi. North East

143. Implementation of the Panchayat Extension to Scheduled Areas Act (PESA) to facilitate women's representation in local governance.
144. The Autonomous Councils must become catalysts for economic transformation and not merely be legislative, regulatory and administrative agencies. They will however need to adopt a more participatory approach in order to effectively assume a central role in local development. In this context, it may be desirable to consider the approach adopted in the Fifth Schedule areas, where democratic elections, (based on adult franchise and reservations for women in elected seats) and leadership positions have been applied without reducing the importance of Adivasi customs and traditions.
145. Provide all forms of communication in the local language. Support TV/radio/print Information Education Communication campaigns in local languages at all levels. Fund community radio to facilitate knowledge dissemination for the institutions of grassroots governance.
146. Internally Displaced Persons (development, disaster and conflict-induced) should be recognized as a separate category. Conflict situations have created unprecedented numbers of internally displaced people within the North East and many of them are displaced for over a decade while several others get displaced periodically. A comprehensive rehabilitation policy is needed and existing international standards should be adhered to.
147. Policies and social programmes need to be formulated taking into account India's commitment to the Beijing Platform for Action and the Convention on Elimination of Discrimination Against Women. All efforts should be made to remove negative gender stereotyping. Witch hunting has spread in several parts of Assam and a legislative provision has to be initiated.
148. Translate gender commitments into budgetary allocations.
149. Disability should be an inclusive human rights issue cutting across all sectors and support should not be provided only on the basis of economic criteria such as the BPL cards.
150. Education of persons with disability should be exclusively under the Ministry of Human Resource Development.
151. Social audit of implementation of all schemes is necessary with the inclusion of civil society and the relevant stakeholders.
152. Ensure access to and transparency in availability of government funding for civil society organisations.
153. Health care system must respond to the needs of those affected by conflict in the North East, especially for trauma counseling service for women and children.
154. The state must recognize the realities of those affected by the various conflict situations in the North East by adopting appropriate policies and livelihood support programmes. In addition, compensation packages for families and individuals affected by conflict should be introduced. Similarly, central schemes for those affected by communal and terrorist violence should be extended to families affected by state and non-state violence.
155. There is a need to recognize the direct and indirect impact of conflict on women. India should adopt and implement United Nations Resolutions such as 1325, 1820, 1888, 1889, related to impact of conflict on women and 1814, related to children.
156. Increase women's representation and participation in peace building processes, especially in formal ones. Poor and disproportionate representation of women

in different political bodies does have an indirect impact on peace negotiations.

157. Strong monitoring systems and accountability of implementing agencies must be ensured. For instance, the 11th Five Year Plan recommended the setting up of a task force on Violence Against Women in conflict areas which is yet to be materialise. The Vision 2020 document recommended a monitoring and review mechanism for all projects costing above Rs 5 crore. This needs to be built into policy and law if such recommendations are to be honoured and not to remain on paper.
158. The history, culture and language of the indigenous peoples of Tripura have been stunted by their marginalization and must be revived and preserved through special funding by the Centre.

vii. Children

159. The potential of PRIs should be realised in ensuring concrete benefits to children at the local level. Local governance bodies at every level should be supported to prepare child rights plans and to monitor the quality of public services for children.
160. A system to provide information of schemes and programmes for children, the authorities responsible for implementation of those schemes and allocated amounts should be in place at all levels of government.
161. Well-informed and well-trained Child Welfare Committees must exist in all states throughout the country.
162. PRIs with the 3 Fs (Functionary, Functions and Fund) can be instrumental not just in the delivery of services and monitoring but in birth registration, stopping of child marriage and child trafficking.
163. The allocated funds must be transferred to the gram panchayat directly for implementing its needs and priorities and no external restriction should be placed on its spending. Reform of budget allocation and disbursement procedures to minimise the time gap should be given urgent attention so that expenditure on children reaches on time.
164. Participation of children starting from village/ward levels in planning, monitoring and assessing programmes and schemes for children and raising their awareness should be promoted in all states.

165. The capacities and competencies of elected public representatives, officials and staff need to be strengthened to meet the needs, ensure the rights of all children and to understand child-centred development.
166. The literacy level of elected representatives in PRIs varies and women representatives are often not educated. Regular training and enhancement of their skills on innovative and easy record keeping should be undertaken.
167. The feasibility of setting up District Resource Centres should be examined for providing technical training, planning and implementation on decentralised governance and development programmes specially for children.
168. The state must invest in and deliver the core services and child rights should not be up for privatization.
169. It is not justified to expect benefits of better maternal and child health outreach and care just through an ASHA as the need is for more Auxiliary Nurse Midwives, Multipurpose Health Workers and Lady Health Visitors.
170. The Government of India must set up better service standards, provide for actual key service activities, inspire greater energy and honest activity by lower level staff and stimulate closer convergence and coordination among programmes at the place of delivery of services.
171. Institutional mechanisms need to be developed for the planning and implementation of block and district plans of action for children.
172. It is supremely important that plan objectives are focused around reducing inequalities between groups. A key test as to whether policies are promoting inclusive growth is how they deliver for more marginalized groups such as SCs, STs and minorities.
173. All regional, linguistic, rural-urban and caste-class disparities and their impact on children should be taken into account while making the Five Year Plan. Provisions for children of families affected by migration, urbanization, drought and residence in remote areas should be prioritised.
174. The reservation vs. privatization dilemma should be viewed from the perspective of long-term growth and development. Children will be further discriminated if reservation is removed and basic entitlements are privatized.

175. In view of the prevailing nutritional deficiency, provisions of required nutrition should be ensured on sustainable basis to all children and especially children of Dalits, Adivasis, minorities, migrants etc.
176. Common school standards should be followed for Dalits, Adivasis and other excluded and marginalised groups.
177. The government should take special measures to remove discrimination and segregation of children in classrooms, cultural and social activities on the basis of their class, caste, ethnicity and religion. Sensitisation of service providers for handling children vulnerable to discrimination is needed. All programmes for children must safeguard against malpractices that lead to social and economic exploitation of Dalit children.
178. All development and protection measures must recognise that all aspects of the child's life and therefore the full spectrum of necessary services have to be seen as interconnected and interdependent.
179. The government should initiate an intensive community awareness campaign across the country against child labour, child marriage and gender discrimination in order to make these practices unacceptable socially and culturally.
180. The Integrated Child Protection Scheme will need to be implemented in letter and spirit across the country. It has the potential to sensitise and empower community groups to address rights violations of children through establishment of community-based child protection mechanisms.
181. Economic growth should be aimed at protecting children from vulnerability to abuse and exploitation. Children who are at risk in an unprotected environment are children of farmers, peasants, families working in manufacturing and families engaged formal and informal labour. Children who are infected and affected by HIV/AIDs, abused, exploited and trafficked children, forced into prostitution and sex tourism, victims of violence and unrest, orphans due to disasters and many more should all be given special attention.
182. Children of the 14-18 age group should be catered for separately. Many programmes do not address their issues. This is also the age group which is increasingly becoming the target of trafficking, sexual abuse, child labour and crime.
183. For every scheme pertaining to children, a specific proportion of the funds should be dedicated to improving transparency, monitoring and evaluation.
184. Data on migrant children should be collected and updated regularly through a special migrant cell set up jointly by the Ministry of Women and Child Development and the ministry of Labour.
185. Special efforts should be initiated for registration of migrants and ensure portability of their identity cards to provide access to services in destination areas.
186. Information in appropriate accessible formats should be made available to children with disabilities. All bodies and service providers should be encouraged to provide information which they provide to the general public to children with disabilities, in accessible formats.
187. To make growth inclusive there is a need to ensure that all facilities, services and systems, public or private, including consumer goods, housing services, sanitation, communication services, legal and healthcare services offered in the community are also available to children with disabilities.
188. Vocational training within the general education system needs to be integrated to generate employment opportunities for children with disabilities.
189. Holistic assessments of all schemes relating to children, including poverty alleviation programmes, should be undertaken on a regular basis to measure the impact of such programmes in terms of survival, development, protection of children and their participation in their respective communities. The findings must be widely publicized for information and accountability of concerned government departments and PRIs/ward councils.
190. A results-based framework must be established for each department and dispersal of funds should be based on clear accountability standards adopted.
191. An MIS system should to be established for all domains.
192. Mid-Term Appraisals and evaluations of National Five Year Plans should aim to make the status of children as a critical indicator in tracking assessment of development planning, financing and implementation. A beginning can be made in the 12th Plan.
193. Review of the responsibilities of field-based staff at all levels and increase the number of such functionaries commensurate with the needs of service delivery and convergence of services.

194. Gap analysis of capacities at various levels must be undertaken e.g. with RTE Act being implemented, there is a shortfall of 12 lakh teachers and there are few institutions to train so many teachers. We must also explore the use of ICT in capacity building since this has immense potential.
195. Institute on-site continuous training for child development and other schemes through itinerant trainers drawn from staff with training aptitude and experience.
196. Create mechanisms for apprenticeships as preparation for responsibilities for learning from best practices.
197. Ensure that every district has a mobile training unit equipped with materials and competent trainers and this would provide itinerant training which is essential for increasing competence and quality of service delivery.
198. Allocations for rural health and education infrastructure for Adivasis must be adequate so that Adivasi children and other socially excluded groups have access to culturally sensitive health and quality education services.

viii. Transgenders

199. A progressive revision of laws must be initiated to eradicate the social prejudices against transgender persons. The International Bill of Gender Rights adopted by the International Conference on Transgender (TG) Law and Employment Policy in Texas, United States, in 1995 provides an ideal course to follow while considering legal reforms. It lays down that all human beings have the right to define their own gender identity, secure and retain employment and receive just compensation, control and change one's own body, enjoy competent medical and professional care, have freedom of sexual expression, form committed, loving relationships and enter into marital contracts and conceive, bear and adopt children and exercise parental capacity. The Yogyakarta Principles – a set of international legal principles on the application of international law to human rights violations on the basis of sexual orientation and gender identity – also bring greater clarity and coherence to the human rights obligations of states. The principles were drafted by a distinguished group of international human rights experts at a meeting held in Yogyakarta, Indonesia,

from November 6 to 9, 2006. These principles recognize that sexual orientation and gender identity are integral to every person's dignity and humanity and must not be the basis for discrimination or abuse. It also views critically the policing of sexuality, which remains a potent force behind the continuing gender-based violence and gender inequality.

200. The Planning Commission should fund the National Legal Services Authority (NALSA) to take up the issues of transgenders under Social Justice Litigation and seek legal redressal for them.
201. Steps toward taking a position on legal recognition of the gender identity of Hijras/TG need to be taken in consultation with Hijras/TG and other key stakeholders. Getting legal recognition² and avoiding ambiguities in the current procedures that issue identity documents to Hijras/TG are a must as they are connected to basic civil entitlements such as access to health and public services, right to vote, right to contest elections, right to education, inheritance rights and marriage and child adoption. For e.g. In February 2003, the Madhya Pradesh High Court struck down the election of Kamala Jaan as the Mayor of the Municipal Corporation of Katni. The court's logic was that since Kamala Jaan was not a woman, she could not contest the seat, which was reserved for women.
202. In 2005, India's Central government introduced a category 'E' in passport application forms where 'E' stands for "eunuch." Transgender people would like this to be changed. The term "eunuch" bears a lot of historical stigma and transgender people do not want to be addressed thus. Additionally, other countries do not recognise the eunuch identity and this causes difficulties during international travel. This was a typical case of a government making a policy without consulting the population that is affected. The government may choose to review these terms and use culturally appropriate terminology and identities based on international best practices with regards to transgender-transsexual identity documents for travel etc.
203. Recognize that every person must have the right to decide their gender expression and identity, including transgenders and hijras. They should also have the right

² National Legal Services Authority has proposed to provide free legal aid to transgender people and to initiate legal literacy classes on the rights of transgender people in January 2011.

to freely express their gender identity. This includes the demand for transgenders-hijras to be considered female as well as a third sex. e.g. A direction from the Election Commission (EC) in September 1994 stated that hijras can be registered in the electoral roles either as male or female depending on their statement at the time of enrolment. This direction was given by the EC after Shabnam, a hijra candidate from the Sihagpur Assembly constituency in Madhya Pradesh, wrote to the Chief Election Commissioner enquiring about the gender category in which hijras were to be classified.

204. A welfare board that has been set up by the Tamil Nadu government enables transgenders and hijras to secure their entitlements such as social security and citizenship rights. The Department of Social Welfare in Tamil Nadu passed a government order (GO) in December 2006 with recommendations to improve the living conditions of Aravanis³. The GO strongly favours counseling as a means to deter families from disowning a transgender child. It also recommends counselling for children with behaviour changes in schools, for which teachers need to be specially trained. The GO is clear that there should be no discrimination against admitting transgender persons in schools and colleges. The GO, however, is yet to be implemented and the welfare board presents an opportunity to put these steps into practice. Thus, it is recommended that a national working committee be set up to look into the issues of transgenders-hijras and the central and state ministries develop programmes like that of the Tamil Nadu welfare board.
205. In Karnataka, the government has issued an order to implement a reservation quota for TG. Transgenders have been included in the 2A category of the Backward Class Commission. As a result of this decision, they will be eligible to avail of the 15 per cent reservation in government employment and other schemes. Similar provisions should be made throughout India.
206. There has been no enumeration of the transgender population in India and this has left a huge gap in data on its socio-economic status. The current 2011 Census is an opportunity that could have been tapped to enumerate this population segment, it

is recommended that a plan of action be prepared with community groups and national development partners to map the transgender – hijra population across the Indian states, so as to provide an estimate for legal, social and economic interventions.

207. Ensure coverage of the UID/Aadhaar scheme to the TG community. This is a 12-digit unique number which the Unique Identification Authority of India (UIDAI) will issue for all Indian residents. The number will be stored in a centralised database and linked to the basic demographic and biometric information – photograph, ten fingerprints and iris – of each individual. The UID project is primarily aimed at ensuing inclusive growth by providing a form of identity to those who do not have any identity. It seeks to provide Aadhaar numbers to the marginalized sections of society and this would strengthen equity. Apart from providing identity, the Aadhaar number will enable better delivery of services and effective governance.
208. Gross violations of rights of TGs have often been reported like abduction, arbitrary arrests, detention, beatings and gang rape by the law enforcing agencies and local thugs. Particularly transgenders, Hijras and other ‘effeminate’ males are often vulnerable to these forms of violence. There are also extensive reports of physical and psychological molestation of ‘effeminate’ males in academic institutions and workplaces. Law enforcement and judicial authorities should set up special cells to look into human rights abuse. The Ministry of Law should broaden the inclusion criteria of existing legal redressal mechanisms like that of free legal aid by NALSA and its decentralized units and lok adalats and similar systems of non formal systems of justice.
209. The Home Ministry should strengthen training of the police force at all levels on the importance of HIV/AIDS prevention and the life-saving efforts of HIV/AIDS outreach workers. The ministry should also monitor conditions of detention particularly of women in prostitution and men who have sex with men. It should ensure accountability of police officers and wardens who engage in sexual abuse, as well as other violations of national and international standards for conditions of detention.
210. A civilian review board or civilian ombudsman committee comprising judges and lawyers should be established to monitor police stations and ensure that

3 Aravanis and ‘Thirunangi’: Hijras in Tamil Nadu identify as ‘Aravani’. Tamil Nadu Aravanigal Welfare Board, a state government initiative under the Department of Social Welfare, defines Aravanis as biological males who self-identify themselves as women trapped in male bodies. Some Aravani activists want the public and media to use the term ‘Thirunangi’ to refer to Aravanis.

Supreme Court guidelines on treatment of persons in custody, as established in DK Basu vs. State of West Bengal, are strictly enforced.

211. Continue efforts with the police force on Section 377 Indian Penal Code. While impressive gains have been made in the steps to repeal Section 377, there is continuing need to educate the police department on the judgment against Section 377 and hence its application to the TG community.

ix. Conflict

212. Capacity building of the masses with a rural orientation and not just of the elite or government staff in undertaking of planning, implementation and evaluation of all development plans, policies and programmes should be done.

213. Social audit of government schemes should be done from the grassroots onwards. Mechanisms should be evolved to ensure that all schemes that are being run for the welfare of the people, especially those involving huge investments should be checked for their results and relevance by the people at all levels.

214. The allocations are 80 per cent tied and determined at the central and state levels and so there is little scope for people at the grass root level to get involved in the decision making process. This needs to be changed. State control over the resources and the planning process needs to be reduced to ensure that different groups are not excluded and the planning process becomes truly decentralized.

215. Adoption of decentralised and participative planning process should be followed by introduction of gram/tehsil/district level planning boards. District and gram planning needs to be enforced and implemented so as to ensure development at the grass root levels

216. Local groups apparently do not have the capacity to plan. Efforts should be made to empower them further in the decision making processes.

217. Before implementation of a new policy or programme, consensus from all possible stakeholders should be obtained

218. Need for institutional reforms is felt specially to control corruption in order to have a proper utilisation of resources. Past experience shows that corporate houses indulge in corrupt practices and violate the environment and other laws for their own benefit. This again can create conflict as seen in cases such

as Niyamgiri, POSCO and other big infrastructure related projects. So strict action must be taken against corporate corruption.

219. There have been enough talks on the decentralization of power and decision making but focus should also be on the corruption prevalent in the Gram Panchayats and other local bodies. Transparency in the functioning of the governing bodies should be visible from the very bottom level so as to ensure fair development.

220. Collective responsibility should be promoted. This would mean less corruption, more transparency and proper representation being given to all sections of society.

221. Efforts need to be made to ensure that politics does not result in creation of backward regions in the county.

222. Emergence of a few dominant classes in society should be stopped as this leads to exploitation and conflicts.

223. Control of resources should be made broad based and should be people centric.

224. Subsistence level services should be provided to all as a matter of right and demands for basic subsistence facilities should not be branded as 'criminal' and repressed using police and other para-military forces.

225. Avenues for resistance and protests against unjust development planning should be provided and the protesters should not be branded as naxalites, terrorists and anti-nationals and pushed out of normal society.

226. A perception has gained ground amongst the public that the government and the state are there only for the benefit of the rich. Drastic action and reforms in governance and regulatory frameworks are needed immediately to reinforce people's faith in government and the benevolent character of the state.

x. Adolescents

227. Instead of piecemeal references to adolescents a separate section needs to be dedicated to adolescents in the 12th Plan.

228. The adolescent constituency, while recognized as an important subcategory of the population, does not have its own Department or Ministry. Given its significant size and potential it has to be given its own separate ministry.

229. The 12th Plan should take an incremental approach to planning. This calls for commitments made in the previous plan to be taken forward in the 12th Plan. An example being commitments made with respect to adolescent Reproductive and Sexual Health and Adolescent Friendly Health Services made under the 11th Plan. The moving forward should be based on evidence. It would entail a commitment in the 12th Plan to identifying and ensuring that gaps in effective implementation are addressed. The non utilization of adolescent friendly services must not be interpreted as a lack of demand for these services. Instead it should be seen as a rejection of the services because of a possible a flaw in implementation design and approach.
230. A commitment should be made to track expenditures and results for assessing performance rather than rolling out new 'schemes'. Under the 11th Plan a varied number of schemes and programmes for adolescents were envisaged. The Mid Term Appraisal of the 11th Plan focuses only on whether or not the same were rolled out.
231. The performance tracking should be on a continuous timeline and for that the Plan should set out the detailed timeline rather than leaving it open for a five year period.
232. There is no information with beneficiary groups regarding even the rolling out of schemes. For example most of the CSOs that were present at the consultation from across 12 states were not aware of the SABLE scheme for adolescent girls or updated on its status. Another case in point being the 'Yuva Shakti Yojana', that none of the participants had even heard of. This is an undesirable gap in information and needs to be filled.
233. Mobile telephony with its wide outreach and penetration and a medium popular with adolescents should be used to announce widely the launching of schemes for adolescents.
234. Adolescents are of an age that has enormous potential and the same has been acknowledged and recognised in a wide range of policy documents including the 11th Plan. In spite of that they have been excluded from governance. This plan has to ensure participation of adolescents in 'governance'. Kishore/Kishori Panchaayats should be developed and integrated into village panchaayats. This could be in the form of a nominated adolescent committee with an equal male female ratio. That will ensure adolescents' inclusion in

governance as well as help develop leadership qualities in them. These panchaayats could be connected to the adolescent resource centres. The adolescent panchayats could be given responsibility for managing them. The adolescent panchayats should undertake social audits of schemes for adolescents.

xi. Migrants

235. A disaggregated database on interstate and international migration should be set up.
236. The vulnerability of women migrants should be reduced by ensuring sanitation facilities, providing maternity leave, crèche and prenatal and postnatal care.
237. Sexual harassment committees as per the 'Vishaka Judgment' of the Supreme Court should be set up by Employer/Welfare Boards.
238. The Government of India should sign and ratify the International Labour Organisation Convention on Domestic Workers and the United Nations Convention on Migrants.
239. There should be Implementation of the Equal Wages Act.
240. Action should be taken against exploitative programmes such as Sumangali Thittam in Tamil Nadu⁴
241. The implementation of the CEDAW/GR-26 should be ensured⁵.
242. Proper implementation of resettlement and rehabilitation strategies for Adivasis/displaced population so that they are not forced to migrate.

xii. Elderly

243. Setup helpline at taluka and district level for elderly counseling and prevention of elder abuse.
244. Create a National Association of Older Persons to deal with ageing issues in a more coordinated manner.
245. Establishment of a separate Commissionerate/ Directorate for elderly issues.
246. Sensitisation of the police to ageing issues, especially for the elderly living alone.

⁴ <http://www.hindu.com/2010/05/28/stories/2010052858300600.htm>

⁵ <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/recommendations/recommendations-26.htm>

247. Establishment of Institute of Gerontology at the national level.
248. The creation of a welfare fund for the elderly by levy of an appropriate cess.
249. Framing of an age-sensitive 12th Plan/approach paper.
250. A uniform social pension scheme in all states for all senior citizens from the unorganised sector must be set up under Indira Gandhi National Old Age Pension Scheme (IGNOAP) and budgetary support should be given for people above 60 years of age. Existing models in Goa and Delhi should be scaled up. The recommended amount should be Rs.500 per month each from the Centre and the State.
251. Pension should be delivered through banks/post offices/smart card.
252. The rate of interest on bank deposits of elderly should be increased by 2 per cent over existing rates for normal citizens.
253. Senior citizen issues should be included in the thrust areas of CSR of companies and banks.
254. Concessions in income tax should be given to the care givers of the elderly and those co-residing with their parents.
255. Pension reforms should be undertaken at regular points of time by taking into consideration inflation, cost of living and other indices.
256. Old age homes, atleast one each at taluka and district level should get budgetary support.
257. Establishment of day care centres, to be run by Senior Citizens Associations/NGOs.
258. As a special consideration 80+ year old elderly and widows should be given pension irrespective of the socio economic segment they belong to.
262. Orientation/sensitization of government officials.
263. The appointment of a Monitoring Officer in each ministry or mandating the Ministry of Minority Affairs to ask for status report on quarterly basis of the adherence to the 15 per cent spending for minorities (10 per cent exclusively for Muslims)
264. Progress of the Prime Minister's much talked about 15 point programme for minorities should be transparently shared with the nation on a half yearly basis.
265. Equity and inclusion in a pluralistic society like India will only be possible when the importance of Muslims as an essential part of the diverse Indian social mosaic is squarely recognised. Therefore, as recommended by the Sachar Committee, an Equal Opportunity Commission (EOC) to look into the grievances of the deprived groups, especially Muslims should be set up.
266. To increase participation of Muslims in the democratic institutions such as Parliament, state legislatures, local self government and co-operative institutions, the commission should formulate and implement a special programme.
267. One place where Muslims are over-represented is prisons. Barring Assam, the proportion of Muslims in prison is considerably higher than their share in the population. Anti-Muslim discrimination has intensified in recent years. This is reflected in the harsh application of discriminatory measures to Muslims. All this amounts to systematic exclusion, discrimination and institutionalised prejudice. Establish a standing machinery to periodically review the anti Muslim bias in the performance of the law enforcement machinery.
268. Police reforms should be accomplished according to the Law Commission recommendations.
269. Establish minority cells in police and other departments for oversight and rendering of help to minorities.

xiii. Muslims

259. Training programmes for Muslims should be started to build their confidence and facilitate their inclusion in governance from the panchayat to the parliament level.
260. Formation of information cells at block level to provide information on various government welfare schemes.
261. Revision of BPL policy for proper distribution of BPL cards.
270. The Minority Commission should be given more powers and a greater role of oversight with power to punish.
271. Setting up of government institutes to promote vocational training initiatives for underprivileged Muslim women.
272. Increase budgetary allocation for the empowerment of Muslim women and allocate more funds for Muslim women in the Ministry for Women and Child development.

273. Ensure Central and state responsibility to provide for the development of Muslim women.
274. Ensure Muslims women's inclusion in different government schemes like ASHA worker and Aanganwari.
275. Development of Muslim women should not be limited to leadership development schemes and some scholarships to girl students only. The 12th Plan should include Muslim women as an individual part for each development beneficiary. Special budgetary allocation with a monitoring body can be created to look after the development of Muslim women.
276. A suitable law needs to be passed by the Parliament for the protection of minorities by covering atrocities against them under a criminal statute on par with the SC/ST Prevention of Atrocities Act. This will ensure that harassment and profiling of minorities is not done. In cases of riots, blasts and terrorist activities, even before the preliminary investigations are done, some Muslim names are flashed in the media, which not only affects the investigations, but creates a very negative perception about Muslims in society. Similarly, in cases of riots, strict punishment to those responsible should be given and they should also be asked to pay compensation to the victims, (Rs. 25 lacs and jobs to the dependents of the victims). This will stop any riots in future.
277. A communal violence prevention law that makes officials accountable for their omission and commission should be enacted.
278. Civil society should be given a role in monitoring during communal riots.
279. Police reforms should be implemented and sensitisation of the Police towards the needs of the minority should be done.
280. Minority representation in the police force/security agencies should be in proportion to their population.
281. Education should be ensured to the children affected by communal riots apart from providing alternative housing and employment.
- or strengthened at district, state and national levels to promote community involvement in planning, implementation and monitoring of programmes. GIPA should be incorporated into the national policy as a key prevention strategy. The programmes should not only be limited to HIV but should encompass other domains such as education, welfare, NRHM, NUHM etc. and everywhere meaningful representation of the PLHIV should be ensured.
283. The PLHIV community also consists of individuals belonging to marginalised populations such as Sex Workers, Injecting Drug Users, Men who have sex with men, Transgenders and Hijras. This diversity should be recognised and the means of their involvement established. Issues of gender need to be imbibed in every step of the planning and implementation process.
284. The PLHIV community needs support and capacity-building for their meaningful involvement. This needs to be accounted for in the planning to include support to functioning of PLHIV networks and other associations, technical inputs in the form of trainings and mentoring, state and national platforms for dialogue, meaningful representation at executing bodies e.g. State AIDS Control Societies, Panchayati Raj Institutions, village health committees etc.
285. Concrete steps need to be taken for the reduction and eradication of HIV related stigma and episodes of enacted stigma at all places and services with special focus on health care, employment, law enforcement and the judiciary. Stigma is not only a consequence of HIV or the fear of it but also results from predisposing factors such as social norms, caste, religion, race, sexuality, economic and gender disparities. Recognising the factors that promote stigma a programme for its eradication has to be developed and implemented using a comprehensive framework.
286. All workplace environments should have an HIV and AIDS work place policy in place.
287. All sections within the private and public domain should ensure a stigma free environment as a mandate. Health care settings in the country need to make a resolve to provide a stigma free environment and services of the highest quality achievable to the PLHIV.
288. There is also a need for accessible and faster mechanisms to resolve grievances including legal action with priority given to women and children.

xiv. PLHIV

282. Keeping the PLHIV at the centre and with the guiding principle of Greater Involvement of People Living with HIV and AIDS (GIPA) functional processes and mechanisms need to be established

289. Support mechanisms for the PLHIV to enable them to counter self stigma need to be established.
290. Development and strengthening of community mechanisms such as PLHIV welfare boards at the state level to bridge the gap between the community and the state and national Governments and the service providers. State and national forums for interaction and learning need to be established, especially in the case of marginalised communities.
291. Establishment of a single window system of access at the district and state level for People Living and affected by HIV, for receiving services, entitlements and social welfare schemes such as MGNREGS work, BPL cards, widow pension plans, insurance etc. The model developed by the Delhi State Government could be replicated for this.
292. Establishing platforms and mechanisms at the district, state and national levels for effective feedback, advocacy and monitoring by the PLHIV community of implementation of the programmes.
300. Key positions should be reserved for PWDs in project implementation.
301. There should be strict, transparent and accountable monitoring mechanisms with representation of PWD.
302. The allocated budget for each ministry should be spent in consultation with civil society and PWD organisations.
303. Women with disabilities have to be a part & parcel of the planning and programmes of each ministry and budget should be earmarked for implementation of this inclusion policy.
304. Important commissions like Women's Commission and Human Rights Commission should have inclusive policies including representation for Women with Disability (WWD).
305. Specific Policy and budget allocation for generating data and information on WWD in all kinds of statistics used for development planning and policies.
306. Women with Disability (WWD) should be part and parcel of all the gender mainstreaming and empowerment programme and policies at all levels.
307. There should be budget allocation for making all public service delivery gender sensitive and equipped to cater to the specific need of WWD.
308. The WWD should be a part of the rural and urban development planning process for their growth and development.
309. The High Support Groups (people with mental health disability and disability facing multiple marginalisation) should be specially catered for in all planning. There should be an information, education and communication campaign to sensitise people to the problems of these people.
310. All spaces meant for public use should be accessible to all.

xv. People with Disabilities

293. Disability to be included in all statutes, policies, policy guidelines, implementation and monitoring mechanisms – explicitly NOT implicitly.
294. People with Disability (PWD) and their organisations from rural and urban areas to included in planning, implementation, monitoring – with caste, region and gender balance.
295. Disability sensitivity component should be part of all HR curriculum of all statutory bodies, the judiciary, executive corporations and local bodies with adequate time and resources and with public and private sector partnerships.
296. All the unutilised funds in disability area should be carried forward to next term and should not be diverted to other sectors.
297. A transparent information mechanism should be put in place.
298. Orientation and sensitisation of all stakeholders on disability – Panchayat Raj Institutions, elected representatives and members of the Planning Commission.
299. The constitution of a separate ministry with adequate allocation of budget for PWD.

6

Technology and Innovation

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM
THE DISCUSSION GROUPS RELATED TO CHILDREN,
ADOLESCENTS, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND DALITS.

Technology and Innovation

Section Contents

Context	71
Children	71
Dalits	71
People with Disability	71

Specific Recommendations	72
Children	72
Dalits	72
Adolescents	73
People with Disability	73

1. Context

i. Children

The proportion of children is about 40 per cent of the population and so to ensure that children have access to equitable opportunities, technology and innovation have to play a crucial role. Technology and innovation are means for ensuring addressing challenges for children, particularly in areas such as health, education and skill development. India's spending on research and development remains a mere 0.8 per cent of the GDP – much lower than other Asian countries. Particular emphasis has to be given to the development of agriculture, forestry, fishing, space, industrial development and health. Consequently, there are not enough creative solutions being generated to address some of the biggest problems children face – lack of basic healthcare, high levels of malnutrition, poor quality of teaching etc. These can easily be addressed through innovation and technology.

ii. Dalits

There is hardly any inclusion of the concerns of the Dalits in policies related to science and technology. Institutions for science and technology tend to cater only to the privileged sections rather than those from marginalized sections. Very little investment is made on technologies required by Dalit communities and this should be corrected. There continues to be an upper-caste dominance in professions, business,

culture and the world of information technology. Dalits and Adivasis, specifically the poorer sections, live in vulnerable and hazard-prone areas since these areas are cheaper. There have been no investments made to mitigate these risks through technological innovations which will provide safe and clean living and working conditions for them.

iii. People with Disability

Most often, people with disabilities cannot access web content or operate educational software because of its inaccessible design. People with disability do not receive the benefits of technology. The use of information technology is widespread in schools and employment settings. It has the potential to maximize the independence, participation, and productivity of people with disabilities. However, this potential can only be reached if all people with disabilities can use IT independently and effectively. This requires that people with disabilities be provided with the assistive technology they need and that schools, places of employment, public offices etc procure, develop, and use accessible IT applications.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Children

1. The 12th Plan should pay specific attention to the promotion of innovation not just for 'commercial markets' but with an explicit focus on reducing poverty through 'inclusive innovation'. These should not be restricted to new products, but must also include innovation in public service system delivery, monitoring and development of new organizational models. It is necessary to reorient our approach and rethink how technology can be used to improve the way government agencies interact, deliver services and connect with citizens. In other words, technology should be viewed as a tool that can transform and democratise government.
2. The 12th Plan must establish a results-based framework for ensuring accountability, coordination and transparency by harnessing the benefits of technology. Information and communication technology (ICT) must be utilised to improve and expand the delivery of services and empower citizens.
3. Establish a platform to address 'innovations in delivery of public services' focusing on maternal and child health, education, skill development, teacher training etc. This realm lies outside the conventional industrial concept of innovation with an emphasis on R&D labs and patents.
4. Increased support should be provided for grassroots innovators for impacting the lives of children through the National Innovation Foundation. A Government Fund to provide seed money and early-stage assistance to develop innovations that will produce socially useful outcomes for marginalized children must be provided.
5. Funding must be provided for research on assistive technology, i.e. any kind of technology that can enhance the functional independence of children with disability.
6. Computer-assisted technology must be used to enhance teaching and learning processes and the focus must be on bridging the digital divide that exists between rich and poor children. Online learning offers the possibility of delivering rich curricula to students who do not have access to a wide course selection.

7. Importance must be given to reducing infant and child mortality through telemedicine, which allows children and adults, particularly those in rural or underserved areas, to receive high-quality healthcare from a distance. Telemedicine is a tool that can ensure that the underprivileged obtain care they would otherwise face great difficulty in accessing.
8. Technology, particularly EduSat, must be utilized to provide pre and in-service teacher training in order to meet the requirement of the 1.2 million trained teachers currently needed to implement the Right to Education.
9. Technology must be provided through innovative means to impart skill development to young adults ready to enter the job market.

ii. Dalits

10. Science and technology continue to be influenced by a limited group of people. There is an urgent need to democratise science and technology. Therefore, the main focus of the 12th Plan should be on exploring the goals for science and technology with the people. The transparent sharing of investments and allocations should be ensured through participatory mechanisms that bring in diverse stakeholders into decision-making.
11. Incentives should be provided to the public and private sectors to conduct research and find technological solutions to problems of work and living conditions, hazardous occupations, discharge of industrial and domestic waste in widely used rivers, groundwater contamination, survival and reproduction of fish species in river ecosystems, housing, urban waste management, hazardous or disaster prone areas, availability of cooking fuel for women, energy for remote areas, rural and urban small scale enterprises.
12. Several Dalits are engaged in crucial occupations such as waste management of cities, hygiene, scavenging of leather, etc. However, very little technological investment and research is done for improving their working conditions. Technologies need to be brought in to mitigate occupational hazards, improve working conditions incorporating the labour and knowledge of these communities. The investments in science, technology and innovation for this purpose should be made publicly available for scrutiny among different stakeholders and be reported to Parliament.

13. There is also a need to incorporate the participation of Dalits in other consultations on science, technology and innovation besides discussions on sanitation, toilets, etc. This is crucial to ensure that the intended benefits of technological advancement and innovation touch all sections of society and spheres of life and create opportunities for all.
14. India has attained self-sufficiency in foodgrains production. To feed the large population in the coming decades, extensive efforts are being made in different fields of agricultural science and biotechnology to further increase the food production of the country. In the current context of climate change, research could look closely at the weather-resilient crops and farming practices being followed by small farmers by including them as stakeholders and innovators rather than just depending on private and academic research institutions. Participatory research initiatives and experiments should be taken up on a broader scale for all important decisions on science and technology that impact the market. Thus, there is a greater need to look at traditional varieties of crops which can take moisture stress, are easily available and can be maintained by farmers with less input costs.
15. Institutions engaged in scientific research must have representatives from the most marginalized communities to balance research interests in favour of the Dalits.

iii. Adolescents

16. 'Innovation Hubs' should be set up for adolescents. These could be integrated into recommended 'resource centres' at the Panchayat/ward level. This would enhance the possibility of diversity in innovation as they would be context-specific and would minimize the rural-urban divide.
19. Universal design refers to the design of products and environments so that they are usable by everyone, to the greatest extent possible. A teacher is applying universal design when he purchases an instructional videotape that includes captions for children who are deaf, even though he does not currently have a student who is deaf in his class. The manager of a computer lab is applying universal design when he purchases adjustable tables for students who are smaller or larger than usual or who use wheelchairs. Such universal design principles friendly to PWD must be incorporated in all technology acquisition. Promoting universal design is a powerful way to get one's message across. Just as ramps installed for people who use wheelchairs also benefit those who are pushing delivery carts or baby strollers, accessible IT benefits individuals with and without disabilities. For example, captioning on videotapes can benefit students whose first language is not English and individuals who are learning to read.
 20. Accessible information technology is created when producers consider the needs of PWD in the process of designing IT applications and products. More accessible products minimise the need for AT; they are also compatible with existing AT products. This must be incentivised. AT and accessible information technology work together to allow everyone to access all product features and also allow PWD to participate side-by-side with their peers to complete assignments, access information, and engage in collaborations, simulations, jobs and tutorials.
 21. Building accessible information systems requires the concerted effort of policy makers, IT specialists, AT specialists, teachers, and other decision-makers. A good place to start is district-wide policy that clearly states a commitment to the purchase and use of accessible products, including IT products. For this, clear guidelines regarding accessible IT can be established. Procedures should ensure that accessibility is considered at all stages of technology planning and support. Creating accessible information systems requires close collaboration between those who serve PWD and those who make IT decisions, approve purchases, and provide technical support. As with all systemic change initiatives, persistence of advocates and cooperation among stakeholders is the key.

iv. People with Disability

17. Assistive technology (AT), such as a text-to-speech application, can help a person with disability operate a computer. Grammar checkers, alternative keyboards, hands-free interfaces are all facilitated by AT and this should be provided to all PWD along with computers.
18. Information technology (IT) includes computers, software, Web sites, telephones, CDs, videotapes, calculators and other electronic devices. Many IT

7 Securing the Energy Future of India

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM THE
DISCUSSION GROUPS RELATED TO THE NORTH EAST,
ADIVASIS AND DALITS

Securing the Energy Future of India

Section Contents

Context	77
Adivasis	77
Dalits	77
<hr/>	
Specific Recommendations	78
Adivasis	78
Dalits	78
North East	78

1. Context

i. Adivasis

Mega energy projects have adversely impacted the lives and livelihoods of Adivasis; yet, Adivasi areas are still largely without regular and adequate electricity. Thus, energy security and the security of the lives and livelihoods of the Adivasis have to be linked to each other so that the latter is not sacrificed for the former.

ii. Dalits

Energy security has been so far denied to deprived people living in rural and remote areas, especially the SCs and STs. There has been a stress on electricity being generated and distributed through conventional systems dependent on dams, coal, oil or gas; these have failed to reach unconnected villages, especially in Adivasi areas and segregated habitations of scheduled castes. More than the quantum of generation, what matters is the problem of distribution of power to all. The government has adopted the wrong approach in non-conventional energy also, by setting up large solar power plants similar to conventional power production. This will result in the lack of power to the powerless yet again!

Moreover, by bundling power prices, the poor and the common man are being made to pay for high-capacity generation being offered to the rich by the government.

Small investors from SC/ST communities could have been easily introduced into this vital infrastructure sector. After all, the total requirement for the investment could easily have come from Indian credit institutions, besides the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank, who are zealous in helping only the rich in solar investment. The conventional sources of energy cannot cater to the marginalised sections. Investment in these will only help big industrialists, city dwellers and similar people who already enjoying almost 80 per cent of the power produced while about 30-40 per cent of people are bereft of power. Unfortunately, there is a disproportionate emphasis on power generation using oil and gas through privatisation. This is directly helping a select few multi-millionaires to strengthen their stranglehold over political and bureaucratic governance in the country besides making them rich at the cost of the common man. The common man is made to pay a higher tariff for the power produced by the private sector who invest only on the condition that a higher tariff will be ensured for their profiteering.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Adivasis

1. Increase technical and financial support for decentralised non-conventional energy sources so as to meet the needs of the Adivasi communities.
2. Revisit the energy projects located in Adivasi areas which cause large scale displacement and environmental degradation and allow only those which do not affect the lives and livelihoods of the people and the environment.
3. Reframe the energy policy (especially the dependence on thermal power projects) in the light of climate change because unregulated coal mining has also created ecological damage in Adivasi areas.
4. Recognise the coping mechanisms adopted by primitive tribes in areas, such as the development of drought-resistant crops, where climate change is very visible.
5. Provide support for the use of solar energy as well as expand research that makes its use cost-effective.
6. Set up rural polytechnics for enhancing the skills of local youth in the use of non-conventional energy resources.
7. The energy projects must be based on 'Intergenerational Equity Analysis' that allows the next generation a safe environment and future. All polluting energy projects must be made to pay for environmental as well as human damage.
8. The pollution-bearing capacity of an area must be determined before any energy project is sanctioned. The Damodar Valley alone has more than 1200 industrial projects that have caused severe damage.

ii. Dalits

9. Solar energy could be produced from solar photovoltaic (SPV) units of up to 1 kW capacity for local decentralised distribution.
10. All the energy generation through non-conventional methods should be small-scale so that indigenous people can participate in their distribution and

use. Thus, the promotion of private investment in conventional power projects (like hydel, coal, oil and gas) should be avoided since this will only mean higher tariffs for the people and will be antithetic to the energy security of the poor.

11. Investments in conventional power generation and distribution should be made only by public undertakings of the Government of India and the states.
12. Private investment should be allowed only if it is inclusive. This could be done by making it obligatory that at least 5-10 per cent of the equity should be reserved for SCs and STs and provided on loan by the government. They should be represented in the governing bodies and one of the key management personnel at the directorial level should be from these communities.
13. While conventional power does not yield to smaller generation capacities, renewable energy immensely provides the scope for small generation. The investment in a 100kW SPV power plant would hardly come to only Rs. 1 crore. There are thousands of SCs in this country who can singly or jointly invest this amount with credit and grant support from the government. Solar power generation, therefore, is an ideal technology for ensuring inclusive growth through inclusive financial and credit planning.
14. The allocation for non-conventional energy does not exceed 23 per cent of the total power budget and this should be done under the SCSP and TSP.
15. The energy security of the poor should also be ensured by providing not less than 50 per cent of distributorships/retailerships of petrol, diesel, kerosene and LPG to SCs/STs. The government should set up a task force headed by an inclusive thinker from the SC/ST community assisted by experts in energy for this purpose.

iii. North East

16. Rationalise the demand for energy with the environmental and social costs associated with energy generation.
17. In remote and low population rural areas in the Northeast, emphasis should be on providing subsidised renewable lighting systems like solar LED home lighting systems.

8

Accelerated Development of Transport Infrastructure

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM THE
DISCUSSION GROUPS ON CHILDREN, YOUTH AND
NORTH EAST

Accelerated Development of Transport Infrastructure

Section Contents

Context	81
Children	81
<hr/>	
Specific Recommendations	82
Children	82
North East	82
Youth	82

1. Context

i. Children

Children's access to support and opportunity are limited by insufficient and unaffordable transportation. The poorest and most isolated are the worst affected. Transportation plans must consciously address the communication and mobility needs of the poor. Poor connectivity and lack of road and transport development limits people's access to essential services, markets and development opportunities. Rural connectivity needs must be better addressed, so that 'remote' areas do not remain isolated and cut off from development. Transportation sector investments can transform access to healthcare, nutrition, education, skills, and employment of parents. Long distances and unsafe routes to school significantly undermine education access, especially for girls and the disabled. One consequence of rural underdevelopment due to remoteness is the increasing incidence of urban migration. In urban settings also, families often find themselves living in even more precarious situations with lack of proper transport facilities. Policy and planning must also take into account the fact that a large portion of India's population cannot afford private motorised forms of transportation and still rely on slower, lower-cost means, some of which are being pushed off the roads by faster traffic. As disadvantaged communities increasingly find themselves pushed out of city centres and relegated to settlements on the outskirts of urban areas, affordable and accessible public transportation is becoming even more important. Public investment in transport infrastructure is being overshadowed by private investment and this trend must be corrected in the 12th Plan.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Children

1. Ensure priority for transportation development in rural, remote and under-served areas.
2. Prohibit all forms of child labour in the construction and maintenance of transport infrastructure.
3. Assess the impact of existing and proposed transport on children and disadvantaged communities, especially with regard to affordability and the connectivity to employment opportunities.
4. Increase investment in public transport by cross-subsidising it through the levy of higher taxes on personal transport.
5. Ensure establishment and vigilant application of road and transport safety standards.
6. All transportation infrastructure must abide by the Indian Disability Act.
7. Special attention must be focused on improving road safety in areas near parks, playgrounds, schools and other areas frequented by children.
8. Address overlapping responsibilities and the fragmentation of funds between agencies for maintenance and development of roads.
9. Provide for capacity building and empowerment of PRIs in the planning, building and maintenance of transportation infrastructure.

ii. North East

10. Far-flung areas in the North East must be connected with all-weather roads. The process of road building should include communities residing in the respective locations and funds for regular and proper maintenance should be made available.

iii. Youth

11. Only 20 per cent of trips in cities are made by cars but all roads are designed only for private vehicles, and the needs of pedestrians, cyclists, buses, and all other para-transit modes are being ignored. This should be reversed and more attention paid to promoting public transport, cycling and walking.

9 Rural Transformation and Sustained Growth of Agriculture

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM THE DISCUSSION GROUPS ON CHILDREN, YOUTH, DALITS, ADIVASIS, MIGRANTS, NORTH EAST, WOMEN AND CONFLICT-RIDDEN AREAS

Rural Transformation and Sustained Growth of Agriculture

Section Contents

Context	85
Adivasis	85
Youth	85
Dalits	85

Specific Recommendations	86
Adivasis	86
Youth	86
Women	87
Dalits	87
Children	88
Migrants	88
North East	88
Conflict-Ridden Areas	89

1. Context

i. Adivasis

The diversion of agricultural land for industry and mining is the major concern for Adivasi areas. Traditional subsistence agriculture on small landholdings requires massive research and funding support. In its absence, and due to diminishing returns from agriculture and the inability of farmers to access development schemes and programmes, there is massive migration from Adivasi areas. The lack of irrigation facilities and other technology, lack of institutional finance and the exploitation by middlemen further handicap the agriculture of the Adivasis.

ii. Youth

The focus on national food security has led to agricultural production policies that have contributed to large distortions in rural society. There is no special budget for agriculture, unlike for the railways. Thus, agriculture loses out in terms of focus and importance. A major local problem is that landholdings are getting smaller by the year. Dryland farming has been utterly neglected, and there is an unsustainable race for water for irrigation. Sustainable farming practices based on local knowledge have been completely discarded. Instead, unsustainable, external input-dependent technology is being vigorously pursued. The highly-centralized planning in food and agriculture has taken a toll on local institutions and innovations. Thus,

young rural people feel completely marginalized. A general air of despair has enveloped the agrarian landscape, which in turn makes rural youth feel totally aimless and abandoned. Climate change and global warming are looming as a potential for havoc on our agriculture.

iii. Dalits

Planning should enable small and marginal Dalit farmers to cultivate indigenous crop varieties through organic techniques, rather than exotic crops, and increase their marketability. Similarly, small and marginal farmers who contribute 70 per cent of India's agricultural produce should be protected from the vagaries of nature by the provision of crop insurance. All sorts of absentee landlords and corporate agriculture should be discouraged by charging additional taxes and by providing incentives to environment-friendly community living with affirmative programmes and schemes.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Adivasis

1. Direct subsidies should be given to farmers similar to those given to industry.
2. Support, guidance and credit should be given for promotion of traditional farming (organic farming).
3. Value addition through local post-farm industries processing agricultural and minor forest produce should be promoted.
4. A white paper should be released on status of land diversion/allocation for *Jatropha* plantations.
5. There should be registration of middlemen involved in buying and selling of forest produce.
6. Give recognition to traditional knowledge and skills in organic agriculture and herbal medicine.
7. Skills training in traditional livelihoods for value addition and marketing.
8. Multinational corporations should be banned from the retail marketing of agricultural products and instead opportunities must be created for marketing of Adivasi agricultural and forest products.
9. Release a White Paper on farmer suicides and prepare a comprehensive plan for revitalising agriculture in consultation with farmers' movements.
10. Restructure the agricultural extension system for supporting the small and marginal farmers with assured input facilities.
11. Reframe the agriculture policy for promoting and conserving millets and coarse grains.
12. Extend irrigation facilities to the lands of small and marginal Adivasi farmers.
13. Extend financial and technical support for conservation and rejuvenation of traditional water harvesting systems in Adivasi areas (like bamboo check dam and Jhiriya of Chhattisgarh, Katta-Munda method of western Orissa, Path Pani of Western Madhya Pradesh etc.)

ii. Youth

14. Pursue community food sovereignty in place of national food security. The food sovereignty paradigm is deeply transformative in its vision, policies and practices. It comprehensively addresses the issues of land reforms, peasant agriculture, local production, sustainable food systems and livelihood production within an ecological framework all of which are so forward looking that they cannot but inspire youth to engage in its realisation.
15. A special agricultural budget should be instituted on the lines of the Railway Budget. Such a budget should accord a special role for the youth considering their potential to contribute substantially to ecological regeneration of agriculture and food sovereignty.
16. Refocus on land distribution and give it priority. If women and youth are treated as the beneficiaries of the new land reforms, it can play a major stabilizing role for young people and prevent a lot of distress out-migration from villages to cities.
17. Recognise that dryland farming sans irrigation has enormous capacity to offer solutions to our food, fodder, nutrition, ecological and livelihood problems all of which are so critical for the next generation. Therefore, un-irrigated dryland agriculture must be pursued vigorously. On a rough estimate, dryland agriculture on 100 million hectares in the country can provide a minimum of 50 million livelihood years. This can be a huge support for young people in rural areas. Proper investment must be made in sustaining agricultural livelihoods through rejuvenating dryland soils.
18. Promotion of local knowledge-based biodiverse ecological farming systems can infuse fresh life into the rural landscape. Therefore, this must become the growth engine in rural and agricultural planning. Such farming systems use internal inputs and provide a perfect energy balance. By cutting farming expenses, they can halt rural farmer suicides. This will enhance the youth's respect for and dependence on their own community knowledge systems and help them to lead a self-reliant and satisfying life.
19. Support should be provided for dryland millet-based farming which can be a lasting solution for climate change.

iii. Women

20. Recognise women as farmers. Provide subsidies and loan for women and women's collectives to buy land for agriculture and then cultivate it.
21. All agricultural land should be in the name of both women and rules should be made to this effect.
22. Women-friendly tools for agriculture and the traditional sector should be developed.
23. Natural resource management should include women in all planning and implementation initiatives.
24. Water Users' Associations should include women agriculture labourers as members with full voting powers and ownership of land should be removed as a criterion of membership as women do not own land in most cases.

iv. Dalits

25. Most of the initiatives in rural transformation have been promoted through private sector companies and the PPP model. Contracts for making available urban infrastructure in villages for instance have benefited large companies. For real inclusive growth, this should have been done with the help of groups of cooperatives and societies formed by Dalits living in the villages so that they could benefit from such policies.
26. Barren land should be made fertile and available for distribution to landless farmers.
27. Localised models innovated and owned by people themselves should be followed for rural electrification and irrigation needs such as construction of tube wells and wells in Dalit hamlets and subsidy should be given for construction of minor irrigation structures to the people.
28. Loans are hardly being made accessible to SCs for agricultural and village-level enterprises. There are numerous stories and a long list of rejection of loan applications from SCs by banks due to caste discrimination. It should be made mandatory that all banks allocate up to 25 per cent of loans to SC beneficiaries.
29. According to studies conducted on major dams and power projects, it has been found that out of 56 million people involuntarily displaced by major dams,

as high a proportion as 62 per cent is of SCs and STs. The benefits of irrigation and electricity, however, have routinely bypassed the dam affected (WCD, India Study). Given the high capital cost, long-term gestation period and environmental and social costs, hydropower generation is not a preferred option for power generation. Smaller models run by people with small grants or subsidies to them should be explored.

30. Narrow targeting of the PDS has weakened the PDS system; its role of price stabilization has become ineffective. Since a huge part of the population buys from the market, particularly Dalits who are landless, there is huge wastage of food stocks rotting in FCI godowns. Hoarding has made the system prone to leakage. Starvation deaths, malnutrition and food needs of the rising number of the poor still have to be met and there should be no cuts in food subsidies.
31. In agriculture, several Dalits are cultivators but not owners of the land; hence, loans, subsidies and benefits should be accessible to cultivators also who may not have land titles but are engaged in agricultural production on leased land. Broadbasing land reforms by ensuring the provision of at least 5 acres of land to each peasant and access to traditional means of fisheries should be followed.
32. Timely supply of quality seeds from government channels to peasants should be ensured and compensation given to farmers who receive unproductive seeds. The authorities responsible for delay in supply of quality seeds should be taken to task. Organic farming and research on local practices/indigenous knowledge of the Dalit farmers should be encouraged.
33. An Agricultural Land Ceiling Act should be implemented immediately and all planning should start from the level of land available to Dalits. Collective farming among Dalits should be promoted and encouraged. The State should reserve land resources for Dalits/Adivasis. Lands allotted to Dalits/Adivasis should be non-transferable under any circumstances to persons belonging to non-Dalit/non-Adivasi communities.
34. Programmes such as the Bharat Nirman need to ensure that all benefits planned for rural areas reach Dalits. The approaches should look at minimising segregation and increasing access to services and integration within Dalit society.

v. Children

35. Children from rural areas need special provisions to ensure their rights are safeguarded and plans must be developed that specifically target their protection, health and education.
36. The Child Labour Prohibition and Regulation Act needs to be amended to prohibit all forms of labour for children aged 14 and below with agriculture being recognised as a hazardous form of labour.
37. Programmes such as the Bharat Nirman should be expanded to meet the rights of all children.
38. The MGNREGS should be used for developing basic and sustainable infrastructure in rural areas.
39. Involve private investment as a supplement to public investment through forms of PPP. This can be done to acquire financial capacities as well as for implementation.
40. Poor design of monitoring and service delivery mechanism, resulting in poor utilisation and leading to continued high prevalence of malnutrition. The local governance infrastructure is not utilised to map out services required for children.
41. Scheme/service coverage for children under three years of age remains inadequate. Reliance on the take-away ratio in ICDS for children under three involves the risk that it goes into the family pot and does not reach the child. Nutritional anaemia has increased in the age group of 0-3 (NFHS-III). Action has to be taken to correct this.
42. Ensure access to insurance in the agricultural sector to reduce the impact of environmental shocks.
43. Make and monitor interconnections between sustainable livelihoods and child survival, development and protection and include this as an indicator for concurrent impact evaluation of livelihood/employment schemes.
44. Pro-poor agricultural and forest development to forestall migration and destitution should be planned.
45. Skill training should be provided to agriculturists/landless people for multiple options in their areas.
46. Changing land-use patterns (reliance on single cash crops, for example) are leading to lower availability of food from household production and this has to be addressed.
47. Most often, children who fail to receive protection in

rural settings end up in even worse settings in urban centres due to forced or induced migration. Therefore, the status of child protection should be adopted as an indicator of poverty and used in planning and policy formulation exercises as a measure of success of various development programmes.

48. The rights of Adivasis and other socially excluded groups should be respected and upheld by the law so that land cannot be sold to non-Adivasis for commercial purposes without strong agreement from all parties.

vi. Migrants

49. Comprehensive disaggregated data should be collected in the cases of mass displacement and the implementation of resettlement and rehabilitation programmes should be tracked.
50. Consultations with the local population under conditions suitable for the affected population must be undertaken. Although provisions for public hearing exist, they are currently not enforced or implemented. Public hearing must be done in the same place where the project (building of plants, constructions of dams, etc.) is to be implemented and with the people who would be affected.
51. In the case of natural disasters/calamities, the entire community must be resettled in one common place.
52. Adivasis must be given opportunities and the preference to be employed in forest departments and must be allowed to collect the natural products from the forest for their livelihood.

vii. North East

53. Irrigation is almost non-existent in the region. With climate change and unpredictable rains, irrigation facilities will become critical. Promote indigenous methods of irrigation such as terraced rice fields and use of rainwater for lowland paddy cultivation. These can be improved and supported through state financial interventions including micro-credit.
54. Promote the use of indigenous farming methods and indigenous crops. Higher purchase price should be set for indigenous crops and subsidies provided to those using traditional methods and crops. Millets have a great potential in the North East and must be promoted.

55. There should be a platform for marketing goods from remote villages with a process that includes storage (including cold storage for food products) and food processing.
56. Subsidy should be given for animal feed as the North East is highly dependent on animal husbandry for both food and cash.

viii. Conflict-Ridden Areas

57. Dams and roads require large-scale land acquisition and so these projects have created immense discontent due to forced displacement and human rights violations. What is needed is a more democratic and transparent policy that includes a proper debate not just on resettlement and rehabilitation but on what is meant by “development” and who it is for.
58. Mechanization of agriculture should be prevented, as this leads to more unemployment.
59. No agricultural land should be used for setting up industries. Fertile land should be most appropriately used for production of food grains only. Grabbing of lands by MNCs should be stopped. Acquisition of agricultural land needs to be discouraged. Adivasi and other agricultural land should not be taken away forcefully. Eviction of farmers from their land results in migration to the cities, which needs to be discouraged.
60. Dams and mines should not take away agricultural land. Big dams for major irrigation should be discouraged and stopped forthwith. Minor eco-friendly small irrigation dams should be encouraged in every village.
61. An Irrigation Guarantee Scheme should be set up. Under this, all agricultural areas should be provided with irrigation facilities to minimise the effects of drought or floods in any area and also to ensure guaranteed production of food grains.
62. Local seed banks should be set up as they are absolutely necessary for improving productivity. Genetically modified seeds should be banned.
63. Biogas plants and other village-based sources of energy should be revitalized.
64. The village, its culture and economy should be protected, preserved, promoted and propagated by all means.
65. Agriculture and rural industry is the backbone of a village and the nation. Currently, we neglect both and so there is an acute unemployment in the villages. Consequently, there is migration of youth in large numbers from villages to the cities in search of employment. This is a serious matter threatening the existence of both villages and cities.
66. Agriculture and agro-based small scale and cottage industries in the villages should be promoted to absorb the youths by providing employment opportunities to prevent migration.
67. Hence, it is imperative to follow an integrated rural development plan involving development of agriculture and related activities, rural industries and rural infrastructure so as to develop a fairly self-reliant and continually growing complementary rural economy.
68. Farming should contribute more to the GDP, since India is primarily an agrarian economy. Even though we are moving towards higher productivity in the industrial and service sector, we should remain aware that self-sufficiency in the matter of food grains is a must for self reliance and sovereignty.
69. Provision should be made for a separate agricultural budget on the lines of the Railway Budget.
70. The pattern of planning should not be bureaucratic and decisions should not be made only in Delhi and imposed on villages. Proportional representation should be given to farmers in matters of policy formulation at all levels.
71. Protection of small and marginalised farmers should be given importance. Big landowners are still able to make their way through in the times of crisis but the small and marginal farmers suffer the most.
72. More storage facilities should be given to farmers.
73. More agricultural institutes and universities should be set up. The Planning Commission should take initiatives to establish a strong collaborative relationship between agriculture universities, Krishi Vigyan Kendras and NGOs to expedite the process of sustainable growth of agriculture in the villages.

10 Managing Urbanisation

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM THE DISCUSSION GROUPS ON CHILDREN, YOUTH, DALITS, ADOLESCENTS, TRANSGENDERS, NORTH EAST AND CONFLICT-RIDDEN AREAS

Managing Urbanisation

Section Contents

Context	93
Youth	93
Children	93

Specific Recommendations	94
Youth	94
Children	94
Adolescents	95
Dalits	95
Transgenders	96
North East	96
Conflict-Ridden Areas	96

1. Context

i. Youth

The major problems facing youth in urban areas are the lack of employment opportunities, the poor quality of educational facilities, the absence of proof of identity amongst the poorer classes in the informal sector, homelessness, drug abuse and harassment faced by street children and the larger issues of urban renewal and eviction of the working poor. The formal organised sector in cities is being replaced by the informal unorganised sector by design, as older manufacturing units are being shut down and service units are coming in, giving rise to widespread unemployment and under employment. In the name of ‘reforms’ and ‘efficiency’, the state’s role in providing welfare services is being reduced and the private sector is being invited to undertake the task, thereby increasing costs with no visible signs of better quality. As the organised sector is dismantled, the problems of proof of identity and residence have been emerging, since the informal sector provides neither security of tenure nor residential accommodation. All this has driven the youth into antisocial activities. The dream of the ‘world class’ city is being used to evict poor people, rendering more and more youth jobless and homeless – all for the sake of infrastructural development for private gain.

The average 9 per cent “growth” in GDP that is being achieved conceals the fact that 20 per cent Indians were being encouraged by deliberate planning to achieve 40 per cent “growth” (as in the case of investments in information technology and real estate, or mutual funds, or the Pay Commission, or salaries for Members of Parliament) while the remaining 80 per cent were being consigned to just over

1 per cent “growth”. The real income of this huge majority is going down due to inflation and wage squeeze being imposed to ensure more profits for the privileged few. Even the few remaining instruments for protecting the urban poor – such as the Urban Land Ceiling Act, labour laws and the entitlements to housing and basic services – are being steadily done away with.

ii. Children

India is a country of daunting numbers. It is estimated that nearly 140 million people will move to cities by 2020 and 700 million by 2050. Each state has urbanised in its own way, resulting in the coexistence of multiple urbanization models. Most of our cities are extremely crowded— 5 of the 20 most densely populated cities globally are Indian. While urbanization has fuelled economic growth in our cities, it has also resulted in a huge strain on existing physical infrastructure. Overcrowding, rampant growth of slums, disparities in living conditions and lack of equity in access to health services and community centres are serious problems. There is a shortage of land for Anganwadi centres, primary schools, primary health care centres and shelter. In most cities the critical infrastructure is now woefully inadequate, technologically outdated, increasingly fragile and incapable of meeting even the current needs of all its residents. Children’s rights to life, dignity, opportunity, health, education, and a safe, healthy environment where they can grow and develop to actively contribute to the building of a progressive and prosperous India are heavily curtailed. Further problems relate to a lack of identity proof and data gaps, which lead to denial of entitlements. There is a lack of convergence and appropriate governance structures to deal with these vast challenges.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Youth

1. The needs of the 80 per cent of urban citizens whose needs are ignored should be brought to the notice of the planners through quantitative surveys, studies and qualitative field data.
2. Facilitate the mobilisation and organisation of this 80 per cent so that they can assert their right to the city and to decentralised urban planning and governance.
3. Demonstrate that it is only by addressing the needs and aspirations of this 80 per cent that rational resource use and social justice can be achieved.
4. The youth expect the Planning Commission to make policy and financial provisions in the 12th Plan to incorporate this bottom-up perspective.

ii. Children

5. Planners must account for the thousands of “invisible” families in growing cities and their children’s rights and create provisions for adequate basic services.
6. When building and developing cities, it is critical that children are planned for, with schools and areas for play being allocated as a priority to ensure child’s rights to overall development.
7. Children migrate to urban centres as environmental refugees from Bangladesh, as children affected by conflict and as economic migrants with their families. Plans must be developed to integrate them into urban communities and to ensure that disruption to education is limited and their rights to health, protection and participation are addressed.
8. Local governance has to be strengthened if decentralisation is to be implemented in its true sense. Provision of services for children should be based on population density and not geographical area.
9. Capacity building of urban local government officials is needed so that they are able to understand child rights and the importance of child centric policy formulation.
10. Under the Constitution, children are guaranteed

the right to life, a clean environment and education. Building on this framework, the Government of India must develop national and state plans that lead to investing in a universal public health system and public education system that has world-class public infrastructure. Ensuring that children have access to clean and safe drinking water, sanitation and a clean environment with a waste management system that protects children from pollution requires massive investment in public infrastructure.

11. Based on the Right to Free and Compulsory Education Act, schools should see sustained infrastructure investment. All marginalised groups of children must be able to claim their right to quality and inclusive education. This should take place in safe buildings with safe play areas which promote holistic child development. Efficient maintenance and monitoring of infrastructure should take place on a timely basis and electricity and a broadband Internet connection should reach all schools through a time-bound ambitious framework, similar to the way in which road expansion plans are developed.
12. Spaces where children are safe to play and develop like playgrounds, gardens, community halls should be maintained and invested in.
13. Geographical Information Systems (GIS) allow the use and analysis of spatial information in conjunction with relevant socio-economic information, and this should be the basis for planning.
14. According to the Tendulkar Committee, 35 per cent of the country lives in poverty and, in all likelihood, need shelter. A national housing policy has to be developed and a legal framework for shelter should be created to ensure equal rights to all basic entitlements. Special provisions should be made and special plans should be developed to ensure that children living in slums and street children can access their rights to education, health, and a safe environment. Procedures for establishing identity must be developed and providing shelter to street children and their families should be given high priority.
15. Other states should adopt the Madhya Pradesh model where 20-25 per cent of development land as per the population distribution is reserved for economically weaker sections who are given awasi patta.
16. During allotment of plots or flats under various schemes, the size of households should be taken into consideration.

17. Unauthorised colonies should be regularised and provided with basic civic facilities.
18. National, state, and ward level monitoring committees have to be formed to ensure accountability and transparency.
19. When improving the lives of people living in slums, it is critical that quality schools are constructed that allow children to have access to education. This should be a priority to ensure children's rights to overall development. Further, the adequate health services accessible from slum areas must be provided.
20. Development schemes have to be employment-centric to provide for secure livelihoods with mandatory fair wages, so that children are less likely to be forced into child labour which has a severe impact on their social development.
21. This may be achieved by stopping contractual work in government schemes, implementation of existing labour laws in all urban areas without exception (including Special Economic Zones), and giving priority to those development works that generate maximum employment.
22. In addition, the poor residents of unauthorised colonies should be covered under the Swarn Jayanti Shahari Rozgar Yojana. The credit level for self-employment should be raised to Rs 30,000 and planned linkages have to be made between urban and rural employment schemes.
23. A comprehensive budget for the expansion and integration of formal and informal sectors has to be prepared that recognises the link between livelihoods and shelter and provides for universal identity and social security.
24. In order to maintain the integrity of these schemes there has to be a provision for their "social audit" linked to the Right to Information and explicit mention of all subsidies – concealed or otherwise. A Management Information System (MIS) for children is required to facilitate effective monitoring of these schemes.
25. Slum children, street children, migrant children and abandoned children should participate in urban planning so that special accessible secure spaces are created for their play and development and they are protected and able to access their right to education.
26. For those children living in institutional care homes, monitoring by an independent organisation must be undertaken to ensure their rights are protected.
27. A review of urban policies on per capita allocations for basic services and land allocation for shelter, health and education services should be undertaken.

iii. Adolescents

28. The lack of inclusion of adolescents in planning slum improvement has to be addressed. Adolescents' committees should be engaged in slum improvement. There should be an interface with community representatives, and it must ensure equal space for adolescent girls to voice their concerns related to slum improvement. Toilet facilities that are safe and friendly for adolescent girls must receive adequate attention.
29. More attention should be given to livelihood options at the local level in rural settings so that urban migration is reduced.

iv. Dalits

30. Despite a clear trend of urbanization, little has been done to ensure protection and safeguards for those shifting from agriculture to industrial work or rural-to-urban work. The focus of the plan, thus, has to be on measures through which Dalits may either seek out opportunities or be able to ensure sustained livelihoods for themselves.
31. Cities have not been able to cater to the needs of infrastructure, civic amenities, food, clothing, shelter and protection for the poor, women and children living in urban areas. While the urban poor and Dalits provide a vast number of services for urban development, such as construction work, domestic help, care giving, waste management, sanitation and hygiene, loading and unloading of goods and commodities and hospitality services in malls and shopping complexes, the basic rights of these communities are not addressed. Instead of slum improvement, the focus has been on slum removal. The emphasis has not been towards the betterment of housing needs for the homeless and poor but on their demolition and shifting to the margins. So, cities have not been able to show any example of inclusive growth. To ensure focus on inclusive growth, stress needs to be laid on the livelihoods, skills, resource availability and opportunities available for Dalits who are unemployed among the urban poor. The 12th

Plan could actually focus on demonstrating initiatives on inclusive growth in cities.

32. Cities have also become destination points of trafficking and continue to inflict violence on women, Dalits and Adivasis. Thus, a focus needs to be there on the kind of protection being made available in cities and the provisioning of safe, clean, healthy working and living conditions for all.
33. Urban planning remains concentrated on spatial planning, planning of goods and services and infrastructure for further growth, seldom incorporating within its purview the needs of the urban poor. Investments in urban infrastructure also remain skewed in favour of the rich and elite. Flyovers, roads and smooth water pipelines, etc tend to get concentrated in the pockets of the affluent. For instance, SCP/TSP funds in Delhi were used for infrastructure development such as building roads, hospitals, and other infrastructure in the business hubs or elite pockets of the city, while most Dalits who live in slums were left high and dry. Stringent safeguards need to be in place to balance the interests of the market and that of basic needs.
34. The main urban poverty alleviation programme is the SJSRY. However, several more innovative ideas can be brought within this programme, such as making available desktops and laptops and imparting skills that will enhance their employability and entrepreneurial acumen. Schemes such as Dalit Basti Yojana should be enhanced for Dalits in cities.
35. Most Dalits and Adivasis do not have identity cards in the city; as a result, they are not able to participate effectively in local urban governance. Effective mechanisms need to be found to ensure that every resident in the city is able to be part of urban participation and local governance programmes, irrespective of their migrant status.

v. Transgenders

36. Many transgenders and gender non-conforming individuals have no access to bathrooms/toilets and public spaces in urban areas. Some are told to use the bathroom/toilet that does not correspond to their gender identity. For transgender and gender non-conforming people, the lack of access to safe bathroom/restroom, public spaces is “the most

frequent form of discrimination faced but the least acknowledged by policy makers”. Transgenders and hijras face similar problems in prisons, hospitals and other spaces, where the administration is often not able to deal with their gender in a sensitive manner; for example, they put transgenders and hijras in male prisons during incarceration or in male wards during hospitalisation. It is therefore recommended that the government articulate and enforce guidelines for non-discriminatory practices allowing transgenders and hijras to safely access public and private facilities of their choice

vi. North East

37. Infrastructure for PWD should be provided in all public places.
38. Initiate programmes to deal with homelessness and destitution and provide shelters and facilities, particularly for women and children who are more vulnerable.
39. There is a need for capacity building of elected representatives in urban governance on issues relating to civics, ecology, solid waste management, etc.
40. Training should be provided for unemployed youth living in urban areas in manufacturing, construction of low-cost sanitation products, computer and technical skills.
41. Promotion of digital libraries and easy access to their users.

vii. Conflict-Ridden Areas

42. Redevelopment schemes in cities are getting more and more importance as new land is not available. While implementing various developmental schemes, it needs to be seen that the poor and deprived sections of the society are not thrown out.
43. Most of the mega-cities are not in a position to cope with increasing population. Infrastructure and services are collapsing and the poor and the marginal communities suffer the most. It is difficult for them to sustain themselves in an adverse scenario. Basic facilities like medical services, water and electricity should be made available at reasonable rates.

44. Plans should be adopted to develop at least 1000 smaller cities and towns rather than focusing only on the metros. These satellite cities/towns should be made to develop at a distance of about 200 km at least, so that people do not commute from one city to another on a daily basis but shift entirely to the new place.
45. Urbanization has led to ghettoisation of communities. This leads to misunderstanding about other communities and in turn becomes a fertile ground for conflict. Mixed localities that have the potential to avert possible conflict need to be set up.
46. A housing quota system with compulsory reservation for all communities in housing societies should be made mandatory in order to promote increased interaction and integration between communities.
47. The process of urbanization should be stemmed by developing the rural areas.

11 Improved Access to Quality Education

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE COME FROM THE DISCUSSION GROUPS ON CHILDREN, YOUTH, DALITS, ADOLESCENTS, ADIVASIS, ELDERLY, NORTH EAST, MUSLIMS, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY, WOMEN AND MIGRANTS

Improved Access to Quality Education

Section Contents

Context	101
Youth	101
Children	101
Adolescents	102
Dalits	102
Adivasis	103
Migrants	103

Specific Recommendations	104
Youth	104
Children	104
Adolescents	105
Dalits	106
Women	107
Adivasis	107
Migrants	107
North East	108
Elderly	108
Muslims	108
People with Disabilities	109

1. Context

i. Youth

The neglect of the pre-school segment affects all stages of further education as it is the foundational stage. The youth of today are cognisant of this gap in the education system which has affected many of them in later life. The elementary schooling sector is now governed by the Right to Education (RTE) Act, which seeks to fundamentally alter the quality of education in this segment as well as universalise it. The focus should be on its proper implementation. The concerns of the youth also relate to the bottlenecks related to teacher training and quality as well as accountability and grievance redressal.

The secondary and high school levels are bound by rigidity in terms of the courses offered, which is a constraint for many youth who are compelled to follow limited streams of learning. The lack of good opportunities that could build talents and skills of youth in non-conventional areas and a lack of transparency in budget allocations in the education system also act as hurdles.

The lack of technical colleges and institutes outside the metros combined with the lack of opportunities for community service, which could inculcate in the youth the values of good citizenship and allow them to develop a sense of responsibility to the society in which they live constrain the development of the youth in rural areas. There is a

severe lack of opportunities for youth from disadvantaged backgrounds, such as those marginalised on the basis of caste/ethnicity, religion, class, dis/ability, sexuality and gender identity (transgender). The disruption of education in areas of conflict is another cause for concern. Adolescent education programmes are informed by judgmental and superficial approaches to adolescence, gender and sexuality that are not in harmony with the lived realities and needs of adolescents.

ii. Children

Total school enrolment has improved; nevertheless, high dropout rates, absenteeism and low learning achievement persist. The education system lacks quality. The lack of effective monitoring and supervision, along with poor teacher training, continues to adversely impact standards. Access to secondary education remains extremely inequitable for girls, the poor and the marginalised. Location also affects accessibility and quality. Vulnerable and marginalised children stand to gain the most from high quality formal education and yet they continue to face multiple and reinforcing barriers to obtaining it. The Right to Free Compulsory Education Act 2009 entitles the most marginalised children including street children and child kabariwalas to be immediately withdrawn from labour and enrolled into a system of quality and inclusive education, and this has to be the focus of planning.

iii. Adolescents

There is a wide disparity in terms of infrastructure and quality of education between government schools and private schools. The low salary of the large number of para-teachers is a de-motivating factor for them to deliver effective services. Therefore, teachers are more interested in private tuitions than in regular teaching in school. There is a lack of information and course content regarding life skills and vocational skills. The high schools are situated at places far from villages. Adivasis and Dalits have very poor access to education. The dropout rate is significant after the 5th standard and is higher amongst girls. Discrimination is faced by HIV-positive students in schools. There is a lack of sexuality education in the school curriculum. There is lack of support and sensitivity towards cases of sexual abuse.

iv. Dalits

Enrolment rates continue to grow simultaneously with dropout rates (both reported and unreported). A substantial proportion of young people are not accessing education that can spur them to workforce participation and skill enhancement. While the gross enrolment ratio (GER) for upper primary schools is 72.8 per cent, it is only 5 per cent for SC when it comes to higher education. Various practices and traditions like manual scavenging, devdasi system, bonded labour and child labour take a heavy toll on Dalit children, forcing them out of schools into the labour market or onto the streets. Caste- and gender-based discrimination continues to haunt educational institutions from pre-school to centres of excellence, and Dalit communities and children who aspire for equality and equal treatment often pay a heavy price – sometimes with their lives – as reported from schools and professional colleges. Inadequate and insensitive implementation of entitlements and provisions hurt the dignity and negatively impact the personal development of Dalit children and youth. Poor infrastructure and unequal state provisions in infrastructure and services to Dalit habitations prevent Dalit children and youth from accessing education at all levels, from pre-school to higher education. The lack of information, guidance and support on available resources and modes of accessing them also limit Dalit children's choices and opportunities. Reduced employment opportunities in government services without measures to promote their employment in the private sector or in entrepreneurship has also become a dampener to Dalit families for higher investment in education. The larger environment of increasing poverty and inequality, shrinking

employment opportunities and precarious livelihoods of Dalit parents has a negative impact on the education and development of their children. Dalits aspire for dignity, social and economic mobility, increased employment and livelihood opportunities and inclusion through education.

The diametrically opposite trends in the enrolment ratios of SCs in the school sector and in higher education will have to be addressed. Data from the Government of Tamil Nadu's Ministry of Human Resources reveals that the enrolment ratio of SCs in schools from 1st standard to 12th standard is uniform and at least 2 percentage points higher than that of the enrolment ratio for the general students. This reveals a remarkable resilience and tenacity amongst SCs to pursue education, in spite of all socio-economic, demographic and geographic hurdles. Thus, SCs are immensely qualified to pursue higher education, which unfortunately is denied them on false grounds. To reduce the rate of illiteracy among SCs/STs, an innovative thrust should be given to quality upgradation of SCs in schools by giving greater inputs than what others enjoy.

The thrust on education should be at all levels and not just confined to lateral expansion of foundational, elementary and literacy levels alone. No productive thought emerged in the minds of education planners during any of the past 11 Five Year Plans nor the required money budgeted for nurturing SCs in higher education. However, several of the policies brought in have acted against the interests of SCs, such as privatization, commercialization of education, establishment of deemed universities, charging of capitation fees, foreign investment in education and cessation of grants to aided institutions, aborting the expansion of government institutions, providing autonomy to vested groups in schools of excellences, etc. This has resulted in the reversal of SC representation in higher education. For example, in Tamil Nadu, the percentage of SCs in engineering colleges has slid from over 20 per cent in the 1980s to a measly 6 per cent now.

Caste- and gender-based discrimination are major deterrents to Dalit children and youth accessing education. Personal stories, media highlights, studies and reports of various committees have highlighted this issue. We are currently also aware that the traditional caste mindset among teachers, education administrators and larger civil society severely impacts Dalit children's opportunities. While various policies speak of the elimination of untouchability and caste-based discrimination, it continues to hold sway in educational institutions. India is also a signatory to the United Nations Convention against Discrimination in

Education, one of the first UN Conventions. Thus, non-discrimination has to be included as an objective and monitorable indicator at all levels of education. Indicators and standards for its implementation should be included in the routine school reporting formats. Teachers at all levels and administrators must be made aware of norms and standards in non-discrimination and made sensitive to non-discrimination to Dalit girls and boys.

Thus, a seamless system of education from pre-school to higher education should be the approach of planning, rather than piecemeal attention on primary or secondary education. The equal and equitable access to quality education at pre-school, school, technical and higher education levels for all sections of society should be the focus of the plan.

v. Adivasis

The Adivasi youth are faced with a loss of self-belief and self-respect, poor implementation of plans and programmes, poor economic returns from traditional trades, loss of resources such as land, forest and water due to industrialisation, mining and other development projects, a limited local market for forest/agro products along with lack of skills required for marketing, high dropout rates after Class 5 due to being first-generation learners, limited local employment/self employment opportunities along with lack of appropriate support and training, malnutrition among children and adults, the ravages of diseases like malaria, tuberculosis, leprosy and diarrhoea, lack of appropriate and adequate health services, a mismatch between skills and aspirations and a lack of opportunities for learning new skills.

vi. Migrants

Language is a significant barrier for migrant children to access education in the destination site. The scarcity of trained teachers, inadequate infrastructure and the lack of a clear-cut policy to deal with children of migrant workers are the major problems. Consequently, migrant children find it difficult to get admission in government schools. There is also limited or no access to crèche facilities and pre-school education in the destination site. Matters are compounded by the lack of awareness among the parents on the importance of children's education.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Youth

1. Pre-school education must be made part of the education department's responsibility.
2. Suo motu disclosure of information about work plans and budgets should be done in all educational institutions through boards and websites.
3. Social audit should be institutionalised and youth provided opportunities to volunteer in social monitoring exercises.
4. Diversify the courses that are offered at high school and college level.
5. Issues related to youth from marginalised backgrounds must form part of the BEd and other teacher training curricula. Expert working groups must be constituted to ensure that realities and concerns related to youth from disadvantaged backgrounds are integrated into school and university curricula. Such working groups should engage in consultative processes with youth from these backgrounds.
6. Indicators related to inclusion and equity must be included in the evaluation frameworks of educational programmes.
7. All educational institutions must be made free of police and armed forces interference.
8. A consultative process should be undertaken with adolescents in order to ascertain their learning needs. These in turn should inform a curriculum framework for adolescence education.
9. This framework should also guide the design of relevant content and pedagogy for integration into the BEd and other teacher training curricula.
10. These processes should also ensure that the realities and concerns of adolescents from disadvantaged backgrounds are addressed.
11. Integrate active citizenship and entrepreneurial skills in school and college curricula to build the following competencies in young people: a) understanding the self: self awareness, self esteem, critical thinking, reflection, risk taking, creativity, decision-making and entrepreneurial skills; b) ability to develop effective

relationships through respect and empathy, effective communication, negotiation, conflict resolution and team work; and c) ability to impact society through systems thinking, diagnosis of problems, planning, implementation and evaluation.

ii. Children

12. The implementation of the Right to Education Act must be ensured. India must realise the goal of universal primary and secondary education, which will lead to a greatly increased proportion of skilled and employable workers.
13. Children at pre-school, primary and secondary levels can be taught the need for conservation and adults must act as role models to positively influence them. This aspect of education should also be reflected in the teacher-training syllabi.
14. All children, without any distinction, should have access to formal high quality education with early learning opportunities below the age of three and formal education beyond the 6-14 age group.
15. The total expenditure on education should be increased to 6 per cent of GDP with 3.7 per cent of GDP for primary education.⁶ There must be an emphasis on innovation and quality improvement.
16. Increase the demand for education among marginalised populations (incentives, attendance scholarships and awareness campaigns can help increase demand).
17. Relevant, inclusive, appropriate and high-quality curricula, textbooks and learning materials in children's native language should be prepared. These should be comprehensive including life skills, health and nutrition, environmental education, human rights, moral values, unified arts education and media literacy.
18. Address significant data deficiencies through consistent collection of reliable and robust data to monitor progress across the nation and specifically for marginalised children.
19. Professional development and recruitment of adequate number of teachers and administrators should be undertaken to meet the mandated pupil-to-teacher

⁶ National Convention on Union Budget 2011-12 organised by People's Budget Initiative, New Delhi

ratio through intensive capacity building. There must be an emphasis on hiring of qualified, local and female teachers.

20. Extend compulsory education beyond the 6-14 year old age group to eventually include children from the 14-18 year old age group.
21. Allow for flexible school registration.
22. Special plans and provisions should be made to ensure that in conflict-affected districts, school infrastructure is secure and sufficient.
23. Schools must be located close to where students live. Existing schools must be given support for maintenance and upgrading. Schools must be safe and inclusive. Suitable and safe transportation should be provided if its absence prevents children from attending school or otherwise inconveniences them.
24. Free supply of uniforms, textbooks learning, materials etc should be ensured.
25. Objective assessments and requisite modifications of centrally funded (Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan and Midday Meal) and state schemes should be done and convergence built with ICDS and secondary education reforms.
26. Engagement and support of families and local communities and the empowerment of PRIs and school management committees to monitor, mentor and support quality reforms should be encouraged. Children must be allowed to participate in school planning including school development plans.
27. Child labour must be abolished. The Child Labour Prohibition and Regulation Act must be implemented in line with the RTE Act so that children aged 6-14 are not involved in any form of labour.
28. Universalisation of secondary education with focus on special provisions for poorly resourced districts.
29. Vocationalisation of education through development of appropriate curricula with vocational education and training responding to market needs.
30. An accreditation system should be established for vocational education.
31. Private investment, including PPP in education should be facilitated.
32. A regulatory framework is needed for all private education institutions.
33. Develop standards for early child care and development (ECCD), with a specific emphasis on urban slums and other children that are disadvantaged on the basis of their location.
34. The radical change of approach in ECCD is the inclusion of “care” as an essential component for delivery of services through multiple models. Planning for the 0-6 age group should be done under the Department of Women and Child Development.
35. Universalise maternity entitlements to enable “care” of children.
36. A clear preschool policy is needed including planning for human resources, training, status and regulation of the private sector.
37. Planning should be done for the entire age group of 0-6 years (rather than 0-3 years and 3-6 years).
38. The electrification and development of a broadband Internet connection should target rural areas and provide services to rural children who are entitled to the same rights and opportunities as those more easily available in better-off urban contexts.
39. More attention should be paid towards ensuring universal quality of education. There is a need to develop peoples’ watch groups to look after the quality of education at the ground level. There is also a need to revise the salary structure of the teachers. More attention has to be paid on capacity building programmes for the teachers.
40. Life Skills Education (LSE) should be included in the curriculum from the pre-adolescent age group onwards.
41. Counselling sessions should be held with the parents for them to be able to understand the importance of alternate careers and to get their support for LSE and sexuality education.
42. The 12th Plan needs to ensure a firm commitment to sexuality education. There is a crying need amongst adolescents for information, support and counselling in the area of sexuality and transition to adulthood. This cannot be denied. The denial, in fact, can be ill afforded. There is adequate evidence supporting such a case.
43. Sexual harassment committees should be set up in educational institutions.

iii. Adolescents

iv. Dalits

44. High-quality hostel accommodation should be provided for secondary and above classes under strict monitoring by a Dalit committee.
45. Dalit students should not be made to pay fees upfront and instead the fees should be adjusted against the scholarship released by the government to the institution.
46. Opportunity to study in private education institutions of choice including the opportunity to live in hostels should be provided to Dalits and the costs borne by the state.
47. Entrance examination for higher education and centres of excellence should be removed and the higher secondary marks should be the basis for all admissions.
48. Education abroad should be promoted and supported and made fully free for Dalit students that qualify and gain such admissions.
49. Provide quality support to Dalits for all competitive examinations.
50. Reservation for Dalits in private educational institutions must be made mandatory.
51. The Planning Commission should undertake a massive public education campaign against caste-based discrimination and promote understanding among all social groups regarding the rationale and justification for special measures for Dalit students.
52. Human rights education should be part of the school curriculum.
53. Grievance redressal mechanisms against caste-based discrimination should be set up at the school and district levels.
54. Dalit community members should be part of the monitoring body in schools.
55. Sensitisation of teachers and administrators to the Dalits should be included under the teacher training curricula.
56. The implementation of RTE should be stressed in the 12th Plan, taking it beyond secondary school to the higher secondary school level. Quality education to the level of Kendriya Vidyalaya standards should be ensured in all government schools. The information and communication technology (ICT) education component to be strengthened and made accessible to Dalit students.
57. The current practice of notional allocation and expenditure of SCP should be changed. The SCP should not become part of the common pool for education expenditure. It should be maintained as a separate fund available for additional support to enhance the capacity and human resources of Dalit students. This money should be tracked separately. In addition to providing direct support to students, the SCP should also be made available to Dalit people who would like to start schools and colleges under the public-private-community-partnership (PPCP) model. The Ministry of Human Resource Development should elect a minister to monitor the SCP budget.
58. Dalit children and youth are entitled to various provisions of the state such as scholarships at the pre- and post- secondary levels, residential hostels, free textbooks, additional tutoring, etc. However, the implementation is inadequate and depressing. The Plan should review these provisions in terms of universal reach, price parity, timeliness, quality of provision, sensitivity to the dignity of the students etc.
59. Even within Dalit communities, some communities or sections face additional discrimination and challenges owing to their occupation or other traditional practices. Children from manual scavenging communities, children of devdasi women and children who are bonded labour fall in this category. In addition, there are communities that are specifically disadvantaged in a state or local context. The 12th Plan should create mechanisms within the education system to specially track them and provide additional measures to promote equitable opportunities and benefits for them in education. This should be in the form of need-based incentives and additional provisions.
60. Dalits are perceived as beneficiaries of the education system rather than as partners. While this is true overall, there are examples of Dalits providing education at the school and higher education levels in states like Uttar Pradesh and a few other places. Dalit equity should be promoted through the PPCP model by facilitating them to become providers of education, which would create models of non-discrimination, inclusion and equity.
61. The additional barriers at the intersection of the caste-gender exclusion on Dalit girl children and young women needs to be recognised and special attention

paid to ensure that they are able to equitably access education and employment provisions. The model in Andhra Pradesh, where a quota within the overall quota has been provided to girls and women, can be thought of in this area.

62. The lack of implementation has been a major handicap to Dalit education and development. A monitoring mechanism at the highest level under the Ministry of Human Resource Development should be set up to periodically review and monitor the implementation of schemes and provisions. The Dalit community should be engaged in all monitoring mechanisms from the community to the state and national levels. As there are various hurdles in representing the real issues, special opportunities and platforms to discuss the constraints must be built into the monitoring mechanisms at the highest levels. A Dalit status report of education and human resource development should be published on an annual basis by the ministry at the state and national levels to facilitate corrective measures.
63. The 12th Plan should put special emphasis on early child hood care and development which is currently being undertaken through the ICDS.
64. Laptops could be provided to rural SC children in elementary schools (in contrast to the supply of television, cycle, gas and stoves). Urban tours, contests in creative art, sports events, and television appearances should be organised for them.

v. Women

65. Promote universal education and desist from further privatisation of education.
66. Saakshar Bharat Programme implementation should be speeded up in the 12th Plan.
67. Interstate migrant labour children should be accompanied by two teachers conversant in their mother tongue to impart them education for six months.
68. Expansion of secondary education with vocational alternatives.
69. Skill training through PRIs.
70. There should be gender education at the school level.
71. Admissions in private schools and hostel facilities should be provided to HIV/AIDS affected children.

72. Education to mentally retarded people should be given priority.
73. Women should be considered as workers and have access to care for their children irrespective of their earning status.
74. Crèche services should be arranged for unorganised workers, women with HIV/AIDS, women in sex work and migrant labourers.
75. Universal maternity entitlements at prevailing minimum wages and other benefits should be provided to unorganised sector workers.
76. The number of children should not to be a criterion to exclude remote unserved areas from getting ICDS centres.

vi. Adivasis

77. The infrastructure and services available for education should be improved with more and better quality teachers and learning materials.
78. Review the content of education given so as to include Adivasi history and culture (to restore dignity and belief) as well as provide opportunities for developing vocational skills linked to the usage of locally available resources.
79. A special Adivasi youth policy should be formulated as part of a national youth policy.
80. Organise events that allow learning about Adivasi history and its heroes, traditional practices and arts, etc.
81. Provide opportunities for the preservation of traditional and experience based knowledge along with recognition of this knowledge so that the young are motivated in learning it.
82. The Ekal Vidyalaya (school with only one teacher) should be enhanced by deputing more teachers and extending the educational services to areas where primitive Adivasi groups live.

vii. Migrants

83. Special programmes like bridge and transit schools for children of migrant workers should be started.
84. Education in their own mother tongue for children of migrants should be ensured.

85. Recruit trained teachers and develop the modalities for teaching children of migrant workers with the help of the National Centre for Educational Research and Training and state centres.
86. Explore the possibility of setting up residential schools for children of migrant workers at source.
87. Mass awareness programmes should be conducted among parents/migrant workers on the importance of education.
88. Set up a facilitation centre for children's education needs at the destination areas.
89. Provide vocational training for migrants through the Department of Labour, Employment and Training.
90. Increase awareness on modular employable skills among the migrants.
91. Develop appropriate trainings and accreditation for migrant workers.

viii. North East

92. Ensure the right to quality education instead of the right to education, especially in rural areas.
93. Vocational courses should be made relevant to the local context.
94. Life skills should also be incorporated at the secondary level.
95. Gender studies as a separate discipline should be introduced at the graduate and post-graduate levels.
96. Hostels should be provided for rural school children who attend bridge courses in urban areas. This is necessary to sustain the students through these courses and also ensure their safety in towns.
97. A course on the North East should be included in the national educational curriculum both at the school as well as the university levels. This will enhance the knowledge of students who, currently, have poor knowledge of the region and its diversity.
98. Knowledge books should be made available in vernacular languages for young people in states in the North East.

ix. Elderly

99. An institute should be set up to research into diseases and conditions of the ageing.

100. The school curriculum to include value education concerning aging-related issues.
101. Establish a national institute of gerontology.
102. Promotion of research and training in gerontology and geriatrics.

x. Muslims

103. The setting up of an independent/autonomous government agency for educational empowerment for Muslims.
104. Location of schools/banks/colleges/universities is an important factor in access to them; therefore, enough such institutions should be set up where Muslims can access them.
105. Diploma courses in technical education should be made available in Muslim-populated areas so that girls can be educated because the parents of poor girl children are not in a position to send them far for education.
106. Production of caste certificate should not be required for receiving scholarships in schools because scholarships are given to minorities, not to any particular caste. The student's and parents' names show that the child belongs to a minority.
107. The information about the different schemes for minorities should not only be published in the Hindi and Urdu newspapers but also be given to the different organisations working for the minorities. The information will thus be disseminated to a larger mass.
108. Exclusive schools for girls, particularly for Standards 9-12, should be started as this would facilitate higher participation of Muslim girls in school education.
109. More women teachers should be appointed in co-education schools.
110. Skill development opportunities should be provided through Industrial Training Institutes (ITI) and polytechnics in sectors that have high growth potential and in which the Muslim population is concentrated.
111. Establish vocational schools and ITIs in talukas having substantial populations of Muslims.
112. The University Grants Commission (UGC) should evolve a system whereby a part of the fund allocation to colleges and universities is linked to the strength of Muslim students in the student population.

113. Create hostel facilities at reasonable costs for Muslim students especially for girls in cities of all sizes to ensure that girls would continue their education (beyond secondary/college education) as they would not have to commute on a daily basis from their place of residence.
114. Accommodate Urdu in schools of the Hindi region under the Three Language Formula and provide a regular Urdu teacher.
115. Introduce Urdu as an optional subject in all government and government-aided schools in states having a substantial Urdu-speaking population.
116. Facilitate the establishment of professional colleges and private universities by the Muslims under Article 30 of the Constitution.
117. Full-fledged campuses of Aligarh Muslim University and Jamia Millia Islamia should be started in Muslim-majority districts of the country.
118. Provision of subsidised education specifically for Muslim men and women should be ensured in the 12th Five Year Plan in the areas of concern India-wide.
119. Employment assistance should be provided to educated Muslim men and women who are in need of employment and have the requisite qualifications but do not have proper directions.
120. Planning should ensure that the Muslim literacy rate becomes equal to the national average.
121. One school should be opened per every 5000 population in Muslim-dominated areas.
122. Ensure more incentives to Muslim girl students.
123. The common school system should be implemented.
124. Madrasas should be given the status of basic schools.
125. The Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan should be modified according to regional and community needs.
126. The widespread perception of discrimination among the Muslim community needs to be addressed. Denying the existence of discrimination and prejudice against the community and continuing their present social and economic exclusion will not only worsen the condition of the community but will also threaten the emergence of a composite and cohesive Indian society with all its natural diversity. An awareness campaign to sensitise the non-Muslims to this issue should be started.

xi. People with Disabilities

127. Education for all children with disability (CWD) should be provided and the schematic and project method to be discarded.
128. Education of ALL children should be the onus of the Ministry of Human Resources Development (MoHRD).
129. All levels of teacher training courses should have diversity as a generic component (in all subjects like child development, child psychology, learning pedagogy, teaching learning methodology and universal curriculum). These courses should be taken within a given time frame by all existing faculty at all levels and this project should be owned, implemented and monitored by the MoHRD.
130. There should be special schools to progressively move towards inclusive strategies.
131. Disability rights should be included in the curriculum.
132. A national institute for universal design should be set up as an autonomous body for making the built environment and transportation PWD-friendly. Research should be conducted on assistive technology for all products to be used by all. Sign language and vernacular languages should be further developed.
133. Minimum national standards for PWD friendly-design should be set down and five districts developed as models of universal design.

12 Better Preventive and Curative Healthcare

INPUTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE HAVE
COME FROM THE DISCUSSION GROUPS ON
CHILDREN, YOUTH, DALITS, ADOLESCENTS,
TRANSGENDERS, THE NORTH EAST, ADIVASIS,
THE ELDERLY, MUSLIMS, PLHIV, PEOPLE WITH
DISABILITY, WOMEN AND MIGRANTS

Better Preventive and Curative Healthcare

Section Contents

Context	113
Dalits	113
Children	113
Adolescents	114
Youth	114
Migrants	114
PLHIV	114

Specific Recommendations	116
Dalits	116
Women	116
Children	117
Adolescents	118
Youth	119
Adivasis	119
Transgenders	119
Migrants	120
North East	120
Elderly	121
Muslims	121
PLHIV	122
People with Disability	122

1. Context

i. Dalits

Public spending on health continues to be abysmally low, at about 1 per cent of the GDP, despite the United Progressive Alliance government's commitment in its National Common Minimum Programme to raise it to 2-3 per cent of the GDP. Health expenditure has not increased during the 11th Plan period.⁷ Data from the National Family Health Survey-III (2005-06) clearly highlights the caste differential in health, which includes reduced access to maternal and child healthcare, stunting, wasting, underweight and anaemia in children and adults. Similarly, neonatal, post-natal, infant, child and under-five statistics clearly show a higher mortality among the SCs and STs. Problems in accessing health care are higher among SCs and this situation is not very different from 1998-99. Studies as well as anecdotal stories further reveal that there is extensive discrimination and exclusion against SC communities when they access health services. This is experienced in the hospital premises, during treatment, during nursing care and provisioning of health aids, etc.

Studies reveal that health expenditure is the second biggest cause for rural indebtedness. This applies particularly to the SC/ST and Muslim communities, the poorest.

⁷ http://www.cbgaindia.org/files/budget_responses/How%20did%20the%20UPA%20spend%20our%20money.pdf

Additionally, due to their unhealthy living conditions, their probability of contracting communicable diseases is higher. While the National Rural Health Mission seeks to ensure provisioning of public health infrastructure and services particularly in rural areas, it needs to build in adequate strategies to include SC/STs and Muslims. There continues to be a shortage of medical professionals, infrastructure and medical facilities in rural areas. This has specific implications for marginalised communities, as they have to go to informal practitioners as they cannot afford the services of a professional private practitioner.

It is also a proven fact that malnourishment in children and mothers can be addressed through the quality provisioning of local food at ICDS centres. Studies have shown that ICDS centres are used mostly by children from marginalised communities. However there continues to be the challenge of poor implementation, insensitivity to issues of communities from deprived sections and a lack of focus on the urban poor in the ICDS system.

ii. Children

India currently has the highest number of child and maternal deaths of any country in the world and a high incidence of malnutrition and certain diseases like HIV, TB and malaria. Every newborn child and mother has a right to life and for this to be realised, the Government of India needs to radically reform the health system. There has to be

universal access to public health in both rural and urban settings. To ensure the newborn and child's right to survival, the Indian health system needs immediate overhauling. Its infrastructure has to be strengthened and the focus must shift from curative to preventative care. Investing in newborn and child health would ensure the human capital for India's continuing growth story. Only 1 per cent of GDP is currently being spent on public health despite previous commitments of increasing it to 3 per cent by 2012. To develop a universal public health system which focuses on prevention and ensures the universal right to health, holistic legislation and a convergent policy backed up by large scale investment is urgently required. Drinking water should be seen as a Fundamental Right. Every person should have access to clean drinking water. The lack of drinking water can cause extreme harm to children and be a cause for various diseases. With 400,000 children dying of diarrhoea every year, action is needed immediately to stop these preventable deaths. Improving water resources and providing all children with clean water in a time-bound period of two years would require an infrastructure project on the scale of our road building project. Water and sanitation should be considered a human right and this should be reflected in comprehensive legislation at the national and state levels. Children's right to food and nutrition is not secure. The challenge of malnutrition is well known. Indeed, the Prime Minister declared it a "national shame". The National Nutrition Mission and Council exist and the National Plan of Action has to be monitored by the Prime Minister's Office. However, this has not resulted in a visible impact on children's hunger.

iii. Adolescents

Drug abuse is on the rise among adolescents. Yet, there is no mention of it in plans for services for adolescents. A large number of girls below 18 is sexually abused. Sexual abuse has huge impacts on children's mental and emotional state as they grow. A significant proportion of mental illnesses starts during adolescence but mental health does not receive adequate attention from the public health system. Poor infrastructure, the negligence of service providers and inadequate supplies dog the public health system. There is a lack of effort in promoting health-seeking behaviour amongst adolescents. Adolescents' access to reproductive and sexual health information, services and materials is compromised, especially in the case of out-of-school adolescents.

iv. Youth

The public health system is not suited to the health needs of diverse groups. Its inadequacies force people to access high-cost private health services. There has been insufficient public investment in building health systems, infrastructure and capacities. There is a lack of awareness about the health needs of disabled youth, lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer and intersex (LGBTQI) youth and young people living with HIV-AIDS (YPLHA). The problem of malnutrition amongst young women has reached serious proportions. Early marriages are still prevalent in large numbers giving rise to specific health problems which too are not being addressed. There is considerable violence within and outside marital relationships leading to health problems which too are not being addressed.

v. Migrants

Increased incidence of HIV/AIDS/STDs/RTIs among spouses both at source and destination is a major problem for migrant populations. Vulnerability of mental health arising from stress is another area of concern. Malnutrition among the children of migrant labour and lack of access to healthcare facilities for adults and children combined with low levels of awareness among migrant workers regarding existing health services compounds matters. There are also language and cultural barriers and the question of affordability. The migrant's health is affected by lack of shelter, sanitation and water supply and exposure to occupational hazards. There is no provision for periodic medical check-ups, medical benefits, sick leave etc by employers or contractors.

vi. PLHIV

The HIV epidemic in India has caused irreplaceable loss to human life and capital in the country since the mid-1980s. The latest evidence suggests significant success of the combined efforts of the Indian Government, civil society and United Nations and bilateral agencies in curtailing the epidemic under the much celebrated National AIDS Control Programme, currently in its third phase. The persistence and selfless contribution of people living with HIV (PLHIV) deserves special mention and applause. The PLHIV community in India has come together, synergised the work of all stakeholders and successfully influenced national and international policies. The issues of HIV-

infected and -affected adults and children, families, sexual minorities and diverse groups have been brought into focus and appropriately addressed. The HIV epidemic has evolved with new dimensions and facets added every year. We have learnt and built on our experiences with this evolution. One clear strategy that has emerged is the need for multisectoral responses with the core guiding principles of inclusion and participation, human rights, comprehensiveness, convergence, accountability and a strong gender focus. The PLHIV community will play a central and important role going forward.

2. Specific Recommendations

i. Dalits

1. The Union and State Budgets need to be augmented substantially to fully realise health outcomes. For this the health sector must be provided not less than 6 per cent of GDP. The NRHM budget should be increased.
2. Dalits should have the right to access quality-free healthcare in private institutions based on choice, the cost for which should be borne by the government. Access to Dalits should be given in all private hospitals across the country and free health insurance provided to all Dalits. The criterion of income should be removed while providing health services for Dalits.
3. Support should be provided to Dalit doctors/professionals to set up private hospitals and medical colleges.
4. A separate policy of inclusion enumerating specific strategies targeted to realising health rights of SC/STs, Muslims and migrant workers must be drawn up under the NRHM. While considerable attempts have already been made on factoring in social exclusion in the Mission's work, such as community-based monitoring, there is a need to locate strategies which will universalise this, ensuring that services are available to every Dalit person. Sex, caste and seasonal disaggregation and hunger mapping must be conducted to be able to provide for communities which face different levels of vulnerability.
5. A larger number of SCs should be given special support in pursuing medical education and going overseas to enhance their skills. Reservation in medical institutions has been defined in the narrowest ways where SC/ST candidates are given admission only under the SC/ST category even if they qualify under the general category. This has to be taken note of and an advice must be issued to medical institutions in this regard. The reservation for SC/ST students is for additional support and not to curtail the common space.
6. It is crucial to bring Dai practitioners (traditional birth attendants) within the health policy fold so as to address a lot of gaps in child survival and

maternal mortality at the local levels. Thus, separate policies should be drawn up for the recognition and enhancement of indigenous medical practices.

7. Adequate provisioning of rural infrastructure for disabled populations, early detection and therapy clinics, and research and training is needed.
8. Greater participation from Dalit communities in planning, monitoring and implementation of ICDS and mid-day meal schemes should be encouraged. Care should be taken that a hamlet-level strategy in provisioning of ICDS for SC communities is put in place. Further care should also be taken that there is a fair representation of SC communities and communities living in remote areas among workers in the ICDS system.
9. Kitchen gardening, collective farms, and grain banks (in kind) can help to bring in sustained food security to combat malnutrition. It could also go a long way in supporting communities to tide over food insecurity. Besides being an indicator of poor health, malnourishment also indicates indebtedness, loss of land, displacement, unemployment, poor work conditions and social discrimination. So, it is important to find complementary strategies besides just food schemes.
10. The committees formed under the NRHM have representation from Dalit and Adivasi communities but in effect they remain invisible and non-participatory due to various reasons. There is need to ensure full and meaningful participation of socially excluded communities in these committees to include their concerns and healthcare needs at the district and state levels.

ii. Women

11. Entitlements should not be linked to domicile. There should be no conditionality for access to health services.
12. The public healthcare system should be strengthened to check privatisation of healthcare.
13. Family planning policies should shift the focus from women to men to promote parental responsibility.
14. Free and subsidised medication should be provided for HIV-infected and physically challenged terminally ill persons.

15. Women's healthcare should be seen in a holistic manner rather than only their reproductive health focussed on. Special attention should be given to treating anaemia resulting from malnutrition, under-nutrition, early motherhood etc.
16. Mental healthcare for women should be provided at district and sub-district level hospitals as part of comprehensive health care.
17. Toilets for both girls and boys in adequate numbers with proper water and sanitation facilities should be provided in every school. This is essential to prevent girls from dropping out.
18. There should be provision of more safe and functional toilet facilities in public spaces for women.
19. De-addiction centres should be set up in one of every four panchayats.
20. Special infrastructure facilities should be provided for physically challenged people.
21. The PDS needs to be strengthened further beyond focusing on providing essential food items to the BPL families – it should also have reasonably priced food for other groups.
26. Establish more meaningful targets, especially related to maternal, newborn and child (MNC) health outcomes, and move the monitoring and evaluation focus to outcomes rather than process measures.
27. Decentralise and democratise information by increasing local involvement in planning, monitoring and supporting behaviour change efforts, such as through Village Health and Nutrition Days in PRIs. The gram sabhas and the female workers (ANMs and ASHAs) role should be augmented in holding government programmes accountable for providing mandated services.
28. Formulation of a comprehensive legislation which covers the universal right to health instead of standalone schemes and programmes. An evidence-based comprehensive newborn and child survival policy and operational package would ensure that critical programmes and missions collaborate, especially linking health, education, nutrition, environmental sanitation, hygiene, safe drinking water, food security and food safety.

iii. Children

22. The National Rural Health Mission's linkage to nutrition is unclear. No ministry is focally responsible for nutrition of all children. The Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS) and the Mid Day Meal scheme are not enough, as they leave out many children. Further plans need to be developed with high-level buy-in from political leaders to eradicate malnutrition.
23. The poverty-hunger-malnutrition-death nexus needs to be addressed and overcome. The figures of nutrition programmes focus on coverage but do not give the status of children.
24. The present staffing of ICDS is inadequate for outreach services. Accountability frameworks need to be developed that reward good practice and attendance of staff and highlights mass absenteeism that puts children's lives and health rights at risk.
25. Huge investment in the public health system is necessary to universalise it. The allocation to the children's health budget needs to be increased to meet the needs of the currently unreached 41 per cent of the country's total population of children. The state needs to clearly indicate health and nutrition as political and programmatic priorities at all levels (national, state, district and block) with a commensurate budgetary allocation of at least 5 per cent of GDP for these essential interventions to catalyse a dramatic change in the country's health status.
29. Ensure that appropriate regulatory frameworks and safeguards are set up to ensure that public private partnerships support public facilities and make them more efficient. Creating such 'institutional safeguards' would prevent any conflict of interests and also control the entry of commercial foods and products into government programmes.
30. Standardise a specific set of rules and instructions for providing quality healthcare (for health practitioners to follow) particularly for marginalised children (especially those living in underserved areas, found in both rural and urban settings). This would ensure that market parities are maintained and undue monopolies are not encouraged, thus making private healthcare more affordable, given the reality of out-of-pocket expenditure on health.
31. Make 'good governance' an explicit objective at all levels (national, state, district, block and local). Select and replicate successful model efforts to improve governance. Set efficiency/good governance targets

and measure and publicly share progress towards good governance targets (link outlays to outcomes).

32. Specific plans should be made to ensure that children in conflict areas and from marginalised groups like Dalits, Adivasis and street children can access their rights to health.
33. A strategic shift to a universal preventive public healthcare system rather than one that focuses primarily on curative health care is required.
34. Universal nutrition and food security at the household and individual level are minimum requirements that the state needs to fulfil.
35. Place special focus on addressing equity and gender issues and improving girls' and women's health and nutritional status.
36. Create stronger coordination and accountability mechanisms at all levels to ensure that existing government missions and programmes focus on health and nutrition and collaborate with each other to achieve specific outcomes through district and block convergence forums and monthly coordination meetings at all levels.
37. Early Childhood Care and Development (ECCD) is the prerogative of every child. All sets of services for children should be planned in such a way that this right is fulfilled.
38. The importance of the 0-2 age group rests on the fact that over 90 percent of a child's development occurs in this period (some experts maintain that it is 95 per cent). At the later stages of childhood, a couple of growth spurts occur but they are only marginally incremental. There is a need to strategise optimal ways of enhancing the nutritional and health status of this age group. Investing in newborn and child health and education will pay back huge dividends for India by ensuring economic and social growth.
39. The key to preventing child malnutrition lies in improving three indicators – low birth weight, poor nutritional status (even in the first few months of life) and prevalence of underweight children under two years old. Thus, all emphasis must be laid on improving these indicators.
40. Information and services promoting healthy spacing and timing of births should be made available.
41. Essential newborn care through “newborn corners” at all primary health care centres and “special newborn care units” at community health centres must be provided.
42. Timely initiation of breastfeeding and exclusive breastfeeding during the first six months of life and no other foods or fluids, not even water, should be ensured.
43. Timely introduction of complementary foods at six months, while breastfeeding continues until 24 months and beyond should be ensured. Age appropriate complementary feeding, adequate in terms of quality, quantity and frequency for children of 6-24 months should be ensured.
44. Safe handling of complementary foods and hygienic complementary feeding practices, including washing caregivers' and children's hands, using clean utensils and avoiding feeding bottles must be ensured.
45. Bi-annual vitamin A supplementation with deworming, routine immunization in the first year and bi-annual vitamin A supplementation and deworming twice yearly during the first five years of life (6-59 months) must be ensured.
46. Frequent, appropriate and active feeding for children during and after illness, including oral rehydration with zinc supplementation during diarrhoea must be ensured.
47. Timely and quality therapeutic feeding and care for all children with severe acute malnutrition, preferably before the development of medical complications, must be ensured.

iv. Adolescents

48. The design of strategies for services for adolescents should be rooted in available empirical evidence. There are tested pilots in the country that should be acknowledged and taken to scale. Untested innovative ideas with potential should be put through a pilot phase and then scaled up. It is also important, in the interest of evidence-based planning, that a simplistic approach to successful pilots be resisted. They must not be seen as ‘stories’ that need to be replicated but as a set of successful strategies and approaches that need to be identified based on critical analysis and study of the pilot.
49. Secondly, evidence-based planning implies that evidence should be gathered on ongoing programmes

to ensure the desired results are being achieved and mid-course corrections should be undertaken as and when necessary. Civil society could be useful partners in this.

50. The 12th Plan should make a commitment to participatory approach and ensure inclusion of adolescents in planning processes.
51. The importance of participatory planning is adequately brought out in the way adolescent-friendly health services were implemented in response to the commitments made under the previous Plan. Besides other reasons, inadequate participation and inclusion of adolescents in designing adolescent-friendly services is also perhaps an important reason for non-utilisation of these services where they have been offered, though sparingly so.
52. The Government of India developed a set of operational guidelines for managers of service delivery units to implement adolescent-friendly health services. While it was a strong step with enormous potential, it did not yield the desired result. There should be a commitment under the 12th Plan to study the guidelines to understand the constraints or difficulties of service providers and/or managers in using these and address such difficulties.
53. To ensure adolescents' effective participation in designing plans/programmes/solutions, an interface should be set up with adolescents through civil society organizations. Given that adolescents constitute a heterogeneous group, the interface should take into account the heterogeneity and diversity of the group. Such an interface can then serve as a mechanism for capacity building in planning and programming.
54. The 12th Plan needs to allocate resources for demand generation activities in tandem with service delivery.
55. Programmes are required for promoting health-seeking behaviour amongst adolescents and their parents and other key influencers at the community level. This would ensure optimal utilisation of health services provided to adolescents.
56. The 12th Plan needs to commit to comprehensive rather than fragmented adolescent-friendly health services. These need to address, amongst other issues, substance abuse prevention counselling and support services, child sexual abuse prevention and support services and mental health services for adolescents integrated into an adolescent-friendly health service.

v. Youth

57. The principles of choice and competition embedded in the Rashtriya Swastha Bima Yojana (RSBY) should be extended to other health schemes whereby the poor get cashless service at a hospital of their choice (public or private) based on subsidised premia.
58. The health infrastructure should also enable confidentiality and privacy.
59. Further expand the choice for the rural and urban poor to attend private hospitals by making mandatory free services for better treatment. The tax revenue should follow the patients and should not end up being an excuse for the employment of government health workers.
60. Train all health functionaries to cater to adolescents and young people, sex workers, disabilities, people living with HIV and LGBTQI. The training should include technical knowledge which should cover information and skills (confidential, sensitive, non-judgmental, value-based, client-oriented, service-oriented, non-corrupt and rights-based).
61. Schemes like Chiranjeevi in Gujarat which leverage the private sector to provide maternity vouchers in a cost-effective manner and use competition to push up service quality should be encouraged in other states and at the national level.
62. Promoting non-violence as a preventive measure and providing counselling and rehabilitation to victims.
63. Provide exclusive health and safety stations for women in every district.

vi. Adivasis

64. Traditional medical workers (like Dais in villages) must be registered, recognised and provided with support for further developing their skills.
65. Traditional healers and their knowledge of herbal medicines should be promoted and conserved.
66. The health services should include traditional healing practices and practitioners.

vii. Transgenders

67. Address the gaps in the National AIDS Control Programme Phase 3 (NACP-III) by establishing

and increasing the HIV sentinel sero-surveillance sites for hijras/transgenders at strategic locations. Conduct operations research to design and fine tune a culturally relevant package of HIV prevention and care interventions for hijras/transgenders⁸. Provide financial support for the formation of community-based organisations run by hijras/transgenders. Build the capacity of CBOs to implement effective programmes.

68. According to the two main diagnostic systems used in the Indian medical establishment, transsexualism is defined as a “gender identity disorder”. The doctors usually prescribe sexual reassignment surgery (SRS), which currently resorts to hormone therapy and surgical reconstruction and may include electrolysis, speech therapy and counselling. Surgical construction could include the removal of male sex organs and the construction of female ones. Since government hospitals and qualified private practitioners do not usually perform SRS, many hijras go to quacks, thus placing themselves at serious risk. Neither the Indian Council for Medical Research (ICMR) nor the Medical Council of India (MCI) has formulated any guidelines to be followed in SRS. Presently, even castration is a criminal offence under the Indian Penal Code. The Planning Commission may direct the Ministry of Health through the MCI and ICMR to clarify the ambiguous legal status of SRS and provide free gender transition and SRS services (with proper pre- and post-operation/transition counselling) in public hospitals in various parts of India. Tamil Nadu is the only state where these surgeries are being done free of cost since 2008 in government hospitals. Based on this experience, the ICMR/MCI could request the World Health Organization and allied health organisations to develop standard medical procedures for SRS.
69. Sensitise and educate healthcare providers on the current state of research in and knowledge of transgenders and the need to take an adequate sexual history. These efforts should start in medical school but must also be a part of continuing medical education.
70. Sensitise and educate healthcare providers to

recognise the physical and psychological needs of their transgender patients.

71. Encourage physicians, medical schools, hospitals, and clinics to broaden any non-discriminatory statement made to patients, healthcare workers, or employees to include “sexual orientation, sex, or gender identity”.

viii. Migrants

72. Establish adequate crèche/baby care centre/ICDS facilities at worksite/place of stay.
73. Increase awareness of healthcare facilities for migrants regarding health issues and existing schemes by involving NGOs, CSOs, migrant worker unions etc.
74. Increase proximity of healthcare facility/PHCs/PHUs to migrants.
75. State Welfare Boards for migrant workers with representative units in the District Panchayats in rural areas and Urban Local Bodies in urban areas should also help workers address healthcare needs.
76. Facilitate the inclusion of migrant workers in existing social schemes such as the RSBY. In districts where such schemes do not exist, formulate and implement schemes on the lines of the Employees State Insurance scheme for migrant workers.
77. Evaluate and scale up pilot programmes such as Social Security Benefits for Unorganised Workers (SSBK) being implemented in Karnataka.
78. Inclusion of the issues of migrants’ health in medical curricula to orient health workers on migrant-specific issues.
79. Better follow-up and monitoring of the Pravasi Bima Yojana to ensure benefits reach the emigrants working abroad.
80. Abolition of mandatory testing for emigrants as it violates the fundamental rights of the emigrant.

ix. North East

81. The healthcare system must respond to the needs of those affected by conflict in the North East, especially the provision of trauma counselling for women and children. This includes a large segment of children working in the coal mines of some North East states. Provision of accessible, affordable and quality health services should be ensured.

⁸ Recently, UNDP-India has commissioned the preparation of Hijras/TG-specific targeted HIV intervention guidelines. These guidelines are being developed to be culturally specific to various intervention settings. UNDP with DFID intends to develop guidelines based on this model for the national AIDS control programme(NACP)

82. The population policy of the government should be reformulated and made to conform to the recommendations of the International Conference on Population and Development (ICPD). Especially to counter the persistently high infant mortality and maternal mortality rates, a gender-sensitive approach cutting across all projects/programmes and schemes must be adopted.
83. Community monitoring of NRHM and health facilities to be extended to all the districts as the claims of state reports showing high success of the programme may be exaggerated, especially in Assam.
84. There is a high incidence of parent-to-child transmission of HIV in the North East. Prevention of parent-to-child transmission (PPTCT) centres should be expanded in the North East along with appropriate information dissemination on the issue. Preventive medicine for children should be made available to pregnant HIV-positive women.
85. Women living with HIV find it extremely difficult to secure bank loans. Financial assistance for HIV-positive SHG members must be provided by the government so that they will have the means for improving their economic conditions and become productive members of the community;
86. Orphaned children living with HIV/AIDS need special attention due to the prevailing stigma around HIV/AIDS. The government must ensure their safety and provide them with food, nutrition, medicines and shelter.
87. To address working HIV-infected and -affected women's concerns regarding their children, the government should set up day care centres for their children.
88. Recognise the growing incidence of mental illness and the lack of facilities and services for the mentally ill and focus on the entire North East, where such services and infrastructure are very poor.
89. All ICDS projects have to be strictly monitored as its accountability in the North East is dismal. This has resulted in lack of motivation amongst the workforce on the one hand and high scale of malnutrition amongst the children, especially in areas that are remote.

x. Elderly

90. Frame senior citizen-friendly health insurance schemes with separate focus on BPL and APL families. The Arogyasri Model from Andhra Pradesh can be replicated.
91. The recommendations of the Sastri Committee Report of the Insurance Regulatory and Development Authority of India, which is with the Ministry of Finance, should be implemented.
92. Geriatric wards and geriatric outpatient departments should be established in all major hospitals located at taluka and district levels.
93. Strengthening public health centres by providing more staff, adequate medicines and infrastructural facilities to treat old persons.
94. Extend the Mid Day Meal scheme to provide nutritional support to the elderly through day care centres.
95. Promotion of a mental health programme for the elderly.
96. Free distribution of technology and assistive devices to the elderly should be ensured.
97. Inclusion of elderly health issues in ongoing programmes of the National Rural Health Mission (NRHM) and National Urban Health Mission (NUHM) and the creation of an age-friendly public health system.
98. Training in geriatrics should be provided to doctors, nurses, para-medical staff and care givers.

xi. Muslims

99. Provision of health facilities like public hospitals, PHCs and clinics in designated Muslim areas.
100. Diploma holders in Unani and Ayurvedic medicine should be given recognition in the second schedule of the Central Council of Indian Medicine Act of 1970.
101. Reservation should be given to Muslim students in getting seats in state and Central medical colleges.
102. The Accredited Social Health Activist (ASHA) in different village areas should include Muslim women appointed by the Chief District Medical Officer.
103. Under the Rajiv Gandhi Swasthya Bima Yojana, proper representation should be given to Muslims.

104. Two Muslim members should be nominated by the Chief District Medical Officer in Jilaa Swasthya Sewa.
105. The financial allocation to meet the budget by the government should be done in consultation with Muslim civil society.

xii. PLHIV

106. A healthy and balanced focus on HIV prevention, care, support and treatment for the National AIDS Control Plan.
107. Encourage and apply innovative approaches to current programmes not limited to HIV, that will inform and mobilize communities to access entitlements and services
108. Development and implementation of focused programmes for HIV-affected and infected women and children.
109. Protect the right to health of PLHIV by ensuring continuous availability of treatment – both antiretroviral therapy and treatment for opportunistic infections. Future needs and advances in effective therapy, i.e. Hepatitis C medication, 2nd line and 3rd line therapy for adults and children and oral substitute therapy (OST) should also be made universally available and accessible in the country. To improve access and adherence, one-stop HIV health services should be provided for PLHIV.
110. The PLHIV community is concerned about the threat to universal access and sustainability of treatment with regards to India's stand on Trade Related Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS) under the World Trade Organisation negotiations. The Government of India should make sure that public health interests inform India's stand on these negotiations.
111. The infrastructure and technical capacity will need to be scaled up to provide quality healthcare. The services have to consider the diversity, be sensitive to the needs of marginalised communities and keep special focus on women and children. Facilities that improve access and sustain adherence to therapy, such as temporary shelters and care homes, should be promoted.

xiii. People with Disability

112. Include disability as part and parcel of ICDS policy guidelines.

113. Disability should be included as a generic component of the training curriculum of ICDS including inclusive implementation strategies.
114. Reasonable accommodation should be provided to CWDs as part of the curriculum and practice in ICDS centres.
115. CWDs should be absorbed as ICDS workers in the proportion of 6:1.
116. Implementation and monitoring should include representation of PWD in all health-related planning and monitoring structures at all levels.
117. Sensitisation of health officials and personnel on disability in the health department in the existing curriculum.
118. There should be budget allocation for medicines at the PHC level for health conditions like epilepsy, mental health and other such conditions.
119. There should be budget allocation for disability certification at the PHC level.
120. Health department to take the responsibility of providing medical rehabilitation, assistive devices (including maintenance) and surgical post-operative care.
121. ASHAs to be given separate incentive for supporting children and persons with disabilities.
122. IEC campaigns should focus on disability and integrate disability in health awareness at the primary care level.
123. Develop computerised MIS to document data on number and types of disability at the PHC level.
124. Presently doctors have a very short orientation on identification of disability, so special courses should be designed for them regarding this subject.
125. Social advertising should be done through the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting by allocating 20 per cent of the budget for disability-related work.
126. Schools of mass communication and journalism should create IEC programmes as a part of their training, covering the sector as a whole including all cross-disability issues.
127. The opportunities of all vulnerable groups including street children should be equalised.
128. Disability specific cell should be there in every district hospital and ECCD facilities (e.g. Anganwadi) on similar lines as for HIV programmes.

129. All residential set-ups meant for minority groups should be disability inclusive.
130. Course design should incorporate prevention, promotion, appropriate intervention as well as long term interventions for PWD with a life-span approach.
131. Capacity building should be done at the grassroots and funds should be given for civil society organisations, Panchayats, SHGs and all community care providers (parents, PWDs), parent associations, day care and respite care providers) involved in such work.
132. There should be cross-sectoral planning. A specified percentage of funds from every ministry should be earmarked for making programmes disability-inclusive e.g. the construction of a universal design hospital.
133. Universality of health coverage can be achieved by bringing the health system to the school system and including all children.
134. Fiscal cross-subsidisation policies should be followed to fund disability-inclusive planning.

Other Recommendations

Urban Poor

Consultation on Urban Poor for the Approach to the 12th Five Year Plan

Swaasthya, IGSSS, Green Flag, Action Aid, and Hazards Centre had taken the responsibility to organise the National Consultation on the Urban Poor to make recommendations for the Approach Paper to the 12th Five Year Plan. This was successfully organised at the Vanamati venue in Nagpur on 28th November 2010. Unfortunately, because of the extremely short notice, many groups who were keen to come could not attend because of non-availability of tickets on trains and our inability to pay air fare. Even among the co-anchors, only the IGSSS and Hazards Centre could attend and so the responsibility for administrative and other matters mainly fell on the Hazards Centre. However, the local organisation was done very ably by the INSAF group.

The participants were mainly from cities and towns in Maharashtra such as Mumbai, Pune, Nagpur, Nashik, Nanded and Malegaon. There was also some representation from Delhi and Vishakhapatnam. Hence, it was decided that the proceedings of the consultation would be disseminated widely amongst the many other groups working with the urban poor in other cities and towns in order that a consensus could be reached with respect to the expectations of this constituency from the 12th Five Year Plan. Harsha Srivastava represented the Planning Commission at the consultation, and he also had the opportunity to interact with some slum groups of Nagpur in the evening. Later, inputs were received from urban groups in Andhra, Orissa, Chhattisgarh, Delhi and West Bengal and these have also been incorporated into the issues and recommendations given below.

The proceedings began with a welcome on behalf of all the co-anchors and an introduction to the consultation

by Dunu Roy of the Hazards Centre. At the request of the participants, he also briefly presented a review of the planning process, the results of the Mid-Term Appraisal of the 11th Five Year Plan, and the challenges proposed for the 12th Five Year Plan by the Planning Commission. Harsha Srivastava also spoke about the process that had been set in motion by the Planning Commission to make the 12th Five Year Plan more participatory and presented the expectations of the Commission from this consultation. This was followed by self-introduction by all the present groups and a summary of their experiences along with an animated discussion on the (lack of) linkage between the previous mid-term appraisal and the proposed challenges. Subsequently, it was agreed that four working groups should be formed on the themes of governance, livelihoods, shelter, and basic services. These groups spent almost three hours discussing their themes and then assembled in the plenary to present their conclusions. These are listed below.

1. Governance

- Local governance has to be strengthened if decentralisation is to be implemented in its true sense. For this, it is important to constitutionally introduce a tier of governance at the local Sabha level where the population should not be more than 5000.
- The development agencies should be accountable to these local bodies and training has to be imparted to the officials and the Nagar Sewaks to be responsive to the needs of the urban poor.
- There should be increased investment in small and medium-sized towns and this investment should not be for higher profits but for better services.
- These basic services should be provided to all without discriminatory terms and conditions

and the provisions/norms for the poor should be in relation to their proportion in the urban population.

- A database of all small and medium-sized towns must be made available online to allow the people to participate in the process of decision making.
- Gender planning and gender budgeting must be prioritised in the allocation of funds. The priorities and issues of women and men differ in the process of planning.
- District Planning Committees (DPC) must and should be set up with immediate effect in the respective states where there is no DPC.
- An empowered convergence structure is needed at the state level to bring together basic services, health services, urban planning and children's programmes for integrated action.

2. Livelihoods

- Development schemes have to be employment-centric to provide for security of employment opportunities with mandatory fair wages and challenging the myth of the "growth rate".
- Employment generation schemes cannot reach their target unless labour-intensive industries and working sectors develop in numbers.
- This may be partially achieved by stopping contractual work in government schemes, implementation of existing labour laws in all urban areas without exception (including Special Economic Zones) and giving priority to those development works that generate maximum employment.
- In addition, the poor and the residents of unauthorised colonies should be covered under the Swarn Jayanti Shahari Rozgar Yojana. The credit level for self-employment should be raised to Rs. 30,000, planned linkages have to be made between urban and rural employment schemes, and there has to be large scale setting up of vocational training institutions.
- A comprehensive budget for the expansion and integration of formal and informal sectors has to be prepared that recognises the link between livelihoods and shelter and provides for universal identity and social security.

- In order to maintain the integrity of these schemes there has to be a provision for "social audit" of all schemes linked to access through Right to Information and explicit mention of all subsidies – concealed or otherwise.

3. Basic Services

3.1 Health

- Identification of entitlement and universal access
- Health education through public sector
- Increased budget allocation
- Improved quality of services including after-care
- Increased provision for mental healthcare and non-communicable diseases
- Development of an occupational hazards policy
- Review policies to integrate basic services for the most marginalised
- Multiple models to be used to address the issue of childcare
- Reliable data on maternal health and young children in slums to be collated for accurate planning

3.2 Education

- Education fees should be regulated
- No privatisation in education
- Provide basic facilities and quality in all educational institutions
- Desirable student-teacher proportions to be made mandatory
- Vishaka Judgment guidelines to be made compulsory
- Appointment of school counsellors
- No discrimination among students
- Proper maintenance and monitoring
- Mid Day Meals and tiffin to be nutritious
- Migrant children should be brought within the ambit of SSA and extension services

3.3 Electricity

- Electricity unit rate should be affordable
- Illegal connections to be stopped
- No privatisation of electricity generation and distribution
- Connection rate should be less expensive

3.4 Water

- Equal distribution of water and all services
- No privatisation of water through 24X7 programmes
- Drinking water to all as per Central Public Health Engineering Department norms
- Proper waste water disposal management

3.5 Transport

- Provision of well-constructed roads
- No privatisation in transport sector
- Increase in the number of buses and bus stops
- Ensure strict regulation and traffic discipline
- Sustainable and low investment public transportation to be encouraged

3.6 Sanitation

- Increase the number of public toilets and provide for maintenance
- Appropriate low-cost waste management process/techniques with segregation at source and appropriate healthcare for trash collectors
- Judicious use of pesticides, medicines, cleaning solvents etc to prevent pollution

3.7 Public Distribution Services

- Stop corruption in the PDS from top to bottom
- Proper information to be provided to the beneficiaries

3.8 Public services

- Provision of pro-poor markets, playgrounds, gardens, burial grounds and community halls

4. Shelter

- The Tendulkar Committee has estimated the BPL population to be 35 per cent. This figure or a re-survey should form the basis for determining the need for shelter.
- A national housing policy has to be framed in consonance with United Nations guidelines for shelter with equal rights to all basic services.
- Until all the basic facilities are made available at the resettlement plots/flats, slums should not be evicted and they should be covered under the Valmiki Ambedkar Awaas Yojana or Master Plans.
- Labour colonies to be constructed by the government like those for government servants and given on rent or lease for 99 years or with ownership (Malki Patta).
- Plot size should be fixed between 500-600 sq ft and there should be no cut-off date for eligibility. It should also be remembered that high-rise housing is not pro-poor.
- Houses/flats under Maharashtra Housing and Area Development Authority should be given permanently instead of for 30 years and maintenance provided.
- Other states should adopt the Madhya Pradesh model where 12 per cent area in residential colonies is reserved for EWS/Awasi patta as per the population distribution.
- During allotment of SRA /JNNURM plots/flats, size of household/family members to be taken care of.
- Unauthorised colonies should be regularised and provided with basic civic facilities.
- National, state, and ward level monitoring committees have to be formed to ensure accountability and transparency.

5. Final Recommendations

At the plenary, the group suggestions were debated and the following recommendations arrived at through consensus, with respect to the 10 challenges posed by the Planning Commission:

1. Growth is not an indicator of hunger-free India, where growth is increasing while the condition of the poor is declining.

2. Reject the GDP-centred economic growth model and markets as mechanisms for inclusion and efficiency and emphasise alternative planning around livelihood-focused development.
3. The identity of workers, including migrants, through registration is crucial to ensure access to government welfare programmes.
4. Implement labour laws (Building and Other Construction Workers' Act, Tea and Plantation Workers Act, Migrant Workers Act, Minimum Wages Act, Child Marriage Act and Child Labour Act, etc) universally to ensure a living wage and abolish contractual and casual work.
5. Estimate the housing deficit and provide tenured, affordable and liveable shelter near work places for all.
6. Provide for innovative people's housing and regularise all 'illegal' – but affordable and liveable – housing.
7. Universal and equal access to all state-managed welfare services without any privatisation whatsoever.
8. Recognise the environmental benefits of low-cost and low-resource-use pro-poor livelihoods and shelter with provisions for value addition.
9. Decentralised governance at the mohalla level (population 5,000) with building skills for participating in alternative planning.
10. Social audits of all implementation through strengthening existing participation and transparency laws and the use of accessible media.
11. Build linkages between rural and urban livelihoods and, therefore, of integrated employment-centric planning with provisions for voluntary migration.

Thematic Inputs from Others

Thematic Inputs from Others

Section Contents

1. Maternal health	133
2. Land rights	135
3. Food and nutrition security in the 12 th Five Year Plan	138
4. Health	140
5. Water	142
6. Right to education and Key Challenges	144
7. Resourcing the transparency regime in India	145
8. Inclusive growth ensuring distributive justice from a labour rights perspective	148
9. Climate change	150
10. Energy	153
11. Improving access to quality education	155
12. Mining	164
13. Budget	166
14. Review of the Central Social Welfare Board	171
15. Voluntary sector and government: partners in development	172
16. Governance, institutions and the planning process	173
17. Need for peace and equity audit as a parameter for development planning	175

1. Maternal Health

National Alliance for Maternal Health and Human Rights

Challenges addressed in this paper

1. Enhancing the Capacity for Growth
2. Decentralisation, Empowerment and Information
3. Rural Transformation and Sustained Growth of Agriculture
4. Better Preventive and Curative Healthcare

The 1994 Cairo Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development stated:

Reproductive rights embrace certain human rights that are already recognised in national laws, international human rights documents and other relevant United Nations consensus documents. These rights rest on the recognition of the basic right of all couples and individuals to decide freely and responsibly the number, spacing and timing of their children and to have the information and means to do so, and the right to attain the highest standard of sexual and reproductive health. It also includes the right of all to make decisions concerning reproduction free of discrimination, coercion and violence as expressed in human rights documents. In the exercise of this right, they should take into account the needs of their living and future children and their responsibilities towards the community.... Implicit in this is the right of access to healthcare services that will enable women to go safely through pregnancy and childbirth. All countries are called upon to strive to make reproductive health accessible through the primary healthcare system to all individuals of appropriate age.

Maternal mortality in India is a grave issue, with 70-80,000 women¹ dying each year due to pregnancy related causes. Moreover, it is undoubtedly an issue of social inequity, as it is faced by the most marginal communities and women in vulnerable situations. It has been seen that the prevalence of poor maternal health is higher in marginalised Dalit communities and other lower caste and Adivasi communities. Maternal mortality is also the one-point indicator of the quality of primary health services. Maternal health is affected by many social determinants, including gender discrimination, social exclusion and discrimination, displacement, violence, conflict and the lack of basic necessities such as nutrition, livelihoods, safe water and sanitation.

We affirm the need for strong rights-based strategies to ensure greater accountability for these thousands of preventable deaths among women in India. To strengthen such a rights-based approach, we need to position ourselves in the real situation of the primary rights-holders who are still struggling to access their entitlements despite having several normative 'rights'. At the same time, we have to understand the roles and constraints of health service providers, especially at the field-level. This would involve a broader understanding of social exclusion and its consequences at various levels and in all its dimensions, resulting in a strong political will to bring about the desired change.

Universalisation of rights is necessary for the furthering of a rights-based approach. We should be moving towards a participatory regulation of the entire health sector within a framework of a publicly managed and funded universal access system with no targeting at all.

¹ Estimates range from 65,000 to 100,000; an unacceptable number for any country and more so for India.

Next, we want to state that it is the responsibility of the government to provide basic and good quality health services to all the citizens of the country without any discrimination on the lines of caste, class, religion, gender, etc. At this point, then, what is required is the fulfilment of the election promise of greater fund allocation² to the health budget through a massive infusion of resources, along with clear indicators for accountability and monitoring (governance, human resource, grievance redress, community-based monitoring, etc).

With regard to health policies in the country, we strongly advocate that there needs to be an objective re-examination of the role of “incentives” in reducing maternal deaths. Instead, the quality orientation of services should be tracked by monitoring maternal, foetal and neo-natal survival, and the extent of infection prevention or management of obstetric or post-partum complications.

The lack of accountability with regard to maternal mortality is a serious issue that acts as an obstacle to moving forward and addressing the qualitative nuances of the problem. Given the vast number of women dying, the government must assume greater accountability for each case. Currently, the focus is on inputs like the Janani Suraksha Yojana (JSY), and outputs like the number of women who have received JSY benefits, or the number who have attended institutions during childbirth. In order to meet the 11th Plan goals, more attention must be paid to examining maternal health outcomes (such as the number of maternal deaths within 42 days, number of deliveries that had safe outcomes for both mother and baby, records of postpartum complications, or any other adverse outcomes).

The policy discussion on maternal health in the present scenario, has become limited to institutional delivery, without looking at the continuum of maternal care. The socio-economic determinants of health such as poverty, social exclusion, access to food are also neglected. We need to urgently reconsider how safe motherhood may be ensured for the significant proportion of pregnant women still not reaching hospitals. It is not adequate to talk of only institutional delivery and the focus should be on safe delivery³, even if it occurs at home. The first and second Auxiliary Nurse Midwives (ANM) posted in the sub-centres

should provide domiciliary care during childbirth and in the post-partum stage if the mother is not reaching the hospital. Those women who develop any dangerous complications must be visited at home by the Primary Health Centre (PHC) doctors and, if needed, transported to the appropriate facility for further treatment.

The JSY focus should be expanded from institutional delivery to continual care. For this, all treatment for obstetric or post-partum/ante-partum complications must be free with adequate follow-up at home, based on a protocol. Moreover, malnutrition, which is a major cause of anaemia and consequent maternal deaths, needs to be addressed through effective implementation of food and nutrition support programmes. The most effective method would be to ensure that all women who become pregnant are paid a single-installment, unconditional maternity benefit, equal to and not less than the minimum wages for three months of work in their state.

Finally, we recommend that all women delivering in private, public or NGO hospitals should be legally entitled to adequate information, dignity, privacy, informed consent, access to medical records, non-discrimination, free beds in trust hospitals, etc. This will enable them to receive better quality access to maternal healthcare. To ensure this, the rules for the recently passed National Clinical Establishments (Registration and Regulation) Act should explicitly include the protection of patients’ rights.

2 India’s current ratio of 0.89 per cent of GDP spent on health is lower than many developing countries - Sri Lanka’s ratio is 2 per cent, Costa Rica’s is 5.3 per cent, Cuba’s is 7.1 per cent, and both Malaysia and China’s is 1.9 per cent.

3 The Comptroller and Auditor General’s (CAG) report on the National Rural Health Mission (NRHM) shows the gaps in JSY records, meaning that the registration of women cannot be always equated with either institutional delivery or safe delivery.

2. Land Rights

Ramesh Sharma, Ekta Parishad

A New Vision of Land Reforms

The urgency of land reforms in India stems from the critical role of land ownership in sustaining basic human needs. Since Independence, land reforms have occupied centrestage in the nation's economic policy and development. At the current juncture, the sustainability and success of India's economic development is being critically observed around the world. A serious revision and reassessment of land policy is necessary if our country hopes to realise the possibilities of broad-based economic growth. This new vision of land reforms is based on our Constitution, which promises people a decent living standard and a dignified means of livelihood.

The insufficient land reform laws have failed to provide land to the landless. Moreover, in states where they have had some initial success, they are being "rolled back" and repealed. This regression of land reform laws reveals that the critical issues of social equity, empowerment and poverty reduction have not been comprehensively addressed. Abandoned and ignored by the state, the marginalised are compelled into social violence and armed activities to express their disillusionment with democratic processes and institutions. This rural distress has further led to high levels of land alienation/eviction and indebtedness. The extent of poverty caused by landlessness reaches beyond rural areas. Migration to cities is another inescapable result of rural poverty and it further exacerbates the problems of infrastructure, food and shelter for the urban working poor. The Central government must convince the states to enact and implement appropriate land reform laws if it wants to ensure equity in economic growth.

The key components of this new vision of land reform are:

- Initiate a time-bound programme for immediate land regularisation and distribution including

identification of surplus and ceiling land and genuine landless persons to ensure livelihood security.

- Guarantee land rights and entitlements to the marginalised poor, while respecting the principles of social equity, empowerment and inclusion.
- Arrest the process of pauperisation of marginal and small farmers by addressing issues such as debt burden, mortgaging and distressed selling of land and the provision of an adequate support base for sustaining agriculture.
- Recognise that the combination of globalisation, liberalisation and privatisation has initiated a reversal of land reforms through a systematic dismantling of previous legislation and policy. The upward revision of land ceiling, liberalisation of tenancy law, increasing corporatisation of agriculture, opening up of prime agricultural lands, wastelands, mines, water and other natural resources to multinationals and corporate entities are causing serious damage to the socio-economy of rural India and should be immediately stopped.

Policy Implications

1. Land Identification, Regularisation and Distribution of Land to the Landless Poor

This entails identification of surplus land, available ceiling land and other revenue land and ensuring the proper distribution (through regularisation) and allotment (through physical possession) to the needy communities taking into account tenancy rights. Provision of homestead land as well as joint title is significant for women in this process. Individual and collective ownership or long-term lease for 99 years for the landless poor are means to enable families to hold on to land resources.

2. Regularisation of Adivasi Land

Regularisation includes survey, allotment, physical possession and safeguarding of lands of the Scheduled Tribes. Preventing land alienation (because of protected areas, industrialisation and infrastructural projects) ought to be the norm. Wherever displacement becomes inevitable, the scheduled Adivasi family should remain the owner of the land benefiting from a lease agreement. Where there is no benefit, the Scheduled Tribes should be guaranteed rehabilitation and resettlement.

3. Preventing loss of farmland particularly that owned by small and marginal farmers

The loss of farmland occurs due to land consolidation and contract farming, lack of access to rural institutional credit and adverse agricultural pricing, and this has led to a high degree of distress sale and suicides. Those that become landless are forced to struggle for a limited number of employment opportunities and livelihood options. To mitigate this various urgent measures must be taken including:

- Under the Right to Property Act, all allotted land must be updated as joint entitlement.
- Promulgation and implementation of a Debt Relief Act including one time remission of the cumulative institutional and non-institutional debt burden of marginal and small farmers.

4. Land and Women

Women need to be provided with land that gives them independent or joint title and greater decision-making power over the land plot. Special attention needs to be given to widows and single women. In addition, women who are managing small farms should be given incentives for remaining on the farm. Collective farming should be encouraged through self-help groups (SHGs) particularly among women who have no land resources. Women should be recognised as farmers and given that status in any subsidy, credit scheme and agricultural extension programme.

Institutional Mechanism

I. National Task Force on Forest Rights Act (FRA) and PESA Act

A National Task Force should be formed and given statutory powers to direct state governments and other line departments for carrying out a time-bound implementation of the FRA and the PESA. It should be accorded the institutional power to coordinate with state departments and ministries.

Suggested Functions

The National Task Force will be responsible for monitoring of State performance and preparation of a time-bound action plan and issuance of guidelines for effective implementation of the PESA and Forest Rights Act.

II. National Land Reforms Council

A National Land Reforms Council should be set up and given statutory powers to direct state governments and other agencies to carry out a comprehensive land reform agenda. It should be accorded the power to coordinate with other ministries and departments.

Suggested Functions

- Providing a clear picture of land utilisation in India based on updated state land records.
- Ensure proper implementation of land and housing rights through allocation of government land, Bhudan land, temple and trust lands and common lands.
- Prioritise implementation of land reform laws in areas with agrarian violence and unrest, such as those in Naxalite dominated areas.
- Identify available land for redistribution with the help of State governments and their concerned departments.
- Strengthen various pro-poor laws related to land and livelihood resources like the Land Ceiling Act, Panchayat Extension to Scheduled Areas Act, Tenancy Act, etc.
- Shield vulnerable sections from the adverse effects of the Indian Forest Act, Forest Conservation Act, Wildlife Act and Land Acquisition Act.
- Maintain a reliable database on lands available for redistribution to landless, lands distributed but not in possession of the beneficiaries, wastelands,

temple and trust lands, Bhudan lands and forestland.

III. Fast Track Courts on Land Disputes

Fast Track Courts need to be constituted in order to deal with the long delays in acquiring land title, adjudicating in land disputes and in minimising harassment and expense. Adjudication of rights of the tiller with respect of land under absentee landlords should also be expedited. Also, cases against Scheduled Tribes should be given special cognisance.

Suggested Functions

- The first basic task should be to clear the backlog of cases related to land disputes from the lower to the highest courts. The services of retired judges and social activists could be used over a period of years. There are thousands of disputes among the farmers and in many cases between farmers and labourers or tillers that need to be resolved quickly.
- Reduce the time, energy and cost that people have to expend in litigation.

IV. One Window System for Land Distribution

A one-window system needs to be constituted at the sub-division level to deal with issues of land allotment, mutation, demarcation and giving of physical possession over land.

Suggested Functions

- Farmers and labourers should be able to access this system for land-related grievances at the tehsil level so as to reduce time and cost.
- Sensitive and efficient officers need to be appointed and provided with the advisory contributions of social activists.

3. Food and Nutrition Security in the TFYP

Dipa Sinha, Right to Food Campaign

While the 11th Five Year Plan set ambitious targets towards achieving a 50 per cent reduction in malnutrition, it does not seem like we are anywhere close to achieving this. In this context it is important that the 12th Five Year Plan reiterates a commitment towards reduction of malnutrition and ensures that some of the recommendations of the 11th Five Year Plan are taken forward along with the necessary financial backing.

In this context, the following are some of the points that should be included in the 12th Five Year Plan:

1. **Integrated Child Development Services for providing benefits to children under six, pregnant and lactating mothers, adolescent girls (ICDS):**

1. There is no national system of nutrition monitoring, mapping and surveillance in the country. District level disaggregated data are not available from the National Nutrition Monitoring Bureau and the National Family Health Surveys. An independent nutrition surveillance system must be set up so that we are able to monitor the progress made on malnutrition at least once in two years at the district level, along the lines of the District Level Household Survey (DLHS). This would be important even for the Planning Commission to monitor its targets.
2. The effective implementation of ICDS and related interventions requires a high-level overseeing authority, serving as a technical body and providing strategic oversight, that centrally monitors both health and nutrition outcomes of children under six. This overseeing authority should be linked directly with the Prime

Minister's Office and the Planning Commission. It should have a balanced composition, including some representation of civil society organisations but excluding commercial interests.

3. All interventions for universalisation with quality of the ICDS must be put in place.
4. Ensure focus on children under two years of age through the appointment of a second anganwadi worker and start anganwadi-cum-crèches in at least 10 per cent of anganwadis (as proposed in the 11th Five Year Plan).
5. The maternity benefit scheme has been started in a pilot manner in 200 districts. The 12th Plan should include provisions for universalising the maternity benefit scheme and also to increase the amount of the benefit given to each woman to at least Rs. 6000.
6. Similarly, SABLA (the Rajiv Gandhi Scheme for Empowerment of Adolescent Girls) for adolescent girls should also be universalised.
7. A budget must be provided for breastfeeding counselling and promotion in every district.
8. All contributions towards nutrition support should be inflation-indexed.
9. Provide a roadmap for identification and treatment of severely malnourished children (especially severe acute malnutrition) including the setting up of Nutrition Rehabilitation Centres (NRCs).
10. Special interventions for anaemia such as nutrition counselling and the universal availability of paediatric doses of iron supplements should be introduced.

2. Public Distribution System (PDS)

1. The leakages in the PDS should be plugged through the end-to-end automation of the entire PDS chain, introduction of GPS tracking and the activation of vigilance committees.
2. The PDS should be expanded to include pulses, millets and oils as a necessary nutrition intervention.

3. Others

1. Introduce a programme for feeding of destitutes.
2. Run community kitchens in urban areas.

4. Health

Indranil, Research Scholar, JNU

1. **The 12th Five Year Plan is an opportunity to invest in health infrastructure.** One of the major reasons for the deterioration in the quality of health services is lack of capital investment in health services for a prolonged period. It has been observed that the greater share of plan funds is being spent for revenue purposes. The Planning Commission should take initiatives to provide substantial plan assistance to the states so that infrastructural requirements to ensure universal access to health are met within the 12th Five Year Plan period. This would mean:

- Upgrading existing Primary Health Centres (PHC) and Community Health Centres (CHC) to Indian Public Health Standards norms and build new PHCs to these norms.
- District hospitals should be developed in a way that they serve as the highest referral units. This would mean developing district hospitals as medical colleges. Medical education being the joint responsibility of the states and the Centre, the 12th Five Year Plan funds should be transferred to the states to create necessary infrastructure to build medical colleges.
- Given huge vacancies in posts of doctors, nurses and paramedics, the 12th Five Year Plan should focus on creating infrastructure for these teaching institutions.
- States severely lack infrastructure for ancillary services like drug storage and ware housing, medical waste management, surveillance and cold chain management. The 12th Five Year Plan funds should be devoted towards creation of such facilities at the district level to start with.

2. **Strengthening district level planning:** One of the important bottlenecks in proper implementation of

the NRHM is the lack of capacity at the district level and below to plan for health programmes. The 12th Five Year Plan should take up special initiatives to:

- Train district and block-level health administrators on planning.
- Help the states to develop special work forces with abilities to plan properly.
- Engage with Panchayati Raj Institutions (PRI) and develop their capacities and use their grassroots knowledge to plan in a more meaningful way.
- Effective planning would also require generation of extensive data at the village level. Huge investment would be required to develop skills and infrastructure to conduct surveys, collate the data, computerise it and upload it onto a web-enabled MIS.

3. **Urban Health:** In the 11th Five Year Plan, the National Urban Health Mission (NUHM) was talked about but nothing substantial has happened since then. Lack of basic amenities like proper drinking water, sanitation facilities, Primary Health Centres, along with congested settlements, lack of proper food and other social security benefits make the urban poor especially vulnerable to diseases. The main approach of the NUHM seems to depend upon an insurance-based model where there would be higher dependence on the private sector. In the context of the previous plans having failed to deliver their promise to provide basic health and sanitation facilities to the urban poor, it is high time that the 12th Plan should ensure:

- All urban settlements are provided with sub-centres, ICDS centres and PHCs based on the requirement.

- Proper sanitation and water supply to all households in urban areas. Commercialisation of water supply under the Jawaharlal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission (JNNURM) should be resisted under the 12th Plan.
 - There should be proper evaluation of insurance-based schemes like Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana before jumping into a major insurance drive. Existing evidence suggests that such schemes have failed badly in providing requisite services to the poor and instead they are subjected to exploitation.
4. **The issue of human resources:** There has been a general tendency to fulfil human resource vacancies through Plan schemes. Given the very nature of Plan schemes, all these recruitments are done on a contractual basis. This is so rampant that almost half the recruitment of doctors in the public sector is contractual (Rural Health Statistics, 2008). There is ample evidence now that these recruitments lead to deterioration in services because of a lack of commitment and high attrition of staff. According to the CAG, more than half the contractual staff does not complete their entire tenure. It is high time that the Planning Commission stops promoting contractualisation through its programmes. It would be wiser if the Commission stops the business of recruitment and instead focuses on developing capacities at the state level to create a greater pool of human resources and capacities for training. The issue of recruitment should be dealt at the state level. If required, special funds should be provided to states (may be through Finance Commission transfers) to deal with the issue.
5. **Maternal and Child Health:** The entire approach of safe motherhood programmes is based on institutional delivery, whereby conditional cash transfer schemes like JSY are being aggressively pushed. The NRHM Common Review Mission findings and CAG reports clearly suggest that the quality of healthcare in the PHCs and CHCs have so far failed to live up to the increasing demand on these institutions for delivery. The JSY is also marred with delayed payments, harassment of women and increase in informal payments. Evidence also suggests that Ante Natal Care (ANC) and immunisation are being neglected due to the overemphasis on JSY. The 12th Plan should focus on the following:
- Cash benefits under the JSY should be increased adequately, payment should be made in multiple instalments and most of the money should be disbursed before delivery.
 - Regressive conditions like linking the benefits to the number of children should be done away with. However, it is important that transfers are linked to ANC and Post Natal Care (PNC).
 - Special drives should be taken to step up ANC coverage.
 - Given the poor state of affairs of Routine Immunisation, its allocation should be stepped up and the implementation mechanism be strengthened.
 - Issues like developing Emergency Obstetric Care Units, Neonatal Care Units, Integrated Management of Neo-natal and Childhood Illnesses should be integrated with overall development of CHCs and District Hospitals.
 - Production and effective supply of vaccines.
6. **Hunger and malnourishment:** The main cause of the failure of the Indian state to tackle the issue of rising hunger and malnourishment is its limited approach. Hunger and malnourishment cannot be curbed until and unless there is a universalisation of the PDS, ICDS and, specifically, the Supplementary Nutrition Programme. One thing that is universal among these targeted programmes is their utter failure to deliver to the poor and vulnerable. Special emphasis should be taken under the 12th Five Year Plan to universalise the PDS and ICDS.
7. **Research:** Planned investment on health research, especially in the aspects that are important for developing countries should be taken up widely. The Commission should reject the myth that the private sector would play a major role in health research and pave the way for state leadership in this field.

5. Water

Romit Sen, Centre for Science and Environment

1. A hydrological approach to water management

The Planning Commission in its mid-term review (MTR) of the 12th Five Year Plan rightfully mentions that the problems with regard to water management, usage and distribution cannot be tackled until we do away with the current compartmentalisation of water across various ministries and departments. The MTR acknowledges that water management has to look at the entire hydrological cycle holistically. This is the basic premise upon which the 12th Plan needs to proceed.

The biggest challenge with regard to the water sector is the unregulated exploitation of groundwater. In the period from 1995 to 2004, the proportion of districts where groundwater exploitation has reached semi-critical, critical and overexploited stages has grown from 9 per cent to 31 per cent. With 40 per cent of irrigation water and 85 per cent of drinking water coming from groundwater sources, the future scenario is bleak. Groundwater extraction for irrigation using tube wells is the major cause for depleting sources, which have impacted drinking water supply in rural areas. As per Information available with the Central Ground Water Board, there are 27,500 tube wells in the country. However, there is no information on the number of private tube wells in the country. The Economic Survey of Delhi estimates 22 lakh private tube wells in the city. A mechanism to monitor the number of private tube wells in the country will be essential for any measure of groundwater regulation. The problem of groundwater exploitation is compounded by the populist measure of free or highly subsidised electricity to farmers, which leaves no incentive for conservation.

The Government of India's Model Groundwater Bill drafted in 2005 is for the states to adopt. However, the fundamental problem of limiting extraction of groundwater is not addressed in the Bill; it merely proposes a restriction on digging of new wells in areas where the lowering of water tables has been observed. The states need to adopt the Bill with mechanisms to monitor and regulate uncontrolled extraction of groundwater.

2. Drinking Water Management

The National Rural Drinking Water Programme (NRDWP, earlier known as ARWSP) has missed many deadlines of attaining universal coverage. The latest target set by the Department of Drinking Water and Sanitation is March 31, 2012, which coincides with the completion of the 11th Five Year Plan. The mid-term assessment, while pointing out to the constant slippages, raises the concern that despite spending Rs. 72,000 crores since the initiation of the Five Year Plans, coverage remains a problem. Attaining universal coverage by the stipulated deadline will remain a challenge with over a lakh habitations having household access to water as of September 30, 2010 – less than 25 per cent. Water quality is deteriorating across the country with 203 districts affected by fluoride, 206 by iron, 137 by salinity, 109 districts by nitrate and 35 by arsenic contamination. Apart from the chemical, bacteriological contamination is adding to the disease burden with increased infant mortality, maternal health and other disorders.

The new guidelines for drinking water supply reflect major changes in the policy and programme approach with focus on sustaining the sources, community

ownership and management of water supply schemes and water quality management. The preparation of village water security plans is mandatory. However, there are challenges in implementing the guidelines that need to be addressed. The first and foremost challenge is the availability of data for preparing village plans by an informed group of people in the village. Collation and analysis of data on aspects like rainfall, groundwater availability, hydrogeology, present demand especially for irrigation are some of the aspects which will require attention.

The need for the line departments to facilitate this process is also outlined in the guidelines. In reality, there is opposition amongst the line departments to give away power to the PRIs. The principle of empowering the village communities will also entail the disempowerment of the line department officials. A method of change management has to be adopted to move away from government-led delivery of water supply programmes. Solving the problems of water scarcity will necessitate reviving traditional water harvesting systems and incentives for rainwater harvesting across the country including rural areas.

6. Right to Education and Key Challenges

Sandeep Mishra, National Coalition for Education

Children's Right to Free and Compulsory Education was enforced on April 1, 2010, through the Right to Education Act 2009. The key challenge is to implement this Act in the fullest manner. On the one hand, the Government of India has made education a Fundamental Right and on the other hand, it is allowing private sector investment. This can prove to be counterproductive for the poor children of India. The private institutions would invest in primary education for their own vested interests rather than for the betterment of poor children. We have already seen cases of increased tuition fees in private schools in the recent past.

The Planning Commission's initiative to seek inputs from CSOs for developing the approach paper for the 12th Five Year Plan is commendable. There are certain areas of core concern, which should be kept in mind while developing the approach paper for the forthcoming 12th Five Year Plan. Though the Planning Commission also has identified certain bullet points as key challenges for education, yet the process should contain a few more challenges that are pertinent to the approach paper.

Even after eight months of its enforcement, certain states have still not been able to draft their model rules under the RTE Act 2009. The proper and effective implementation of the RTE Act needs many financial provisions for its realisation. For improving access to quality education the following points should also be taken into consideration.

1. The Primary Shiksha Kosh (PSK) is a welcome step taken by the government that should be continued.
2. The PPP model should be re-worked, as it is seemingly oriented towards opening the doors for privatisation of education. The tax benefits being given to the private players seem unjustified, as this can reduce, at least partly, the resources available for improving access to quality education.
3. The 13th Finance Commission's recommendations in terms of fund requirement for the RTE's implementation and its approval in cabinet should be welcomed and the PPP model should be denied, especially when it is being pursued by corporates solely for making profits.
4. Resources should be allocated for updated training modules for teachers and School Management Committees (SMCs).
5. Conditional cash transfer should be discouraged.
6. Resources should be allocated for research to enumerate the number of out-of-school children in the country so that inclusion can be ensured and policies can be chalked out with the correct numbers.
7. A nodal authority should be in place to take cognisance of issues related to the violation of the RTE. The nodal agency should take care of inter-ministerial coordination and victims should not face harassment in getting their rights realised.
8. Centre-state shares of expenditure should be re-worked keeping in mind states that have inadequate resources for fulfilling the education criterion.

7. Resourcing the Transparency Regime in India

Venkatesh Nayak, Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative, New Delhi

1. Background

Way back in 2002, the 10th Five Year Plan document recognised that “*the task of the development administration would become easier if steps are taken to make available information, as a matter of right, to the citizens.*” (Vol. 1, Chap. 6, p. 182). While the statutory framework in the form of the Freedom of Information Act, 2002 was not implemented at all, the Planning Commission made the Right to Information central to the development agenda for the entire country. The linkage, between transparency and its popular vehicle – the right to information – and good governance as a prerequisite for the success of planned socio-economic development, was reiterated in the 11th Five Year Plan as follows: “*The government at all levels must be accountable and transparent. Closely related to accountability is the need to eliminate corruption, which is widely seen as a major deficiency in governance.*” (Vol. 1, Chap. 10, p. 223)

Further, emphasising the role of the non-governmental sector in monitoring the implementation of the Plan agenda, the 11th Five Year Plan document states: “*Space must be provided to VOs [voluntary organisations] for developing citizen initiatives, acting as a watchdog on government systems and strengthening group initiatives. This can only be done if full transparency is assured.*” (Vol. 1, Chap. 10, p. 225). The Right to Information Act (RTI Act) was enacted by Parliament in 2005 to establish a uniform regime of transparency at all levels of administration. The experience of implementation of this seminal law over the past five years calls for urgent attention and resource investment in the following areas during the next five years.

Problem Area 1: The transparency regime is hampered by poor records management.

An efficient system of records management is the sine

qua non of any transparency regime. If records are not easily accessible to officers designated under the RTI Act, they will not be able to make decisions on people’s requests promptly. According to the Second Administrative Reforms Commission, “the weakest link in our information system is the total neglect of record keeping... In many subordinate offices/ agencies of GOI and State Governments, record keeping procedures often do not exist. And where they exist, they are rarely followed. In most cases record keeping procedures have not been revised for decades. Most significantly the practice of cataloguing, indexing and orderly storage is singularly absent. Even when records are stored, retrieval of intelligible information is virtually impossible.” (SARC, First Report, 2006, p. 31)

This Commission recommended that 1 per cent of all flagship development programmes be set aside for improving records management. However, the Government of India diluted this suggestion and advised its departments to make their own budgetary provisions for this purpose. The imperative of records management spelt out in Section 4(1)(a) of the RTI Act has remained a dead letter because this obligation is subject to the availability of resources.

Recommendation:

The 12th Five Year Plan may identify improving information management as a priority area across all levels of the administration and recommend allocation of resources for:

- a) improving the system of records maintenance in government in a phased manner starting with offices that have a high degree of public interface; and
- b) resourcing administrative training institutions to undertake training for public authorities to modernise their record-keeping practices.

Problem Area 2: Inadequate levels of voluntary disclosure by public authorities

The primary intention of the RTI Act as spelt out in Section 4(2) is to require all public authorities to disseminate more information about their working so that people's need to obtain information by making formal applications is reduced. Proactive disclosure of 16 categories of information under Section 4(1)(b) of the RTI Act is a much neglected area. As a result, people are compelled to file applications for information that should have been made public automatically, such as the guidelines, performance reports and evaluation of various welfare schemes and flagship development programmes, amongst others. In areas where resource extraction takes place on a large scale, residents have little information about the value contributed to the GDP by such activities. Little data is publicly available about the extent to which the area is benefiting from the wealth created. Despite the President of India giving an assurance that the Government of India would put all non-strategic information in the public domain (Address to Joint Session of Parliament in June 2009), not much progress has been made. If information is prepared in a reader-friendly manner in the local official language and made available to people through print and electronic means, the number of formal RTI applications is likely to come down. This would considerably reduce the work burden of public authorities.

Recommendation:

The 12th Five Year Plan may identify voluntary disclosure of development-related information as a strategic area across all levels of the administration and recommend allocation of resources for:

- a) developing the capacity of public authorities especially at the district and sub-district level to disseminate crucial information through print and electronic media. The experience of dealing with RTI applications in each public authority during the past five years should serve as a guide for identifying what categories of information may be disseminated voluntarily in addition to the requirement under Section 4(1)(b) of the RTI Act; and
- b) equipping public authorities in districts most plagued by corruption, especially where natural resources are exploited in the form of mining and other forms of resource extraction, to publish through print and electronic media the volumes of output, its monetary value, the revenue/royalty earned by the administration and the extent to which the wealth

so created is invested back in development-related activities in the same region.

Problem Area 3: Poor levels of awareness about and usage of RTI Act and PAIS

The Planning Commission popularised the idea of establishing Public Accountability Information Systems (PAIS) as a means of ensuring people's participation in the implementation, evaluation and social audit of flagship development programmes (see A. Virmani, 'Planning for Results: The Public Accountability Information System', Working Papers Series No.1/2007-PC, 2007). The Government of India recognises its importance (Economic Survey 2008-09, p. 268), but Internet-based PAIS has remained a non-starter for several reasons. Most people, including CSOs and VOs, are not computer/internet literate enough to use PAIS as a resource. The PAIS has remained ineffective as there is no popular pressure on the implementing authorities to regularly upload information about the progress of flagship development programmes on the Management Information Systems (MIS). For example, few CSOs working in rural areas are aware of and know how to use the PAIS of the MGNREGS Portal. Similarly, adequate investment has not been made for spreading awareness about procedures for obtaining information under the RTI Act in the regional languages. This is a statutory obligation under the RTI Act but it is subject to the availability of resources.

Recommendation:

The 12th Five Year Plan may identify as focus areas and recommend investment of resources for:

- a) establishing Internet-based PAIS for all Central- and state- sponsored development programmes and building the capacity of CSOs and VOs to make effective use of these systems to combat corruption; and
- b) educating people with a particular focus on disadvantaged groups about their rights and entitlements under the RTI Act.

Problem Area 4: Poorly-resourced Information Commissions

With the operationalisation of the RTI Act, the traffic of information requests to public authorities has increased manifold. A variety of reasons has contributed to the piling up of information access disputes under the RTI Act before 28 Information Commissions around the country (plus one

newly established in Jammu and Kashmir under that State's RTI Act). These bodies are poorly resourced and staffed, affecting their case disposal performance. They have few resources to monitor the performance of public authorities in terms of voluntary disclosure and records management obligations. Well-resourced Information Commissions can be of great assistance in improving transparency at various levels of the administration throughout the country.

Recommendation:

The 12th Five Year Plan may identify the strengthening of Information Commissions established under the RTI Act as a priority area and recommend allocation of resources to support infrastructure and staffing requirements.

8. Inclusive Growth Ensuring Distributive Justice from a Labour Rights Perspective

J John

1. Employment

Employment generation is one of the most important goals of economic growth. Accelerating economic activities towards the generation of productive and gainful employment has been reiterated by the Planning Commission. The feedback for the approach paper to the 12th Five Year Plan from a labour perspective is that:

- 1.1 The assured days of employment under the MGNREGS should be a minimum of 200 days.
- 1.2 The Employment Guarantee Scheme should be extended to urban areas.

2. Quality of Employment – Decent Work

Employment alone is not sufficient. There has to be an emphasis on decent work. Implementation of the principal of decent work should be ensured by the government.

- 2.1 Right to organise and take part in collective bargaining should be given to all workers.
- 2.2 Child labour should be eliminated. Children below the age of 18 should not be allowed to work.
- 2.3 Stringent measures should be taken against forced labour.
- 2.4 Non-discrimination at workplace should be ensured.
- 2.5 All workers should be paid a living wage.

3. Labour administration

Labour administration should be strengthened. Further liberalisation of labour laws should not be considered, instead the increasing contractualisation

and other labour market flexibilities that are against India's commitment of rights of labour under the constitution should be checked.

- 3.1 The ratio of labour inspectors to workers should be such that labour laws are properly implemented.
- 3.2 There should be stringent punishment for violators.
- 3.3 Accountability of labour administrators should be ensured.

4. Recruitment practices

- 4.1 There should be strict norms for recruitment of workers.
- 4.2 Recruiting agencies need to be regulated.
- 4.3 Creation of a regulatory authority for this purpose is required.

5. Internal Migrant Workers

The Interstate Migrant Workmen's Act (ISMW) in its present form is non-implementable. Most of the migration that takes place is single migration and contractors are not involved.

- 5.1 Identification and registration of all internal migrant workers should be made a priority. All workers should be given identity cards.
- 5.2 Housing facilities should be given to all migrant workers. There should be hostels for working men and women in all industrial clusters.
- 5.3 Sanitation facilities, access to clean drinking water and toilets should be given to all migrant workers.
- 5.4 Health, education and crèche facilities should be provided.

5.5 Banking facilities should be simplified and made accessible to ensure safe transfer of remittances.

6. Emigrant Workers

Migrant workers going out of India for employment should be protected by the government.

6.1 Registration of all Indians going abroad for work should be ensured.

6.2 Counselling services should be strengthened.

6.3 There should be a labour attaché in all Embassies and High Commissions of India.

6.4 Ensure portability of social security benefits.

7. Social Security/Welfare

7.1 Remove the distinction between Above Poverty Line (APL) and Below Poverty Line (BPL) families.

7.2 All workers should be registered, particularly unorganised sector workers.

7.3 Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana (RSBY) should be extended to all workers.

7.4 The RSBY should be extended through the Employees State Insurance system and public insurance.

7.5 Extend old age pension to all workers. The amount should not be less than 50 percent of the wage of the lowest grade government employee.

7.6 Extend maternity benefits to all women workers.

7.7 Unemployment benefits and livelihood loss compensation should be provided to all workers.

8. Wages

8.1 The minimum wage should be recalculated based on the 15th Indian Labour Conference 1957 recommendations and the Sixth Pay Commission's recommendations.

8.2 A national floor wage should be set which should be applicable to all states/industry and occupations

8.3 Non-payment of minimum wage should be made a criminal offence.

8.4 The wage should approximate a living wage.

9. Climate Change

Aditi Kapoor

I. Key Strategy Challenges

1. Enhancing the Capacity for Growth

- Additional budgets for climate adaptation are required. Current approach is business-as-usual wherein ongoing ‘development-focused’ agriculture/drought programmes are identified as ‘adaptation’ programmes without first ascertaining the additional changes in these sectors that climate change is inducing and what additional costs these programmes – and perhaps new programmes – would entail to become adaptive programmes. Enough investment must be made in adaptation.
- Financial institutions to ensure environmental audits through loan agreements.
- Environmental audit of plan expenditure to ensure that environmental sustainability is built into planned expenditure at every level.
- Climate-friendly shelter and transport needs of the poor in the rural areas to be addressed.

2. Enhancing Skills and Faster Generation of Employment

- Homes and schools must be flood-resilient and cyclone-resilient using higher plinth/appropriate building materials to avoid disruption in schooling during climate-induced frequent natural disasters.
- Capacity building should be done in disaster risk reduction for village gram sabha/PRI and in the school curriculum, in collaboration with local NGOs and community groups. Several on-the-ground examples exist for emulation.

- Adaptation measures and development work must complement each other to ensure sustainable livelihoods for poverty alleviation.

3. Managing the Environment

- User groups, with gender equity, to have a central role in governing common property resources (water for irrigation, community forests, village pastureland, etc) to ensure sustainable livelihoods for poverty alleviation.
- Socio-economic auditing of adaptation programmes/schemes to ensure that poor and socially marginalised people benefit from these programmes and budgets.
- Integrate poor people’s livelihood options into decentralised renewable energy generation as part of a mitigation strategy.
- Environmental audits of mining activities to be made integral to operations and to involve participation of local communities.
- Waste management to be declared a climate-friendly industry with incentives and protection of rag-pickers’ livelihoods.

4. Markets for Efficiency and Inclusion

- Environmental audit of market-based solutions for public service delivery in climate-sensitive sectors like power and water supply.
- The aim of ‘making markets accessible and instruments of inclusion’ should be seen from the perspective of ensuring sustainable livelihoods for the poor and socially marginalised producers. This is because climate change threatens to deepen economic and social divides, as the poor have the least capacity to cope with unpredictable changes.

5. Decentralisation, Empowerment and Information

- Inclusion of user groups as part of decision-making structures for common property management.
- Ensuring gender equity and representation of marginalised sections of society in panchayat committees/user groups at decision-making levels.
- Using information technology tools such as mobile phones, radios and web-based portals for sharing information, getting feedback and responding to inputs from user groups.
- Encouraging e-governance and providing requisite infrastructure from the panchayat level upwards.

6. Technology and Innovation

- Making adaptation and mitigation technology gender-responsive.
- Giving traditional knowledge and local adaptation practices their rightful place, integrating these into adaptation programmes and spreading awareness through farmer-to-farmer measures to include both men and women farmers, fisherfolk, forest produce gatherers, livestock rearers, etc.
- Linking agriculture research to women and men farmers.
- Building capacities of farmers to collect climate data on their fields and integrate these into planning decisions and link with the Indian meteorological and agricultural research institutions. For example, training women farmers on installing and operating rain gauges.
- Intellectual Property Rights (IPR) for community knowledge (e.g. women's knowledge about biodiversity of minor forest produce) have to be safeguarded and this needs more work in the legal sphere.

II. Key Sectoral Challenges

1. Securing the Energy Future for India

- Bring non-fossil fuel energy sources into greater consideration for ensuring energy security.
- Bring small agricultural equipment like small lift irrigation pumps of 1 to 3 HP into the fold of

energy efficiency.

- Ensure renewable energy is focused on generating livelihoods and meeting agricultural needs with lighting being an additional benefit, rather than the other way around.
- Work with local NGOs and community groups to tailor renewable energy products to people's needs with adequate training and capacity-building in managing and maintaining the decentralised system(s).
- Give incentives to decentralised, livelihoods-linked renewable energy projects.
- Encourage trading of energy by small, even stand-alone, home-based renewable energy systems to ensure growth, sustainable livelihoods and energy security.

2. Accelerated Development of Transport Infrastructure

- Provide low-carbon public transport to rural and semi-urban areas. The focus of the Mission on Sustainable Habitat is urban India.
- Cross-subsidise low-carbon fossil-fuel transport to promote low-carbon mass and private transport.
- Change government and corporate policies, as also lending policies of financial institutions, which promote the ownership of private transport over usage of public transport.

3. Rural Transformation and Sustained Growth of Agriculture

- Ensure soil fertility and retention of soil moisture, especially by promoting low-chemical agriculture.
- Ensure production and marketing of coarse cereals suited to different agro-climatic zones, rather than growing wheat and rice everywhere and supplying just these two cereals through the PDS.
- Promote climate-resilient livestock species, often local species, better suited to local agro-climatic zones.
- Promote crop diversity and seed diversity to ensure food security at the household level.
- Give incentives to sustainable farming systems rather than subsidies to manufacturers of fertilisers and pesticides that lead to greater

emissions. Sustainable farming systems lead to lower emissions as they re-cycle crop waste and livestock waste.

- Promote traditional crop varieties that use less water in drought-prone areas and spread agriculture technologies that use less water and promote retention of soil moisture.
- Recognise women as farmers through extension services, gender-responsive agriculture technologies, representation in decision-making bodies like irrigation user groups and as agriculture experts and repositories of agriculture knowledge.

4. Managing Urbanization

- Gender representation in local urban governance institutions.
- Incentives to use of renewable energy for water and lighting needs at household/colony/housing society level.
- Encourage flexi-timings and work-from-home policies to reduce unnecessary travelling.

5. Improved Access to Quality Education

- Environmental studies and action to be an integral part of the school curriculum.

6. Better Preventive and Curative Health Care

- Additional adaptation budget needed for ascertaining, preventing and curing climate change induced diseases like malaria. Surveillance is needed for longer periods due to higher temperatures/humidity in certain parts of the country, including Delhi.

10. Energy

Vinuta Gopal, Greenpeace

On energy access

India today has a massive electricity shortage – 78 million households that do not even have access to electricity. This amounts to nearly 60 per cent of India's rural population. A report titled "Still Waiting: A report on energy injustice" examines and highlights the issues of energy access and energy injustice in India. The findings of this report clearly shows that the current, centralised energy delivery system has failed to deliver electricity services to millions of Indians in villages and small towns. This system caters largely to large cities and industry who get priority access over everyone else.

Given this scenario, and the fact that India's flagship rural electrification programme, the Rajiv Gandhi Gramin Vidyutikaran Yojana (RGGVY) is under review for the 12th Plan, we believe this needs a proper and transparent review process. Providing quality energy access in rural India needs to be a priority for the next Plan:

1. We believe that the RGGVY's mandate of 'electricity for all' is currently not being delivered even in areas where the Yojana has been successfully implemented. Therefore, the definition of village electrification (currently 10 per cent household electrification) should be replaced to be inclusive and cover 100 per cent households.
2. The centralised grid has not been able to provide quality power to rural areas (15-16 hrs of continuous supply). Therefore, there is a need for incorporating **distributed generation through renewable energy** to meet the energy shortage and it should be a key component of RGGVY in the 12th Plan.
3. Small-scale renewable energy systems have been quite successful in providing quality power in

villages particularly energy-starved states like Bihar. Mainstreaming such systems can be done by setting a target for small-scale renewable energy generation (off-grid) infrastructure development (non-remote places) in the 12th Plan period.

4. There is an urgent need to directly facilitate power requirement for agriculture and rural small-scale industry through a Central government scheme (either under the RGGVY or a separate scheme with sufficient fund allocation).

On Coal Mining: Go and No-Go Zones

One of the biggest challenges that the country faces is that it has reached a point where the rights of communities and the environment are being perceived to be in conflict with "growth" plans of the country. This challenge can only be addressed if there is proper integrated planning. The current discourse on coal mining is dominated by the view that India has to not only fast-track access to coal in the country but also provide mining access to all coal-bearing regions. This is in clear conflict with the communities in these regions and is also in danger of wiping out significant portions of our last remaining "forests".

We recommend that the Ministry of Environment and Forests's initiative to classify areas as **No-Go Zones for coal mining** should be accepted as a step in the direction of protecting India's forests and forest-dependent communities. This process needs to be further enhanced by ensuring the democratic participation of affected parties and civil society. We also suggest the following:

1. Initiate a process to declare No-Go Zones for mining for all forest areas across India based on their

importance to forest-dependent communities and to wildlife and biodiversity.

2. Ensure that attempts to fast-track mining proposals do not violate or in any way weaken the provisions of the Forest Rights Act, Environment Protection Act and Forest Conservation Act, or the need to secure the prior informed consent of affected communities.
3. Initiate a process of public and expert consultation to enhance participation in the decision-making process and ensure that environmental and social concerns are truly reflected in all government decisions on this issue.
4. Initiate a remediation process for the negative environmental and social impacts that past or ongoing coal mining has had or is having across India.

Energy Efficiency

An increase in economic activity and a growing population does not necessarily have to result in an equivalent increase in energy demand. There is still a large potential for exploiting energy efficiency measures. For example, Prayas Energy Group has estimated that the use of energy-efficient home appliances like fans, air conditioners, televisions, tube lights and refrigerators in the country can help save about 55 billion kiloWatt hours of electricity by 2013. It would defer the need for generating 20,000 MW power over a period of five years or setting up one ultra-mega power plant per year. The Government of India, through the Bureau of Energy Efficiency, should

1. phase out all subsidies and other measures that encourage inefficient energy use;
2. set stringent and ever-improving efficiency and emission standards for appliances, buildings, power plants and vehicles; and
3. mandate energy efficiency norms to ensure that manufacturers and users are moving in a concerted effort towards efficient energy use.

Increase the share of renewable energy

Energy supply has become a subject of major universal concern. Volatile oil and gas prices, threats to a secure and stable supply and, not least, climate change have all pushed it high up on the international agenda. Renewable energy shouldn't merely be viewed as a climate mitigation step

but as a sustainable and secure solution for the country's energy needs. India has the unique opportunity to make the shift when our infrastructure is still being developed. We could well be the nation that leads in the energy solutions of the future. This would need a concerted effort from the Government, especially the Planning Commission.

Renewable energy, combined with the smart use of energy, can deliver at least half of the world's energy needs by 2050. The report 'Energy [R]evolution: A Sustainable India Energy Outlook' shows that a massive investment renewable energy sources will be economically beneficial and by 2030 about 35 per cent of India's electricity could come from renewable energy sources. The measures that need to be taken to maximise the potential for renewable energy in the Indian energy mix are the following.

1. Establish legally defined targets for all forms of renewable energy (not only for solar energy).
2. Nationally fixed minimum rates for PPAs or feed-in support.
3. Nationally fixed minimum Renewable Portfolio Obligation and Renewable Energy Certification standards with strict penalty clauses.
4. Coordinated and transparent regulatory framework for off-grid power (including incentive for mini-grids).
5. Harmonised rules for captive power generation.
6. Clear responsibilities for implementation and strong enforcement mechanisms to achieve the target.
7. Investment in research and development.
8. Encouraging innovation and small entrepreneurship.
9. Provision of training and education infrastructure to build a new work force for green energy solutions.

11. IMPROVING ACCESS TO QUALITY EDUCATION⁴

Anjela Taneja, Oxfam India

Education is a tool for empowerment, a Fundamental Right of each Indian citizen and a tool to obtain other rights. At the same time, research has consistently shown that an investment in strengthening the education system makes sound development sense and constitutes hard economic sense. An investment in education constitutes a foundational investment whereby India can take advantage of the demographic dividend that its relatively young population offers. The poor and traditionally marginalised groups are the ones that are also most likely to lack access to education. The present document looks at the challenges for universalisation with quality of the full Education for All agenda, instead of restricting ourselves to particular age groups. This entails a closer look at Early Childhood

Education and Post Secondary Education than provided for under the Planning Commission Challenges.

Right to Education (Universal Elementary⁵ Education)

The Free and Compulsory Education (RTE) Act, 2009 provides a framework for the provision of eight years of elementary (not just primary) education to all children. The delays in the implementation of the Act's provisions and the duration of the present strategy period means that most implementation challenges will have to be addresses during the next strategy period. Therefore, the recommendations with regard to better implementation are as follows.

Issues	Recommendation
Availability	
Despite consistent commitment, 6 per cent of GDP has not been allotted, resulting in limited improvement of school quality.	The total expenditure on education should be increased to a minimum of 6 per cent of GDP and 3.7 per cent of GDP needs to be spent on elementary schooling alone if universal education with uniform quality is to be ensured. ⁶
Not all areas have schools within the statutory distance, especially in remote/ sparsely populated areas. There are fewer upper primary schools resulting in dropouts, especially of girls, after Class V. Many schools that exist need to be upgraded up to RTE standards.	Identify areas needing additional school construction, especially for the upper primary schools and in the States still requiring additional construction overall. Schemes that provide support for the creation of infrastructure must also address the maintenance and upgrading needs of schools. The number of upper primary schools is dramatically lower than that of primary schools. This is a critical challenge that pushes many children out of school. The complete elementary school cycle needs to be provided.

4. Prepared by Anjela Taneja, Oxfam India, drawing heavily on the discussion papers of the various social group consultations, inputs from the Right to Education Forum and based on an ongoing discourse with civil society.

5. The Planning Commission's original challenge spoke of Primary Education alone. This refers to Class V whereas Article 21A speaks of the Right to Education till age 14, which is Class VIII. It is assumed that restricting the challenge to Grade V has been an oversight on the part of the Commission.

6. As articulated by the National Convention on Union Budget 2011-12 organised by People's Budget Initiative on 19 -20 November 2010 in New Delhi and is based on the KV norms.

<p>Little emphasis has been given to adequately preparing the 5.2 million elementary level teachers⁷ to meet the needs of an increasingly diverse school population. In rural areas, over 75 per cent of rural schools are multi-grade⁸ and 9.71 per cent of primary schools are single teacher schools⁹, hampering teachers' ability to provide quality education. This issue is compounded by the fact that 12.93 per cent of total teachers are para-teachers and only 78.21 per cent of government elementary teachers are professionally trained.¹⁰</p>	<p>All vacancies to be filled at the earliest to ensure that the pupil-teacher ratios are as per the provisions of the RTE Act in all schools and not just as an aggregate figure in a block or district. Investment in setting up of many more teacher training institutions, especially in remote areas, to enable the shortage of teachers to be met. End ad hoc appointments in Adivasi areas; instead, train and appoint local youth. Prioritise the hiring of local, especially women, teachers. Given the emphasis on improving enrolment of girls, which is critically dependent upon the presence of female teachers, the existing gender gap of more than 10 per cent in recruitment of teachers needs to be given special attention. End the practice of hiring of para-teachers by states as a cost cutting measure. The skills of existing para-teachers within the education system are to be enhanced by the state through an effective and quality training system to bring them at par with the standards laid down under the new Curriculum Framework for Teacher Education.</p>
<p>While the RTE Act outlaws levying fees in government schools, the practice has not ended in reality. Furthermore, except for a few states, there is limited scope for regulation of fees of private providers.</p>	<p>The levying of additional fees including those related to the purchasing of textbooks, uniforms and other learning materials that can serve as a barrier to education should end in government schools. Central legislation, as in Tamil Nadu, to be introduced to regulate the fees of private providers.</p>
<p>Many schools are remote and children lack means of accessing the same due to absence of transportation facilities.</p>	<p>Suitable and safe transportation to be provided if its absence prevents children from attending school or otherwise puts them in harm. Rationalise timings of public transport in rural areas to enable teachers and children to reach on time. Make provision in remote areas to escort children (especially older girls) using the experience of Bihar which has introduced this for Mahadalits.</p>
<p>Accessibility</p>	
<p>Discrimination against marginalised children continues with impunity despite provisions prohibiting it in law and policy.</p>	<p>Standards of security related to everyday running of schools to be codified and enforced regularly and not just as a response to specific acute problems or events. Grievance redressal mechanisms should be set up in schools with clear lines going to the upper levels against discrimination and violence in schools. Sensitisation of teachers and the administration to be undertaken to specific issues of marginalised groups. Additionally, teachers to be oriented on usage of non violent teaching.</p>
<p>Discrimination within schools persists. Limited sensitivity and respect for cultural diversity in schools.</p>	<p>Education of a common standard to be provided across the country. Substandard provisions in remote areas impact the education of marginalised groups the most. End discrimination and segregation in classrooms, cultural and social activities. Citizenship education and diversity to find mention in the curriculum. Teacher training to be strengthened on these aspects.</p>
<p>Frequent delay in release of scholarships and other financial support to economically marginalised families. Excessive bureaucratisation in the same.</p>	<p>Specific focus on the most marginalised within the marginalised groups, e.g. primitive Adivasi groups, manual scavengers, bonded child labour. Ensure timely release of scholarships, education fee reimbursements and other monetary help being extended to marginalised communities. Peg scholarship amount to the current rate of inflation. Simplify processes for application, like requirement for excessive documentation. These are usually lacking with poor, neoliterate families.</p>

7. DISE, 2008

8. District Information System For Education (DI SE), 2007

9. District Information System For Education, 2008

10. DISE, 2008

Supplemental programmes for successful transition to formal education, learning achievement.	All children to be given support needed to become successful learners. More bridge courses needed commensurate with the number of children out of school. Residential facilities (hostels, etc.) need to be provided to ensure retention of children and their safety.
Issues of Specific Social Groups	
Dalits	Education of the public on caste discrimination for understanding of rationale and justification for special measures for Dalit students and community. Sensitisation of teachers to issues of caste and the need for proactive hiring of Dalit teachers. Appoint Dalits as cooks for the Mid Day Meal scheme as a measure to end caste discrimination. Conduct activities directly focusing on Dalits out of the SC Special Component Plan instead of making notional allocation of resources.
Adivasis	Education should be provided in the mother tongue. This entails hiring of teachers conversant with the Adivasi language through strengthening teacher training institutions in Adivasi dominated areas and working out a bridge to the dominant state language in a phased manner over a period of a few years. Adivasi Ashrams and Residential Schools: Strengthen monitoring systems for these as gross abuses of child rights have been known to happen in the absence of community or government oversight. Strengthen and enforce minimum norms.
Muslims	Address issues of discrimination against Muslim learners in classrooms and schools. Education facilities to be strengthened in Muslim-dominated areas. Saffronisation of the curriculum continues to happen in several states. Secular values in education need to be upheld in the curriculum, textbooks and lesson transactions. Modernisation of the madrasa education system to be further strengthened.
Girls	Extend the network of Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalayas, which has ensured quality education for girls. Take measures to ensure safety of girls in the schools. Implement the Vishaka Guidelines.
Child Labour	Minimum age for all employment to be set down. Child Labour Act to be congruent with the RTE Act in not providing for simultaneous regulation and prohibition of labour by children under 14. Drastically extend network of bridge courses with clear linkages to schools for children out of school who are potential child labourers. Mechanisms for identification of children at risk of trafficking for child labour/commercial sex work need to be set up in endemic areas and prevention should be strengthened at source. Improvement of the national child labour project: The National Child Labour Project (NCLP) was founded in 1998 to rehabilitate working children released from hazardous sectors. However, this project is inadequate; of the estimated <i>2 million children working in hazardous sectors</i> , the NCLP has mainstreamed only 0.48 million working children into regular education to date. Furthermore, <i>it provides only day schooling and of a standard not in congruence with the new RTE Act norms; rescued children often require residential schooling.</i>
Child Migrants	Flexible policies and support programmes needed for child migrants are flexible school admissions, seasonal hostel facilities, residential schools at source and destination location, coaching classes equipping schools to receive returning children and bridge courses for dropouts. These policies should be extended to cover the scale of population needing these services. Teaching practices, curriculum content and language of instruction should be sensitive to migrant children in "receiving" states. This implies mapping the requirements and then hiring the right teachers, orienting the existing teachers and getting the right textbooks.
Children in areas affected by civil unrest; internally displaced and refugee children	All refugee children, without any distinction, must have access to primary education (UNHCR, 1994, p. 111). In the event that a school is damaged or destroyed as a result of armed conflict, the government should take immediate steps to repair or rebuild the school. Education should be provided while repairs are under way. Occupation of schools by security forces to end immediately as per standing Supreme Court orders. If voluntary repatriation remains feasible, curriculum should be based on that of the curriculum in the country of origin. If voluntary repatriation is unlikely to occur in the foreseeable future, the curriculum should incorporate elements of the curriculum used in the country in which they have sought asylum (UNHCR, 1994, p. 113). Peace education: Conflict resolution and tolerance should be taught to children who are victims of armed conflict (UNHCR, 1994, p. 113). Within the Constitution of India the parameters of peace education for areas of conflict as prescribed by the NCERT can be built upon.

Emergencies	Long-term occupation of schools in emergency situations to be avoided to free schools for instruction. Furthermore, structural safety of school buildings to be ensured through compliance with the National Building Code for all new school buildings and retro-fitting to be done of the old ones. Child-Centred Disaster Risk Reduction strategies to be introduced in consistency with the Hyogo Framework of Action (HFA 2005-2015), mainstreaming issues of children in disaster management planning, school safety initiatives and disaster-resilient homes, schools and livelihoods. Issues of school safety to be introduced within the curriculum.
Children living with and affected by HIV/AIDS	Prevent discrimination based on HIV status or status of relatives. All educational institutes (government, aided or private) must be directed not to refuse admission to any children affected by HIV or bar any such child from attending school on grounds of HIV status. Priority for accessing government schemes and waiver of administrative requirements for accessing schemes for children in families affected or infected by HIV/AIDS, including and especially AIDS orphans.
Children with disability	Universal Design: Ensure that infrastructure is accessible by children with disability. This needs to go beyond the existence of a mere ramp at the gate of the school and can include railings in the classroom and toilets, and even the availability of a teacher who can handle children with disability. Teacher training, sensitisation of teachers: There is an acute shortage of special educators in the country. This needs to be overcome. At the same time, all teachers need to be trained to handle children with disability in their own classrooms. Cluster Resource Centres or Block Resource Centres to be strengthened as resources for education and rehabilitation of children with disability in their own areas. Special vs. inclusive schools: In a majority of cases, children with disability can be taught in mainstream schools. Necessary adaptation would be required to accommodate them. This includes the availability of teaching and learning material in classrooms. Home-schooling of children with disability should be discouraged as it fails to comply with the minimum standards of education under the RTE Act. Education of children with disability should be addressed under the same ministry as other children. Consequently, education of children with disability should be transferred to the Ministry of Human Resource Development from the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment.
Acceptability	
Improve standards of schools. Increased time spent learning in school.	Restructure Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan with the clear goal of providing quality of education equivalent to that of the Kendriya Vidyalayas for all schools as mentioned in the 11th Five Year Plan. Free teachers from non-teaching and clerical work. Appointment of clerical staff in larger schools and in part-time capacity in smaller schools to free teachers from non-academic, school related, but non-teaching work. ICT based solutions should be looked at. Urgent provision of electricity and Internet connectivity in all schools. Strengthen teacher training through both in-service and on-site support to teachers to enable them to plan more meaningful activities. Monitoring systems of teacher attendance to be strengthened and relevant incentives and disincentives need to be planned.
School leadership	Appointment of head teachers in all schools. If an existing teacher is appointed as acting headmaster, capacity building should be done to enable him/her to play the role. A new budget line for capacity building of headmasters should be introduced to enable them to provide local leadership to their teachers
Relevant, inclusive, skill level-appropriate and high quality curricula, textbooks and learning materials.	Students must be able to make connections to what they are reading. The quality of textbooks in several states needs to be improved. School libraries should be improved and the children introduced to the idea of reading clubs. A link between village and school libraries should be built. Incorporate components of health and nutrition, environmental education, human rights, moral values, unified arts, media literacy in the curriculum. A truly inclusive educational environment is sensitive to the diverse needs and learning styles of students. Assessments should reflect this Content transacted in classrooms to be made relevant to the learners and supplementary material should be sourced. Schools can consult with children on what additional material and processes would enhance their learning.

<p>Strengthen teacher training and onsite support. Lack of consistency between pre- and in-service teacher training and weak linkages between education departments and decision makers at different levels of governance.¹¹ This publication also reported that ‘there is a greater need to change the government teacher’s self-image to... a respected and significant professional in the local community and the wider society’ to address issues of absenteeism and low motivation.</p>	<p>Set up enough teacher training institutes to ensure availability of trained teachers in the areas where they are needed. Build capacities of CRCs and BRCs to extend need-based support to teachers in their areas. The availability of CRCs and Resource Teachers as per commitments of the 11th FYP to be ensured. The focus on academic aspects to be strengthened, instead of using the CRC as a conduit for information flow. In-service training to be need-based rather than Centrally predetermined. Considerably better investment of thought and finances into the processes need to be made than is being done now. Strengthen and empower District Institutes of Educational Training to enable them to play the role of pedagogical renewal in their District. Strengthen their link with CRCs/BRCs as promised in the 11th Plan. Provide a clear career path for teachers including study leave, etc. Implement the new National Curriculum Framework for Teacher Education. Reform National Scheme for Teacher Training as per recommendations of its review. Incentivise rural postings for teachers. As a bare minimum, make available quarters for female teachers in rural areas. Strengthen school inspection and mechanisms for monitoring teacher performance.</p>
<p>Child Participation in the Education Process</p>	<p>Provide spaces for children’s voices. This includes space for children in the School Management Committees, etc. Recommendations of the National Commission for the Protection of Child Rights on setting up of child rights clubs to be considered in the SSA and orders passed in the relevant state societies.</p>
<p>Midday Meal</p>	<p>Warm, nutritious, locally cooked food to be provided, prepared through a process whereby teachers are not forced to compromise on teaching work. Review including feedback of children should be fed into improvements.</p>
<p>School Health Programme</p>	<p>Revive the School Health Programme. Add aspects of body hygiene, menstrual hygiene reproductive health and HIV. Disseminate and replicate existing best practices.</p>
<p>Adaptability</p>	
<p>Language of instruction (instruction in mother tongue, support for second language learners)</p>	<p>All children should be able to learn in the native tongue, especially in early grades. The three-language formula needs to be implemented in accordance with its intent. Allow children speaking languages other than the state language to start education on sound footing. Make teaching learning materials (especially, textbooks) available in multiple languages. English language may need to be introduced in line with building community demand. Skills of teachers to be built to enable them to teach the same.</p>
<p>Recognition of local culture and history in the curriculum</p>	<p>All learning materials must reflect India’s diversity. Local geography and history should be included. Importance to be given to Adivasi and Dalit history. The neglect of the North East in Indian history textbooks to be redressed.</p>
<p>Enabling Conditions for the above</p>	
<p>Data collection, research and evidence based planning</p>	<p>Reliable and robust data should be consistently collected to monitor progress across the nation. Significant data deficiencies have continued (e.g. a reliable measurement of out-of-school children) which can be overcome if government data collection is made more transparent and communities and CSOs are allowed to participate. The data generated to be used as basis for planning. A People Information System on the functioning of the education system needs to be maintained supplemented by regular social audits.</p> <p>Strengthen capacity of the NCPCR and SCPCRs as monitoring bodies for the RTE Act by bringing in professional expertise, empowerment of structures and revitalising their functioning to enable them to play the role. Strengthen inter-departmental synergy with the MHRD being made the nodal ministry for overseeing delivery of school education. Education provisions under the MSJE, Labour, Adivasi Department, etc to be delegated to MHRD.</p>

Engagement of local communities and empowerment of PRIs.	<p>Community involvement in decision-making, implementation and accountability to be reinforced. Existing structures like the Parents Teachers Association (PTA) or the new RTE-based structure of SMCs and Village Education Committee (VEC) should be strengthened. Empowerment and support, both financial and through capacity building, is needed for PRIs. While the number of days of training of SMCs has been increased, the mechanism for groups to receive ongoing onsite support to function effectively needs to be set up. Strengthen ongoing processes of community-based planning through SMCs and PRIs. Convergence with existing PRI and urban local government-based planning processes under the 73rd and 74th Amendment needs to be strengthened.</p> <p>Community efforts to monitor student enrolment and attendance can decrease dropout, increase retention, monitor teacher performance and attendance and improve learning achievement.</p>
--	--

Expansion of Secondary Education with Vocational Alternatives

The Rashtriya Madhyamik Shiksha Abhiyan was launched during the 11th Five Year Plan to address the lacunae in secondary education. However, the implementation of the same has been slow to start. It is hoped that the focus

on secondary education would strengthen in the coming Plan period, without lowering the existing attention on elementary education. Access to secondary education remains extremely inequitable across gender, location, income and social groups. Many of the issues affecting elementary education are likewise applicable to secondary education. Such issues have not been mentioned in the table below if the recommendations for both age groups are the same.

Issue	Recommendation
<p>Combined secondary & upper secondary enrolment is low at 40 per cent (2004-5), but growing rapidly at 5.4 per cent per year. However, only 65 per cent villages have secondary schools within 5 km which is the government norm. There are 1.69 lakh secondary schools of which 63 per cent are under private management. The share of private unaided secondary schools increased from 15 per cent in 1993-94 to 35 per cent in 2006-07. This is at a time when secondary school attendance of SC, ST, Muslims is 80 per cent lower than that of the general category.</p>	<p>Plan for expansion of the government school system to ensure supply commensurate with emerging demand to move towards the goal of universalising secondary education, reinforced by a legal right, and not at the rate of one school per district or even block. Prioritise opening of secondary schools in remote and rural areas which have been grossly underserved till now. In urban areas too, more secondary schools are needed in localities serving the urban poor communities. Currently, 75 per cent of school enrolment is in the 40 per cent of secondary schools that are in the government sector. This highlights the need for systematic investment in strengthening the infrastructure of government schools, especially for poor families who are unable to afford the fees charged by private schools in rural areas where the shortage of secondary schools is undeniably acute.</p> <p>Needless to say, infrastructure of the secondary schools needs to be also upgraded. Shortage of girls' toilets is one obvious issue that needs to be addressed for retention of girls at this level as well. Regulation and rationalisation of the fees levied by private schools to minimise abuse. Expand Open Schooling opportunities for older out-of-school adolescents to enable them to return to schooling and obtain requisite academic skills. Hostel facilities to be expanded with special focus on marginalised groups at the secondary level and above.</p>
<p>Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalayas have proven to be extremely good vehicles of education. However, they do not take girls up to Class 12.</p>	<p>Expanding the KGBVs to provide higher secondary education would be an extremely desirable step towards ensuring retention of girls at post secondary education levels. Formal schooling should be given a thrust and pilots initiated on girl-friendly schools.</p>
<p>The shortage of teachers, especially if universalisation is to be ensured, needs to be met.</p>	<p>More trained teachers eligible for secondary education and specifically for science and maths to be recruited.</p> <p>This would require considerable expansion of teacher training institutions and enhancing of the capacity of existing ones. The process of accreditation from National Council of Technical Education to be simplified and monitoring of institutes to be enhanced. Mechanisms for in-service training likewise need to be strengthened.</p>

Curriculum	Need for convergence of multiple state boards with the National Curriculum Framework. Textbooks to be revised. Rigidity in terms of courses offered is a constraint for many youth who are compelled to follow limited streams of learning. Provide opportunities for preservation of traditional, experience based knowledge.
Incentives and scholarships	Timely release of scholarships to be ensured
Counselling and sexual and reproductive health education	Appoint counsellors in schools to provide counselling to students and parents, ideally from elementary school. This is especially important in adolescence. Career guidance efforts should be initiated through curriculum from Class 7 onwards. Access to sexual and reproductive health education: A child above the age of 12 should have the right to confidential access to information on sexual and reproductive health including HIV. Such services and policies should ensure education and empowerment of girls. The existing Adolescence Education Programme (Life Skills Education) should begin from Class 8 and not Class 9 considering the dropout rate at the secondary stage.
School governance	Strengthen role of PTAs and local self-government in monitoring the functioning of schools. Involvement of the community in planning, monitoring and auditing to be strengthened and the processes enhanced overall. Data Management System to be strengthened.
Inclusion	Children with disability form the group that is most excluded from secondary education and special priority needs to be given to them. Children in institutional and alternate care must be provided vocational and professional training at the secondary stage.
The EFYP envisaged expansion of vocational education coverage to 20,000 schools with an intake capacity of 25 lakh by 2011-12.	The lack of social recognition, inflexible curricula and duration, the lack of need-based courses and trained teachers, poor vertical mobility and linkage with industry and the absence of a national accreditation system have to be addressed for vocational education to succeed. Vocational education needs to be congruent with the local context. A focus on reviving Adivasi skills could also be part of this.

Early Childhood Education

The foundations of child development are laid during the early childhood years. The absence of effective early childhood education programs, other than the yet-to-be-universalised ICDS, is manifest in the poor quality of the workforce. Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE) that could wonderfully prepare children for school is not

a priority in the education process in India. As a result, when children, particularly from the socio-economically marginalised communities, transit from Anganwadis to formal schools, they face pressure and become overwhelmed, culminating in most of them dropping out between Classes 5-7. Furthermore, the lack of quality care facilities pushes large numbers of older girls out of school. The following are the recommendations in this regard.

Issues	Recommendations
Legal right	Move towards inclusion of Early Childhood Care and Education as a right to citizens. This would entail planning to set up appropriate systems for the same. Clear preschool policy needed including planning for human resources and training and regulation of the private sector.
Children under 3/crèches for all	Universal models of quality day care, especially in urban areas, are urgently needed for improvement in survival, growth and development of children, the release of the girl child for education and safety and protection of young children, particularly girls, from sex abuse, drug peddling and alcohol related violence. Systems for early identification and stimulation for children with disability to be introduced. Universalisation of crèches at MGNREGS worksite and convergence with ICDS is needed. The scope and reach of the Rajiv Gandhi Crèche Scheme to be enhanced. Universalise maternity entitlements to enable 'care'.

Pre-school component of ICDS	Universalise ICDS with quality as per standing government commitment. Every study for decades has pointed at the preschool component as the weakest of services under ICDS. Identified gaps need addressing. Implement previous commitments of the EFYP including appointment of the second worker in Anganwadi centres, strengthen the training process and enhance the availability of teaching learning materials.
Preschool section in schools	One year of preschool education for children entering elementary education in accordance with the pre-existing commitments under the EFYP.
Human resources	The network of teacher training institutes needs to be expanded to ensure availability of adequate number of equipped and certified teachers to teach children of this age group.

Tertiary, Adult and Continuous Education

Issues	Recommendations
Tertiary Education	
Scholarships for higher education for Dalits, Adivasis, Children Living with HIV/Aids	Scholarship schemes provided for adolescents under ST/SC/OBC category should be extended to children affected by HIV/AIDS. Adolescents affected by HIV to be granted waiver of tuition fee for higher and technical education at government institutes. Support for competitive exams for students from the marginalised sections of society. Provision of laptops to scholars from marginalised groups in higher education.
The lack of technical colleges, institutes outside metros. Few teacher training colleges in rural areas. Limited intake of marginalised groups.	Prioritise setting up of higher education institutions in rural areas, especially those headed by people from marginalised groups (eg Dalits). Prioritise intake from SCs/STs in private colleges. Enforcement to be strengthened. Rationalise and strengthen regulation of private providers to ensure compliance with government norms and standards of quality. Link existing students with job placement portals or alumni associations and replicate success stories such as CAP (Children and Police in Hyderabad). Develop the capacities of distance learning schools and colleges. Gender studies as separate discipline to be included at graduate and PG levels.
Youth Volunteerism	Nehru Yuvak Kendras and NSS have been the largest government initiatives to mobilise youth volunteerism. These need to be revitalised to mobilise youth in support of school education; being fresh graduates, the youth have an immediate interest in the system.
Adult and Continuous Education	
Lack of vocational and life skill (communication, negotiation and social integration skills) training among adult and youth migrants.	According to the 60th round of the National Sample Survey, only 3 per cent of rural youth and 6 per cent of urban youth have undergone vocational training. Availability of vocational educational opportunities, the difference in status associated with the same and the uncreative content in vocational educational programmes keep the youth out. There needs to be a complete rethink of the model to ensure greater attractiveness of courses offered, quality of training imparted and clearer links between the training and vocational opportunities. Modular vocational training giving space to upgrade skills on the job on an ongoing basis should be provided. There is a special need for vocational training and accreditation for migrant workers that has to be prioritised.

Institutions of Excellence which are Truly World Class

It is unclear as to which institutions other than the ones above (i.e. institutions ranging from schools to adult education institutes, going by the original sub-challenges) the Planning Commission refers to. All institutions that the State runs or otherwise supports need to be world class if India is to hope to compete at the international stage.

Facilitating Private Investment, including PPP in Education

Ensuring delivery of the Right to Education for all children from birth to the age of 18 (taking the age range of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) that India is signatory to) is unequivocally the responsibility of the State. It is, furthermore, its responsibility to find the resources to do so. However, if additional resources may be leveraged from the corporate sector, this

could be done provided it forms part of the overall (and strengthened and rationalised) planning process. The group firmly believes that entry into PPPs with for-profit entities would not deliver an equitable quality education for all the nation's citizens, especially those from the marginalised sections of society and who constitute the majority of the nation's population. Having said so, an exception to the rule may be made for vocational education, where there is reason to expect that vocational training would be enhanced through a clear linkage with the eventual employers. Entering into partnership with such agencies will formalise this relationship. Firm and rational regulation of such a partnership will, however, be necessary to ensure mutual accountability.

12. Mining

R Sreedhar, Convenor, mines, minerals and PEOPLE

Mining is one of the most environmentally and socially destructive economic activities. It has a low contribution to the GDP but the conflict it engenders is enormous and widespread. Our country today has the dubious distinction of having illegal mines significantly outnumbering legal mines. A new Mines and Minerals Development and Regulation Act is on the anvil and calls for far-reaching reforms in the mining sector. The 12th Five Year Plan should usher in an era of mineral development with sustainable development as the focus rather than the current attitude of exploiting minerals. The key emphases in the Plan has to be on the following.

- 1) Rationalising and regularising of the ongoing mining activities on a war footing. The unacceptable situation of illegal mining must be put to an end. Irrational exploitation of differing grades of ores for short-term gains has to be restrained. Illegal mining of minor minerals, particularly from riverbeds across the country, has been destroying the river systems and needs urgent attention.
- 2) Increasing investment in exploration, especially through non-invasive technologies and augmenting the reserves both on land and within our exclusive economic zone in the oceans. Exploration investment in the country is abysmally low, does not constitute even 2 per cent of the global exploration investment, and needs to be raised significantly. There are very little resources going into developing new exploration methods. While our Extended Economic Zone spans a 200 km-region from the coast, current investment is restricted only to the search for oil and gas.
- 3) Enhancing the efficiency of mining activities and generating more resources from “brownfield” expansion rather than opening up new “greenfield” areas. Small pocket deposits in forested regions are being opened up, creating patchiness and larger impact on the forest corridors, while efficiency improvements and the expansion of existing deposits are being neglected. This has to be given high priority.
- 4) Enabling and emphasising local value addition and restricting export of minerals. Though every state government talks about value addition, in the name of lack of technology or that mining is a stand-alone industry, important minerals are being exported with very little benefit to the state or the communities. Value addition must be the norm rather than the exception.
- 5) Developing a widespread understanding of the strategic value of different minerals and ensuring conservation of requisite quantities of such minerals. The strategic value of various minerals must be recognised and specific efforts must be made to conserve minerals essential for the country’s future. Minerals such as bauxite, titanium and several heavy metals that will be crucial for the future development of materials need to be assessed for our long-term needs rather than for profits to corporates in the current period.
- 6) Ensuring strict compliance of all environmental, social and labour laws governing mining activities, as these are constantly violated in several mining contexts. The laws should be made convergent with proper oversight by authorities. The blight of occupational diseases such as asbestosis and silicosis must be eliminated.
- 7) Enabling evolution of economic opportunities not dependent on mining. The long-term consequences of climate change and strategic future mineral availability should form the key consideration in the development of minerals. It is important to recognise that mineral-bearing areas do not suffer from the classic situation of “resource curse” which is seen across the globe. To

do this, effort must be made to identify economic opportunities that are not dependent on mining.

We must recognise that the minerals will be ours forever if we restrain mining, but the wealth of the soil and other biota will be lost forever if we mine the minerals below them. Economic valuations like that done by the net present value method do not reflect the true long-term value of the ecosystem services that the terrain and the plant and animal resources provide. The 12th Five Year Plan must incorporate these important elements in the design of the approach paper and these should also be reflected in the programme of action. The mines, minerals and PEOPLE alliance would like to assist in this process.

13. Budget

Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability

1. Inputs on Children

The 12th Plan must adopt a holistic approach to child rights, keeping in mind the heterogeneity of children regarding their age, gender, ability, religious and ethnic status. The 12th Plan must take adequate initiatives to fulfil India's commitments to its children as laid out in the Constitution of India, the UNCRC, the National Policy for Children 1974, the National Plan of Action for Children, 2005 and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

- Overall Plan allocation for child-specific schemes must be stepped up. Within various sub-sectors (education, health, development and protection) specific to children, allocation of funds should be in proportion to child population under that domain. Allocation for child protection and ICDS should be enhanced without cutting down allocations made for other sectors.
- In each sector, a specific percentage should be set aside for monitoring and governance and also for CSOs for effective implementation of schemes.
- For improving the quality of service, increased allocations are warranted, especially under education and health. Within education and health, special preference should be given to the BIMARU (Bihar, Madhya Pradesh, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Rajasthan, Uttar Pradesh and Orissa) states.
- Malnutrition of women and children should be addressed as a special issue and separate allocations made.
- Children with disability, street children, vulnerable children should be grouped together and should get separate allocations under each scheme.
- Separate allocations should be put in place to provide mobile cards to the children of migrant families so that they can be used by parents to avail the benefits wherever they go.
- Special allocation of funds should be made for creating a strong database on all aspects of child development and for fostering research on child-specific issues.
- In the North Eastern Region, the North Eastern Council (NEC) and Ministry for Development of the North Eastern Region (DONER) have been formed for balanced growth of the region and they should start allocating funds for child development in this region.
- Special allocation of funds is necessary for detecting and addressing early childhood disorders to prevent potential disability and the permanent liability of continual medical care.
- There should be allocation of funds to create a special cell in PRIs to periodically monitor and evaluate child-related schemes/programmes. Allocations for the necessary infrastructure, including human resources, should also be made.
- Allocations should be made for universal maternity entitlement with six months of minimum wages for all female workers.
- Special allocation should be made for fostering sports and extracurricular activity for ensuring overall personality development of children. Vocational training, disaster management training, life skills education should form part of children's education.

2. Inputs on Education

- There is a need to step up government spending on education. A long-overdue promise of spending 6 per cent of the GDP on education is yet to be fulfilled. At present, the country is spending about 3.23 percent of the GDP on education, which is way below the benchmark fixed more than 40 years ago.
- The Central government's move to fund increases in the budget support to education with education cess is a matter of concern. Further, in the light of the fiscal crunch faced by most of the states, it is necessary that the Central government increases its share in financing education.
- The Right to Education (RTE) Act has been passed and it is proposed to be operationalised through the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA). The scheme outlays need to be stepped up significantly for this to be possible. In this regard, estimating the funds that would be needed to provide free schooling to all using Kendriya Vidyalaya as a norm for quality reveals that Rs.12.83 lakh crores (at current prices) would be needed to implement the RTE, spread over the 12th Five Year Plan (2011-12 to 2015-16). This would amount to Rs.2.56 lakh crores for the Union Budget 2011-12, which is approximately 3.71 percent of the GDP. This would imply that the government spending at the elementary education level should be 3.71 percent of GDP; it is currently around 1.4 percent of GDP (2006). Consequently, the government proposal of spending just Rs.1.82 lakh crores spread over the five years works out to an inadequate Rs.0.36 lakh crores a year.
- Specifically with regard to SSA, the components relating to ensuring the quality of education, i.e. outlays towards teacher training, BRC/CRC and maintenance, require attention. Further, the existing unit costs (salary to para-teachers, training costs, building costs) need to be revised to make them more realistic and to ensure effective scheme implementation.
- To ensure that the disadvantaged sections of the population are able to access quality education at all levels, earmarked spending on education of SCs and STs should reach at least Rs 1500 per SC/ST child from the present Rs 1073 per

SC/ST child in the Union Budget 2011-12. Similarly, earmarked spending on education of the girl child should reach at least Rs 1500 per girl child from the present Rs 1297 per girl child in the Union Budget 2011-12.

- The allocations under Rashtriya Madhyamik Shiksha Abhiyan (RMSA) as the primary vehicle to ensure increased public spending at the secondary level must be stepped up by increasing the unit costs for specific components, such as maintenance, school annual grant and in-service training of teachers. Provision for sanctioning of teachers posts at the secondary level must also be included.
- Constraints with regard to implementation of government schemes in education such as SSA, MDM, RMSA, etc. needs to be addressed to ensure that funds allocated are effectively spent and utilised.
- The last Education Commission was constituted more than 40 years ago. It is time that the Central government sets up another commission with clear terms of reference.
- The increasing trend towards encouraging private sector participation through different modes (PPP, vouchers) needs to be checked as evidence from developed countries clearly shows that in the interest of a strong and vibrant citizenship, financing education is primarily the government's responsibility and cannot be left to market forces.

3. Inputs on Food Security and Public Distribution

- Food and nutrition security to all the citizens of the country must be seen as an entitlement, which calls for provision of sufficient Plan resources to ensure such entitlements.
- Existing Plan programmes and schemes aimed at ensuring food and nutrition security of the country at present needs to be transferred to the non-Plan heads of expenditure. There is a need for broadening its base as well as geographical coverage. For instance, the PDS should be expanded to foodgrains such as millets, pulses and cooking oils.
- To ensure better nutrition, Plan programmes/schemes for the targeted sections of the community during the 12th Plan may be introduced.

- There is an urgent need to universalise the PDS in the country with unconditional additional Plan support to the states.
- Appropriate changes need to be made with regard to the unit of beneficiaries from family to individuals. In other words, the unit of distribution of foodgrains should target the individual rather than the family and distribute at least 7 kg of cereals per month to each adult member of the family while ensuring minimum quality of foodgrains.
- Special provisions should be made in the PDS for disaster- and drought-prone areas of the country.

4. Governance and Institutions

- Special monitoring mechanisms need to be institutionalised within the ambit of the Planning Commission's monitoring framework to ensure transparency in the operation of all Plan programmes and schemes relating to food and nutrition security.
- Transparency and accountability in the PDS needs to be taken into account while financial resources are being allocated. Related to this is the need to establish and strengthen anti-corruption units as an integral part of the Plan programmes to check diversion of food articles meant for public distribution and any corruption therein.
- Social audit should be incorporated and made mandatory within the programme guidelines for PDS.
- Budgetary allocation for building rural infrastructure, especially for strengthening rural connectivity, godowns, market infrastructure and cold storages, are critical for an effective delivery mechanism.
- Related to this is the issue of facilitating and empowering local governance institutions, particularly grassroots Panchayats, for procuring and distributing essential commodities to reduce economic costs.

5. Inputs on Health

- With regard to ensuring priority for health in the overall spending of the government, public investment on health needs to be at least to the tune of 3 percent of GDP. The states should also

increase their investment on health and take it up as a priority.

- There is a pressing concern with regard to increasing investment on 'human resources for health'.
- Training of frontline health service providers at regular intervals should be taken up on a priority basis. Remuneration for frontline staff should be revised regularly in keeping with the increasing cost of living as well as to ensure that the amount is realistic.
- In an attempt to reduce maternal and infant mortality, the implementation of Janani Suraksha Yojana (JSY) and Indira Gandhi Matritva Sahyog Yojana (IGMSY) must be made more effective. Careful monitoring of both JSY and IGMSY would also ensure effective implementation.
- Another related concern is improving the Civil Registration System and District Health Profiles.
- With regard to primary health, facilities must be upgraded and strengthened to provide quality health facilities for all.
- Regulation of private sector in provisioning of health services is critical. This is also important to curtail out of pocket expenses in the health sector. Equity, quality and regulation should be emphasised.
- A shift in the paradigm to viewing health as a basic right of every person needs to be made and a necessary corollary to this is the enactment of an effective and sound legislation on the Right to Health.
- Regular supply of essential medicines through the public health system is another critical factor in ensuring that health services are available to all. All essential drugs need to be brought under price control.
- The Department of Ayurveda, Yoga and Naturopathy, Unani, Siddha and Homoeopathy Systems (AYUSH), presently neglected by the government in terms of budget allocations, must be mainstreamed.
- Greater attention on tuberculosis and malaria in terms of the intra-budgetary priority of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare is recommended.

- Greater focus on child health in general, and on promotion, protection and support to the Infant and Young Child Feeding (IYCF) programme in particular, is suggested given the poor outcomes with regard to child health in the country.

6. Inputs on Water and Sanitation

- Water quality and sustainability of supply should be given prime focus.
- An integrated approach should be used to deal with the issue of trained human resources in the sector.
- Convergence of water and sanitation with departments such as Health and Education should be done.
- Regular and focused training should be provided to Public Health and Engineering staff and PRI members engaged in water and sanitation.
- Serious efforts are needed to encourage and make available alternative dignified employment opportunities for the manual scavengers. The Integrated Low Cost Sanitation Programme should be given greater priority.
- Effective and sufficient monitoring is required for water and sanitation programmes.
- The National Urban Sanitation Policy needs to be operationalised.
- Treatment of wastewater, rainwater harvesting and solid waste management should be given increased priority.
- Behavioural change and communication should be emphasised to bring about greater usage of water and sanitation facilities.
- A gendered perspective should be adopted while framing schemes for water and sanitation.

7. Inputs on Women

7.1 Engendering the Planning Process

It is imperative that the process of conceptualising and implementing schemes is engendered. Proper monitoring mechanisms should be put in place to track the implementation of programmes/schemes. This should be adopted across all sectors – the so-called traditionally women-related as well as mainstream sectors. Furthermore, the exercise of social audits must be institutionalised

across the board. Special attention must be paid towards ensuring women's participation in all these processes.

Separate guidelines should be formulated for women from the most marginalised sections and other vulnerable groups at the time of preparation of the Project Implementation Plans (PIPs) by states.

7.2 Women's Participation in the Economy

(a) Moving Beyond the SHG Model of Economic Empowerment

The predominant approach of the government towards addressing women's rights still seems to be driven by SHGs despite the fact that several women's groups have brought out the limitations of such an approach. Therefore, alternative models of economic empowerment need to be considered. To initiate this process, a thorough review of the SHG model needs to be conducted.

(b) Enabling Structures for Working Women

It is crucial that enabling structures such as crèches or day care centres are provided for working women. Presently, the Rajiv Gandhi National Crèche Scheme for Children of Working Mothers is operational. However, data pertaining to the number of crèches and the quality of services being given is not available. Therefore, a review of the scheme should be undertaken. Moreover, no user fee should be charged for these services.

The draft Bill on Protection of Women from Sexual Harassment at the Workplace, 2010 is in place. However, some women's groups have raised important concerns regarding the draft, particularly the exclusion of domestic workers from its ambit. The Planning Commission should take steps to ensure that these concerns are addressed and the revised draft submitted to the Parliament for consideration and approval.

Taking a cue from women's organisations, strong efforts have to be made to ensure a safe and secure environment for women. This will entail specific safeguards for women especially those with late hours of work.

7.3 Addressing multiple layers of marginalisation

(a) Scheme for Women with Disability

A special scheme for women with disability should be devised to address their specific vulnerabilities.

(b) Evaluation of Schemes Aimed at Providing Support Services to Women in Distress

Schemes such as Swadhar and Short Stay Homes among others have been in existence for a long time; however, no comprehensive evaluation has been done. A detailed assessment is urgently required so that corrective measures can be taken. In addition, this evaluation should also look at the feasibility of devising an integrated programme to address the varied concerns of women in distress.

14. Review of the Central Social Welfare Board

Kalyani Menon-Sen

The Central Social Welfare Board (CSWB) was set up in 1953 as an autonomous body under the Ministry of Women and Child Development (MoWCD), GoI. It is now registered as a non-profit company under Section 25 of the Companies Act. The CSWB had a budget allocation of Rs 16,275 lakhs for 2010-11 and funds NGOs for implementation of eight key schemes for women and children (short-stay homes, family counselling centres, condensed courses of education, awareness programmes on women's rights, working women's hostels, vocational training programmes and crèches for children of working mothers).

Apart from the structural deficits and inadequacies in the schemes themselves, a CAG audit in 2002 highlighted several serious irregularities and shortcomings in the functioning of the CSWB. The exposure in 2009 of corruption and financial irregularities committed by the CSWB in sanctioning funds to NGOs under the Rajiv Gandhi Crèche Scheme of the MoWCD suggests that the CAG's observations have not been acted upon.

Despite recent claims of restructuring and revamping, the functioning of the CSWB continues to be non-transparent and unprofessional. Pre-funding appraisal does not include any assessment of the substantive capacities of applicants and monitoring is primarily through desk reviews. A pilot project for hands-on field monitoring was initiated in Maharashtra and Andhra Pradesh but the results have not been made public. There are several instances of continued funding to non-performing recipients, while genuine NGOs have complained of being sidelined. There are no mechanisms for addressing complaints and grievances of NGOs who have been denied funds.

Independent impact assessments of schemes implemented by the CSWB have not been carried out.

Annual reports contain only statements of financial allocations and a few anecdotal "case-studies" of so-called successful projects. There are serious concerns about the skewed regional distribution of schemes; for instance, not a single short-stay home has been sanctioned in Himachal Pradesh, Goa, Lakshadweep, Meghalaya and Mizoram in 2009-10. The numbers of short-stay homes sanctioned in Delhi (2), Gujarat (2), Punjab (4), Haryana (6) and Rajasthan (8) are completely inadequate in view of the size of the population and the steep increase in reported cases of violence against women in these states.

The governance structure of the board is undemocratic and non-representative. The 56-member General Body is dominated by officials and heads of State Social Welfare Boards. There are only eight seats for representatives of civil society and three seats for elected representatives.

In an environment of increasing economic and social marginalisation and exclusion of women, there is a need for a radical restructuring of the overall mechanism of funding to women's programmes. It is unacceptable that scarce resources are routed through undemocratic, inefficient and unreliable institutions.

An independent professional review of the functioning of the CSWB (including its financial procedures and governance mechanisms), as well as an independent impact evaluations of schemes implemented by the CSWB, should be undertaken without delay. This is the first step towards a radical restructuring.

15. Voluntary Sector and Government: Partners in Development

Voluntary Action Network India

The Voluntary Action Network India, being an apex body of voluntary organisations in the country, would like to suggest ways for better partnership in development between the voluntary sector and the Government.

a) **Planning Target and MDG Targets to achieve**

The 12th Five Year Plans should prepare and define its targets, which we think should be similar to or matching the targets set in the Millennium Development Goals by the United Nations. Voluntary organisations could engage with the Government by carrying out research-based analysis and policy advocacy on the National Schemes and Targets under the 12th Five Year Plan and the Millennium Development Goals. Voluntary organisations could also engage in mid-term appraisals of the targets and oversee the process of implementation.

b) **Awareness Building on Planning Targets**

Voluntary organisations in partnership with the Government in the 12th Five Year Plan could run awareness campaigns among the general masses and the target groups, informing them of the various schemes and targets of the government under the Plan. The national schemes on health, education, etc. introduced during the Plan period would also be brought under the awareness campaign so that there is maximum participation of people under the schemes and the schemes become successful.

c) **Implementation Partnership**

Voluntary organisations look towards building the relationship of partnership with the government and not being mere implementers or an extended hand of line departments. This relationship could be further

strengthened by engaging voluntary organisations in the skill areas and development plans.

d) **Support of Innovation**

Under the 12th Five Year Plan Framework, the Government should support various innovations on various issues developed by Voluntary organisations at the micro-level in both rural and urban areas and later upscale them to the macro-level with these organisations' help.

e) **Developing a Shared Platform**

Under the 12th Five Year Plan partnership, there could be the development of a shared platform where, besides the voluntary sector and the government, the corporate sector could also be used as a third partner. These days, the corporate sector through its corporate social responsibility programmes is also trying to contribute to the upliftment of the poor and marginalised communities in the field of health, education, etc. Thus, their role is also important in nation building. Every partner – the voluntary sector, the government and the corporate sector – would be able to contribute their expertise to the achievements of the targets specified by the 12th Five Year Plan. Thus, we feel that our engagement should be considered that of an equal partner in the processes or stages of development.

Conclusion

It is very evident that the Planning Commission wants to work with voluntary organisations and ensure that their voices are represented in the process, particularly in the context of the marginalised sections of society.

16. Governance, Institutions and the Planning Process

National Social Watch Coalition

Democracy and development require the deepening of the process of popular participation on the one hand and effectiveness of institutions of governance on the other. While the first brings in the sense of belongingness and participation on the part of the citizenry, the second instils a sense of responsibility and urgency about the achievement of the overall development objectives. It is important to both widen and deepen the two processes so that they cover the whole of society and no section and region remains untouched by the processes of democracy and development. Institutions play a pivotal role in actualising the objective and their effectiveness is extremely important.

The biggest challenge for democracies is to see the entire journey of public policy from formulation to implementation through. The failure of democracies to deliver in such cases often leads to the theory of “democratic deficits” (often seen at the level of demand-side and supply-side deficits), where democracy is seen as a process which fails to carry governance forward. This is, however, just one end of the entire development-democracy continuum. One has to go beyond this point of analysis and suggest a deeper analysis of institutions. This is necessary because institutions are the tools /agencies by which the democracies carry their governance agenda forward.

In this light, Social Watch organised a National Consultation on Governance, Institutions and the Planning Process. The following issues emerged from the consultation.

- Greater empowerment of institutions of local governance at the grassroots, as grassroots institutions and local people have a better understanding of local issues and context; so they can manage local development better and make development inclusive.
- The establishment of District Planning Committees has to be done constitutionally with membership representation as outlined in the constitution. It has been noted that almost all DPCs have ministers as their chairpersons. This severely vitiates the participative grassroots nature of the planning process. Planning Commission should push towards energising the DPCs.
- In order to improve outcomes in areas like education and health, it is necessary—but not sufficient—to improve the state’s access to funds. Instead of union funds being allotted by the Planning Commission as transfers, the share of the states in vertical devolution should be increased. This will both improve the availability of funds at the state level and also permit flexibility that is completely lacking today.
- State Finance Commissions are not yet fully established and operational at the state level. Since this Act came into force on April 24, 1993, all the states which were in existence at that time should have had by now reports by three finance commissions with the fourth one in the process of finalising its report. However, the states have not strictly complied with this mandatory provision. In fact, the first finance commission was set up within the mandated period only by ten states, as a result of which the cycle originally envisaged has been substantially disturbed. It would be pertinent to ensure the full operation of state finance commissions to make the implementation of the plan more effective.
- The input data available for the State Finance Commissions is not available in systemic form. Data at local government levels is either non-existent or very poor in quality. It makes the task of the SFCs more complex as they have to first generate data and then analyse it to make suitable recommendations. This could be unrealistic for financially and functionally constrained SFCs.

- There is a need to institutionalize citizens' monitoring mechanisms in the implementation of the plan in the form of various schemes which would supplement and feed in the monitoring process of the Planning Commission itself.

17. Need for Peace and Equity Audit as a Parameter for Development Planning

Mazher Hussain, COVA

The objective of planning should be to secure development and progress for all. But it is seen that development initiatives in India are leading to exclusion of large sections, increase in income disparities, intensification of social tensions and onset of conflicts between different communities/groups and even between the people and the State.

Though liberalization seems to have accelerated the annual growth of GDP of India to an average of 9 per cent, it has contributed to the prosperity of only some sections, while the condition of the majority of the populace seems to be worsening, as is evident from the downward slide in the performance of India on Human Development Index (HDI) from 128 and 127 in 2000 and 2005 respectively to 134th position in 2009. While a handful are reaping benefits and entering the billionaires' club, millions are being displaced from their lands, livelihoods and habitations and forced into deprivation and disempowerment—an unusual phenomenon of continuing poverty and marginalization in the midst of galloping plenty.

Before the onset of liberalization, the State functioned as a custodian of all natural and national resources like land, water, minerals, forests, infrastructure etc that were held in trust as national assets. But the ill-regulated and unbridled privatization of all these resources by the State (as if it is the “owner” and not just a custodian of these resources) is resulting in humongous appropriations of these national assets by a few individuals and communities at unprecedented scales and at unimaginably low prices. As most such transactions as well as access to opportunities in the fields of employment, entrepreneurship and access to credit are based on political discretion guided by community considerations and affiliations, only those sections and groups that have access to the power of the State are cornering all the benefits, while excluding most others, who are already marginalized. This is

leading to further enhancement of inequitable distribution of resources and increase in discrimination in all spheres on the basis of religion, caste, gender, community, region etc. resulting in accentuation of social fault lines — and in many cases — creation of new tensions between different groups and communities and also between the people and the state.

Conflicts: A Product of Inequity and Marginalisation

The deprivation, marginalization and exploitation of the millions of poor seems to be turning them against the system, as they find themselves more and more excluded from the benevolent and protective character of the State. This disenchantment and exclusion of the masses is getting translated into a variety of social and political conflicts that are manifested as agitations, riots, resistance, militancy and even terrorism. The major forms of conflict that seem to be increasing/emerging as a result of the present trajectories of uneven and discriminatory socio-economic development are the social conflicts (covering communal, caste, regional, ethnic conflicts etc), conflicts over resources (leading to displacements, migration, resistance, inter-state and inter-regional disputes) and political conflicts (around issues of governance, accountability, inclusion policies, peoples aspirations etc). Most regions of the country seem to be affected by one or other form of these conflicts and their spread and intensity seems to be on the rise.

If left unaddressed, all these conflicts have the potential of bringing down the legitimacy of the state, leading to violence between groups and causing irreversible damage to social integrity and the national polity. Hence, it is imperative that any planning process of the State should also focus on deliberations on how development in different spheres is contributing to generation/enhancement of conflicts

and explore the possibility of using the Five Year Plans for mitigation of conflicts rather than provide conditions for their accentuation as seems to be the case now.

Peace and Equity Audit

Every development plan, policy or programme can affect different stakeholders in different ways and some of them negatively also. Further, by providing unequal benefits to some and/or affecting the exclusion of some other sections, the process of development could lead to the generation/enhancement of conflicts. Once such conflicts set in, it is difficult to reverse or contain them and over time, they extract heavy economic, social and political costs apart from creating an atmosphere of constant insecurity.

Hence every development plan, policy or programme should be reviewed through a “Peace and Equity Audit” to evaluate if it is equitable to all sections and will not lead to any conflict. If the result from the audit is in the negative, then it should be modified suitably to ensure that development is always a vehicle for promoting equity, social justice and peace in society rather than contributing to inequality, marginalisation and generation of conflict.

Parameters and procedures for Peace and Equity Audit should be formulated and employed by all agencies and bodies – government or private – that are engaged in development work of any kind. Appropriate mechanisms should be established to discourage and disallow all such development initiatives that do not clear the Peace and Equity Audit.

Presently, there seems to be a tendency to measure development mainly by focusing on the growth of the GDP. But we have seen that accelerated growth of GDP could also lead to increasing disparities and actually take the country down on the Human Development Index (HDI). Hence, an appropriate procedure for assessment of development could be a combination of both the growth of GDP and HDI. Only such development initiatives that could score positively on both the HDI and the GDP should be endorsed and encouraged.

12th Five Year Plan through the Paradigm of Peace and Equity

Though the country has progressed substantially in the past 63 years — thanks in large measures to the Five Year Plans format that was adopted — development that has been achieved is not without its share of inequity and conflicts. Standing at the threshold of preparing the Approach Paper for the 12th Five Year Plan, the Planning Commission of India should seriously analyse the generation/enhancement of conflicts as a result of the development processes initiated through the Five Year Plans and evolve parameters and procedures to factor in the possibility of mitigation and redress of the ongoing conflicts through the 12th Five Year Plan that is being formulated.

It is heartening to note that the Planning Commission of India is seeking suggestions for addressing the challenges related to decentralization, empowerment and information to be included in the Approach Paper to the 12th Five Year Plan. The Approach Paper would focus on how these challenges impact various sections of society in the development context. This could transform the planning process from being a predominantly economic exercise to also include the concerns and perspectives of the people and thereby ensure increased equitability in development and reduction in conflicts — provided appropriate parameters and procedures for a Peace and Equity Audit are evolved and adopted for the formulation and finalization of the 12th Five Year Plan for India.

Summary Reports

Summary Reports

Section Contents

1. Dalits	179
2. Adolescents	187
3. Muslims	191
4. Elderly	195
5. Migrants	199
6. Advasis	205
7. Youth	210
8. North-east	212
9. Children	217
10. Conflict	224

1. Dalits

Introduction

The National Dalit Consultation was jointly organised on the 8 December 2010 in New Delhi by the four major national Dalit platforms – National Campaign on Dalit Human Rights (NCDHR), National Confederation of Dalit Organisations (NACDOR), National Dalit Forum (NDF) and National Federation of Dalit Women (NFDW). This was part of a process to make the approach paper to the 12th Five Year Plan inclusive of the perspectives of the vulnerable and marginalised groups, who have been long excluded. This consultation was one of the 13 consultations with civil society organisations (CSO) platforms working with women, youth, children, people with disability (PWD), lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer and intersex (LGBTQI) people, people belonging to conflict-ridden areas, displaced people, Dalits and adivasis, the urban poor and other marginalised groups across the country. The consultation had participation of Dalit activists and CSOs from different states of the country, namely Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh, Himachal Pradesh, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh, Chhattisgarh, Bihar, Orissa, Rajasthan and Jharkhand (participant list annexed).

The consultation aimed at providing critical inputs to the Planning Commission of India on the core themes identified as sectors where Dalits have been systematically excluded all these years. It is very important to influence the approach paper at the time of its preparation because the framework of planning is decided in this approach paper and later approved by the Cabinet and the National Development Council. Following the approval from the centre, schemes and allocations are prepared based on the approach paper. The Planning Commission of India has for the first time opened up the process of setting directives for the 12th Five Year Plan through a series of consultations with CSOs who have whole-heartedly welcomed the initiative.

This report will present the proceedings of the National Dalit Consultation, wherein important measures were suggested and recommendations emerged for ensuring the 12th Five Year Plan reflects the concerns of the Dalits.

Dalit CSO leaders welcomed the opportunity as a crucial one to articulate to the government the clear demands that they had on behalf of Dalit groups and communities. The practice followed in the planning process until the 11th Five Year Plan has been of including civil society members in working groups. This is the first time they are being consulted for the preparation of the approach paper. Planning so far has always been dominated by an upper-caste mindset. The Planning Commission has had minimal representation from the Dalit community. It has been economics-centric and has hardly incorporated other disciplines within its fold. Though there were some attempts to include civil society in planning in the 1960s and 1980s, the planning process has not only failed to address Dalit issues, but has also failed to be people-centred in general. It was recommended that the Planning Commission needs to consult directly with Dalits beyond CSO participation in the future. Though not articulated separately in the papers, it can be presumed that the measures and directives proposed for planning should be equally applicable to Dalits from different religious backgrounds.

The Context

The process of preparation of the 12th Five Year Plan has started and this time, the Planning Commission has opened up the process for broader consultations with CSOs. The Dalit organisations were invited to facilitate the voice of the people, especially the marginalised, to ensure their concerns were reflected in the approach paper. The process was set

in motion with a meeting on 1 October 2010, chaired by Member Dr Syeda Hameed and attended by Members Arun Maira, Mihir Shah and Abhijit Sen and Principal Adviser Pronab Sen. Wada Na Todo Abhiyan (WNTA) took the lead to facilitate a diverse spectrum of CSOs to amplify the voices of the excluded so that their concerns could find a place in the 12th Five Year Plan approach paper. A meeting of CSOs was organised on the 26 October 2010 in New Delhi to engage with the Planning Commission. Dr Sayeda Hameed, Member, Planning Commission, who anchors the civil society work of the Commission and Mr Arun Maira, Member, Planning Commission, who is in charge of the 12th Plan process, participated in this meeting, in which over 60 networks/organisations from various constituencies and thematic areas were present.

It was in this meeting that the decision was taken to organise national consultations with representatives of the various thematic sectors and platforms of the various marginalised communities and groups. Following mutual deliberations, the organising group decided to have the national consultation on 8 December 2010 in the Indian Social Institute, Delhi. Around 120 participants comprising activists and academics representing most of the states from all the regions were a part of this important event to voice their views and concerns for Dalits in the challenges identified and put forward by the Planning Commission.

The challenges identified are listed below.

1. Enhancing the capacity for growth
2. Enhancing skills and faster generation of employment
3. Managing the environment
4. Markets for efficiency and inclusion
5. Decentralisation, empowerment and information
6. Technology and innovation
7. Securing an energy future for India
8. Accelerated development of transport infrastructure
9. Rural transformation and sustained growth for agriculture
10. Managing urbanisation
11. Improved access to quality education
12. Better preventive and curative healthcare

The Purpose of Consultation

All these years, the planning process has always been dominated by economics, and the participation of sociologists and political scientists were limited to an academic exercise. As a result, the Plans that emerged from this kind of planning were focused only on the economic growth of the country. In this rush for economic growth, India has left its primary responsibility of social change, social transformation and social justice somewhere in the dark. Loud political promises made were restricted to political manifestos only and never found their way into the planning process. By the time people's concerns and issues reach the planning process, most political promises are converted into complex technical and economic issues. In the past 60 years, civil society has felt a huge hiatus on two counts, viz. the way in which the planning process has evolved, and what it has actually been able to deliver to the people and the level of participation and inclusion of people's voices. In the 1960s and 1980s, there were a few organised initiatives from some CSOs, which tried to give inputs to the planning process. However, they somehow could not be sustained.

Immediate learning should be drawn from the people's plan in Kerala, which was a remarkable achievement for it was able to give to the state planning board a people's plan formulated at the gram panchayat level. This inspired CSOs to think about turning the planning process upside down, giving it a bottom-up approach. CSOs must target making the 13th Five Year Plan – if not the 12th Five Year Plan – the People's Plan. This process of giving inputs should be transformed into a campaign to achieve this target of the 13th Five Year Plan. With this motive, WNTA raised the concern that at least the monitoring of the implementation of plans should be done externally, if the Planning Commission continues to do the planning and evaluation. Hence, the people's mid-term appraisal of the 11th Five Year Plan was done by WNTA. Initially the Planning Commission was very tentative and anxious about how the process would unfold, but once they started looking at the process, they were open to engage with it. There were 10 state-level consultations and five regional consultations attended by the members of the Planning Commission, and thereafter they realised the need to take inputs from civil society into the planning process.

It is very important to influence the approach paper at the time of its making, because it articulates the fundamental pillars of planning. Once the approach paper is approved by the government, the schemes and budgets follow. This is a yearlong process in which all ministries engage, and this is then vetted by the National Development Council. The Planning Commission identified 12 challenges for the 12th Five Year Plan, which it thought the most crucial challenges for the country. CSOs need to design their approach paper around these 12 challenges and submit their recommendations to the Planning Commission. All this is part of a much broader process towards making social justice the universal goal. It is also very important to think of what would follow this approach paper. There needs to be enough space for CSOs' critique of the final approach paper; if need be, a shadow approach paper would also be prepared. There has to be an alternative for the approach paper, and what kinds of schemes are required with corresponding budgetary allocations needed for implementing the schemes. The CSOs have to make the Planning Commission heed its concerns for Dalits in an organised manner.

Approaches In The Earlier Five Year Plans: An Overview

It is well understood that the planning process in India has always been dominated by the economic and dominant-caste perspectives. There was never a representation from Dalit sections in the Planning Commission until the VP Singh regime. The dire need now is to include the Dalit perspective into the planning process of the Planning Commission. The various approaches substantiate how there have been caste biases in the planning process until now. Civil society also hardly took up Dalit concerns in the planning process with the same intensity as it did on other rights. Therefore, it is important for Dalit organisations to shoulder this responsibility and move ahead. In 2001, the Centre for Alternative Dalit Media created the National Confederation of Dalit Organisations, which in the context of the 10th Five Year Plan had analysed the schemes and the set of budgetary allocations. A consultation was also organised on the 10th Five Year Plan's approach paper, and the report was submitted to the Planning Commission. Hence, CSO engagement with the Planning Commission dates back a decade.

The shift in the government and the Planning Commission's approach can be seen to span five phases. The first phase began in March 1950, when the government adopted a resolution and declared the constitution of the Planning Commission. In forming the Planning Commission, India's founding fathers intended to provide for social, economic and political justice for all; adequate means of livelihood to citizens, both men and women; people's welfare; people's ownership and control over the country's material resources; and equitable distribution of the material wealth for subserving the common good. This has not happened in the past 60 years.

In the 1st Five Year Plan, Dalits were given Rs 5 crores out of Rs 490 crores. No Five Year Plan until now has been people-centric, leave alone focussed on Dalits. People-centredness have been projected as one of the objectives in the 12th Five Year Plan. At Independence, 60 per cent of the population was below the poverty line and yet until the 4th Five Year Plan (including three Annual Plans between) people were not the prime beneficiaries. By the time of the 5th Five Year Plan (and the end of the 1st phase), banks were being nationalised. Indira Gandhi had written to the government saying the benefits of the FYPs did not "trickle down" to the Dalits and Adivasis.

In the 5th Five Year Plan (second phase), the Government of India thought of introducing the Tribal Sub Plan (TSP), in proportion to the adivasi population in India, who were the most backward and marginalised. The Special Component Plan (SCP), initially called the Scheduled Caste Sub Component Plan, also was born on account of a similar recommendation of the government in the 6th Five Year Plan. These were introduced to address the large-scale backwardness of the Adivasis and Dalits. However, no mechanisms were created by the bureaucracy to implement the SCP and TSP. There were no plans as to which ministry would take the responsibility to plan the utilisation of funds allocated for Dalits and Adivasis. No plans for these communities were visualised and placed before the Planning Commission in the Five Year Plans. This continued until the 11th Five Year Plan, for there are no schemes created under the SCP and TSP still and the system is devoid of any mechanism to check the utilisation of budgetary allocations. Even the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment (MoSJ&E) lacks any such monitoring mechanism.

The third phase began with the 8th Five Year Plan, where the Indian government actively began promoting a market-based economy and the neoliberal economy shaped up. The

government had shifted its focus from being a welfare state (until the 7th Five Year Plan) to being a neoliberal state, and everything was left over to the market forces. So much so that, in the 10th Five Year Plan the government declared that it must reduce recruitment in Class 3 and Class 4 categories at the rate of 3 per cent every year. Thus, in the 8th Five Year Plan, the government emphasised on investment in the private sector and privatisation of national industries and the initiation of public-private-partnerships.

In the 12th Five Year Plan also, the Government has chosen (twelve) themes which have never been inclusive of the people, the Dalits. Therefore, the 12th Five Year Plan should be made people-centric. The Government speaks of the rationalisation of programmes along with other concerns in the 12th Five Year Plan, which could also mean a reduction or even closure of certain programmes for Dalits and Adivasis. Though women, children and Scheduled Castes and Tribes have been featured as one subject, what the Planning Commission would like to address specifically in this category is not known. Components of human resources are listed out in the 12th Five Year Plan but nothing about developing the country's human resources is clearly spelt out.

In all the FYPs, the SCs, Adivasis and Backward Castes put together have been allotted less than 2 per cent of the total government's budget. Therefore, a Plan central to the development of SCs, STs, minorities and human development and other marginalised people has to be demanded. It has been proposed to the Planning Commission that they should dialogue with the Dalits directly even beyond civil society facilitation and also fund these consultations and help reduce civil society's dependence on donor organisations.

The Process Of Formation Of Groups

After a comprehensive review of the earlier Five Year Plans, six groups were formed to devote their discussions on the 12 key challenges. The twelve challenges were paired up for discussion by these six groups. Accordingly, each group with about 15 participants had two challenges to be discussed. Discussion notes were circulated to each group, which facilitated the further brainstorming on the challenges allotted to each group for reflection.

Group 1 – Growth + Employment

Group 2 – Skills and Employment + Urbanization

Group 3 – Environment + Energy

Group 4 – Decentralization and Empowerment + Transport infrastructure

Group 5 – Technology & Innovation + Rural transformation and Agriculture

Group 6 – Education + Health

Challenges And Suggestions For The 12th Five Year Plan Approach Paper

For programmes with entitlements for Dalits such as enhancing skills, employment generation, health and education provisioning, the focus on dignity with anti-discriminatory measures and equal opportunity components emerged as a dominant unanimous concern in all group presentations. It was stressed that social justice will continue to be a delusion without a rights-based approach. Some key recommendations and additions on each paper (annexed to this report) were discussed in the concluding plenary. In the Plenary Session, presentations on each paper were opened up to the larger group for suggestions and recommendations followed by closing remarks by Planning Commission members. The conclusive elements that emerged from the sub-group discussions on each of the challenges and suggestions for the approach paper were as follows.

- To incorporate a comprehensive inclusive agenda in planning, it must be ensured that every ministry in the government works equally towards the benefits of SC/STs and Muslims and not the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment alone. This isolation has had a dubious impact on the empowerment of Dalits and worked against ensuring inclusion of excluded groups.
- In the overall approach to planning, there needs to be a stress on rights and entitlements and inclusion of excluded groups in several growth sectors. For example, in the infrastructure sector, the approach should be employment-linked infrastructure growth where the contribution of Dalits to these sectors is recognised and due benefits distributed among them.
- Emphasis was recommended on specific measures for inclusion within the policies in the market that ensure

redistribution of productive resources to Dalits, through land reforms, implementation of Agricultural Ceiling Acts, special allocation of outlets, shops and establishments for Dalits and collective farming models, along with policies of affirmative action in different spheres of activity in the market.

- For approaches on energy security and the environment, the focus recommended was on small-scale investment, participatory approaches encouraging people's ownership of these projects, emphasis on protection, and conservation by people and on small-scale investments with Dalit communities and groups on renewable energy as a means to achieving energy security.
- Decentralisation means envisaging roles for Panchayats beyond that of implementers. To achieve empowerment and decentralisation, the approaches need to look at the 3 Fs: devolving Functions, Functionaries and Funds. This should be in tandem with reclaiming the agenda of social justice in the functioning of Panchayats. Gram Sabhas need to adopt section-wise/community-wise and hamlet-wise approaches (including women sabhas) in meetings and processes for inclusive governance. Special focus needs to be given to information availability and dissemination and empowerment of women Dalit Sarpanches.
- Stress was laid on evolving audit mechanisms, accountability procedures, regulation and evaluations systems which are participatory for allocations and funds in plans.
- Special Component Plans must be planned and implemented by Dalit communities and groups themselves. A common thread running through all the challenges was the importance of SCP and TSP to meet the needs of SC/ST communities for which approaches need to concentrate on improved implementation, fund allocation and utilisation, monitoring, accountability and evaluation mechanisms.
- In the case of provisioning of healthcare and education services, special focus on inclusive, anti-discriminatory, free and quality services for Dalits was recommended. The 12th Plan thus needs to look at issues of equity, revised norms in entitlements, and inclusion and participation of Dalits in decision-making committees. Besides this, adopting an approach of 'additional support' over and above the

normal earmarking of scholarships and schemes was also recommended through the SCP.

- A suggestion was made to provision some extra funds under the SCP to the panchayats as is done for the MP Local Area Development Fund to make them economically and politically empowered to perform their functions effectively. The suggestion emanated from the case whereby 3-4 panchayats in Tamil Nadu were not allowed to initiate the election process by other people, due to which there were no elections. Extra funds at the panchayats' disposal would give them some power. The demand for providing extra funds to panchayats was accepted as doable once all panchayats in the country became operational. The present state of affairs is Panchayati Raj Institutions have not developed at all in many states. The implementation of PRI varies from state to state. Thus, this demand could be pushed forward whenever PRIs are fully functional.
- It was suggested that in all plans made for Dalits, specific programmes for Dalit women should also be introduced for they are the most vulnerable, and doubly discriminated for their gender and for being Dalits. The suggestion was well received by the Member, Planning Commission.
- With regard to the diversion of SCP fund for the Commonwealth Games, and similar diversions taking place in other states, it was suggested that checks and balances should be imposed on authorities to track such diversions.
- It was suggested that the government should reopen cases of a serious nature and get the guilty convicted, even if the complainants have the case compounded under coercion.
- It was suggested to have subject- and section-wise planning with the members of the SC community, considering their priorities and participation in implementation of plans, with adequate effective means of monitoring mechanisms. The feudal mindset and systems, which are still pervasive, need to be removed by getting SCs into planning.

Feedback From The Planning Commission Members

The critical difference to be brought about and that which has clearly emerged from the suggestions is that the CSOs and the communities should have control over the implementation of the provisions of the plan, with full access to resources and entitlements. In the absence of entitlements created by the government as suggested by the Planning Commission, especially the ones linked to fund allocation, social justice will continue to be a mirage. In this approach paper, the thrust should be on giving the 12th Five Year Plan a rights-based approach for creating entitlements for those who have been excluded and continue to be excluded in the economic sector. In most of the sectors identified as challenges by the Planning Commission, there is very little being done on the aspect of inclusion. A cursory look at the policy paper on skills brought out by the ministry also reflects the sheer absence of innovation. For the entire infrastructure created for the Commonwealth Games, at least 2 lakh labourers were brought into Delhi from other states and adjoining areas for even tasks like welding. Is it not possible to link such jobs in infrastructure created with aspects of employment in growing sectors of the budget?

Today, this stands as one major challenge for the Dalit organisations. Dalit organisations want to associate with the Planning Commission in not just the making of the 12th Five Year Plan's approach paper but also want to partake in the entire planning process, influence the plan document and monitor its implementation.

Mr Arun Maira, Member, Planning Commission of India

The Planning Commission had various ways of planning this approach paper to the 12th Five Year Plan, but it chose to make this approach inclusive and participatory of the CSOs, and specifically the Dalit organisations, to ensure the inclusion of the Dalit perspective. As it has been suggested and agreed even by the Planning Commission, the planning process should take off from the village level itself; however, it is not feasible or efficient. That is why a mechanism was required by which civil society could share the facts and needs of the people with the Planning Commission. It was thus proposed to the representatives of the Dalit organisations to converge on a common platform and share

all their concerns collectively in the form of one document, with possible solutions to the challenges identified, with the Planning Commission.

It is not just about making plans but also about their implementation. In addition, the people for whom it is being made should be its monitors. The intention is to benefit the people who have been historically subjugated and vulnerable. The Dalits should monitor the implementation of plans from their perspective. The rights-based approach epitomises the right to govern and change this country for the better from one's perspective, and that would be the greatest success of planning. Still, not all this will happen over one Plan and one approach. The consultative process has just begun and efforts are being made this time for coming out with this kind of plan. Consultations are being held with different groups on thematic areas like women and children, people with disability, etc. and all put together will lay the plan, which will cater to all sections of society and especially the most vulnerable and marginalised groups, the Dalits. The process has begun in the direction of making people partners of implementation and not just partners in planning.

Dr Narendra Jadhav, Member, Planning Commission of India

Maximum participation from the people has been ensured to integrate all concerns and suggestions from the Dalit perspective into the 12th Five Year Plan. These consultations have been invited for preparing the Approach paper to the 12th Five Year Plan and three months from now, a proper document on the 12th Five Year Plan Schemes, starting from 1 April 2011 to 31 March 2017, would be worked on. This time the Planning Commission has ensured to have the Plan document released along with the initiation of the Plan, which is not usually done. The CSOs would be invited to assist in preparing the Plan document also and, through different media, efforts would be made to integrate suggestions and thoughts from CSOs in the Plan document as well.

After 35 years, the implementation of SCP and TSP also is found to be unconstitutional. Diversion of these funds has been done by many states. During the mid-term appraisal of the 11th Five Year Plan, groups were constituted in the Planning Commission and for the first time, Dalit organisations of the country were invited to talk on Dalit issues before the commission. There are guidelines for departments that are supposed to earmark funds in certain proportion to the population of SCs and STs, and

these departments have always been instructed to make allocations under separate sub-heads for SCP (789) and TSP (796) minor heads.

In these 35 years, only one ministry out of the 68 ministries has created its own sub-head for SCP, i.e. the MoSJ&E. Because of this diversion of money becomes easy, and became simple during the Commonwealth Games. With respect to the states, notional expenditures are made and the rest is diverted to other works. Moreover, many states have utilised 16 per cent SCP funds for cloud ceiling.

The Prime Minister has formed a Task Force on Implementation of SCP and TSP. Regional consultations have been held with regard to changing the guidelines. The central part of the consultation report has already been submitted to the government, while the state portion is soon to be submitted and also presented to the Planning Commission. Strong recommendations and Dalit concerns have been raised in the government by the Commission. The Commission is ensuring 16.2 per cent for SCs and 8.2 per cent for STs out of the total Central Sector Plan for 2010-11, which is Rs 2,80,000 crores. For achieving and ensuring the fulfilment of this demand, the report of changes required in the guidelines has been submitted and accepted by the Planning Commission and it is awaiting the Cabinet's endorsement. The Planning Commission may also suggest penal actions against those contravening just application and implementation of the SCP and STP funds in the 12th Five Year Plan. Even 16.2 per cent and 8.2 per cent allocation would be insufficient, as it would widen the existing social inequality by making it perpetual. If at all this social inequality has to be eliminated, the SCs and STs should get allocations more than the proportion of their population. These thoughts should be pushed ahead and demanded by the Planning Commission and CSOs.

The issue of scholarship to SCs is a sensitive one. These scholarships are given by the department of SJ&E whose budget was Rs 2100-2500 crores until 2009. There was no change in the budget of the department for six years. For the first time after six years, 80 per cent increase from Rs 2500 crores to Rs 4500 crores was granted in the last budget, that too with a consideration from the finance minister that it could be further revised upwards for it was long overdue. SC and ST scholarship rates were not revised from 1998 and 2000 respectively. This has been revised now and the process is on. In fact, the scholarship for Dalit children to pursue education abroad should also be promoted widely.

Questions & Answers

It was stated that the Planning Commission has diluted its own formal decision of not having any divisible and non-divisible component in the allocation of SCP and TSP, by exempting the departments dealing with mega projects and infrastructure projects from earmarking SCP allocation. In Gujarat Rs 30,000 crores have been spent on the Sardar Sarovar project and now the government is going to spend thousands of crores of rupees on another big dam scheme, which is a very dubious one. What role would be expected of the Planning Commission in the absence of any allocation for SCs from these exempted departments?

The query fetched a response from the member of the Planning Commission that, under the SC Special Component Plan, there are schemes which are identified as beneficiary-oriented for 40 per cent of the SCs and STs and that criterion has also been generalised in the revised guidelines. As long as the allocated share for SCs and STs is reaching them, the question of the source (department) of this allocation is insignificant. Earlier, it was made mandatory for each ministry to earmark funds for SC and STs and not all of them followed this. Some ministries are capable of allocating 16 per cent funds to SCs and some are not capable of it, while few are capable of allocating more than 16 per cent. The defence department has also been exempted, though it would be appreciated if they do allocate, but they are released of any constitutional accountability. The ultimate idea is of ensuring a total amount of 16.2 per cent for the total population of SCs. The Planning Commission has made a recommendation to the Central government to create a special fund for SCs and STs in case even the required allocation fails to reach them, and the recommendation is yet to be vetted by the PM. (The recommendation paper may be downloaded from the Planning Commission's website.)

There were questions that in Uttar Pradesh, amidst many problems, one major issue was of non-issuance of caste certificates to students, for which the past 50 years record is asked of them. Consequently, children face obstructions in pursuing higher/university education.

With regard to the query related to caste certificates, the Member, Planning Commission, stated that even though the issue did not fall within the ambit of the Commission, yet it should be taken up at the national level. NACDOR has already taken up the issue of caste certificates posing a hurdle in education of children with the Prime Minister.

The concern of funds not reaching the state under the Central Special Assistance (CSA) due to late submission of proposals by the states was articulated, in conjunction with the misappropriation of the Member of Parliament Local Area Development Fund. The money under MP Local Area Development Fund is never used for the development of the Dalit localities, as has been clearly spelt in the government rules.

The Member of the Planning Commission responded that the commission has no authority to instruct the states to submit their proposals under the CSA to the centre, for the subject falls outside its jurisdiction. However, the social organisations should be vigilant on these matters and raise them in public. In relation to the inappropriate usage of funds, the Planning Commission has been writing periodically to the Chief Ministers of states enquiring about the utilisation of the SCP and TSP funds, and disclosure of the inappropriate utilisation of funds can lead to political embarrassment for the government, and so they feel pressurised. By exerting pressure on the governments in such manner, improvements are likely to take place.

It was pointed out that in the 11th Five Year Plan funds for youth development came in the name of the Nehru Yuva Kendra Sangathan. But experience has revealed that the Nehru Yuva Kendra Sangathan whose work is to bring about personality enhancement in the youth and develop sports activities etc, has culminated into a political organisation. Its allocations and activities have also become political in nature. Its vision and objectives are getting diluted. In the name of Nehru Yuva Kendra Sangathan, all funds are being used for political activities. This needs to be questioned. Secondly, if Nehru Kendra is for males, then there need to be similar centres for girls also, to not allow perpetuation of a patriarchal mindset. These two components are very vital to youth development and should be carefully looked into.

The Member, Planning Commission, responded that the institution of Nehru Yuva Kendra has been narrowly understood for youth (yuva) encapsulates both boys (yuvak) and girls (yuvati). However, de facto it is found that the representation of boys in the institution outdoes female representation, which needs to be increased.

The question of reduction of investment in Post Doctoral Fellowship (PDF) scheme despite an increase in the budget for MoSJE from Rs 2500 crores to Rs 4000 crores was voiced. PDF allocation has been reduced to Rs 4 crores from last year's budget of Rs 7 crores.

The Member, Planning Commission, responded that there must be a much larger scheme for foreign education, which would come forth. As far as the allocation for higher education was concerned, it was informed by him that it is Rs 11,000 crores in the 11th Five Year Plan, which is nine times that of the 10th Five Year Plan.

The question pertaining to non-opening of the codes 789 (for SCP) and 796 (for TSP) in Madhya Pradesh was voiced.

The response received was that many states have not operationalised the respective codes. At the Central level, the Centre is supposed to earmark in proportion to national share of the SCs and ST population, and at the state level, each state is supposed to earmark funds in proportion to the population of SCs and STs in that state. The states do not make provision in the separate account as the centre. They only make a technical provision, which is wrong. They do not make provision in the minor sub-head and because of this diversion becomes possible. This has to be checked. Then, it is clearly laid down that SCP and TSP should not be lapsed and yet it gets lapsed also. Even the provision that the states make, which is less than the proportion of the population of SCs and STs in that state, is not actually spent; part of it is spent and the rest is either diverted or lapsed. All this should be plugged and for this, all social organisations should be very active to keep a watch, and use the tool of RTI to extract information to challenge the government. The central sector outlay alone exclusive of states' fund transfer was Rs. 68,000 crores. It should be checked by CSOs as to how much is allocated and how much is sent to the states, and the quantum reaching the SCs and STs.

Conclusion

This was a most widely participated consultation for it was for the first time in Indian history that CSOs were given an opportunity to participate in the planning process of the approach paper to a Five Year Plan. They represented the concerns and voices of the people in various sectors. It was a big prospect for the Dalit civil society, which has been working for the concerns of the people for many years. It was also the opportunity to tell the government as to what and how much has been achieved through the past Five Year Plans and what was needed of the 12th Five Year Plan to ensure inclusion of Dalit concerns and priorities.

2. Adolescents

National Consultation on Adolescents, 30 November 2010

Preamble

This preamble attempts to present some of civil society's hopes and fears linked to the consultation process called for by the Planning Commission. The Planning Commission of India has decided to engage with CSOs for developing an approach paper for the 12th Five Year Plan. The same has been received by CSOs with a lot of enthusiasm and it is also being seen as an opportunity to ensure the inclusion of voices of the socially excluded groups. At the same time, there are fears and scepticism – fears of being co-opted, scepticism about whether or not the recommendations and voices will actually find their way into the approach paper and thence to the 12th Five Year Plan. Civil society organisations, during this process, also raised concerns about the planning paradigm itself and asked for a paradigm shift. There was difficulty comprehending the 12 challenges presented by the Planning Commission and a session to 'integrate the two languages' was organised on 11 November 2010 to understand these. This meeting provided an opportunity to the CSOs anchoring the constituency-based consultations to look beyond submission of civil society approach papers. Clearly, the vision that civil society is pursuing is one of a 'people's plan'. Also, there is hope, therefore, of a continuing engagement with the Planning Commission up until the 12th Plan is formulated and even beyond that.

The national civil society consultation on the adolescent constituency for the 12th Five Year Plan was held on 30 November 2010, under the aegis of Swaasthya, CHETNA and Smile Foundation. There was a clear-cut diversity represented in the adolescent consultation. The consultation covered diversity – geographically, thematically and in terms of the composition of participants (layering of participants: technical experts as panellists, CSO representatives and adolescents themselves). Geographical diversity was captured

through CSOs coming from different states of India. Twelve states, namely Rajasthan, Jharkhand, Himachal Pradesh, Haryana, Delhi, Bihar, UP, Jammu and Kashmir, Orissa, Gujarat, and West Bengal, were present in person and three other states had sent their inputs on adolescent concerns and expectations. Most of the states who were present had conducted consultations in their respective states and had also selected one adolescent leader to join the national-level consultation. Among participants, there were panellists who have expertise in different thematic areas relating to adolescents. Moreover, two distinguished Planning Commission Members, Mr RK Gupta and Ms Deepika Srivasthava, were also present.

The introductory plenary had set a general background for civil society engagement in the adolescent consultation. The session also provided a technical touch with Dr Geeta Sodhi's review of the 11th Five Year Plan and Mid Term Appraisal Report. In the introductory note, Mr Gupta emphasised that for the first time in the history of the Planning Commission, civil society has been involved in the process of planning. He said that the 12th Plan looks forward to have more inclusiveness in its planning. The commission has identified 12 major challenges for constituency-based consultations to reflect on.

Immediately after Mr Gupta's discussion, Dr Geeta Sodhi made an objective review of the 11th Plan, according to which adolescents were not considered as a separate constituency. There were a few mentions in the plan regarding adolescents, but clubbed with other categories like women, youth and children. In order to be objective and unbiased, Dr Geeta Sodhi preferred not to interpret the broader implications of 11th Plan with respect to adolescents as she felt that her opinion might influence discussions of small groups.

Following the introductory session, due to an enthusiastic response, the second session initiated (from 11.30am-12.00 noon), where a few states shared their experience on state level consultations and findings. CEDPA presented an overview of the state consultation, which was held in Jharkhand with other 20 organisations belonging to the state. The state representation emphasised the need of better opportunities for higher education, health and employment opportunities, along with sensitisation of gender equity. On behalf of Masoom, Ms Pallavi presented the state consultation results of Maharashtra. This representation emphasised the need for better educational opportunities for the adolescents in adivasi areas, and demanded that girls be encouraged to go for higher education by making available basic infrastructure and transportation facilities. The third state consultation representation was from Sahyog, which was presented by Mr Sunil and demanded that the right to education be extended to 18 years and the provision of career counselling and guidance.

After the three states' presentations, participants were divided into three sub-groups with each group assigned four of the challenges identified by the Planning Commission. They were asked to identify concerns and expectations of adolescents. The presentation made by each groups at the plenary was followed by open discussion.

Group Work

Group 1

The group was provided the checklist, and a set of four challenges (1-4). They were also circulated the reviewed report of the 11th Five Year Plan and the Mid Term Appraisal Report. Initially, there was confusion among members in relating with the applicability of challenges to concerns of adolescents. However, subsequently they came up with the following concerns and expectations.

Issues

Rural-urban disparity, lack of equitable growth, nutritional concern, gender inequality, sexual harassment, government and private school disparity in terms of infrastructure and self-esteem, disability, lack of focus in policy and programmes, marginalised groups (HIV+), lack of vocational training, migration and trafficking, lack of market integration, lack of education and information regarding health, inadequate life skills and other schemes,

poor implementation of schemes/programmes, lack of parental support, lack of integration, referral and linkages, lack of convergence with industry.

Expectations

The schemes related with rural youth/adolescents should have equal focus on urban adolescents, programmes for adolescent boys should be designed along with girls' programmes, community-based youth resource centres, resources allocation for youth/adolescents, involvement of media, proper dissemination of newly launched schemes and others, strengthening of government services, inclusion of life skills education in school programmes, vocational training with proper linkages and market and it should be integrated in school programmes, effective community-based monitoring and discussion on global harmony issues.

Group 2

The group was provided the checklist, a draft of the review of the 11th Plan and MTAR and a set of 4 challenges (5-8). The objective of the group work was explained in detail to this group. The groups discussed the following concerns of adolescents and their expectations.

Concerns

Parents are not supportive of girls, girls are not allowed to make decisions, adolescent girls as well as CSO representatives are not aware of the different schemes launched, education system has to be more supportive especially to minority groups (girls), drug abuse is not getting the required attention, more counselling sessions with the parents are needed for them be able to understand the importance of alternate careers and inadequate resources and tokenism in the launching of the Sabla scheme.

Expectations

CSOs engagement, involvement of youth, effective implementation and monitoring of schemes.

Recommendations

Creation of an enabling environment for adolescents, especially girls; education system for minority groups to be supportive by way of using community radio; ICT for development (mobile, broadband) and ensuring access to adolescents; drug abuse prevention (focus should be on drug abuse prevention which is not the case now); as the programmes are aimed at treatment only, the dropouts need to be tracked and the reason for the same should be

known to be able to decide the strategies and motivational sessions for adolescents for them to be able to pursue the careers they wish to; mainstreaming adolescent education in schools and effective implementation and monitoring of the schemes launched. Monitoring is essentially to be done by a third party. There should be no discrimination against homosexuals/transgenders and they should be able to access their rights, especially property rights. Increased access to health care by provision of infrastructure and transport facilities, adolescent friendly counselling at the PHCs and youth-friendly centres at the village level.

Group 3

The group was provided the checklist and a set of four challenges (9-12). The group discussed these concerns of adolescents and their expectations mentioned below.

Concerns

Dropout rate is very high after the 5th standard and it happens more among girls; unavailability of Higher Secondary schools and inaccessibility of High Schools for adolescent girls (due to distance and transportation issue); lack of exposure of adolescents in rural areas and social insecurity. Health education should be provided for HIV-positive people's adolescent children, care home for HIV-positive people's children, lack of sexual education in course curriculum, substance abuse, stigma and discrimination with HIV-positive students in schools.

Overarching issues

Lack of proper implementation of government policies or schemes (gaps at field level, corruption at all levels), scholarships, teachers, high migration of adolescents, mainly engaged in labour work, lack of benefits for migrant adolescents (education, health services, etc.), trafficking of girls is an issue in Orissa, Jharkhand and West Bengal.

Expectations

Improve governance with respect to education and health issues; youth involvement in monitoring committees, eg. social audit of the programmes; 50 per cent reservation for women in local Panchayats; strengthen the ICDS; regularisation of access to services by HIV positive students (without disclosing their status); sex education in school, regularisation of funding for HIV positive care centres, counsellors should be appointed at school level, an interstate migration policy.

Panel Discussion

The panel was chaired by Ms Poonam Mutreja. In response to all the presentations, four distinguished panellists made their comments and discussed a certain pertinent theme relating to adolescents.

1. Ms Aparajita Gigoy insisted on the need for a framework for the implementation of plans and said that there should be a good system to monitor and track the progress of implementation. She also added that there should be a separate section for the adolescents in the Five Year Plan. Another observation was to include the parents in decision making and also educating the parents on the issues related to the adolescents. She suggested that the language should be used properly to ensure better effect, referring to the need for sex education among the adolescents.
2. Mr Joy Elamon commented that the whole issue has to be looked upon with a view on the future as adolescents become adults soon. In addition, it was necessary to have a dream and a vision while formulating policies for the adolescents.
3. Ms Sunayana noted that the vocational training available at present is obsolete and has no market value. It has to be linked directly to the need of the market, as that will ensure employability for adolescents. She also maintained that the programmes should be monitored and audited with involvement of society.
4. Ms Anuja demanded the need for including programmes to check child sexual abuse and incest. She said that 52 per cent of girl children and adolescents in the Indian society are subjected to some kind of sexual abuse by very close relatives in the family.
5. After the panellists' presentations, Dr Vikram Patel's (in absentia) presentation on the mental health of adolescents was presented by Dr Geeta Sodhi. The presentation focused on several aspects of the mental health of adolescents.

Way Forward

Lastly, there was a session on the 'Way Forward' (between 4.15-5.00 pm), where the possible future for the entire advocacy network on adolescents was discussed. At the outset, a consensus was built to take the advocacy forum forward to engage with the Planning Commission and the

Government of India, even after the approach paper. A need was felt by almost all participants to build a pressure group, and it was also mentioned by a few participants that advocacy should be done at the state level. Ms Anuja from Rahi reiterated that there is a need to build capacity to lead some issues pertaining to adolescents. It was also mentioned that (by Ms Sunayana and Dr Geeta Sodhi) there is a need to follow a specific strategy and a framework towards building a broader and greater advocacy forum in future. Ms Veenita from Ford Foundation also announced funds to facilitate one of the future meetings. The session ended with a lot of hope.

3. Muslims

National Consultation for Muslim Civil Society Engagement with the Planning Process For the 12th Five Year Plan

Mr Sardar Anwar, President, Tehereek-e-Pasmanda Muslim Samaj (TPMS), opened the consultation by describing the sorry state of the Muslim community. He underlined the fact that benefits of progress in the country have remained limited only to a small privileged group of the population of about 15 per cent. The Muslim population is mostly not part of this elite. The country might have progressed but the Muslim community appears to have been pushed into the most marginalized sections of the population.

The Sachar Commission has described the plight of Muslims in the country very accurately and has given meaningful suggestions for their progress and incorporation in the mainstream. Sadly, implementation has lacked political will despite lip service by the politicians. Muslims are deprived of jobs, healthcare and education. They form a substantial proportion among rickshaw drivers and in the lines in front of the charity hospitals.

This deprivation has put them in a depressed mindset. Citing comments from the builder community, Mr Anwar contrasted the mindset of Muslims and non-Muslims: when a non-Muslim customer approaches a builder, he first inquires about the facilities and amenities in the plan such as width of roads and then asks for the price; in contrast, when a Muslim visits a builder he only asks for the price and hardly cares for other facilities – he is happy as long as the roads are wide enough for a funeral procession. What a depressive mindset to have fallen into after six decades of independence! Is this progress?

Mr Ashok Bharti, Chairman, National Conference of Dalit Organisations, emphasised the importance of public consultation. He informed the audience that public consultation was never followed by the government since Independence until recently.

Mr Irfan Engineer mentioned that although the government has drawn up a fifteen-point plan for the Muslims and has initiated development schemes, the fund allocation is inadequate. The worst part is that even this fund is not utilised. Civil society groups and community leaders are unhappy because funds do not reach them. The bureaucracy, on the other hand, says that it has funds but cannot find people to entrust the funds with. It is a tragicomic situation. Mr Irfan Engineer also underscored the fact that the bureaucrats put obstacles in the implementation of schemes, distribution of loans, and award of scholarships. He mentioned that application forms of various schemes require attestation by a Gazetted Officer, and asked, “From where will the Muslims get their forms signed by Gazetted Officers?” Due to such obstacles, utilisation of allocated funds is very poor.

Mr Irfan Engineer suggested that (1) the rules be made simpler, (2) since bureaucrats do not show interest or take initiative, they should be given incentives and targets, (3) there is a need for an oversight committee for Muslim minorities, and (4) more schools should be set up in the Muslim-dominant areas.

Mr Amitabh Behar spoke of economists’ dominance in the planning process since Independence and how sociologists were never involved in the process. In the initial years after Independence, Vinoba Bhave and EMS Namboodiripad were asked to prepare parallel plans. Vinoba Bhave had said that he would undertake a long march during which the plan would be ready. Such isolated incidents are the only examples of public consultation and there has been no organised way to involve the public in the planning consultations. Mr Behar praised the example of Kerala, which initiated public consultation in the late 1990s, when people were asked to submit plans through local governing bodies. He mentioned that it inspired

people across the country. He mentioned that a midterm plan appraisal by people was also suggested to the Planning Commission. Mr Behar also said that the planning process involves three steps: (1) the first step is preparation of the approach paper giving the broad plan; (2) then this plan is converted into schemes along with fund requirements by the respective ministries; and (3) finally, it is sent for approval and passage. For the 12th Plan, 15 national level meetings have been planned.

Ms Shabnam Hashmi emphatically said that Muslims must be mainly seen from the political angle. She noted with sadness how “Muslims” get pushed into the class of “minority” and then from “minority” get confined to “minority bastis”. She felt that Muslims are no longer first grade citizens in India and feel oppressed. Ms Shabnam Hashmi also criticised the practice of using funds earmarked for upliftment of the Muslim community for general tasks. She further stated that biased bureaucrats put obstacles in the implementation of schemes designed for Muslims. She strongly felt the need to include Muslims in the planning process. She focused on building more schools and hospitals for the Muslim community. She also suggested that the Planning Commission should pressurise the government for political upliftment of the Muslim community.

Mr Ashok Bharti supported Ms Hashmi’s assertion that Muslims live under deplorable conditions and that bureaucrats fool people. He cited an incident. The sorry state of a Badarpur Khadar village, which is predominantly inhabited by Muslims, became an issue of debate in the Delhi Assembly. Clever bureaucrats showed pictures of another village, called Badarpur, to prove that everything is all right with Badarpur Khadar!

Mr Mazhar Hussain described the awful state of Muslims by describing them as “non-citizens” in India. He said there are three challenges concerning the Muslim community: (1) political transformation from the status of “non-citizens” to “citizens”, (2) their economic development, and (3) how to change their mindset of feeling victimised or oppressed.

Mr Hussain suggested six points for consideration by the Planning Commission.

- (1) The issue of high child labour had to be addressed by promoting education. He felt that the community could also assist by using the RTI Act for finding facts.
- (2) Promote small scale and cottage industry among Muslim women.

- (3) Focus on the lower middle class youth who quit education after Class 10 or 12 due to financial problems and become unemployable.
- (4) Focus on improving the civic amenities in Muslim bastis.
- (5) Give 20 per cent or more reservation in government housing schemes to eliminate ghettoisation of the community.
- (6) Improve their participation/representation in governance at all levels through various measures.

Dr Shoukat Hayat emphasised the need for having a vibrant grassroots democracy ensuring participatory involvement of women and their capacity building. He stressed the need for social justice, access and equality, reducing gender disparity, reaching out to the marginalised groups (widows, divorcees, old age, handicapped, single women, etc) and their social empowerment. He also stressed the need for improving civic amenities and implementing slum improvement plans. Dr Hayat also spoke about democratisation and dissemination of information on welfare schemes. Citing the example of Bangladesh, he suggested promoting technology such as community radio for propagating information on schemes and local issues. For tackling poverty, Dr Hayat suggested promotion of micro-credit schemes to generate self-employment, training in specific trades, enhancing skills for employability, upgrading and certifying the skills of self-skilled people (their skills are not recognised and hence they cannot grow further).

Mr Hilal made an interesting point at the outset. He said it is not security but removal of their “sense of insecurity” that is the major challenge for Muslims. This sense of insecurity coupled with other social and political issues is forcing them into ghettos. They feel frustrated and really do not know when, how and whom to approach for their problems. On top of that, non-issues are politically imposed upon them. He also suggested that after the sense of insecurity, educational backwardness is the second major challenge for the Muslim community. Mr Hilal mentioned that the backwardness is area-based – areas with high density of Muslim population have fewer civic facilities and amenities compared with areas with low Muslim populations. Thus, he emphasised the need for infrastructural development in Muslim-dominant areas (ghettos). Citing statistics, he showed that the literacy rate is far too low in Muslim Concentration Districts (MCDs) compared to non-MCD districts. Population-wise, more than half the total Muslim population lives in four states: WB, UP, Bihar and Assam. These states drag down

the overall literacy rate of the community. Hence, they need more attention. In the opinion of Mr Hilal, the government has little understanding of the Muslim community's issues, requirement, priorities, and their temperament, etc. Therefore, its schemes and the way they are being implemented create further confusion and frustration in the community. He attributed bureaucratic hurdles and rigid rules for the failure of most government schemes. He also blamed different norms for Muslim applications compared with SC/ST for benefits of government schemes for poor utilisation of funds.

Citing the example of scholarships, Mr Hilal pointed out the ridiculous nature of implementation: applicants have to spend Rs 1500 to get a benefit of Rs 500. Besides, there are far fewer scholarships than eligible scholars. He highlighted the distorted perception of bureaucrats about the schemes targeting Muslims. Citing statistics from the Assam MCDs, he pointed out that most (in some cases 100 per cent) of the funds were diverted to the Indira Awas Yojana.

Mr Hilal's expectations from the 12th Plan are as follows.

- (1) Give topmost priority to education
- (2) All scholarship schemes should be at par with SC/ST scholarship norms
- (3) Increase the welfare budget by at least 10 times
- (4) The Ministry of Minority Affairs should concentrate only on minority issues
- (5) Include urban welfare schemes also in the 15 point plan for Muslims
- (6) Ensure Muslim community participation in public-private-partnership projects
- (7) Revise the cut-off population percentage to 15 per cent for MCD classification
- (8) Activate monitoring mechanisms as suggested in the Sachar Report

Specific Suggestions were Received after Group Discussions in the Following Six Groups:

Group Leader	Group Topic
1. Muktar Ahmed Fardeen	Poverty
2. Yusuf Ansari	Education
3. S Umer	Health
4. Irfan Engineer	Security
5. Shaista Amber	Women's empowerment
6. Shameem Baig	Planning and resource allocation

1. Poverty

Mr Muktar Ahmed Fardeen

- Increase the number of BPL cards to at least 12.5 crores.
- Post secular bureaucrats and administrators in MCD and other districts with a high Muslim population.
- Allocate the minority budget in proportion to the population.
- Implement the Sachar Commission recommendations properly.
- Stop spending on propaganda of schemes and utilise the funds for poverty alleviation.
- Revise the definition of poverty line to make it more realistic.

2. Education

Mr Yusuf Ansari

- Bring the Muslim literacy rate up to the national average and aim to have 1 primary school per 3000 population and a teacher-to-student ratio of 1:40.
- Give incentives for girls' education.
- Plan for uniform syllabus throughout the country.
- Madrasas should be run like schools and should be managed by trusts/societies.
- Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan infrastructure should be

utilised efficiently based on local conditions.

- A special task force should be set up to plan the above for the Muslim community.
- Simplify the rules for scholarship applications and introduce a punitive action clause for disciplining erring bureaucrats.
- Increase involvement of NGOs for better implementation. They can play a significant role in monitoring.
- Provide for open information centres and camps at the grassroots level to popularise government schemes.
- To reduce centre-state conflict in the implementation of schemes, make states responsible and accountable.
- Introduce a student tracking system to monitor how students are doing after completion of their studies.
- All scheme expenditures should be regularly updated on the respective websites and should also be published in the national and local newspapers.

3. Health

Dr S Umer

- There is a danger of derecognition of 74000 doctors (trained in Yunani and Ayurvedic medicine) practising for decades due to a 1970 rule of the Indian Medical Council. This needs attention.
- More healthcare centres are needed in Muslim dominated areas and reservations should be provided for Muslims in medical colleges.
- Give incentives to Muslim women so that they can also become Accredited Social Health Activists (ASHA).
- Increase Muslim representation in local bodies overseeing healthcare.

4. Security

Mr Irfan Engineer

- There should be no racial profiling of Muslims by law enforcement agencies.
- Representation in police/security forces as per population.
- Action against all accused involved in riots.

- Harsh acts like the Maharashtra Control of Criminal Activities Act and Armed Forces Special Powers Act should be repealed.
- Strengthen human rights protection, particularly in Jammu and Kashmir.
- Allocate funds for rehabilitation of riot victims.
- Legislation for prevention of communal violence and atrocities against Muslims should be enacted.
- Initiate police reforms.
- Sensitise the police and security forces about minority sentiments.
- Create a minority cell in the police department.
- Give more powers to the Minority Commission.

5. Women's Empowerment

Ms Shaista Amber

- Enhance government accountability towards minorities.
- Make Mahila Kalyan Yojanas more effective.
- Promote small-scale home industries.
- Bring out more housing schemes for minorities.
- Increase representation of Pasmanda women among Anganwadi workers.
- Create minority committees at local levels.

6. Planning and Resource Allocation

Mr Shamim Baig

- Create a national Muslim watch cell.
- Promote a culture of bottom-up planning and include NGOs in the process.
- Reserve 20 per cent plan funds for Muslims.
- Training programmes at all levels to enhance minority participation.
- Set up a chain of information cells with total infrastructural support from the government.
- Revise the BPL card policy and ensure proper distribution.
- Plan for orientation and sensitisation of government personnel towards minority communities.

4. Elderly

Preface

The Planning Commission, Government of India has embarked upon the formulation of the 12th Five Year Plan, and it is commendable that it is engaging civil society in the planning process in general and for the formulation of the approach paper to the 12th Five Year Plan in particular. In this context, meetings were held on 1 October 2010 and 26 October 2010 at Delhi, which were attended by networks/organisations from various constituencies and thematic areas. It was felt that different citizen groups need to be in the consultations and there is a need to organise meetings with senior citizens associations for getting the inputs for the approach paper for the 12th Five Year Plan (2012 to 2017).

Towards this, HelpAge India in association with Tata Institute of Social Sciences (TISS) organised a meeting on 7 December 2010 at TISS, Mumbai. Altogether, 26 representatives from various Senior Citizens Associations attended the meeting. The participants were divided into groups and they discussed at length the various ageing issues especially in the areas of financial security, health care and nutrition, education, welfare, protection of life and property and shelter and family. The in-depth discussion resulted in a set of recommendations for 12th Five Year Plan approach paper. The report presents the proceedings of the meeting for submission to the Planning Commission, New Delhi.

Inaugural Session

The HelpAge India-TISS Consultation Meeting for Recommendations on Senior Citizen Issues for the 12th Five Year Plan revealed several core issues, which were prioritised for the Planning Commission to review. Dr Parasuraman, Director of Tata Institute of Social Sciences (TISS), in his

inaugural address set the context within which the meeting was conducted. He highlighted India's growing economy, the impending population replacement level, the projected increase in the population of the elderly, particularly of women due to higher life expectancy, all accompanied by a strong productive population. Against this background, Dr. Parasuraman suggested looking at policies and frameworks in two ways: 1) an analysis of how and where the elderly are located, 2) review of the state policies in place to meet their needs.

Mr Mathew Cherian, CEO of HelpAge India, detailed the various areas of concern that require attention in the 12th Five Year Plan. He stressed upon the need for the Planning Commission to consult the public for more inclusive growth and drew attention to core issues. Mr Cherian asserted that resource allocation and utilisation requires attention, as from the 11th Five Year Plan's allocation of Rs 400 crores, only Rs 44 crores was allocated towards senior citizens; only Rs 20 crores of this have been spent to date. He also mentioned the lack of implementation of the health insurance schemes for which the IRDA appointed commission gave recommendations, of the Maintenance Law that provides for one old-age home in every district, and of the 11th Five Year Plan's old age pension contribution scheme that reaches only 16 million people. Mr Cherian strongly suggested that a National Commission and State Commissions be set up to facilitate implementation.

The Planning Commission's role at the conference, as stated by Professor Abhijit Sen, was to listen to the voices of the elderly for a more inclusive approach to the 12th Five Year Plan. Prof Sen highlighted that the listening process was a structured effort undertaken with the help of NGOs, which is necessary for inclusivity. Such efforts, he detailed, include an interactive site to collect diverse views as the elderly have problems beyond merely age that need to be

taken into account during the planning process. Prof Sen mentioned that the problems of the elderly will be relatively important in a Plan which thinks about the future of India. By 2020, the transition to a young workforce will falsify the assumption that old age issues will automatically take care of themselves. Instead, planners need to see how well the demographic dividend can be used to place the young – either in productive sectors or social/care-giving sectors – for an acceptable social security level.

Group Discussions

The meeting proceeded as a platform for every participant from different senior citizen organizations and associations working on rural/urban elderly issues and belonging to different socio-economic strata to voice their concerns. Each expressed their views and expectations from the approach paper of the 12th Five Year Plan to be prepared by the Planning Commission. The issues raised in the meeting are summarized as follows.

a) Policies

The following issues need to be considered for inclusion in policies.

1. Terminology and Classifications: The term “senior citizens” should replace “older persons”; age criteria should be made consistent; dementia should be considered a disability; and classification of Below Poverty Line (BPL) definition for senior citizens should be reviewed, as it is unclear.
2. Family Structure: While family structures have broken down, they have not completely disintegrated – physical space may not be shared, but there is a common income pool. Incentives such as income tax deduction should be given to assist the family and to encourage the joint family structure.
3. The Pension Index should be made uniform across the country and be indexed to inflation.
4. Inclusion of the elderly: Schemes like the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme should make special provisions for including the elderly.
5. Corporate Social Responsibility: Reservation of some percent of profits for senior citizens.
6. Micro-finance: National Bank for Agriculture

and Rural Development (NABARD) has only very recently started giving the elderly credit. The Planning Commission can enhance such efforts.

7. A geriatric-sensitive city plan: Cities should accommodate elderly needs such as ramps etc.

b) Implementation

A common consensus emerged that the 11th Five Year Plan had numerous suitable provisions for senior citizens; however, few were being implemented. The following suggestions were made for the Planning Commission to facilitate quick implementation:

1. Unique ID (UID) be given on a priority basis to all senior citizens.
2. Organizations and senior citizens need to collaborate to further the cause of senior citizen issues.
3. Review of the 1999 policy to be accompanied by analysis of implementation issues.
4. Provide Panchayats with the power for speedy implementation of various policies. This is in the context of the lack of state-centre co-ordination for expeditious implementation of plans.
5. Establish an all-India civil society body to voice elderly needs objectively.
6. A review/monitoring body should be set up to assess the implementation progress of schemes.

c) Healthcare

In the light of increasing costs of healthcare and the lack of affordable health insurance schemes and adequate services for senior citizens, several areas were highlighted as requiring immediate attention.

1. Cost-effective health insurance: A fund set up with individual and government contributions can support such a scheme. For example, the Andhra Pradesh scheme or the Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana can be used as models but must include both BPL and APL citizens.
2. Healthcare measures: These must accommodate people moving from villages to towns for healthcare treatment. Health check-up camp, mental healthcare programmes and geriatric facilities in all medical colleges are also necessary. In addition, 75 per cent of healthcare centres need better resources such as staff, medicines etc.

3. Outreach services: Rural areas have different needs from urban areas and must be taken into account when planning. As elderly lack easy mobility, and Primary Health Centres are located at large distances between each other, palliative care should be looked into. Also, health posts, which are geographically closer, can be considered.
4. Institutional care: Institutions with geriatric facilities to be expanded to place staff trained in the field. Also, institutions must provide for those with mental illnesses, as families are looking for such options, being unable to cope themselves.
5. Nutrition programmes: Provision of nutrition supplements is important, given the high number of anaemia cases in Mumbai.

d) Finance

A number of suggestions were made on pensions, financial incentives and interest rates:

1. Income tax exemptions: Should be provided to encourage home support to the elderly.
2. Pension: Eligibility requires analysis, as some elderly may have children who have crossed 60 years of age, but are not eligible for pension. Distribution is also an issue as it is difficult to claim pension from the bank especially in rural areas, due to conditions such as stroke, arthritis, etc. LIC pensions have been blocked by the government, while central government employees get medical schemes.
3. Bureaucracy: Many government departments tend to call the elderly to fill out various forms several times, which is difficult if one does not have family to help. In addition, elderly schemes require documentation to avail them and often names do not appear on the list of the elderly in villages, and many are misrepresented.
4. Interest rates: Senior citizens should get an additional interest rate of at least 2 per cent.

e) Transport

Inter-state concessions: Concessions should accommodate inter-state movement. Similarly, seats reserved for senior citizens should be uniform across states.

f) Old Age Homes/Daycare Centres

These were considered a priority area by many in the meeting. The needs of such centres were diverse.

1. Implementation/Regulation: Policy provisions accommodate the construction of old age homes but it requires implementation. In addition, there is no licensing authority available to count the number of old age homes or to monitor their quality. So a registration policy is required to control the living conditions of these homes.
2. Daycare centre: These need to be established for community, entertainment and refuge. In slums, many of the elderly have alcoholic children who take their money away from them. The daycare centres can alleviate their struggle by offering a place of refuge. In addition, such centres can be used not only for recreation but also for utilisation of the knowledge and experience of senior citizens and to encourage them to participate in the larger community.

g) Feminisation of ageing

Due to the increasing longevity of women, the sex ratio of senior citizens tends to be tilted towards the women and this requires extra attention, as their needs are different from men.

1. Women senior citizens: Their issues require study, as their problems are different from men senior citizens and cannot be accommodated under a single model. In addition, their health status is especially low and thus deserves special attention.
2. Elderly widows: The population of this group is projected to rise and requires attention. There is no record of elderly widows, especially if they shift states, and this becomes a problem with regard to pension allocation.

h) Education/Awareness

The current database on ageing is insufficient. As education is a tool of awareness of such issues, the following measures need to be put into place.

1. School curriculum: Senior citizen issues must be incorporated in school curricula for more awareness

2. Multi-disciplinary focus of courses required: Tata Institute of Social Science's diploma in gerontology, which is an evening course, is a focused one-year programme that looks at ageing from an inter-disciplinary perspective. Such an approach is vital to the study of ageing and should be replicated widely.
3. Existing literature and gaps: Research on ageing is at a very peripheral stage, with hardly any interdisciplinary focus. In addition, we lack national level data on senior citizens, and micro-level data is not sufficient. The 12th Five Year Plan can help build a knowledge base on ageing issues.
4. Research institutes: Provisions made in the 12th Five Year Plan for two research institutes on ageing were not implemented and therefore this remains to be followed up.

i) National/State Institutions

The need for separate institutional machinery to cater particularly to senior citizens was felt to be important unanimously.

1. Separate senior citizens department: The Ministry of Social Justice deals with drug addicts, beggars, destitutes and elderly and so their attention is split amongst these groups, while women and children have their own separate departments. Therefore, a separate department for the elderly should be set up, as their number is substantial and growing.
2. Tribunal: Elder abuse/neglect happens especially in families struggling economically. Awareness has to be increased through, say, a campaign against the prevention of abuse of the elderly. While acts such as the Maintenance and Welfare of Senior Citizens' Act do exist, there is no tribunal in place for redressal in case the act is not being implemented – cases sometimes take one year or more.

Concluding Session

Prof Abhijit Sen concluded the session by offering his observations from the meeting and his suggestions regarding how best to focus senior citizens' needs for review by the Planning Commission. He stated that as an economist and planner, he has to point out that old age cuts across society. In such a scenario, inequalities are much larger amongst the older population than the younger, as those who were deprived in the past are particularly distraught in their old age. Thus, history and mobility become central to determining senior citizens' welfare across society. Prof Sen noted two broad implications of his observation.

- a) **Savings:** While a large amount of money cannot be spent on social security, correct incentives have to be put into place to encourage the young to take care of their parents and to save for old age, rather than the reverse.
- b) **Inequality:** The inequality that exists requires the Commission to aim at certain minimum requirements. He stressed the need to ensure that even the Rs 400 pension (which is too little) should be received by those in need. Prof Sen urged that while there are many things that are expensive, there are actions that require little money. The divide across society should be bridged by emphasising common issues amongst the diverse senior citizen population.

Prof Sen's final suggestion was to look for such minimum requirements for senior citizens across all strata, to be put forth as recommendations to the Planning Commission for consideration.

5. Migrants

Background and Introduction

Internal mobility is critical to the livelihoods of Adivasi groups/socially deprived people and people from resource-poor areas. While some attention has been paid to this feature, in terms of the Inter State Migrant Workman (ISMW) Act 1979, the Minimum Wages Act, 1948 and the Contract Labour Act, 1970, there is a need to revisit the ISMW Act and provide additional safeguards for all migrants. Some data on population (and not worker) mobility in India can be found in the Census and the National Sample Survey. However, these underestimate the flow of seasonal and temporary (labour) migration. Migration in India is predominantly short-distance; only about 20 per cent move across state boundaries. Given the growing trend in seasonal migration, there is a strong need to provide a greater priority to all aspects of migration by policy makers and NGO programmes.

Facts about Migration

Migration and commuting are part of routine livelihood strategies and not simply a response to shocks. People migrate to take advantage of new economic opportunities, acquire new skills and escape the caste system. Many adivasis from Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka and Maharashtra migrate to work in construction, tile factories, brick kilns and crop harvesting. Some migrate individually and others as household units. Family migration is prevalent in sugarcane cutting, construction and brick kilns, as it is more economical for employers. Some 40,000 females from Kerala migrate annually in order to work in the fishery industry. In the domestic work sector, there is a huge increase in

independent female migration. The share of northern states is very large in male migration, whereas the southern states have a comparatively larger share of female migrants.

- During the 2001 Census period, 14.4 million people migrated within the country for work purposes to either cities or areas with higher expected economic gains.
- The 2001 Census has recorded about 53.3 million rural-to-rural migration within the country. According to the National Commission on Rural Labour (NCRL), a large number of migrants are employed in cultivation and plantations, brick-kilns, quarries, construction sites and fish processing.
- The NCRL estimates the number of internal labour migrants in rural areas in India alone at around 10 million (including roughly 4.5 million inter-state migrants and 6 million intra-state migrants).
- A large number of migrants works in the urban informal manufacturing construction, services or transport sectors as casual labourers, head loaders, rickshaw pullers, vendors and hawkers.
- In the case of most intra-state and inter-state unskilled and semi-skilled migrants, migrant labourers run a high risk of exploitation, for they are exposed to uncertainties and lack access to information and knowledge. This makes it very difficult for them to switch jobs in case of dissatisfaction with the current employer. Because of their choice-less situation, these labourers lack bargaining power and thereby fail to negotiate reasonable pay scales and fair working conditions with the contractors.
- Most migrants live in open spaces, makeshift shelters or illegal settlements, which lack the basic infrastructure and access to civic amenities. They

have no local ration cards, which can provide them their food at subsidised rates through the PDS. They are highly prone to occupational health hazards and vulnerable to epidemics including HIV/AIDS.

- Since migrants are mobile, their children have no crèche facilities or access to schooling. They do not come under the purview of either the local government or NGO programmes for they do not belong to that particular region. So, citing the problem of monitoring, most agencies leave them outside the scope of development intervention.
- In India, labour migrants are largely found working in the developed states, which are the traditional migrant-receiving states. Typically, they come from underdeveloped regions of the country and consist primarily of the most marginalised sections of society, namely the Adivasis and the Scheduled Castes (SCs). These migrants are entirely without legal protection or social security. They are “invisible”; they are not acknowledged and are denied access even to basic amenities in most cases. They have no identity in the places where they live and no voice in the places they have left behind.
- Overseas migrants are vulnerable to trafficking and smuggling. Migrants might opt of their own free will to being smuggled and so end up in a trafficked situation. They are prone to suffer abuse at the hands of their smugglers. Even migrant workers who are part of legally sanctioned labour migration schemes may be exploited by their employers. India is a country of origin, transit and destination. In the citation index, India is ranked high as a country of origin and destination and is ranked medium as a country of transit (Trafficking in Persons - Global Patterns, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime). Domestic servitude, bonded labour, and indentured servitude is also widespread alongside cross-border trafficking, internal trafficking of women, children and men for purposes of sexual exploitation.
- In addition to internal migration, external migration is also a significant feature for India. India continued to be the largest recipient of remittances, with the figure rising from \$49.6 billion in 2009 to \$55 billion in 2010. However, many problems remain unaddressed for safe migration at all stages.

Given the above context, the International Organisation for Migration, along with the United Nations Development

Programme and Wada Na Todo Abhiyan, organised a consultation with migrants on 13-14 December 2010, in order to bring their voices into the planning process, as a proposed input for the Planning Commission in developing the 12th Five Year Plan. The consultation focused on the problems of migrants in terms of their source, transit, destination and return/reintegration conditions and policy interventions to promote safe migration. The discussions in the consultation brought out key challenges and recommendations on six thematic areas, and the conclusions of the consultative process are summarised below.

1. Identity/Documentation/Access to Government Schemes and Livelihoods

(Addresses Planning Commission's key challenges of enhancing skills and faster generation of employment, rural transformation and sustained growth of agriculture)

Challenges

- Migrant workers increasingly missed in census and BPL surveys
- Migrants and their families miss out on access to government schemes at source
- Political exclusion of migrant workers – a large number of migrants is not able to vote
- Lack of an ID proof increases vulnerability to police harassment, sexual harassment, especially of women migrants, and trafficking of children
- Lack of access to basic services at destination, such as shelter, sanitation, health services, Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS), education, banking and financial services, and PDS
- Unable to register birth and death at destination due to complicated process and language barriers

Recommendations

- Develop a mechanism for registration of migrant workers at source and destination, at Panchayat/Urban Local Body level, by creating a computerised database for migrant workers, aggregating this information at the block level and above, strictly implementing proposed amendments to ISMWA at local levels, and sensitising local panchayats for registration of all migrant workers

- UID to integrate its project with organisations working with migrant workers across the country, e.g. MoU of UID Authority of India with the National Coalition of Organisations for Security of Migrant Workers (a coalition of non-governmental organisations working on migration issues)
- Linking of UID for migrant workers to services such as education, banking (savings, credit and remittances), health services, and mobile PDS (e.g. Disha, Nashik - <http://dishafoundation.wordpress.com/>)
- Benefits of unorganised sector welfare boards and/or schemes to be made available to migrant workers
- Enable voting for migrant workers – more research could be taken up on the subject
- Make census counting more sensitive to increased mobility of rural populations
- Interstate portability of identity documents such as ration cards or other valid IDs, so that migrant workers can access social benefit schemes in destination states

2. Education – Children/Adults

(Addresses Planning Commission's key challenge of improving access to quality education)

Challenges

- Language is a barrier to access education in the destination site
- Scarcity of trained teachers, inadequate infrastructure, lack of clear-cut policy to deal with children of migrant workers
- Admission in government schools is difficult
- Limited/no access crèche facilities and pre-school education in the destination site
- Lack of awareness among the parents on importance of education
- Lack of vocational and life skills (communication, negotiation and social integration skills) training among adult and youth migrants

Recommendations

- Special programmes, such as bridge and transit schools for children of migrant workers to provide education in their own mother tongue for migrants and provision of TLM by recruiting trained teachers

and developing modalities for teaching children of migrant workers

- NCERT and SCERT to take up a study on appropriate models
- Explore the possibility of setting up residential schools for children of migrant workers at source
- Mass awareness programmes among parents/migrant workers on the importance of education
- Set up a facilitation centre for children's education needs at the destination
- Drive to provide vocational training under the MES for migrants of the Department of Labour, Employment and Training
- Increase awareness on modular employable skills
- Develop appropriate trainings and accreditation for migrant workers
- Increase budget allocation – Wada Na Todo Abhiyan, Nine is Mine

3. Gender and Migration

(Addresses Planning Commission's key challenge of decentralisation, empowerment and information)

Challenges

- Lack of disaggregated data on women migrants
- Increased vulnerability of women migrants:
 - Lack of safety/security and sexual harassment at work site/place of stay
 - Poor access to adolescent and reproductive health
 - Exploitation of women through schemes, e.g. the Sumangali Thittam in Tamil Nadu
 - Exploitation of domestic workers
 - Increased incidence of HIV/STDs
 - Trafficking for sexual and labour exploitation
- Violence against women
- Discrimination of women migrants
 - Payment of wages – no payment, lower wages
 - No compensatory mechanism – occupational safety and health
 - Absence of crèche facilities
 - Cap on age for emigration

- Lack of recognition and protection irregular migrants, especially women
- Increased incidence of forced displacement of women due to climate change, development project-induced migration and natural disasters

Recommendations:

- Disaggregated database on interstate and international migration
- Reduction of vulnerability of women migrants
 - Ensure sanitation facilities
 - Provision of maternity leave and need for crèche and provision of prenatal and postnatal care
- Formation of sexual harassment committee as per the Vishaka Judgment by employer/welfare boards
- Sign and ratify ILO Convention on Domestic Workers and UN Convention on Migrants
 - Increased awareness on HIV/AIDS
 - Elimination of discrimination
 - Implementation of Equal Wages Act
- Action against exploitative programs such as Sumangali Thittam in Tamil Nadu¹
- Increased implementation of CEDAW/GR-26 (<http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/recommendations/recommendations-26.htm>)
- Strengthening the anti-trafficking initiatives and capacity building of service providers
- Irregular women migrant workers should be treated as victims not as offenders

4. Migration and Health

(Addresses Planning Commission's key challenge of better preventive and curative healthcare)

Challenges

- Increased incidence of HIV/AIDS/STDs/RTIs among spouses both at source and destination
- Vulnerability to mental health issues
- Malnutrition among the children of migrant labour
- Access to healthcare facilities for adults and children
 - Low level of awareness among migrant workers regarding existing health services

- Language and cultural barriers
- Affordability
- Service availability, location, hours of operation
- Procedural difficulties

- Migrant health is affected by
 - poor shelter, sanitation, and water supply
 - exposure to occupational hazards
- No provision for periodic medical check-ups, medical benefits, sick leave etc., at employer / contractor level

Recommendations

- Establish adequate crèche/baby care centre/ICDS facilities at work site/place of stay
- Increase awareness of healthcare facilities for migrants regarding health issues and existing schemes by involving NGOs, CSOs, migrant worker unions, etc.
- Increase proximity of healthcare facility/PHCs/ PHUs to migrants
- State Welfare Boards for migrant workers with representative units in the District Panchayat in rural areas and Urban Local Bodies in urban areas that also help workers address healthcare needs
- Facilitate the inclusion of migrant workers in existing social schemes such as RSBY or Janata Bima Yojana; in districts where such schemes do not exist, formulate and implement schemes on the lines of ESI (for migrant workers)
- Evaluation and scale up of pilot programs such as Social Security Benefits for Unorganised Worker in Karnataka (SSBK)
- Inclusion of the issues of migrant health medical curriculum to orient health workers on migrant-specific issues
- Better follow up and monitoring of the Pravasi Bima Yojana to ensure benefits reach the emigrants
- Abolition of mandatory testing for emigrants as it violates their Fundamental Rights

¹ <http://www.hindu.com/2010/05/28/stories/2010052858300600.htm>

5. Protection Mechanisms for Internal and External Migrants

(Addresses Planning Commission's key challenge of markets for efficiency and inclusion and decentralisation, empowerment and information)

Challenges

- Lack of access to banking and financial inclusion, which carries the risk due to carrying large amounts of money
- Vulnerability of children of migrants to child labour, child trafficking and sexual exploitation
- Labour rights violation
 - Termination without notice
 - Non-payment, holding back of wages, etc.
 - Exploitative system of advance payment resulting in bonded labour
 - Irregular working hours
 - Poor working conditions
- Lack of legal support to migrant workers
- Discrimination/conflict between local people and migrant workers in the destination area
- Poor information and awareness of schemes for migrant workers

Recommendations

- Formalise payment of wages to migrant workers through banks to address payment related issues
 - Evaluation and upscaling of pilot programmes for financial inclusion, especially for migrant workers
 - Dialogue with Indian Banks Association to explore appropriate mechanisms for bank account opening, operations and remittances for migrant workers
- Portability of benefits beyond source area of migrant worker
- Activation of child welfare centres, child protection services and child helpline at the district level
- Migrant workers relief fund to cover all sectors of unorganised work, both at the national and the state level
- Wages in tune with WPI (Wholesale Price Index)

- An urban employment guarantee scheme on the lines of MGNREGS for migrant workers
- Allocation under poverty alleviation programmes for migrant workers
- Living and working conditions to be monitored by the government, trade unions, media and NGOs
- Enforcement of labour legislation
- Migrant assistance/information centres for both migrants and their families should be established
 - Creation of a National Labour Helpline on the lines of Child Line
- Effective implementation of the following acts:
 - Minimum Wages Act, 1948
 - Inter State Migrant Workman (Regulation of Employment and Conditions of Service) Act 1979
 - Building and Other Construction Workers (Regulation of Employment) Act 1996
 - Building and Other Construction Workers Welfare Cess Act, 1996
 - Contract Labour (Regulation and Abolition) Act 1970
 - Emigration Act, 1983 and Emigration (Amendment) Rules, 2009
- Benefits of the Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana (RSBY) should be made portable and made available to contract labour
- Establish National Overseas Manpower Corporation to handle recruitment processes in a safe manner
- Establish Labour Attaché at Indian embassies at destination places
- In order to overcome lack of awareness, at least, the demand letter, power of attorney and the terms of contract should be made available in local language
- Mechanism for timely redressal of grievances
- Bilateral and multi-lateral agreements with receiving countries
- Migrant Resource Centres should be established in all states
- Resettlement and re-integration programs for returnees
- Helpline for migrant workers in each state in all Indian languages

6. Internally Displaced Population /Forced Labour

(Addresses Planning Commission's key challenge of rural transformation and sustained growth of agriculture and managing urbanization)

Challenges

- Forced displacement in urban, rural and forest areas due to:
 - loss of traditional means of livelihood for displaced tribes
 - land acquisition for mining and dam projects
 - disasters/calamities
- Invisibility – lack of disaggregated data
- Poor implementation of resettlement and rehabilitation strategies for adivasis/displaced population
- Vulnerability to trafficking due to loss of traditional livelihood options

Recommendations:

- Comprehensive disaggregated data to be collected in the cases of mass displacement
- Tracking resettlement and rehabilitation measures
- Consultations with the local population under conditions suitable for affected population must be undertaken. Although provisions for public hearing exist, they are currently not enforced or implemented. Public hearing must be done in the same place where the project (building of plants, constructions of dams, etc) is to be implemented and with the people who would be affected immediately.
- In the case of forced displacement due to
 - development projects (dams, widening of roads, building of mass transportation, mining), alternative housing and livelihood facilities must be prepared in advance of displacement and the enforcement monitored
 - natural disasters/calamities, the entire community must be resettled in one common place
- Adivasi rights to be considered while implementing forest and animal protection laws

- Adivasis must be given opportunities and preference to be employed in forest departments and must be allowed to collect the natural products from the forest for their livelihood

Conclusion

Participants generally were of the opinion that the problems faced by migrants are multi-faceted, and satisfactory redressal of these issues involves coordination between multiple ministries/departments/agencies. It was strongly urged that the Government should explore the possibility of setting up a National Policy/Commission/Mission for Migrant Workers. This would enable provision of appropriate priority and budgetary allocations for migrant workers.

6. Adivasis

Preamble

The total population of Scheduled Tribes is 84,326,240 as per the 2001 Census, 8.2 per cent of the total population of the country. A majority of the Scheduled Tribe population lives in rural areas and their population is 10.4 per cent of the total rural population of the country. The share of the Scheduled Tribe population in urban areas is a meagre 2.4 per cent. Large populations of Scheduled Tribes live in Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Orissa, Gujarat, Rajasthan, Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh, Andhra Pradesh, West Bengal and Karnataka. These states account for 83.2 per cent of the total Scheduled Tribe population of the country. Another 15.3 per cent of the total Scheduled Tribe population live in Assam, Meghalaya, Nagaland, Jammu & Kashmir, Tripura, Mizoram, Bihar, Manipur, Arunachal Pradesh and Tamil Nadu. There are 105,295 villages and 57 towns in the country where Scheduled Tribes make up more than 50 per cent of the population. Of the total ST population, 52 per cent lives below the poverty line. Estimates show that 25 per cent live in severe poverty. Two-thirds of the bonded labourers (essentially chronically poor with likelihood of intergenerational transmission of poverty) identified in the country are from Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

The De-Notified and Nomadic Tribes make up about 60 million of India's population (however the data is merely a conjecture, as there has been no census of this population). There are 313 Nomadic Tribes and 198 De-notified Tribes. According to the Indian Confederation of Indigenous and Adivasi People, 80 per cent of this population lives below the poverty line. In the context of planning for these populations, the following concerns emerged from the consultation at Tilde, Chhattisgarh.

The term **'development'** needs to be redefined so that people and not profit becomes the core of planning.

Development must be in terms of well-being and justice. Interest of the few cannot be to the detriment of others.

'National Interest' is a good idea but what is national interest? Is it the destruction of the identity of many for some? Is the destruction of natural resources for industrial growth 'national interest'? Are Adivasis anti-national if they wish to protect their land and forests from industrial encroachment? This term needs to be redefined.

'Mainstreaming': Who or what is the mainstream? What about pluralism? Why should the Adivasis give up their identity, culture and livelihoods in order to become 'mainstream'? How is it that a tiny group of people has decided that they are mainstream and all others must follow?

Self-reliance vs Dependency: The Indian state is forcing people to become dependent through its various schemes and programmes. Why should people stand in queues to prove their identity and give up all self-respect? The vision of the state should be that people strive for self-reliance and dignity. The Adivasi people have always had high self-respect but now they are being forced to beg for their mere existence. The police and forest department have overwhelming power over the adivasi people and their dignity and self-respect is constantly under threat; eviction, abuse and exploitation have become their lot in life.

Survival or Death is the choice that Adivasi people face. Their struggle is a struggle for survival in the face of growing violence in their lands and loss of livelihoods linked to land forest and water. Rapid industrialisation, mining and 'development' projects along with wildlife protection projects and sanctuaries are forcing these people off their lands and homes. Failure to implement laws such as the PESA Act and the failure of institutions such as Adivasi Development Authorities are ensuring the end of their lives, traditions and culture.

Conflict Zone: Most Adivasi areas have been turned into conflict zones. Why are the lands and homes of these people the site of violence? This question must be asked. Is it because these lands are rich in minerals and resources essential for 'growth'? Why are Adivasis being denied the right to democratic space? The Indian state must realise that destruction of democratic processes and reduction of this space will only aggravate the situation. Peace initiatives and people who believe in peace should be respected and allowed to work in these areas. The Adivasi population is entitled to the Fundamental Rights enshrined in the Indian Constitution and these cannot be denied through the process of creating conflict zones.

The whole consultation focused on certain issues suggested by the Planning Commission of India (GoI). Some relevant issues have also been incorporated by the Ekta Parishad for broad basing the larger concerns around adivasi development and rights. The participants were divided into seven groups for the discussions.

Group 1

- **Growth opportunities for the adivasi youth**
- **Opportunities for better education**
- **Possibilities for better health**
- **Development of human capacities for the growth of Adivasi society**

Context

The problematic issues are

- Five to eight crore Adivasi youth
- Loss of self belief and self respect
- Poor implementation of plans and programmes
- Poor economic returns from traditional trades
- Loss of resources such as land, forest and water due to industrialisation, mining and other development projects
- Limited market for forest/agro products along with lack of skills required for marketing, high dropout rates after Class 5
- Large numbers are first-generation learners and therefore require additional support/facilities for continuation of education
- Limited local employment/self-employment opportunities along with lack of appropriate support and training

- Malnutrition among children and adults, malaria, tuberculosis, leprosy and diarrhoea, lack of appropriate and adequate health services
- Mismatch between skills and aspirations along with lack of opportunities for learning new skills

Recommendations

- Improvement in the infrastructure and services available for education – more and better quality teachers (do away with single-teacher schools)
- Review the content of education to include adivasi history and culture (restore self respect and belief) as well as provide opportunities for developing vocational skills linked to the usage of locally available resources.
- Formulate a adivasi youth policy as part of a national youth policy
- Develop more opportunities in areas such as forest produce marketing and processing, traditional organic agriculture and traditional health practices and herbal medicines
- Improve and extend health services including recognition of traditional healing practices and practitioners
- Organise events that allow learning about adivasi history and its heroes, traditional practices and arts, etc.
- Provide opportunities for the preservation of traditional and experience based knowledge along with recognition of this knowledge so that the young are motivated in learning it

Group 2

- **Issues in the rights and entitlements to water, forest and land resources**
- **Environmental rights – protection and management**

Context

The problems are listed below.

- Non-compliance of PESA Act (rules not formulated in most states)
- Rapid depletion of resources critical to their livelihood
- Loss of land and forests due to rapid industrialisation and mining
- Poor implementation of Forest Rights Act
- Harassment and evictions by the forest department
- Existence of a forest department without adequate checks and balances

- Diversion of agriculture and forest land for non-agriculture and forest use
- Increasing conflict and creation of conflict zones
- Poor functioning of Adivasi Development Authority
- Poor utilisation of Tribal Sub Plan allocations
- Large scale denial of community rights (village forest)
- Diminishing returns from agriculture
- Inability of farmers to access schemes and programmes aimed at agricultural development (administrative inertia and corruption along with lack of awareness of processes)
- Lack of irrigation facilities and other technology
- Exploitative middlemen

Recommendations

- Time-bound land settlement in adivasi areas by Adivasi Development Authority (involvement of forest and revenue departments should be done away with)
- Ensuring formulation of rules for PESA Act and its implementation – stop allocation of central funds to states that fail to do so
- White paper on the status of implementation of PESA Act (based on reports by the state governors)
- The powers for determination of compensation for acquired lands/forest land (of gram panchayats) should be given to the Gram Panchayats and not the Collector (as practised currently)
- Central Water Commission guidelines for the use of water to be reviewed and enforced (create appropriate mechanism)
- Sharing of 26 per cent profit from mining/industry and determination of the mechanism that allows Gram Sabhas to use the money
- Conversion of Gram Panchayats into Urban Areas in scheduled Adivasi areas – release a paper on the current status and form guidelines for future
- Ensure that the Adivasi Development Authority becomes dynamic and functional
- Diminishing non-timber forest products (NTFP) due to over harvesting, environmental changes and diversion of land
- Low economic returns from traditional sources of employment
- Lack of skills for enhancing (value addition) existing opportunities
- Lack of skills for new employment (say mining and industry)

Recommendations

- Direct subsidies to farmers (similar to those given to industry)
- Support, guidance and credit for traditional farming (organic farming)
- Growth in employment opportunities from agriculture and forest (value addition processes)
- Release white paper on status of land diversion/allocation for Jatropha plantations
- Minimum Support Price for NTFPs (as for certain crops)
- Registration and certification of middlemen (involved in buying and selling of NTFPs)
- Recognition of traditional knowledge and skills (organic agriculture and herbal medicinal plants and practices)
- Skills training in traditional livelihoods (for value addition and marketing)
- Ban on entry of MNCs in retailing and instead opportunities for marketing of adivasi agro and forest products by adivasi federations should be explored
- Release a White Paper on farmer suicides

Group 3

- **Possibilities of agricultural extension and development**
- **Better opportunities of self-employment and skills development/enhancement**
- **Market opportunities and challenges in adivasi areas**

Context

The problems are listed below.

- Diversion of agricultural land for industry and mining
- Traditional agricultural practices
- Small landholdings/subsistence farming
- Large scale migration of people in agriculture

Group 4

- **Development of new techno capacities**
- **Opportunities for energy conservation**

Context

The problems are listed below.

- Mega energy projects impacting adivasi lives and livelihoods
- Adivasi areas still largely without regular and adequate electricity
- Mining for raw materials largely at the cost of adivasi livelihoods; however, the benefit to adivasis is minimal (for example, example electricity, water for irrigation and money from sale of product)
- Energy production is also linked to environmental changes

Recommendations

- Increase support for non-conventional energy sources
- Recognize traditional water harvesting systems and the knowledge and skills associated with them, provide incentives and support for their revival and use
- Recognize the knowledge and skills of nomadic tribes and provide opportunities for enhancing its value
- Provide training/skills that add value to traditional skills/crafts and enable creation of products that sell in the market
- Provide support for use of solar energy as well as expand research that makes the use cost-effective

Group 5

Self-rule in violence affected areas

Context

The problems are listed below.

- People involved in peace building initiatives are also branded as Maoists and Naxals
- Denial of basic human rights of the people living in the area
- Inappropriate use of force by police and armed forces
- Abuse of the public hearing process and use of force for obtaining no objection certificates
- Suspension of administration and related development activities
- Large numbers of internally displaced persons,
- Absence of opportunities for the youth
- Lapsed allocations
- Absence of accountability

- Shrinking democratic spaces
- Misuse of democratic processes and institutions

Recommendations

- Begin a process of building leadership amongst the youth
- Assess the use/abuse of Special Area Security Acts
- Release a white paper on the status of internally displaced persons (IDPs)
- The functioning of the Compensatory Afforestation Fund Management and Planning Authority and the MGNREGS should be evaluated and audited (social audit)
- Creation of a ministry exclusively for dealing with issues arising in conflict zones
- D Bandopadhyay Committee Report should be seen and its recommendations followed

Group 6

Reconstruction of Adivasi Welfare Ministry and other related organisations/institutions

Decentralization of information

Context

The problems are listed below.

- Powerlessness of the ministry in view of the challenges
- Weak and/or defunct organisations and institutions
- Lack of adequate human resources
- Ineffectiveness in view of current challenges such as mining, industrialization, etc
- Lack of awareness among the people (rights, entitlements, schemes, programmes)

Recommendations

- Recognise the history, culture and identity of adivasi people as distinct and valued
- Formulation of National Adivasi Policy
- Creation of a single window system for the adivasi people
- Revive the Adivasi Advisory Committees and strengthen the Scheduled Tribes Commission in view of the current challenges like violence and loss of livelihoods and resources
- Release of white papers based on governors reports

Group 7

■ Local knowledge based opportunities for growth

Context

The problems are listed below.

- Loss of dignity and respect associated with traditional knowledge/skills
- Stagnation in learning processes
- Disinterest amongst the youth as returns are way below the efforts
- Spread of consumerism
- Aggressive mainstreaming
- Loss of skills and knowledge due to lack of conservation and threats such as ipr
- Loss of traditional institutions and systems

Recommendations

- Planning priorities need to be redefined (planning at gram sabha level based on local knowledge and resources)
- Traditional systems of organisation and governance need to be recognised
- Industrial Training Institutes that are being opened in adivasi areas should offer courses that enhance local skills such as bamboo craft, iron smithy, etc.
- Recognition should be given to traditional healers and their knowledge of herbal medicines
- Creation of Gramin Gyan Kendras to serve as banks of local knowledge and prevent patenting of knowledge and products by outsiders
- Include people with traditional knowledge in the state and district planning boards

7. Youth

Brief Report on National Youth Consultation: Approach Paper to the 12th Five Year Plan

Executive Summary

The National Youth Consultation on the approach paper to the 12th Five Year Plan was held on 5 December 2010 in Delhi and was organised by Youth Alliance for Planning (YAP). The consultation was attended by over 150 youth participants from around 70 organisations working on different issues in both rural and urban areas across 13 states.

The consultation was held as part of the process initiated by the Planning Commission to engage with civil society organisations to get their inputs on different issues for preparation of the approach paper to the 12th Five Year Plan. The National Youth Consultation aimed at discussing and raising the concerns faced by the youth from across the country along different key issues. The consultation began with Mr Arun Maira, Member, Planning Commission and Mr Amitabh Behar, WNTA setting the context. After this, the participants formed groups to discuss problems, possible solutions and specific recommendations. The main issues taken up by the participating organisations were education, health, decentralisation and democratisation of information, environment, enhancing capacity for growth and markets for inclusion, skill development, urbanisation and rural transformation and sustained agriculture growth. The discussions on these issues were facilitated by Mr Dunu Roy, Mr PV Sateesh, Mr Nikhil Dey, Ms Malika Vardi, Ms Kiran Bhatta, Mr Madhavan, Ms Randeep Kaur and others.

The main issues taken up by the participating organisations were decentralisation and democratisation of information, rural transformation and sustainable agriculture growth, education, managing environment, skill development, enhancing capacity for growth and markets for inclusion, health and urbanisation.

The following are the main recommendations across all the discussions.

- The need for a National Youth Commission to address all issues related to youth.
- The need for a National Youth Policy to draw up schemes and programmes for youth development and for greater engagement of youth across all sections of society.
- Ensure participation and representation of youth in different governance structures by making mandatory provisions for their representation.
- Make systems more transparent and accountable to the citizen by institutionalising social audits in implementation of all programs and schemes. Involve youth in monitoring of various government programs and schemes.
- Equal access to education is a right. Right to Education should not be only for primary and upper primary but should be extended to secondary and higher education.
- Education requires a practical curriculum that promotes indigenous skills and traditional knowledge. Modules on different Acts and Provisions should be included in regular school/college curricula as capacity building of youth will help in ensuring active citizenship, social justice and equity.
- Paradigm shift from a rights-based approach to an autonomy approach, in which the community is empowered to plan and manage their own resources. This will enable the youth to take responsibility for their growth and will help instilling in them a sense of dignity and self worth thus ending their sense of alienation.

- Focus on youth for overall planning instead of treating them only as a specific sector.
- Need for a holistic approach to health services and special attention to be given to education on sexual and reproductive health for youth.

8. North-East

THE NORTH EAST CONSULTATION ON THE APPROACH PAPER TO 12TH FIVE YEAR PLAN

Introduction

The two days (6-7 December 2010) of the North East Region (NER) Consultation on the Approach Paper for the 12th Five Year Plan was organised by the North East Network (NEN) in Shillong, Meghalaya. Sixty participants attended it from different states of the North East Region, with the exception of Sikkim. It is however to be noted that a meeting did take place in Gangtok amongst members of NGOs a few days after the Shillong Consultation, and several points were incorporated into the main NER Consultation inputs for the approach paper, which were sent to WNTA on 21 December 2010.

The Shillong Consultation on 6 December 2010 started with a welcome address by Ms Anurita Hazarika, followed by a brief historical background of the consultations in the region during the 9th, 10th and 11th Plan processes by Dr Monisha Behal, the Chairperson, NEN. Dr. Behal also highlighted the following major objectives of the consultation.

- Get inputs/concerns from the participants
- Discuss these issues and concerns
- Chalk out the recommendations so that are accepted at the planning/policy level

This was followed by a self-introduction by the participants. The main agenda of the pre-lunch session was a panel discussion where Ms Jennifer Liang, Ms Patricia Mukhim, Ms Gita Bhattacharjee, Mr Amiya Sharma and Ms Rosemary Dzuvichu were the panellists.

Ms Jennifer Liang specifically underlined the main problems of the region that undermine good governance, especially in the state of Assam. The first one is the “Onion Skin Syndrome”, i.e. how unwilling/hesitant people are at

the micro level to complain about wrongdoing. This, she pointed out, is because our (NE) society is a closed one and people know one another and therefore they do not wish to hurt one another. Officers (local) are not able to get work done by their juniors as they share a ‘cosy’ non-hierarchical relationship with them. Militancy is often projected as a legitimate excuse for under-performance. On the other hand, many officers who are deputed in the region with an objective of bringing in positive changes consider this a punishment posting. As a result, these officers perceive their work in a negative manner, often being resentful against the people and the place, thus adversely affecting governance.

Indifference towards the problems of the people (with special reference to flesh trade among the internally displaced women) is another serious problem. The special status granted to the Bodoland Territorial Area Districts (BTAD) under the Sixth Schedule has enhanced the development process in the area. However, the absence of ‘systematic accountability’ is missing in the area and owing to this leakages take place (with special reference to the 99.9 per cent leakage in NREGA scheme in the BTAD). It is difficult to investigate such leakages by people working in CBOs. Not only this, the absence of ‘systematic accountability’ has helped spawn a smooth coalition of peace-militancy-leakage that will continue to function in these areas.

Ms Patricia Mukhim, activist and columnist, speaking on the issue of ensuring transparency in Sixth Schedule Areas lamented the poor functioning of the Autonomous District Councils (ADC) in Meghalaya. She pointed out how the councillors who were elected with the objective of safeguarding the traditional rights of the communities (under the Scheduled Areas) are indulging in rampant corruption. She further said that most of the members of the Council (District Council) do not understand the actual objectives of safeguarding the tribal tradition and

forests, promoting education and health, issuing trading licences to non-Adivasis, regulating trade and markets, and appointing headmen and heads of traditional institutions. The councillors have abdicated all of the above duties in practice.

Besides these, she also highlighted a gamut of other issues like environmental degradation, increasing rate of privatisation of land in the North East, politicisation of the appointment of chiefs and headmen. Mukhim concluded by proposing that the funds allocated to the ADCs should be audited by the CAG and at the same be made public for social auditing. This is the only way to deal with the above-mentioned problems. Her other suggestions included reforming and remodelling provisions in ADCs in such a manner that they can do away with the present problems.

Ms Gita Bhattacharjee's presentation centred around issues concerning education and health in rural areas of Assam. Recollecting some of her field experiences, Ms. Bhattacharjee pointed out the irregularity of schoolteachers coupled with absence of community monitoring systems. She described the following major challenges faced by the education and health sectors in the rural areas.

- Communities' indifference regarding the issue of irregular teachers due to the political patronage that these teachers enjoy
- The services of the teachers are not evaluated on the basis of their performance
- There are many single teacher schools in the NER where the same teacher is responsible for all affairs of the school and this is adversely affecting the quality of education
- Health schemes like *janani suraksha yojana* lack pragmatism

Ms Bhattacharjee concluded by suggesting that the Government should come up with an alternative to target centric self-evaluation. A monitoring mechanism needs to be put in place and skill development is necessary for those government functionaries who implement programmes and support services.

Speaking on the issues of the NER, Mr Amiya Sharma pointed out that most of the NGOs working in the region are dealing with non-economic concerns. He also lamented the inability of the organisations of the region to make appropriate approaches to the concerned departments/ministries that are well-funded, such as the Ministry for Development of North Eastern Region (DoNER). He also

pointed out that the delay in the release of funds by the Centre results in its non-utilisation and this cycle of delayed release followed by under-utilisation has continued over the years. He also aired his doubts about the NER industrial policy, saying that though the industries in the region reap all the benefits in the form of tax holidays, etc., they show no concern towards the issue of sustainable resource management, environmental protection or any other social responsibility.

Ms Rosemary Dzuwichu presented her views on the representation of women. She pointed out how the implementation of the Nagaland Municipal Amendment Act 2006, which ensured reservation for women in the municipal elections, has been delayed. The Act was formalised within six months but its implementation has not started yet. In 2008, soon after the reserved wards were identified, there were protests against its implementation. Two main arguments were that since women do not own land, they should be denied the right to represent wards. Secondly, there are some sections in society who believed that implementation of women's reservation would jeopardise the peace process in Nagaland. She further pointed out the reasons behind non representation of women as ignorance about their own rights and lack of organisational unity. Ms Dzuwichu also proposed that since conflict is an important issue concerning the NER, it should not be camouflaged. It should be discussed and be made a central point in the centres of power as well.

Mr Sanat Chakraborty reiterated that inputs of important consultations of the past have not really been honoured by the Centre and doubted whether the current one for the 12th Five Year Plan would be a worthwhile exercise. He added that the Vision 2020 document has most of the priorities of the NER well-represented. On this, Mr Sanjoy Hazarika briefed the participants on Vision 2020, suggesting that prioritisation of some of the challenges, which are crucial from the viewpoint of the region, would be helpful in coming up with workable ideas. He further said that it was now high time to act and not merely plan.

The next session commenced with the participants forming into three groups, which came up with suggestions, which had not found a place in the Vision 2020 plans crafted for the NER. The three groups were asked to discuss and make their presentation the following day.

On 7 December 2010, the 2nd day, the programme was introduced by Ms Seno Tshuhah of NEN, Nagaland. Mr Saumitra Chaudhuri, Member of the Planning Commission

was present and Mr F Kharkhongor, Commissioner of Agriculture, Government of Meghalaya attended the consultation. Ms Caitlin from UNDP could not come for the programme and instead two other UNDP officials, Mr Sashi Sudhir and Mr Tushi Imlong, attended the consultation. The day's programme began with a brief recap of the events of the 1st day by Ms Jennifer Liang. This was followed by the presentations by each of the three groups, formed and assigned to come up with their strategies on certain specific key challenges. Ms Liang recapitulated the previous day's session followed by presentations from the groups.

Accordingly, Mr Rajiv Handique representing Group 1 pointed out the following suggestions under the key strategy challenge point: enhancing the capacity for growth. Ms Rosemary Dzuvichu and Ms Linda Chhahchhuak, representatives of Group 2, pointed out some issues on the key strategy challenges: managing the environment and decentralisation, empowerment and information. Group 3 was represented by Ms Monrina and the group highlighted some suggestions around rural transformation and sustained growth of agriculture, improved access to quality education and better preventive and curative healthcare.

Following the presentations of all the three groups, Mr Saumitra Chaudhuri, Member, Planning Commission, made some observations. The suggestions should have consistencies, and should not overlap with the constitutional schemes. For instance, a participant talked about the representation of women in the District Councils, though certain indigenous people have traditional customary powers that cannot be encroached upon. At the same time, there were suggestions that PESA should be extended to District Councils in tribal areas. It is well known that one of the reasons why we do not have Panchayat System in many parts of the NER is that in the traditional system of governance, the headman or gaonbura, is elected on the basis of customary laws. Another observation made by him was regarding the feasibility of micro hydel projects. He pointed out that in micro hydel projects, every little stream and waterfall are utilised which results in bringing about ecological imbalances in the process, affecting communities along those areas. After Mr Chaudhuri's speech, Mr F Kharkongor, Commissioner of Agriculture, Government of Meghalaya gave a brief explanation on the strategies related to agriculture being implemented in Meghalaya.

Discussions

Participants were asked to bring out their points and there were varied ones, which are mentioned below in brief.

Ms Rosemary Dzivechu of Nagaland spoke on governance. There are many places in the NER where they have Village Councils, especially in those areas which they do not have PRI. There is absolutely no women's representation in such councils. Therefore, strategies should be developed, such as the provision of incentives to those traditional councils that encourage adequate representation of women in the councils, as most of these councils depend on government funds and schemes. On the issue of education, she said that the NER has eight universities. The major concern is that of corruption in these universities. e.g. NEHU and Nagaland University have had Central Bureau of Investigation enquiries, and yet no action has been taken. As a result of applications made under the RTI Act, there is also proof of money having been siphoned off. Therefore, intervention of the Planning Commission is required to look into these issues and seek new directions for funding these universities.

Another issue in the education system is that most of the schools in villages have a committee called Village Education Council (VEC) manned by people who have no idea about education or are themselves illiterate. They control the whole school and so the whole education system is fractured. Transfer and selection of teachers are also politicised.

There is no cooperation from the government with the community. For instance, the collection of electricity bills is done by an individual from among the residents of the locality. He does this by travelling to and fro for a couple of hours without being paid by the government. These problems should be addressed by the state to promote participation of the community.

Taking the example of the success of the education systems of South East Asian countries, Ms Darilyn of Meghalaya pointed out that gender studies should be introduced at the graduate and postgraduate levels.

Suggestions

Mr Chaudhuri suggested that the local people should do the assessment and evaluation as they are on the ground and not wait for Delhi to do the needful.

Ms Sunita and Ms Meena Debbarma of Tripura spoke strongly about the absence of Tripura's indigenous language and the denial of portraying the popular cultures that belong to the state. These and the indigenous histories of Tripura have not been promoted by the state government. Therefore, they requested the Planning Commission Member to help with this issue. Mr Anthony Debbarma said that the indigenous people are being deprived of education and the dropout rate is as high as 80 per cent. He appealed that the Tribal communities in Tripura need adequate attention from the state and the Centre, without which there would be no progress despite its being known as a 'stable' state.

Suggestions

Mr Chaudhuri suggested that as the NER comprises so many groups and a variety of languages with beautiful cultures, they should come together, make a list of what should be projected about the NER and make the people in the rest of the country know about this.

Ms Grace Jajo of Manipur said that Jhum has to be recognised, respected and supported as a way of life of the tribal people. She said that 70 per cent of the people of the NER depend on Jhum, which is suited to the topography of the region. Most of the people are rice eaters and it was feared that cash crops would result in the decline of rice production. She said that instead of doing away with Jhum, we should look for value added support for Jhum.

Mr Anthony Debbarma of Tripura spoke of the high mortality rate in his state due to viral fever and meningitis in July and August 2010. About 27 children had died of viral fever. He said that hospitals of national standards have to be set up.

Carmo Norhona of Meghalaya stated that people with disability should have a place in society as they have been denied many rights for years. Attention should be given in this consultation to this segment of people and those living with HIV, with specific indicators. Of the people with disability in the NER, 90 per cent are in rural areas and the problem is that when it comes to reservation for these people in the Poverty Reservation Scheme, very few of them accept it due to fear of being ostracised.

Ms Jaya Joram of Arunachal talked at length about the corruption within the state agencies, an example being the PDS scandal. She even talked about the ICDS and the denial of fresh mid day meals in several centres. In addition, she spoke of remote areas of Arunachal with sparse

households that had no access to roads, health care and electricity. It is therefore important that building of roads and infrastructure should not be determined by population in Arunachal but only on the needs of small communities which deserve attention and development. Finally she spoke of the clubbing of several departments under the fold of the Department of Social Welfare which has created gaps in implementation of programmes and schemes.

Mr Saumitra Choudhuri did agree that there was a problem with the Food Corporation of India and the Government of Arunachal Pradesh on PDS. With regard to the ICDS, delivery of food items to some districts through fair price shops has been a problem in the rainy months. There are some border areas that are very far away, but still efforts are being made to cover these areas.

Ms Gita Bhattacharjee of Assam said that parts of Assam practise witch hunting. This is a violation of women's human rights. CEDAW has clearly talked of such discrimination and the issue has to be highlighted in the approach paper to initiate a process of state intervention.

Sister Judith of Meghalaya said that being a member of the Child Committee, she wanted to speak about social justice for all. She said that the Social Welfare Department, Government of Meghalaya has identified certain homes to rehabilitate children and provide them with some skill training. She suggested the Centre transfer funds directly to service providers and not route it through the state government. She also complained about the late release of funds from the Central government.

Ms Annie Sohtun of Meghalaya said that under the Domestic Violence Act, the District Social Welfare Officers are also the Protection Officers. When NGOs approach them they usually decline to help saying that the additional role of being Protection Officers is heavy and it is difficult for them to look after other schemes. Thought has to be given to this problem.

Ms Sheetal Sharma of Assam asked about the relationship between the Centre and the State Planning Boards in the context of programming and implementation of schemes. Mr Chaudhuri said that some State Planning Boards (SPB) are very active and some are not. He suggested that if it is found that an SPB is not sufficiently active then an issue should be made of this and action taken.

Ms Grace Jajo of Manipur spoke on the subject of education and brought out the issue of teachers in schools of rural areas. A system of sub-contracting of teachers has been

going on in Manipur where a 'teacher' gets a substitute to do his work in the school. The concern is that these contracted 'teachers' have hardly any qualification. There are also some teachers who are absent for many years from schools and nothing can be done as they are related, or have some link, to bureaucrats and politicians. At the same time the villagers cannot complain as they fear that the schemes and funds will be diverted to some other areas. She also said that some schools are as small as a paan shop and this is a total mockery of the education system in this country. All these and more have snatched away the potential values that are expected to be inculcated in young children.

Mr Amiya Sharma of Assam said that an *India Today* ranking of states is not based only on per capita income but also on environment and governance issues. Therefore, we must not look only at the issue of per capita income but at all areas – agriculture, forest and governance. He was emphatic the North Eastern Council (NEC) should be strengthened so that the people do not have to go to Delhi to air their problems. There should be a role change and at the same time, CSOs need to play their role in approaching the NEC about development of the region. He thanked everyone for their effort and dedication. He said that only the NER is having a regional consultation because it has unique issues and unique statistics while all the others – Tribals, Dalits, water – are subject specific. The organisations in the NER have a unique position in being able to look at the questions of development from the point of view of the users or the beneficiaries. He said that we must look at the issues with a specialised view when we structure a problem. All of us should speak on the area we are specialised in and then put them together so that the overall suggestions become concrete and comprehensive. He also suggested that we must document all the issues, the findings and facts; it will be of great value as it represents our learning from ground-level evidence. He finally said that all the information and inputs provided by us would be very important for the Planning Commission. The post-lunch session was followed by comments on the views expressed after which a draft of the inputs was prepared. The session ended with the finalisation of the points, which would be included in the suggestions for the approach paper from the region.

9. Children

Country Focus Meeting to Position Child Rights in the 12th Five Year Plan

Focus Presentation on Positioning the Child in National Development, Razia Ismail Abbasi

The 12th Five Year Plan's mandate is rightfully centred on children. Their survival, security and well-being are clearly positioned as Fundamental Rights and national priorities in the Constitution of India. The State must recognise how pivotal they are to genuine national progress, and focus its attention and investments accordingly. It is neither logical nor ethical to assume that benefits to the young will automatically find their way through age-blind programming and investment. Facts on the ground, from Plan to Plan, show that they do not.

Even when child-specific goals are set, they do not seem to be pursued as priorities. Both the 10th and 11th Five Year Plans missed targets which could have changed children's realities, and so did previous plans. Such pledges carry over from one Plan to the next, and many may now move to the 12th Plan. Can India afford to postpone such foundational investment? The price is paid not merely in children's lives, but in national progress. All children have equal rights to life, dignity, opportunity, health, education, participation and a safe, caring and healthy environment where they can grow and develop to actively contribute to the building of a progressive and prosperous society and nation. The State is slow to understand that a young population is a resource, and that children are assets – not liabilities. Poor investment is no way to treat or nurture an asset. The 12 key challenges set out by the Planning Commission do not express such an understanding.

Formal recognition of rights makes implementation an obligation. Substantive action to secure the survival, development, protection, dignity and inclusion of every child in India is long overdue. This is the core non-negotiable for the immediate future and the longer term to achieve genuine national progress.

Shifting focus to the youngest citizen – the 'aam baccha' – is not charity but economic commonsense. Children make up 41 per cent of India's people. They carry the potential of yielding the richest dividend on economic and social investment. The pursuit of growth must go beyond macroeconomic indicators, and see equal emphasis and political will to address human development indices with specific focus on them.

The 12th Plan marks a critical opportunity to bring about breakthrough change for children by infusing a rights-based approach to building human resources. This calls for transition to a comprehensive holistic perspective on child survival and development. Planning must transcend scheme-based and limited sectoral approaches and individual ministerial portfolios to address all rights of all children – before and after birth – and throughout the period of growth and development to the age of 18 years. The National Policy for Children gave paramount importance to this 36 years ago. India must act now.

Eleven Five Year Plans have not assured children of simple survival, and basic development still eludes too many. This is not human resource development. Thus children's survival, and the quality of that survival, emerges as the first imperative. There are 12 key challenges – and this one ranks first.

Challenges

Survival remains the primary and persistent challenge. Most critical at the start of life, it remains a risk throughout childhood. Life-saving, life-sustaining and protective measures must be in place to combat these. These include adequate nutrition, psycho-social stimulation, health

care, clean drinking water, sanitation and security. Child development begins from conception, and the first three years are the critical foundational period for cognitive, intellectual, physical and social development, with life-long impact. Neglect of these puts at risk children's capacity to reach their full potential and contribute to India's growth story.

- Hunger is distinct among un-met challenges. The NFHS reports reveal worsening of under-nutrition in the 0-3 age group, and persisting nutrition deficits in children across the childhood years. The under-fed teenage girl pushed into early childbearing is a dramatic example. Malnutrition has been declared a "national shame" by the Prime Minister, but declarations are not enough. Nutrition is a non-negotiable priority. Families cutting their diets in the face of rising prices cannot tackle it on their own; the State must assist.
- Survivors of a bad start remain vulnerable throughout childhood. Plans must address the needs of each stage of growth through the 18 years.
- Identity is an accompanying challenge; children overall are not seen as India's richest national asset, deserving of investment. Children are also denied deserved attention and deprived of entitlements because of who they are and where they come from.
- Data provides clear proof of persisting, unacceptable disparities. The State must adequately address social exclusion, and provide dignity to all children from socially marginalised backgrounds to grow equitably and become the true national capital.
- Locational insecurity or transience of location cannot justify exclusion from basic supports. Migrant and transient populations cannot produce fixed addresses; this must not debar them from services and attention.
- Essential learning and development rights must be accessible to all children, and the least endowed must not have to make do with inferior 'alternative' services. Education is the child's principal hope for a better future.
- Child exploitation, abuse and violence continue unabated. A weak protective environment negatively affects the other rights of the child and threatens a normal development trajectory. Children in conflict situations must get priority in protection and targeted attention.

India's effort to achieve national progress calls for both long-term vision and goals and more immediate targets,

with constant tracking of their implementation. The persisting realities of children's status and condition demand that their survival, security, and well-being are positioned as the key indicators of whether or not development decisions and outcomes are on track. If these are primary objectives, implementation and impact can be measured by creating and utilising a child development index.

Critical indicators for a child development index must include neonatal, infant and child mortality, under-nutrition and learning outcomes at various stages of a child's development. The age of marriage of the girl child and age at which the first child is born must also be seen as critical social child indicators. The growing incidence of foeticide threatens the demographic balance and viability in terms of gender and age-related populations. Indicators must include child sex ratio for girl child survival, reduced incidence of abuse, exploitation, labour and violence.

A conscious effort is needed to base programme targeting and delivery on updated information; official plans and commitments cannot rest on data that is already five years old or older. The time gaps in information flow are not justifiable. What happened to the nic.net connections forged by the Technology Missions? Why is monitoring so weak and lax and field findings left unattended? The Government must become serious about the knowledge base it uses.

How will this focusing change present thinking on the planning process and its outcomes? New thinking, methodology, planning, convergence, implementation and evaluation are essential.

An integrated and convergent approach based on rights would commit to the following.

- Every child's right of access to the State's attention, supports and protections and services beyond the coverage, design and outreach of existing schemes, with new or enhanced programming to meet actual entitlement
- Priority targeting for children's benefit in budgeting and investment allocation across all sectors
- Attention to the full spectrum of age, from ante-natal protection, to the tackling of mortality, morbidity, malnutrition and security risks of the first month and first year, to the universalisation of survival and developmental, protection and participation (based on the evolving capacity of a child) rights of every child through every year of childhood

- Every child's equal right to recognition, dignity, worth, self-expression and choice; and the child as a whole person and an individual in his or her own right, without distinction of any kind based on any factor of identity, origin or social placement, or any situation of alienation
- Manpower development and deployment to equip and energise the development sectors
- The removal of barriers to any service or scheme that makes access conditional on the child or beneficiary providing proof of settled location to benefit
- Planned investment in execution of existing laws for child protection; every child's right to be universally covered under all forms of laws and policies applicable to them in line with constitutional provisions
- New strategies and mechanisms which establish connectedness and convergence both as a strategy and as a desired outcome, and a mission mode approach
- Improved and enhanced public education and community outreach to promote and bring about family/community attitudinal and behavioural changes with regular evaluation and modification, as needed
- Fact-based programming, with greater attention to the generation of reliable data and indicators on children, and use of an up to date knowledge base; priority attention to investigating causes and challenges of the underdevelopment of children
- Translation of all outcomes into critical indicators of a child development index

Attention and Resources

(i) Fiscal

The size of the "Child Budget" within the Union Budget (the aggregate outlay for child-specific schemes as a proportion of total budget outlay) is shamefully low. It grew to 4.1 percent in 2010-11 (Budget Estimate) from 3.7 percent in 2009-10 (Revised Estimate). But a look at the allocations earmarked for children in the whole period from 2007 – 08 to 2010-11 shows a miniscule increase in 2010-11 (BE). The major flagship programmes for the welfare of children – ICDS, SSA and immunisation – depend heavily on external funding. In 2008-09, external aid was 13 per cent of the "Child Budget". These programmes also

leave many children out, especially the neediest, and notably many of the older ones.

(ii) Human

One key challenge is 'enhancing the capacity for growth', which flags a 'massive effort to expand education and skills to reap the demographic dividend'. What is this supposed to mean? What are the skills needed for social development and the fundamental elements of public good at community, household and individual base? The new Plan should aim to develop and deploy a manpower resource in key sectors that can achieve direct and genuine benefits to the common people. This must correct what the 11th Plan approach identified as the aim of education and skill development.

(iii) Democratising Information

Community education, communication training for workers and information outreach are essential to the knowledge transfer needed to energise and mobilise social and economic change and cultural integration. If children's status and condition are to be recognised as the indicator of progress at every level, extension education and knowledge access are critical. This calls for people – providers and public alike, and children included – to have genuine rights to information. It also calls for an attentive governance infrastructure ready to hear the people's voices and respond.

(iv) Social Justice

This demands official and political commitment to equal rights. The State cannot wait for social change; it must galvanise it and be answerable for it. The treatment of children of the disadvantaged is a litmus test of such attention. It is supremely important that Plan objectives are focused around reducing inequalities between groups. A key test for policies promoting inclusive growth is how they deliver for more marginalised groups such as SCs, STs and minorities.

Sensitisation of service providers on all issues of caste, ethnicity and religions, notable for handling children vulnerable to discrimination is urgent. All programmes for children must focus to safeguard against the malpractices leading to social and economic exploitation of such children, in all settings and situations of risk or deprivation.

Summary of Conclusions

Concluding Remarks

Mr Arun Maira (Member, Planning Commission)

- What are the main differences between the human rights and welfare approaches? Let those ‘differences’ come out in your submissions to the Commission.
- How do you justify your recommendation on having a child budget for all ministries? Would every ministry be able to make a meaningful investment?
- Rather than criticising the amount of money invested in programmes and schemes for children, you should be adopting the results-oriented approach as even double investments may not lead to the desired results.
- It would be useful to submit 3-4 key recommendations to the Commission on each challenge.

Points of Presentation

Challenge 1: Enhancing the Capacity for Growth

(Ms Sreelakshmi Gururaja, Karnataka Child Rights Observatory)

- Resource mobilisation must undergo a shift in the 12th Plan – overall allocation of child-specific schemes must be stepped up in the Union as well as state budgets, and it should be ensured that all needs of children from the time before they are born till they attain the age of 18 are provided for
- The State must invest and deliver all their core and primary responsibilities to children
- The focus should be on consolidation rather than proliferation of schemes to develop an integrated safety net for all children
- What about capacity building of personnel who are expected to carry out the State’s obligation towards children?
- Impact evaluation of all programmes and schemes needs to be conducted regularly

Challenge 2: Enhancing Skills and Faster Generation of Employment

(Ms Sreelakshmi Gururaja, Karnataka Child Rights Observatory)

- The implementation of the Right to Education must be ensured – India must realise the goals of universal elementary, primary and secondary education
- It is the State’s responsibility to strengthen the implementation of labour laws to ensure open and fair access of poor families to labour markets
- Monitor interconnections between sustainable livelihoods and child survival, development and protection
- Provide institutional mechanisms like daycare etc. for working parents at the work site

Challenge 3: Managing the Environment

(Mr John Butler and Mr Sudhir Sundaresan, Save the Children)

- Disaster Management Act should be implemented immediately with specific interventions for children
- The Right to Life guaranteed by the Indian Constitution is directly related to clean water and sanitation, yet 400000 children die of diarrhoea every year; clearly, these are deaths that can be prevented
- The rights of Adivasis and other socially excluded communities must be protected by the State
- An institutional waste management system is urgently required
- Suggestions on possible mitigation strategies for climate change – environmental education should be included in school curriculum as well as personnel training, etc.

Challenge 4: Markets for Efficiency and Inclusion

(Mr Deepak Bose, IACR)

- Services meant for fulfilling children’s rights should be dispensed solely by the Government and not be included in public private partnerships; a child

impact assessment should be conducted for every such service

- Steps need to be taken to prevent the displacement of work forces from home regions
- Labour laws need to be strengthened to ensure child protection and equitable wages
- Sustainable food security is a major challenge that needs to be overcome if hunger and malnutrition are to be eradicated
- To ensure the optimal utilization of funds transferred (in terms of benefits for the poor and marginalized), the Central Government should follow up on the funds transferred to State Governments

Challenge 5: Decentralisation, Empowerment and Information

(Ms Sreelakshmi Gururaja, Karnataka Child Rights Observatory and J B Oli, IACR)

- We must explore the potential of Panchayati Raj Institutions (PRIs) in extending benefits to children; when used with the 3Fs (Functionaries, Functions and Funds), PRIs can be instrumental in bringing many positive changes in the lives of children
- Child participation in planning and monitoring should be encouraged
- Plan objectives should focus around reducing inequalities between groups
- Nutrition for children belonging to the socially excluded classes should be a primary concern
- All development and protection measures must recognise that all aspects of the child's life should be covered and thus, the full spectrum of necessary child-related services has to be seen as interconnected and interdependent
- Protection of children in the age group 14-18 should be given special attention as this age group is most vulnerable to trafficking, sexual abuse, etc.

Challenge 6: Technology and Innovation

(Ms Renu Singh, Young Lives)

- The 12th Plan must not only promote innovation for 'commercial purposes' but also promote poverty

alleviation through 'inclusive innovation'. This should include innovation in public service system delivery, monitoring and developing new organisational models

- There should be increased support for grassroots innovators whose innovations impact the lives of children

Challenge 7 : Securing the Energy Future for India

(Ms Padmini, Child Rights Trust)

- Market prices should include cross-subsidy patterns
- Current levels of pollution affect children much more than adults
- Children need to be taught to be energy-efficient – leading by example, making energy saving fun, etc.
- In terms of energy, we must universalise access
- We need to focus on "good" fuel
- Currently, there is no accountability; we must educate consumers on more sustainable forms of energy and must also teach children to be energy-efficient

Challenge 8: Transport Infrastructure

(Ms Padmini, Child Rights Trust)

- Our focus needs to undergo change; so far, we have been following the failed American model
- When talking about transportation, you must consider access, safety (e.g. traffic accident) and health (e.g. the detrimental impact of pollution)
- Common problems include poor infrastructure, insufficient footpaths, poor maintenance, inadequate or unsafe spaces for play, and pollution
- We need better roads, playgrounds and parks, crosswalks and sidewalks

Challenge 9: Rural Transformation and Sustained Growth of Agriculture

Challenge 10: Managing Urbanization

(Ms Devika Singh, Mobile Crèches and Ms Kanupriya J Chatterjee, IACR)

Challenges 9 and 10 are interconnected.

- It is not possible to segregate children's rights from their communities
- In today's economy, the way we are getting affected by urbanization, rural and urban linkages cannot be segregated
- Interdependence of urban and rural areas
 - Rural households are always trying to adopt urban lifestyles
 - Urban industries are moving to rural areas
 - Urban communities consume rural communities' resources
- It is an anachronism that the State is still segregating policies between urban and rural areas
- There is lack of any sort of targeted data for children under six.
- Urban policies that need urgent review are
 - Per capita norms
 - Programmes for the child who is not reached by any services
 - Daycare

Challenge 11: Education

(Ms Renu Singh, Young Lives and Ms Kate Lockwood, IACR)

- Early childhood education must be accessible to all children; early childhood education (especially 6-14 years) is a critical area that needs attention
- ICDS has not been universalised so far
- The 11th Plan emphasizes elementary education
- Even though there is a no-detention policy, students are still dropping out because they are not ready for schools and/or schools are not ready for children
- Secondary education is a problem even in states that are otherwise doing very well
- How does one define quality when talking about 'quality education'?

- The implementation of the Right to Education needs to be investigated; the way in which children are being taught is just as or more important than the number of teachers available

Challenge 12: Health

(Mr Rajiv Tandon, Save the Children and Ms Swati Malik, IACR)

- Improving the quality of maternal, newborn and other children's health and nutrition services (MNCHN) is crucial
- The state needs to make improving MNCHN a national priority and adopt measures like adopting the right to health as the fundamental right of all citizens and providing a special focus on addressing equity and gender issues, etc.
- Primary healthcare and nutrition interventions must follow an evidence-based approach – scaling up proven low-cost, high-impact interventions
- Coordination between services across ministries needs to be promoted
- Monitoring and governance need to be improved by establishing more meaningful targets, holding monthly reviews of progress of health and nutrition indicators, etc.

Comments

(Mr K B Saxena, Council for Social Development)

- Children cannot be separated from their families and so, when the State takes decisions for children, it is bound to affect their families (in many instances, make the families more vulnerable)
- The resources reserved for poor people must not be allocated by the Government to any other head
- Protection cannot be separated from development and strategy. Today, there is almost no implementation of labour laws leading to an almost complete devaluation of labour machinery. One of the reasons may be the large number of informal vocations being pursued that are not within the ambit of any labour law. There is an urgent need to bring in uncovered vocations into labour laws.

- People are being pushed to migrant labour which often is quite like bonded labour; access of migrants to State services is very poor.
- Status of land, water resources etc. needs to be protected. The previous definition of land for 'public purpose' was much better than the present one. The worst part of this definition is that now land can be directly acquired by corporates.
- Decentralisation has been stymied by the State. Decentralisation is not only about implementation. If the local government units are not empowered enough to make decisions, they literally have no power. This pretence of decentralisation needs to be changed to actual decentralisation.
- Scheduled Castes face tremendous social exclusion. There must be ways devised to ensure that such tendencies can be removed.
- India needs a climate change mitigation strategy.

Questions/Comments

- We must focus on maternal health. Thirteen million children do not eat adequate food during the first 6 months of life and 70 per cent of brain development occurs during the first year of life. Another scheme is not going to solve this problem. (Dr. Arun Gupta, BPNI)
- We need to focus on food security. (Ms Padmini, Child Rights Trust)
- We should ask for every department and ministry to have a child budget just as there is a gender budget. Child participation is a necessary area of investment. (Ms Bharti Ali, HAQ: Centre for Child Rights)
- The Government makes plans, schemes, and budgets, but how far are they monitored? Children should be able to participate in the monitoring. (Ms Minaxi Shukla, CHETNA, Ahmedabad)
- Children must not be thought of in isolation from their families or communities (Mr PS Krishnan, Activist, Inclusive Development)
- There must be a radical change – the 'care' component should be included, maternity entitlements must be addressed. We need to evaluate the impact of market oriented policies and PPP on children.
- When discussing transportation, we need to not overlook the importance of accessibility for pregnant women. (Mr Satya Dey, CRY)

10. Conflict

National Consultation on Orienting the 12th Five Year Plan for Conflict Mitigation and Redress, 16–17 December 2010, New Delhi

Observations/ Recommendations/ Suggestions

The objective of planning should be to secure development and progress for all. Nevertheless, it is seen that development initiatives could also lead to exclusion, social tensions and conflicts. The consultation focused on deliberating on how development in different spheres is contributing to generation/enhancement of conflict and suggested possibilities of using the 12th Five Year Plan process for mitigation and redress of conflicts.

Discussions were structured around social conflicts (covering communal, caste, regional, ethnic conflicts, etc.), conflicts over resources (leading to displacements, migration, resistance, inter-state and inter-regional disputes, insurgencies) and political conflicts (around issues of governance, accountability, inclusion policies, peoples aspirations, etc).

The Planning Commission of India has identified 12 key challenges for the formulation of the approach paper for the 12th Five Year Plan. The two-day consultation focused on six of the 12 key challenges, along with deliberations on challenges and perspectives not being covered by the proposed format of the 12th Five Year Plan.

The six key challenges covered are listed below.

1. Enhancing the capacity for growth
2. Managing the environment
3. Rural transformation and sustained growth of agriculture

4. Enhancing skills and fostering generation of employment
5. Decentralisation, empowerment and information
6. Managing urbanisation

Speakers and Panellists

Dr Syeda Hameed, Dr Rajesh Tandon, Mr PV Rajagopal (MP), John Dayal, Harsh Mander, Rahul Jalali (J&K), Ashok Choudhury (UP), Chunni Bhai Vaid (Gujarat), Hindu Singh Sodha (Rajasthan), Hem Bhai (Assam), Ram Puniyani (Mumbai), Jatin Desai (Mumbai), Kavita Srivastava (Rajasthan), S Sen (CII), Kodand Ram (AP), Satinath Chaudhury, Ashok Bharti, SDJM Prasad (AP), Alice Morris (Gujarat), Jamal Kidwai, Kamal Faruqui, Anil Choudhury, Anil Singh, Dunu Roy, Amitabh Behar, Lalit Kumar, Sohail Razzack, Balaji Singh, Richa Singh, Krishan Bir Singh, Mazher Hussain and others.

This consultation was organised by COVA in collaboration with Ekta Parishad, SANSAD, PUCAAR, ASHA Parivar and WNTA.

Observation on the Framework, Processes and Limitations of the Planning Commission

- The GDP growth-obsessed development model should be questioned. Growth should not be allowed

at the cost of the poor but should be people-centred and equity-based. The measure for growth should not be just the GDP but also the Human Development Index (HDI). A high score on GDP but low ranking on the HDI is indicative of unequal growth and provides the necessary condition for breeding of conflicts and social tensions that would be detrimental to the overall national interest. Hence, there is a need to go beyond the framework of the Planning Commission that is focusing predominantly on economic growth to incorporate equitable distribution and social justice as essential parameters for the evaluation of development.

- Increasing growth has witnessed increasing inequality, which is breeding conflict. The challenge is the reconciliation of the imperative of growth with the imperative of equality. In view of the enhancement of marginalisation and conflicts because of the accelerated growth of the GDP, and in the absence of a proper mechanism to ensure equitable growth, it appears prudent to consider a reduction in the growth rate of 8-9 per cent, as we are unable to keep pace with the requirements of equality.
- We need to ponder the fact that despite social spending having gone up almost three times, India's position in terms of HDI has not improved. The fact that democratisation and shift of power has resulted in a small section of society gaining dominance cannot be ignored. Planning should thus keep all these aspects in mind.
- Reaching out to all sections of the society is indeed a challenge and requires special efforts to promote equality and justice. Hence, parameters should be formulated and resources should be allocated to govern the interest of both growth and equality. Development indicators should be evolved with the involvement of the people and should not be fixed according to the understanding of the 'development concept' of the State. The State needs to assess the need and requirements of the people before setting up a project
- In the present scenario, resources are not going to the people but to the corporates and the rich. Additionally, the people are being excluded from access to natural resources and national assets, leading to enhancement of socio-economic inequality and generation of conflict situations. The transformation of the role of the State from being a "trustee" to an "auctioneer" of

these assets and resources is fraught with dangers and must be questioned.

- The ownership of all the people over all natural resources and national assets should be non-negotiable. It is necessary to redefine the paradigms for the ownership, control, management and utilisation of all natural and national resources and assets that will be in the interest of the people and posterity.
- It must be recognised that today India is facing greater danger from internal conflicts than from external threats. This is primarily due to inequitable distribution of resources, deprivation and marginalisation of large sections of the people. This issue has to be taken seriously and addressed immediately in the interest of the progress, prosperity and integrity of the country. Hence, there is a need to review all existing programmes in accordance with values of social justice and equality.
- That planning in India has not pursued the right path is proven by the relative levels of deprivation and disparities existing in Indian society are no less or are even higher after nearly six decades of planning. This is the primary cause of the various forms of alienation and conflicts that are today plaguing Indian society and the nation.
- All kinds of conflict, be it conflict as resistance or oppression, or conflict between people, or communal conflict, can be attributed to the government in a number of ways. These conflicts do not exist by themselves and are mostly induced.
- The relationship between the state and conflict and the role of the state in creation/encouragement of conflict needs to be examined and exposed. Laws are needed to hold the state accountable and there should be provision for criminal action for injustice and inequality against individuals, groups and the state.
- The most pertinent questions that need to be answered are why India still ranks 135 on HDI despite the over 8 per cent growth rate and why the people of those regions where natural resources are in abundance are suffering the most.
- The existing planning model needs a thorough and critical review. It considers the average growth rate, which hides the inequality prevailing among the people. It believes in the trickle-down ideology, which could reap results – mostly diluted – after the lapse

of a lot of time. Moreover, the budgetary allocations are not balanced and do not contribute to equitable growth.

- Though the role of the Planning Commission is not political, it needs to find ways for development and growth that are not detrimental to any section of the society and benefit one and all.

Finally, the efforts of the Planning Commission to reach out to civil society groups to seek their inputs for the preparation of the 12th Five Year Plan are commendable. However, the process of consultations should go beyond civil society to include the people at all levels. Civil society should only be a facilitator in this process, and not the negotiator.

Appendices

Appendix 1

Strategy Challenges

Based on an intensive process within the Planning Commission, the following “Twelve Strategy Challenges” have been identified to initiate the consultations (http://12thplan.gov.in/displayforum_list.php).

The “strategy challenges” refer to some core areas that require new approaches to produce the desired results.

Enhancing the Capacity for Growth

Today, India can sustain a GDP growth of 8 per cent a year. Increasing this to 9 or 10 per cent will need more mobilization of investment resources; better allocation of these resources through more efficient capital markets; higher investment in infrastructure through both public and PPP routes; and more efficient use of public resources.

Enhancing Skills and Faster Generation of Employment

It is believed that India’s economic growth is not generating enough jobs or livelihood opportunities. At the same time, many sectors face manpower shortages. To address both, we need to improve our education and training systems; create efficient and accessible labour markets for all skill categories; and encourage the faster growth of small and micro enterprises.

Managing the Environment

Environmental and ecological degradation has serious global and local implications, especially for the most vulnerable citizens of our country. How can we encourage responsible behaviour without compromising on our developmental needs?

Markets for Efficiency and Inclusion

Open, integrated, and well-regulated markets for land, labour, and capital and for goods and services are essential for growth, inclusion, and sustainability. We have many sectors where markets are non-existent or incomplete, especially those which are dominated by public provisioning. How do we create or improve markets in all sectors

Decentralisation, Empowerment and Information

Greater and more informed participation of all citizens in decision-making, enforcing accountability, exercising their rights and entitlements; and determining the course of their lives is central to faster growth, inclusion, and sustainability. How can we best promote the capabilities of all Indians, especially the most disadvantaged, to achieve this end?

Technology and Innovation

Technological and organizational innovation is the key to higher productivity and competitiveness. How can we encourage and incentivize innovation and their diffusion in academia and government as well as in enterprises of all sizes.

Securing the Energy Future for India

Faster and more inclusive growth will require a rapid increase in energy consumption. Since we have limited

domestic resources, how can we meet this need equitably and affordably without compromising on our environment?

Accelerated Development of Transport Infrastructure

Our inadequate transport infrastructure results in lower efficiency and productivity; higher transaction costs; and insufficient access to our large national market. How can we create an efficient and widespread multi-modal transport network?

Rural Transformation and Sustained Growth of Agriculture

Rural India suffers from poor infrastructure and inadequate amenities. Low agricultural growth perpetuates food and nutritional insecurities, which also reduces rural incomes. How can we encourage and support our villages in improving their living and livelihood conditions in innovative ways?

Managing Urbanization

Most of our metros and cities are under severe stress with inadequate social and physical infrastructure coupled with worsening pollution. Migration pressures are likely to increase. How do we make our cities more liveable? What can we do today to ensure that smaller cities and towns are not similarly overwhelmed tomorrow?

Improved Access to Quality Education

Educational and training facilities have been increasing rapidly. However, access, affordability, and quality remain serious concerns. Employability is also an issue. How can we improve the quality and the utility of our education, while ensuring equity and affordability?

Better Preventive and Curative Healthcare

India's health indicators are not improving as fast as other socio-economic indicators. Good healthcare is perceived to be either unavailable or unaffordable. How can we improve healthcare conditions, both curative and preventive, especially relating to women and children?

Appendix 2

CSOs, Individuals and Media in the 12th Five Year Plan Consultations 2010-11

Sl/No.	CS Organisation/Govt. Institutions
1	All India Bank Retirees Federation
2	All India Retired Reserve Bank Employee Association
3	Brihan Mumbai Pensioners Association
4	All India Federation General Insurance Pensioners
5	Harmony for Silvers Foundation
6	Indian Federation of Ageing
7	Jeevan Adhar Sewa Sanstha
8	Shree Ramanugrah Trust
9	1298 Senior Citizens Helpline
10	All India Central Government Pensioners Association
11	All India Retired Insurance Employees Federation
12	Brihan Mumbai Retired Employees Association
13	NCC-USW
14	Cross Cultural Solution (CCS)
15	Aaagaz
16	AAAS, Nagpur
17	Aarth Astha India
18	Aawaz-E-Niswaan
19	Abhas – Action Beyond Help and Support
20	Abhivyakti
21	Accountability Initiative
22	Act Now for Harmony and Democracy (ANHAD)
23	Action Aid
24	Action for Ability Development of Inclusion (AADI)
25	Action for Autism (AFA)
26	Action India
27	Action Reseach and Traning for Health (ARTH)
28	Adivasi Banihar Sakti Sangthan
29	Adivasi Bigu Vikas Utthan Samiti Mandal
30	Adivasi Mahila Surakhya Mandal
31	Adivasi Vikas Utthan Samiti
32	Advancement for Social Action (AFSA)
33	Agragramee
34	Agrocrats Society for Rural Development
35	AICC - AICU
36	Aid et Action
37	AIMUF
38	All India Senior Citizens' Confederation (AISCCON)
39	Ajeevika Bearue
40	Akhil Bharti Sadbhavna Trust
41	Alankar Welfare Society
42	Alfa
43	Al-Jamat Hawarin
44	All India Bank Retirees Federation
45	All India Dalit Mahila Adhikar Manch (AIDMAM)
46	All India Kabadi Mazdoor Sansthan
47	All India Mass Movement (AIMM)

48	Alliance for Dalit Rights (ADR)
49	Amai Mauza Gorkha Village
50	Aman Ishaara
51	Aman Trust
52	Amau
53	Ambedkar Mission of Orissa
54	Ambedkar Vichar Manch
55	Ambedkar Vichar Manch, Jharkhand
56	AMI
57	AMSC
58	Annamalai University
59	ANT
60	Anweshi Dalit Woman Documentation
61	Anweshi Women's Counselling Centre
62	Arunachal Pradesh Women's Welfare Society (APWWS)
63	Alzheimer's and Related Disorders Society of India (ARDSI)
64	Arman Foundation
65	ARTD
66	Arthar Sarang
67	Arunachal Pradesh Women's Welfare Society
68	ASHA Parivar
69	Ashadeep
70	Assam Mahila Samata Society
71	Association for Community Development (ACD)
72	Association for Stimulating Knowhow (ASK)
73	ASSS
74	Astha Sansthan
75	Astitva
76	ATIMA
77	Aund
78	AVM Thondu Nirvanam
79	Awadh People Forum
80	BAA, Haryana
81	Bachpan Bachao Andolan, Bihar
82	Baha'I, New Delhi
83	Bailancho Saad Goa
84	Bal Vikas Dhara
85	Bandhan
86	Banwari
87	Banwasi Sewa Ashram

88	Bazm-e-Adalat
89	Bazm-e-Khawateen
90	Beghar Mazdoor Sangharsh Samiti
91	Bethany Society
92	BEWR Development Society
93	Bharathidasan University
94	Bharati Trust
95	Bharatiya Muslim Mahila Andolan
96	Bhartiya Adivasi Vanwasi Kalyan Samiti
97	Bhimrao Jagruk Vikas Samiti, UP
98	Bhoruka Public Welfare Trust
99	Bhumihin Kisan Majdoor Seva Sansthan
100	BMS
101	BOAW
102	Borok People's Human Rights Organisation (BPHRO)
103	Breast Feeding Promotion Network of India (BPNI)
104	Brihan Mumbai Pension Association
105	Brispatin
106	Bundelkhand Vidhas Samiti
107	C & Rd. Govt. of Meghalaya
108	C & S (Agriculture), Meghalaya
109	CADAM Advancement of Minority
110	CAFYA Campaign
111	CARE India
112	C-Cerp
113	CDS, Tamil Nadu
114	Centre for Development and Population Activities (CEDPA)
115	Center for Lifelong Learning - TISS
116	Centre for Advocacy and Research (CFAR)
117	Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability (CBGA)
118	Centre for Dalit Rights (CDR)
119	Centre for Development Studies & Activities (CDSA)
120	Centre for Health Education, Training and Nutrition Awareness (CHETNA)
121	Centre for Human Rights Initiative, Training and Research Association (CHITRA)
122	Centre for People's Education
123	Centre for Rural Management

124	Centre for Social Equity and Inclusion (CSEI)
125	Centre for Social Justice (CSJ)
126	Centre for Social Reconstruction
127	Centre for South Asia Studies (CSAS)
128	Centre for Study of Society and Secularism
129	Centre for Women Development and Research
130	Centre for Women's Studies
131	The Center for Experiencing Socio-Cultural Interaction (CESCI)
132	CG Gramin Vikas Avam Kalyan Samaj Sewa Sansthan
133	Chetna Sangh Bhakhwadi Khurd
134	Chetna, Ahmedabad
135	Chhattisgarh Gramin Sewa Samiti
136	Chhattisgarh Yuvak Samaj
137	Child in Need Institute (CINI)
138	Child Rights & You, New Delhi (CRY)
139	Child Rights Trust (Bangalore)
140	Cultural Himalaya Rural Action Group (CHIRAG)
141	Christian Aid
142	Church's Auxiliary for Social Action (CASA)
143	Civil Society Institute (CSI)
144	Cloning Coom
145	CMSON-CBO
146	C-NES
147	Community Support Initiative (CSI)
148	Confederation of Indian Industry (CII)
149	Confederation of Voluntary Associations (COVA)
150	Constitution Club of India
151	Council for Social Development, New Delhi (CSD)
152	Counterpart International
153	CPDL
154	Credibility Alliance
155	Centre for Research in Rural and Industrial Development (CRRID)
156	CRT
157	Civil Society Women's Organization, Meghalaya (CSWO)
158	DACE-NEHU
159	Dactrust
160	DAGAR, Rajasthan

161	Dalit Adhikar Manch Wiham Patna
162	Dalit Adivasi Manch (DAM)
163	Dalit Arthik Adhikar Andolan (DAAA)
164	Dalit Development Society (DDS)
165	Dalit Hak Rakshak Mandal
166	Dalit Muslim Samaj
167	DAPPU
168	Dastak
169	DCINM
170	Deafway
171	Decentralization Community, Solution Exchange, UNDP
172	Deepalaya
173	Dept. of Social Work, Bundelkhand University
174	Dept. of Sociology, Jamia Millia Islamia
175	Deputy CEPW
176	Dhikshantar
177	Dhriti
178	Diaspora Foundation, Hyderabad
179	Dibrugarh University
180	Disha Foundation
181	Disha Uttarakhand
182	District Harijan Adivasi Development Organization
183	Diya Samaj Sevi Sanstha
184	DMM, Rajasthan
185	Don Bosco Yar Forum, New Delhi
186	Doosra Dashak
187	Dr. B.R. Ambedkar Open University, Hyderabad
188	Drishti
189	Dukhut
190	DWDS
191	EKTA
192	Ekta Parishad
193	Ekta Samaj Sewa Sansthan
194	Equations, Bangalore
195	Federation of Senior Citizens Organisations Maharashtra (FESCOM)
196	FFLL
197	FORCES
198	Ford Foundation
199	Forums on the Global South, India

200	GAIN
201	Gandhi Peace Foundation, Madras
202	Gandhi Vikas Samiti Tamdiya Chaksu
203	Gandhigram Rural University
204	Gaurav Gramin Mahila Vikas Manch
205	General Insurance Pensioners Association
206	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale (GIZ)
207	GLI
208	Global Gandhi Forum
209	Gouran
210	Gram Mitra
211	Gram Vikas Manch
212	Grameen Development Society
213	Gramin Evam Nagar Vikas Parishad
214	Gramin Vikas & Shiksha Sansthan
215	Gramin Vikas Pratisthan
216	Grassroots Options, Meghalaya
217	Green Flag
218	GSNP+
219	Gujarat Vidgaram
220	GVP
221	GVSS
222	Gyan Gargo Tori
223	HAQ: Centre for Child Rights, New Delhi
224	Harsh Samaj Sewa Sansthan
225	Hazards Centre
226	HelpAge India
227	Helpline Social Worker
228	Hemy Martyn Institute
229	Himachal Pradesh Voluntary Health Association (HPVHA)
230	Himalaya Niti Abhiyan
231	Holy Cross
232	Human Development & Education Organization
233	Human Rights Council
234	Human Rights Law Network, New Delhi (HRLN)
235	IAP, New Delhi
236	International Baby Food Action Network (IBFAN)
237	Idrisya Madarsaa
238	IHES

239	IIM, Shillong
240	IKP
241	Impulse
242	India Alliance for Child Rights (IACR)
243	India HIV/AIDS Alliance
244	Indian Committee of Youth Organizations (ICYO)
245	Indian Institute of Community Development
246	Indian Institute of Development Studies (IIDS)
247	Indian Institute of Human Settlement (IIHS)
248	Indian Maritime University
249	Indian National Trust for Art and Cultural Heritage (INTACH)
250	Indian Network of People Living with HIV
251	Indian Social Action Forum (INSAF)
252	Indian Social Institute (ISI)
253	Indian Special Engineer Centre
254	Indian Water Rights Coalition (IWRC)
255	Indian Youth Climate Network (IYCN)
256	Indo Global Social Service Society (IGSSS)
257	Initiative for Social Upliftment
258	Insight Foundation
259	Inspector General of Police, Special Enquiry, Lucknow
260	Institute of Health Management Pachod (IHMP)
261	Institute of Human Rights Education
262	Institute of Rural Management Anand (IRMA)
263	Institute of Social and Economic Change
264	Institute of Social Sciences, New Delhi (ISS)
265	International Longevity Center
266	International Organization for Migration (IOM)
267	International Union Against Tuberculosis and Young Distance (IUATLD)
268	India People's Theatre Association (IPTA)
269	ISSUE
270	Izad
271	JAEAR
272	JAGORI
273	Jagriti Seva Sanstha
274	Jamia Millia Islamia
275	Jan Jagriti
276	JAN SAHAS

277	Jan Sakha Parishad (JSP)
278	Jan Sewa Sanstha (JSS)
279	Jan Vikas Jagriti
280	Janhit Chhattisgarh Vikas Samiti
281	Jashpur Samaj Seva Samiti
282	Jeevika
283	Jirimiya Sena Majhi
284	Joint Action Committee of Senior Citizens
285	Joint Operation for Social Help, Delhi (JOSH)
286	Joint Women's Programme, New Delhi (JWP)
287	Judav
288	Jugaru
289	Julab
290	JVBU
291	JVM
292	Kabir Society
293	Karnataka Child Rights Observatory
294	Kashmir Foundation for Organization Research & Development
295	Kasturba Sewa Kendra
296	KCRO, Bangalore
297	KDS
298	KFORI
299	Khoj
300	Kinnar Kasturi
301	Kisan Ki Awaaz
302	KJP Assembly, Meghalaya
303	Krishak Sahay Sansthan, MP
304	Kshitiz Samaj Sewa Sansthan
305	Ladies Wing FKMA
306	Lahar Samaj Sevi Sansthan
307	Law Trust
308	LCD
309	Liberal Youth Forum
310	Lok Astha
311	LTMG Hospital
312	LYF
313	M.K. Gandhi Foundation
314	Macarthur Foundation India
315	MACT India
316	Madari Organization
317	Madhusudan Gaware

318	Maharashtra Bahujan Manjil Hakk Parisad, Nasik
319	Mahatma Gandhi Adivasi Vikas Mandal
320	Mahatma Gandhi Seva Ashram
321	Mahila Kalpana Sakti
322	Mahila Rajsatta Andolan (MRA)
323	Mahila Samakhya, Kerala
324	Mahila Samakhya, Karnataka
325	Mahila Samatha, Andhra Pradesh
326	Malwa Mazdoor Kisan Sangathan (MMKS)
327	Manav Adhikar Forum
328	Manbha Foundation
329	Manipur University
330	Margadarshak Samaj Sewa Sanstha
331	MARPU
332	Marudhar Ganga Society
333	Masoom
334	Matrica Foundation
335	Mazdoor Kisan Shakti Sangathan (MKSS)
336	MCF
337	MDW
338	Media Centre for Development Communication
339	Mehattar
340	Migrant Forum
341	Mizoram Central University
342	Mobile Creches, New Delhi
343	Money Life Foundation
344	Mountain Children's Foundation
345	Mountain Dalit Right Himachal Pradesh
346	Maharshi Patanjali Vidya Mandir (MPVM)
347	MSS Institute of Social Work, Nagpur
348	Nadhi Bachoo Abhiyan (NBA)
349	Naga Women's Hoho Dimapur
350	Nagpur Municipal Corporation Plumber Union
351	Nahind
352	National Legal Services Authority (NALSA)
353	Nandani
354	National Alliance for Land Rights (NALR)
355	National Alliance for People's Movement (NAPM)
356	National Alliance for Women Organization

357	National Campaign for Dalit Human Rights (NCDHR)
358	National Centre for Advocacy Study (NCAS)
359	National Confederation of Dalit Organisations (NACDOR)
360	National Dalit Forum
361	National Federation of Dalit Women (NFDW)
362	National Foundation for India
363	National Skills Mission
364	National Social Watch Coalition, Delhi
365	Nav Jagriti Vikas Salahkar Samithi
366	Nava Jeevan Trust
367	Naveen Bharati Sewa Samit
368	Navjagrit Vikas Salahkar Samiti
369	Navjyot
370	Navrachna Samaj Sewa Sansthan
371	Navsarjan
372	National Alliance of Women's Organizations (NAWO)
373	NAZ Foundation
374	NDF, Madhya Pradesh
375	NDW
376	NDW-Swadhikar
377	NEED
378	NEHU, Meghalaya
379	NEICORD
380	NFFFWF
381	NIDAN
382	NIRANTAR
383	NIRD
384	Nirman
385	NMC Employees Union, Nagpur
386	NMML
387	NMPS
388	North East Hill University
389	North East Network (NEN)
390	North East Social Trust
391	North Eastern Social Research Centre
392	MGNREGS Watch
393	OXFAM India
394	PSS
395	Pahal Foundation
396	Parivan Sewa, Delhi

397	Parivar Sewa
398	Pasmad Mushlim Mahaz
399	Pasmanda Samaj Sansthan
400	Patang
401	Path
402	PCA
403	Omeo Kumar Das Institute of Social Change and Development, OKDISCD
404	Peace Trust
405	People for Peace
406	Plan India, New Delhi
407	Plan4Children Collective
408	Population Foundation of India (PFI)
409	Power Finance Corporation
410	PPUS
411	Prabhar Niketan Prenabharti
412	Prabodhi
413	PRADAN
414	Pradeepan
415	Pragati
416	Pragati Sansthan
417	Pratigya
418	Pravah
419	Prayas, Pune
420	Prayog
421	Prerana
422	PRIA
423	PSS
424	Public Health India
425	PUCAAR
426	Pukmatiya
427	Punjab Committee Chandigarh
428	Purva Bharti Turst
429	Purvanchal Dalit Adhikar Manch
430	PVCL
431	Positive Women's Network (PWN)
432	Recovering and Healing from Incest (RAHI)
433	Rajasthan Mahila Kamgar Union, Jaipur
434	Rashtriya Dalit Mahila Andolan
435	Rashtriya Grameen Vikas Nidhi, Assam
436	Rashtriya Mahila Andolan
437	Rastriya Jagriti Sewa Samiti
438	Rati

439	RDT
440	REEDS
441	Refa Samaj Sewa
442	Refah Samajik Sangathan
443	Republican Youth Students Forum
444	RGVN
445	Right to Food Campaign
446	RNBA, Manipur
447	Rohidas Mahila Kalyan Samiti
448	Rongmei Naga Baptist Association, Manipur
449	Rooh Mamta Bachao Jan Andolan
450	Rural Development Institute
451	Rural Women Association
452	SFAC, Meghalaya
453	Saathi Mumbai
454	Saathii
455	Sadhanki
456	SAFED
457	Sahabhagi Sanstha
458	Sahayog
459	Sahjivan Bahuuddeshiv Vikas Mandal
460	Sahyogita Vikas Sansthan, Chattarpur
461	Sakhi Charchowghi
462	Sakshi Human Rights
463	Salam Balak Trust
464	SAMA
465	Samadhan, Ranchi
466	Samajik Seva Sadan
467	Samarth Shiksha Prasasanik Mandal
468	Samarthan
469	Sampari Hukumu Bodoi
470	Sampari Hukumu Bodol, Tripura
471	Sampark, Nagpur
472	Samyak Shiksha Eavam Manviya Vikas Sansthan
473	Sanchar
474	Sangama
475	Sangharsh Yuva Manch, Nashik
476	Sanjeevani Creations
477	South Asia Network for Social & Agricultural Development (SANSAD)
478	Santoshi
479	SAPA

480	SAUP
481	Saurashtra Dalit Sansthan
482	Save Interschool India
483	Save the Children, India (SCF)
484	SBT
485	SCFD
486	School Bachao Abhiyan
487	Schotastica
488	Score
489	Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC)
490	SDYM
491	Seba Jagat
492	Secular Forum
493	Senior Citizens Organization, Nerul
494	Sense International India
495	SEPVS, Jodhpur
496	Seva Mandal, Udaipur
497	Sewa Mandir
498	SEWAK
499	SFAC Meghalaya
500	SGVV
501	Shanti Sadhana Ashram
502	SHED
503	Shive Sukh Nawoyank Mandal Paldi Parsi
504	Shri Chetna Sangh
505	Shri Gandhi Seva Ashram
506	Shristi
507	SIDA Foundation
508	Siga Community Service Guild
509	Siksha Shodh Avam Vikas Sansthan & Dalit Setu
510	Silver Innings
511	Sir Syed Muslim Foundation
512	The State Institute for Rural Development (SIRD)
513	SKA
514	SKRS
515	Smile Foundation
516	Sneha
517	SNS Foundation
518	Social Justice Alliance
519	Social Uplift Through Rural Action (SUTRA)

520	Social Watch Tamilnadu Chennai
521	Society for Development Action, Patna
522	Solidarity Centre
523	SOS Children's Villages of India
524	South Asia Peace Alliance
525	South Vihar Welfare Society for Tribal
526	SPAN
527	Spoorthi
528	SPYM
529	Sri Auro Vision
530	SS Arhvan Basli the Gmmirahati
531	State Law Commission, Meghalaya
532	Stella Maris College
533	STEP
534	Student Forum
535	Sujagrati Samaj Sewa Sansthan
536	Sumfeemi
537	Surguja Gramin Vikas Manda
538	Swaasthya
539	Swabhlabhi
540	SWATI
541	Swavlambi
542	Synjuk ki Rangbah Shnong
543	Talking about Reproductive and Sexual Health Issues (TARSHI)
544	Tata Institute of Social Sciences (TISS)
545	TDWF
546	Tehreek-E-Pasmanda Muslim Samaj (TPMS)
547	Telangana Joint Action Committee (JAC)
548	The Deef way Foundation
549	The Family Welfare Agency
550	The International Center for Research on Women (ICRW)
551	The Tehelka Foundation
552	The United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)
553	TNSIC Guindy
554	TOWF
555	Toxics Link
556	Transgender Rights Association
557	Tribal Society
558	Tripude College of Social Work, Nagpur
559	Tripura University

560	TTF
561	TYPE
562	Udyem
563	Ugnyawas Jagriti Kendra Sansthan
564	UN Women
565	UNAIDS
566	United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)
567	United Reform Organisation
568	UNNATI
569	Unorganized Workers Federation
570	UPVM
571	Ural Samity
572	Urdu Association
573	Urdu Journalist Association
574	Urmul
575	Urmul Setu
576	Urmul Simant
577	Utthan
578	Vadharc
579	Vidyasagar Samajik Suraksha Seva Evam Shodh Sansthan (VSSSSS)
580	Vikalp Samaj Sewa Sanstha
581	Vikas Samvad
582	Vistirn Samajik Sangathan
583	Voluntary Service Oversees (VSO)
584	VSS
585	We Care Social Service Society
586	WFDW
587	WGLNR, Manipur
588	White Lotus
589	WISE
590	WNTAM
591	Women Power Connect (WPC)
592	Women's Collective, Tamil Nadu
593	Women's Front, Tamil Nadu
594	Women's Coalition Trust
595	World Vision India (WVI)
596	YAAR
597	Vanangana
598	YCDA
599	Yes for Peace
600	Young at Risk India Forum

601	Young Lives, Delhi
602	Youth Coalition
603	Youth for Policy and Dialogue
604	Youth Parliament
605	Yugantar, Hyderabad
606	Yuva Chetna Manch
607	Yuva Rural - Nagpur
608	Yuva, Mumbai
Individuals	
1	Ajara Bai
2	Amrit Lal Joshi
3	Anand Tirkey
4	Anil Bhai
5	Anjor Singh
6	Anju Soni
7	Annu
8	Ama Lal
9	Amar Singh Choudhary
10	Arun Sahu
11	Arun Singh
12	Ashok Choudhary
13	Ashok Kumar
14	Ashok Meshram
15	Ashwani Verma
16	Augdus Ekka
17	Baisakhin Bai
18	Baisakhu Ram
19	Bal Singh
20	Bali Ram
21	Balsingh
22	Banmali Prasad Gouraha
23	Basant Kr. Rautray
24	Basant Yadav
25	Bhadali Bai
26	Bhanu Patel
27	Bharat Bhushan Thakur
28	Bhola Bhai
29	Bhuneshwar Sahu
30	Bibinika Pradhan
31	Bipin
32	Birohin
33	Bishnu Nishad
34	Bishram

35	Boloram
36	Budhari
37	Budhram Yadav
38	Carmela Ekka
39	Chaitram
40	Chandan Singh
41	Chandrasah Patel
42	Chandramani
43	Chandrawati Korwa
44	Dropati Sahu
45	D. Vishwatma
46	Dayaram Bhoi
47	Deme Oram
48	Dev Prasad Sahu
49	G.S.N. Sharma
50	Ganesh Prasad
51	Gangaram
52	Garbhin Bai
53	Durga Patel
54	Durpati
55	Gayatri Panchal
56	Geeta Singh
57	Ghari Ram
58	Gregory Kerketta
59	Gwal Singh
60	Hem Singh
61	Hemant
62	Ishwar Prasad
63	Jagat Ram
64	Jagdish
65	Jageshwar
66	Jaidev Mohurle
67	Jaisingh Jadon
68	Jacob Nellithanam
69	Janaki
70	Jethu Ram
71	Jhalak Ram Yadu
72	Jhul Singh Dhruw
73	Jasmani Baa
74	Kanhu Mohanty
75	Karam Singh
76	Kartik
77	Kashi Ram

78	L. Kindo
79	Keshav Choubey
80	Khalia Sabar
81	Khelan Ram Dadsena
82	Mahulal
83	Manhgu Lal
84	Manish Rajput
85	Mannu Lal
86	Maya Ram
87	Meena
88	Meena Sahu
89	Mehataru Singh
90	Mohammad Khan
91	Mohar Singh
92	Renuka Ekka
93	Santo Bai
94	Saraswami Uekey
95	Nicolas Barla
96	Nilesh Choubey
97	Nohar Singh
98	Padum Lal Singh
99	Pardeshi Ram
100	Parwati Yadu
101	Pati Ram
102	Patiya Bai
103	Paul Pradhan
104	Prashant Kumar P.V.
105	Prerana Bharti
106	Priti Tiwari
107	Prof. J. Parikshita
108	Rajkali Patel
109	Pushpika Tirky
110	Raghuvir Pradhan
111	Rajnish Gupta
112	Rajpati Bai
113	Rakesh Ratan Singh
114	Ram Gulam Sinha
115	Ram Lal
116	Abdul
117	Sr. Khristi Lakada
118	Sr. Ursula Khalkho
119	Sitaram Sonwani
120	Skolastica Barla

121	Tijiya Bai
122	Tikam Singh
123	Umabai Pradhan
124	Umesh Hrishi
125	V.B. Chandra Shekhar
126	Valentin Kiro
127	William Henej
128	Sujan Singh Verma
129	Sagan Bai
130	Sahdev Ram
131	Salimuddin
132	Samaru Ram
133	Samaru Singh
134	Samee Kerana
135	Sanat Ram
136	Sani Ram
137	Santoshi Bai
138	Santu Ram
139	Shakuntala Kashyap
140	Shani Ram
141	Sheeba
142	Shiba Dungkung
143	Shikari Baiga
144	Dhirendra
145	Devendra Baghel
146	Sidharth
147	Shushil
148	Shyambati
149	Murali Das Sant
150	Gloriya
151	Mangal
152	Diwakar
153	Sachin R. Mandavi
154	Meghaiya Bai
155	K.K Abraham
156	Manoj Pardesi
157	Saroja Puthran
158	G. Karunanidhi
159	Laxman J Meena
160	Joseph Mathew
161	B . Jeevan
162	Tarit Chakraborty
163	Geeta Chitroda

164	Naresh Yadav
165	Anil Dalvi
166	Farzana Begum
167	P.Nagarajan
168	Azad Shaikh
169	Agui Daimie
170	K Mukesh
171	Salam Irene
172	Linda Chhahchhuak
173	Rajib Handique
174	Phul Singh
175	Shabeena Francis
176	Palanithurai
177	Raghunandan
178	Meenakshisundaram
179	Nelly Rodriques
180	Chhavi Rajawat
181	Haneef Balkhi
182	Mathur R S
183	Sharad Behar
184	Nirmala Buch
185	Amitabh Singh
186	Rashmi Sharma
187	Sudha Pillai
188	Caitlin Wiesen
189	Dhirendra Krishna
190	Paramjit Kaur Gill
191	Jayanta Chaudhuri
192	Lily Kujur
193	Muraleedharan B
Media	
1	All India Urdu Mass Communication Society for Peace
2	Budha Sakthi Telugu daily
3	Channel one News
4	UNN
5	India Mail
6	NETV
7	News Live
8	Voice
9	The Meghalaya Times
10	Urdu Daily, Hyderabad
11	Press Trust of India (PTI)

Special thanks to the people who facilitated the consultations and to those who made this publication.	
1	Amitabh Behar
2	Radha Khan
3	Anup Kumar Srivastava
4	Leander Toppo
5	Geeta Kaim
6	Naresh Kumar
7	Gulshan Kumar
8	Suman Dasgupta
9	Binu Sebastian
10	Saswati Swetlena
11	Rahul Banerjee
12	Anil Singh

Abbreviations

ADC	Autonomous District Councils	ICMR	Indian Council for Medical Research
ANC	Ante Natal Care	ICPD	International Conference on Population and Development
ANM	Auxiliary Nurse Midwives	ICT	Information and Communication Technology
APL	Above Poverty Line	IDPs	Internally Displaced Persons
ARC	Administrative Reforms Commission	IGMSY	Indira Gandhi Matritva Sahyog Yojana
ASHA	Accredited Social Health Activist	IGNOAP	Indira Gandhi National Old Age Pension Scheme
AT	assistive technology	IPR	Intellectual Property Rights
BPL	Below Poverty Line	ISMW	Inter State Migrant Workman
BTAD	Bodoland Territorial Area Districts	IT	Information Technology
CAG	Comptroller and Auditor General	ITI	Industrial Training Institutes
CEDAW	Convention for the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women	IYCF	Infant and Young Child Feeding
CHC	Community Health Centres	JNNURM	Jawaharlal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission
CSA	Central Special Assistance	JSY	Janani Suraksha Yojana
CSO	Civil Society Organisations	LGBTQI	Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Queer and Intersex
CSS	Centrally Sponsored Schemes	LSE	Life Skills Education
CSWB	Central Social Welfare Board	MCDs	Muslim Concentration Districts
CWD	Children with Disability	MCI	Medical Council of India
DGET	Directorate General of Employment and Training	MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
DLHS	District Level Household Survey	MGNREGS	Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme
DONER	Development of North Eastern Region	MIS	Management Information System
DPC	District Planning Committees	MNC	Maternal, Newborn and Child
ECCD	Early Childhood Care and Development	MNCHN	Maternal, Newborn and Other Children's Health and Nutrition Services
ECCE	Early Childhood Care and Education	MoHRD	Ministry of Human Resources Development
EOC	Equal Opportunity Commission	MoSJ&E	Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment	MoWCD	Ministry of Women and Child Development
FRA	Forest Rights Act	MSME	Micro, small and medium enterprises
GDP	Gross Domestic Product	MTR	Mid-Term Review
GER	Gross Enrolment Ratio	NABARD	National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development
GIPA	Greater Involvement of People Living with HIV and AIDS		
GIS	Geographical Information Systems		
GNH	Gross National Happiness		
GO	Government Order		
HDI	Human Development Index		
HFA	Hyogo Framework of Action		
ICDS	Integrated Child Development Scheme		

NACDOR	National Confederation of Dalit Organisations	RGGVY	Rajiv Gandhi Gramin Vidyutikaran Yojana
NACP	National AIDS Control Programme	RMSA	Rashtriya Madhyamik Shiksha Abhiyan
NACP-III	National AIDS Control Programme Phase 3	RSBY	Rashtriya Swastha Bima Yojana
NALSA	National Legal Services Authority	RTE	Right to Education
NCDHR	National Campaign on Dalit Human Rights	RTI	Right to Information (Act)
NCLP	National Child Labour Project	SCP	Special Component Plan
NCRL	National Commission on Rural Labour	SCs	Scheduled Castes
NCVT	National Council of Vocational Training	SCVT	State Councils of Vocational Training
NDB	National Data Bank	SGSY	Swarna Jayanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana
NDF	National Dalit Forum	SHGs	self-help groups
NEC	North Eastern Council	SIDBI	Small Industries Development Bank of India
NEN	North East Network	SJSRY	Swarna Jayanti Shahari Rozgar Yojana
NER	North East Region	SMCs	School Management Committees
NFDW	National Federation of Dalit Women	SPB	State Planning Boards
NRCs	Nutrition Rehabilitation Centres	SPV	solar photovoltaic
NRDWP	National Rural Drinking Water Programme	SRS	Sexual Reassignment Surgery
NRHM	National Rural Health Mission	SSA	Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan
NTFP	Non-Timber Forest Products	SSBK	Social Security Benefits for Unorganised Worker in Karnataka
NUHM	National Urban Health Mission	SSS	State Sponsored Schemes
OST	Oral Substitute Therapy	TG	Transgender
PAIS	Public Accountability Information Systems	TISS	Tata Institute of Social Sciences
PDF	Post Doctoral Fellowship	TPMS	Tehereek-e-Pasmanda Muslim Samaj
PDS	Public Distribution System	TRIPS	Trade Related Intellectual Property Rights
PESA	Panchayat Extension to Scheduled Areas Act	TSP	Tribal Sub Plan
PHC	Primary Health Centre	UGC	University Grants Commission
PLHIV	People Living with HIV	UID	Unique Identity
PNC	Post Natal Care	UIDAI	Unique Identification Authority of India
PPCP	Public-Private-Community Partnership	UNCRC	United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child
PPP	Public-Private-Partnership	VEC	Village Education Committee
PPTCT	Prevention of Parent-to-Child Transmission	VEC	Village Education Council
PRI	Panchayati Raj Institutions	WHO	World Health Organization
PSK	Primary Shiksha Kosh	WNTA	Wada Na Todo Abhiyan
PTA	Parents Teachers Association	WWD	Women with Disability
PWD	People with Disability	YAP	Youth Alliance for Planning
		YPLHA	Youth and Young People Living with HIV-AIDS

WADA NA TODO ABHIYAN

Wada Na Todo Abhiyan (WNTA) is a national campaign. It envisages “holding the government accountable to its promise to end poverty, social exclusion, and discrimination”.

At the World Social Forum 2004, Mumbai, human rights activists and social action groups agreed on the need for a forceful, focused, and concerted effort to make a difference to the fact that one-fourth of the world’s poor live in India, and continue to experience intense deprivation of opportunities to learn, live, and work in dignity. WNTA emerged from this consensus.

WNTA aims to make a difference by monitoring the promises made by the Government of India to meet the objectives set in the UN Millennium Declaration (2000), the National Development Goals, and the promises of the UPA II government with a special focus on the Right to Livelihood, Health, Education and Exclusion.

WNTA works to ensure that the concerns and aspirations of Dalits, Adivasis, nomadic tribes, women, children, youth, people with disability and people living with HIV-AIDS are mainstreamed across programmes, policies, and development goals of the Central and state governments.

WNTA is a coalition of over 4000 rights action groups across 28 states and three Union Territories of India to link individuals and social groups and engage policy-makers on issues of strategic relevance.

WNTA is also an affiliate of the UN Millennium Campaign (UNMC) and the Global Call to Action against Poverty (GCAP).

A Campaign Coordination Group consisting of more than 130 organizations governs Wada Na Todo Abhiyan. An elected Convenor leads the Group. The Campaign Steering Group functions as WNTA’s executive committee and comprises 21 elected representatives from the Campaign Co-ordination Group. The National Campaign Coordinator is the Member-Secretary of the Campaign Steering Group.

The Campaign Secretariat is based in New Delhi. It implements the daily operations of WNTA and supports the functioning of the different groups and bodies formed through the Campaign Coordination Group under the leadership of the National Campaign Coordinator.

Some WNTA Initiatives

- All India People’s Manifesto: Developed charter of demands in more than 300 parliamentary constituencies across the country just before the 2009 general election
- The first-ever People’s Mid-term Appraisal of the 11th Five Year Plan
- Annual Civil Society Review of the UPA II’s promises
- Women’s Tribunal against Poverty III: Women’s tribunals are being organized in 10 states, followed by a National Tribunal in Delhi
- Various activities around UN Millennium Development Goals
- “Nine is Mine” campaign to demand the allocation of 9 per cent of the GDP to health and education measures
- Bimonthly radio programme “Haq Hamara Wada Tumhara” on AIR 102.6

Our effort is to make this 12th Five Year Plan inclusive and to create enabling spaces, where the viewpoints of the most marginalised, disadvantaged and poorest of the poor groups/citizens of our country can be voiced and heard.

Our inputs to the Plan approach are formulated keeping human rights and social justice principles in mind.

